

# **The Singer in the Ecclesiastical Hierarchy**

## **The Early History of the Order**

Kaija Ravolainen



STUDIA MUSICA 59

2014

© Kaija Ravolainen 2014  
Doctoral dissertation  
University of the Arts Helsinki  
Sibelius Academy  
DocMus Doctoral School  
Studia Musica 59

Juvenes Print – Suomen Yliopistopaino Oy  
Tampere 2014

ISBN 978-952-5959-77-2  
ISSN 0788-3757

## **Abstract**

The present study examines the origin and the early phases of the ecclesiastical order of the singer, nowadays generally called cantor. The constitutive regulations concerning the order derive from the late fourth century in the canons of the Synod of Laodicea and the Apostolic Constitutions. The order of the singer was established in eastern Christendom, while in the West, it never was added to the ranks of the ecclesiastical hierarchy. There, the members of other ecclesiastical grades answered for the psalmody, although allusions to singers occasionally appear. The study period extends to the seventh century CE.

The development of both ecclesiastical singing and the hierarchy is treated from the beginning of the history of the Church. This is necessary for identifying the standing and the role of the singer, whose order emerges rather late in comparison with other ecclesiastical orders. One of the earlier orders belongs to the reader, who is considered to have preceded the singer, but also to have been one, as all reading was performed in recitation. The study also aims to define why a separate order of the singer was needed, if the reader was able to execute these duties as well.

The materials include both normative – the canons of ecclesiastical councils and synods, and church orders – and descriptive sources, the latter consisting primarily of the texts of the patristic authors. In the interpretation of the materials, some Greek and Latin expressions, simple in appearance, cause problems as their unambiguous meaning is difficult to define. The sources do not furnish a direct answer to the study question, which is solved with the aid of circumstantial evidence and secondary sources.

The orders of the reader and the singer did not share a similar standing in the hierarchy. The order of the reader formed the lowest rank of the ecclesiastical hierarchy; thus, every member of the higher orders had served as a reader. The singer remained in his rank, which, eventually, established a hierarchy of its own, in the manner of a trade guild.

The Christian Church emerged among an abundance of religions and cults, which also appear in the materials of this study. The issue of how far these cults influenced the practices adopted by the Church, or its singing and singers, is addressed in a brief survey appended to the introduction and commented on in the conclusions of the study. The instrumental music of the heathen cults was rejected, but natural similarities appear in the vocabulary and the hierarchy. The inheritance of Judaism is evident, not only in the use of the Psalter and other Holy Scriptures, but also in the references to the Old Covenant elements as models for the ranks of the ecclesiastical hierarchy.

The study systematically introduces the essential documents relating to the topic, thus serving also as a work of reference.

## Acknowledgements

On the completion of this doctoral thesis, I wish to express my gratitude to all the persons and other bodies that have contributed to its successful realisation. I gratefully acknowledge financial support for this research from the Finnish Concordia Fund.

As this dissertation is an extension of my graduate and licentiate theses, I first want to thank professors Reijo Pajamo and Pentti Pelto for their support in these earlier studies. During the years of writing the present work, I participated in the postgraduate seminars held in both Helsinki and Kuopio, led by Jorma Hannikainen and Erkki Tuppurainen. I am grateful for their patience, as also for the interest shown in my work by all the other seminar participants.

I am much obliged to Sibelius Academy for nominating Professor Paavo Castrén (HY) as my supervisor. With great erudition and experience, he has guided me through numerous difficult and time-consuming phases. I wish to express my deepest gratitude to him, not only for the personal instruction I have received, but also for the invitation to the Finnish Symposium of Late Antiquity at Tvärminne in the mid-1990's. Since then, I have attended these annual seminars whenever possible, and remember with gratitude all the Finnish and foreign scholars I have been privileged to meet there.

In the final revision of the manuscript, both its form and contents were enhanced by the constructive comments of the pre-examiners, Professor Gunnar af Hällström (ÅA) and Docent Juhani Forsberg (HY). Michael Freeman (JYU) carried out the language revision with great proficiency. I am very grateful to each of them.

During the years of my studies, use of the Internet has replaced much of the work which used to be done in the library. Despite the ease of browsing on the net at home, I miss the peaceful atmosphere of the National Library and other Helsinki University libraries – the *Antiquitas*, the Library of the Department of Asian and African Culture, and the Theological Library, none of which can any

longer be visited in their earlier locations – and wish specially to thank the personnel of the National Library for the excellent service I have received there.

Notwithstanding, some problems were not solved with the help of printed or digital sources but with that of individual scholars, favourably disposed towards my work: my thanks go to Erkki Sironen, PhD, for assistance with Greek inscriptions and the details of Greek orthography; to Professor Hannu Juusola and Riikka Tuori, PhD, for help with an enigmatic detail in the Arabic Canons of Basil, and to Heikki Leppä, ThD, who has irreplaceably acted as my IT support.

Sincere thanks are due also to the persons closest to me: *Klaus, ich danke Dir.* Sis Eija, and all my friends: thank you for never ceasing to support me.

I dedicate this work to my parents, who did not live to see it completed.

Sulkava, September 2014

Kaija Ravolainen

## Contents

Abbreviations.....	10
1 Introduction.....	11
1.1 Definition of the subject.....	11
1.1.1 Background of the study and earlier research.....	11
1.1.2 Materials and method.....	17
1.2 Music and hierarchy in other cults .....	21
1.2.1 Heathen cults.....	21
The role of musicians in the Roman state cult.....	21
Roman priestly colleges.....	24
Features of some Hellenistic and Egyptian cults.....	28
The professional musicians of theatre and entertainment .....	32
1.2.2 Music and hierarchy in Judaism.....	34
The service in the Temple of Jerusalem .....	34
The hierarchy of the Temple.....	38
The ancient synagogue service.....	40
Musical practices of some Jewish communities in the first century CE .....	45
The organization of the public synagogue.....	46
The establishment of the singer of the synagogue .....	49
2 The first three Christian centuries .....	53
2.1 The biblical basis of ecclesiastical singing .....	53
2.1.1 Singing in the Pauline writings .....	53
2.1.2 An outside attestation of Christian worship: the letter of Pliny .....	57
2.2 Offices and functions in the early Church .....	59
2.2.1 Spiritual and practical offices .....	59
2.2.2 The office of reading.....	63
2.2.3 Divine service and ecclesiastical ranks in the writings of Tertullian .....	66
2.2.4 The offices in the Apostolic Tradition .....	70
2.2.5 The reader in the <i>Didascalia Apostolorum</i> and the Apostolic Church Order .....	74
2.2.6 Readers in the letters of Cyprian of Carthage and Cornelius of Rome .....	77
2.2.7 Two documents from the time of the Diocletian persecution.....	80

2.3	References to ecclesiastical singing in the first centuries .....	83
2.4	Summary.....	87
3	The fourth century.....	91
3.1	The establishment of ecclesiastical life.....	91
3.1.1	Ecclesiastical and imperial legislation in the Constantinian era .....	91
3.1.2	The structure of the ecclesiastical hierarchy .....	93
3.1.3	The Egyptian Canons of Hippolytus .....	95
3.1.4	Psalm singing according to Athanasius of Alexandria.....	99
3.1.5	The impact of the Arian heresy on Christian singing.....	101
3.1.6	First mentions of individual singers .....	105
3.2	The establishment of the order of the singer.....	107
3.2.1	The singer in the canons of the Synod of Laodicea.....	107
3.2.2	The singer in the Apostolic Constitutions.....	112
3.2.3	The course of the Clementine Liturgy.....	116
3.2.4	The ecclesiastical order in the Apostolic Constitutions.....	119
3.2.5	Singers in other fourth-century sources .....	125
3.2.6	John Chrysostom on singing.....	130
3.3	The arrangement of singing in western Christendom.....	133
3.3.1	An apocryphal introduction.....	133
3.3.2	Singer epigrams.....	135
3.3.3	The ecclesiastical hierarchy of the Roman Church.....	139
3.3.4	A suggestion on the reason for the absence of the singer.....	143
3.4	The spreading of the eastern manner of singing.....	145
3.4.1	Biographical details of Ambrose of Milan.....	145
3.4.2	The singer in the writings of Ambrose.....	149
3.4.3	Augustine on singing .....	152
3.5	Summary.....	155
4	From the fifth to the seventh century.....	159
4.1	Hispanic and Gallic documents.....	159
4.1.1	The confessor of the canons of Toledo I .....	159
4.1.2	The appointment of the <i>cantor</i> .....	161
4.2	Eastern sources of the fifth and the sixth centuries .....	165
4.2.1	Catechumen readers and singers in the Church of Alexandria.....	165
4.2.2	Readers and singers in the canons of the Council of Chalcedon ..	166

4.2.3 An apocryphal canon attributed to the Council of Nicaea.....	168
4.2.4 Singing in the hierarchical system of Dionysius (the Pseudo-)Areopagite.....	169
4.2.5 Singers in the Justinian legislation.....	171
4.3 Western sources.....	174
4.3.1 Minor sixth-century references to nomenclature and status .....	174
4.3.2 Reader and singer in the works of Isidore of Seville.....	181
4.3.3 Reforms of Pope Gregory I.....	187
4.3.4 The question of the <i>schola</i> .....	191
4.4 Singers in seventh-century eastern Christendom .....	193
4.4.1 Readers and singers in the Arabic Canons of Basil.....	193
4.4.2 Singers in the canons of the Synod of Trullo.....	198
4.4.3 Singers in inscriptions and papyri .....	203
4.5 Summary.....	207
5 Conclusions.....	211
5.1 Connections with other cults.....	211
5.2 The origin of the order of the singer.....	214
5.3 The relation between the orders of reader and singer.....	216
5.4 Regional lines.....	219
Syria.....	219
Asia Minor .....	221
Egypt.....	223
The Apennine peninsula.....	224
North Africa and the Iberian peninsula.....	225
Bibliography.....	229
Appendix A. Table of inscriptions and papyri .....	257
Appendix B. Table of chronology.....	262
Index of fundamental issues.....	265

## Abbreviations

AC	Apostolic Constitutions
ACO	Apostolic Church Order
AKK	Antiikin käsikirja
ANF	Ante-Nicene Fathers
AT	Apostolic Tradition
BT	Babylonian Talmud
CCSL	Corpus Christianorum Series Latina
CIC	Corpus Iuris Civilis
CIG	Corpus Inscriptionum Graecarum
CIL	Corpus Inscriptionum Latinarum
CJ	Codex Justinianus
CLT	The Clementine Liturgical Text
CSEL	Corpus Scriptorum Ecclesiasticorum Latinorum
CSP	Les Canons des Synodes Particuliers
CT	Codex Theodosianus
DA	Didascalia Apostolorum
DACL	Dictionnaire d'Archéologie Chrétienne et de Liturgie
DNP	Der Neue Pauly
DTC	Dictionnaire de Théologie Catholique
EJ	Encyclopaedia Judaica
GCS	Die griechischen christlichen Schriftsteller der ersten Jahrhunderte
HE	Historia Ecclesiastica
IG	Inscriptiones Graecae
ILCV	Inscriptiones Latinae Christianae Veteres
LAK	Lexikon Alte Kulturen
LP	Liber Pontificalis
LXX	Septuaginta
M	Mishnah
MAMA	Monumenta Asiae Minoris Antiqua
MGG	Musik in Geschichte und Gegenwart
NCE	New Catholic Encyclopedia
NGD	New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians
NOHM	New Oxford History of Music
NPNF	Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers
NSRV	New Standard Revised Version of the Bible
ODCC (3 <sup>rd</sup> ed.)	The Oxford Dictionary of the Christian Church
OKK	Ortodoksisen kirkon kanonit
OP, POxy	Oxyrhynchus Papyri
P. Lond.	Papyri Londinenses
PG	Patrologia graeca
PL	Patrologia latina
P-W	Pauly-Wissowa Realencyclopädie der classischen Altertums-Wissenschaft
RAC	Reallexikon für Antike und Christentum
SC	Sources Chrétiennes
SEA	Statuta Ecclesiae Antiqua
SEG	Supplementum Epigraphicum Graecum
TJ	Talmud of Jerusalem
TLL	Thesaurus Linguae Latinae

# 1 Introduction

## 1.1 Definition of the subject

### 1.1.1 Background of the study and earlier research

The subject of the present study is the origin and early history of the ecclesiastical order of the singer, nowadays generally called the cantor. The establishment of the order is recorded in the canons of the Synod of Laodicea in Asia Minor ca. 380. As the most important orders – those of the bishop, presbyter, and deacon – appear already in the Apostolic Age, and the order of the reader, next in importance, derives from the second century, the relatively late date raises questions regarding the reasons for this and the prevailing circumstances. As the Christian ecclesia has provedly sung since its inception, it has to be asked why a particular singer, or song leader, was not needed earlier. I first took an interest in the subject in 1990, as the topic of my master's thesis for the Sibelius Academy. The course of my studies, along with the contribution of earlier studies, is charted below.

The first description I ever read about the origin of the singer was in a textbook, *Der Kantor: Seine Amt und seine Dienste*, published by Karl Ferdinand Müller in 1964. The book is a history of the cantorate of the Protestant Church up to the 20<sup>th</sup> century. Only some fifteen pages treat the singer in the ancient Church, but they contain the most relevant information. Müller states that permission to sing on the platform (*ambōn*), granted to the singer in the fourth century, emphasized his role in the divine service. From this we can deduce that the singer had not previously been allowed to sing on the platform. Singing alternated with reading, the manner of which was also melodious, recitative.<sup>1</sup>

---

1 Müller 1964, 25.

A practical reason for the establishment of the singer was given by Alexandre Faivre in his doctoral thesis *Fonctions et premières étapes du cursus cléricale* (1975), on the formation of the lower grades of the clergy. According to him, it was necessary to invest the singer in the clergy: a singer inclined towards wilful performance or heretical repertoire, or to both, could cause severe disturbance at the divine service. Once appointed, he was subordinate to the authority of the bishop. Faivre's reasoning indicates that, while singers existed before the establishment of the order, they did not belong to the clergy.<sup>2</sup>

In 1980, Brian Joseph Sparksman published his dissertation, *The Minister of Music in the Western Church: A Canonical-Historical Study*.<sup>3</sup> In spite of the western emphasis of the title, eastern sources are also treated. Sparksman's book is a comprehensive work of reference on church orders, the patristic literature, and canon and secular law from about 100 CE to the late Middle Ages. The author's aim was not to trace the origin of the order but to consider its history, and its meaning for the future.<sup>4</sup>

The roots of the order of the singer were analysed by Edward Foley in his article *The Cantor in Historical Perspective* (1982). Foley states that the role of the ecclesiastical singer derived from the voluntary office of the reader in the synagogue. The reader was chosen from among the men present to act as the messenger of the community (*sheli'ah zibbur*). According to Foley, the Christian singer did not maintain this function but grew rather into a performer, as his mode of representation began to receive more attention than the texts he sang.<sup>5</sup>

---

2 In this study is utilized the later edition of the work, *Naissance d'une hiérarchie* (Théologie historique 40, Paris 1977).

3 The Catholic University of America, Canon Law Studies No. 502.

4 The bases of Sparksman's study are the letter *Ministeria quaedam* by Pope Paul VI in 1972, and its commentary *Ministries in the Church*, given by the National Conference of Catholic Bishops on the Liturgy 1974. Sparksman 1980, 4.

5 *Worship*, Volume 56, 1982, 194-213. In 1996, Foley treated the liturgical environment of the first Christian centuries in the monograph *Foundations of Christian Music. The Music of Pre-Constantinian Christianity*.

At this phase, it became clear that I needed to know more about the Judaic environment of the primitive Church. Thus, my master's thesis treated the history of Judaism, and the elements of the Christian cult and the ecclesiastical hierarchy in the New Testament era.<sup>6</sup> Feeling that I had only prepared the soil, I chose next to follow the ecclesiastical legislation from its beginning to the fourth century. For this, I first utilized the German *Conciliengeschichte* of Carl Joseph von Hefele. The work includes canonical texts, also in their original language, and references to earlier editions, e.g. the eighteenth-century *Collectio sacrorum conciliorum* by Giovanni Domenico Mansi which, eventually, became the main source for my licentiate thesis.<sup>7</sup>

The *Collectio* consists of documents mainly in Greek and Latin, following the ecclesiastical councils from the time of the New Testament up to the days of Mansi himself, with an eye to the apostolic succession. The work is compiled from earlier collections, and the ordering of the documents does not always correspond their actual chronology. However, the texts include lots of references to early ecclesiastical authors, whose writings are available also in more recent editions. Little by little, the structure of the history of the singer began to take shape. One of its elements was formed by the mentions made of ecclesiastical singing itself, and another by information on those who did the singing, both elements not necessarily appearing in tandem. A third element, in fact the supporting framework, was the development of the entire ecclesiastical hierarchy, the principles of which had been laid down already in the Apostolic Age.

Although drawing on the works of Mansi and Hefele, both representative of western Christendom, as my starting point, I saw it necessary to approach the scholarship of the Eastern Orthodoxy – not least because the order of the singer

6 My master's thesis *Kanttorin esihistoria. Jumalanpalveluksen musiikki ja sen suoritajat Vanhan ja Uuden testamentin aikana* (Sibelius-Akatemia 1993) is unpublished.

7 In all, the *Sacrorum conciliorum nova et amplissima collectio* consists of 31 volumes, of which I studied the first three, extending from the beginning of the Christian Era to the year 409.

originated in eastern Christendom. There, the order of the singer is among the ecclesiastical ranks, which are considered to have been established out of practical necessity, while the orders of bishop, presbyter, and deacon possess divine provenance.<sup>8</sup> On the one hand, the practical necessity for establishing officials was linked to the improved economy of the Church, which was one of the effects of the new standing of Christianity in the fourth century. The imperial protection bestowed upon the Church led also to the enrichment of the divine service which, in its entirety, was chanted, as Alexander Schmemmann has put it, the verb referring to both singing and reading. On the other hand, new participants attending the liturgy were accustomed to the rites of heathen and imperial cults. They had to be instructed in the discipline and the teaching of the Church, in both of which singing was employed as a method.<sup>9</sup>

It can be concluded, then, that there were several reasons for the establishment of the order of the singer, none of which were clearly to be distinguished on the basis of the canonical texts, nor of the ecclesiastical writings to which I had been led by the *Collectio*. Thus, at the end of my licentiate thesis, I suggested that my original study question should be re-framed, based on the character of the materials.<sup>10</sup> However, when I pondered the matter, a potential stumbling block arose: what was the relation of the singer to the reader, mentioned as his predecessor? The recitative manner of reading, or cantillation, was a matter of course; in the materials, it is sometimes referred to as speaking, sometimes as

---

8 Milasch 1905, 242. In discussing the eastern tradition, I have, for linguistic reasons, adhered to a German translation of the work of the Serbian bishop Nikodim Milasch (1845-1915), and the Finnish edition of his explanations of the Canons of the Orthodox Church, translated by Dr. iur. can. Antti Inkinen (1880-1966) but published only in 1980, under the title *Ortodoksisen kirkon kanonit*, including the Canons of the Apostles and the Canons of the Seven Ecumenical Councils. In the explanations, Milasch utilized not only the Byzantine works, but also the works of western scholars, e.g. the French Jesuit Jean Hardouin (1646-1729, one of the sources of Mansi), the English William Beveridge (1637-1708), Cardinal Pitra (1812-1889), and the aforementioned *Conciliengeschichte* of Carl Joseph von Hefele.

9 Schmemmann 1975, 92ff., 126, 130-132.

10 My licentiate thesis *Laulajan asema kirkon hierarkiassa 300-luvulla* (Sibelius-Akatemia 1999) is unpublished.

singing. During the first centuries, according to Edward Foley, "the community as yet saw little distinction between the sung and the publicly spoken." Thus, the person who cantillated either psalms or lessons, was called reader.<sup>11</sup> The appearance of the rank of the singer, in the latter half of the fourth century, must have been for specific reason, as readers remained in that office.

These considerations required a new search through the materials. In the framework of the general development of the ecclesiastical hierarchy, I now paid more attention to the rank of the reader before the emergence of the singer. However, for obvious western reasons, the position of the reader had also to be considered afterwards. Since the completion of my licentiate thesis, I had also become acquainted with some minor sources with a provenance difficult to identify, and thus obscure. Nevertheless, I included these among the sources of this study, with the aim of tracing and presenting everything connected with my subject, the singer. I had already completed the first version of my study when I became aware of the publication of *The Christian West and Its Singers. The First Thousand Years*, by Christopher Page in 2010. The volume is fundamental to the subject matter, and its very extent seemed to render my work redundant. However, I soon noticed that the different perspective and broader time span would allow space for my study as well. In relation to the origin of the order of the singer, Page states that it derived from the ecclesiastical order of the reader (*lector*).<sup>12</sup>

Furthermore, in 2012, Hilkka Seppälä published a treatise on the singers of the Orthodox Church. Under the title, *Idän kirkon pyhä laulu. Laulajien perinne ortodoksisessa kirkossa*, she introduces the Orthodox tradition of singing, primarily from the spiritual perspective. Divided into various topics, the text is furnished with numerous extracts from the Synaxaria, patristic writings and liturgical materials. These render the work more ecclesiastical than historical;

---

11 Foley 1982, 205, 209; 1996, 49, 95. See also Gamble 1995, 225ff.

12 Page 2010, 10.

each topic also follows a chronology of its own, which emphasizes the permanence of the Orthodox tradition. As in her earlier works, Seppälä also here underlines that the duty of the ecclesiastical singer was to sing hymns, not psalms.<sup>13</sup>

Both the last-mentioned studies by authoritative scholars presented me with a serious challenge, as now there suddenly was not only one but two monographs treating subject matter which I had been working with for many years. Nevertheless, not even when combined did the volumes wholly satisfy my mind, as neither investigated the origin of the order in detail – the work of Page concentrating on the provable history of the singers of western Christendom, primarily after the period examined here, while Seppälä's monograph connects biblical, canonical, hagiographical, historical, and liturgical materials together for a didactic purpose, to introduce the spiritual realm of the singing of the Orthodox Church. My intention was to examine the subject from both sides, because at the time focused here, Christendom was still formally united. That the practices of East and West differed from each other long before the final division of the Christendom, becomes evident in the course of the study.

In my view, everyone with an interest in the ecclesiastical orders should be aware of their early history, and of the character of the documents in which that history is recorded. The present study serves as an introduction to both, and thus can also be used as a work of reference.

---

<sup>13</sup> In the last three decades, Prof. Seppälä has published several monographs and articles, some of which are also available in English or German. The mentioned work, *Idän kirkon pyhä laulu. Laulajien perinne ortodoksisessa kirkossa* is published by the University of Eastern Finland (Aducate Reports and Books 1/2012).

### 1.1.2 Materials and method

This study is based on a corpus of primary sources, deriving from the period of interest and available in their original languages. These are the acts of ecclesiastical councils and synods, church orders, writings of ecclesiastical writers and other ancient authors, and the imperial law. In addition to these documents, inscriptions and papyri are considered. All the sources are available in printed editions.

Most of the texts treated here are sections or details of larger documents. Some of them are of undisputed value, such as the decrees of the ecumenical councils. On the other hand, some texts of a seemingly authoritative character may never have been observed, or their actual significance can not be proved even though they are considered to be of ancient origin. To some extent at least, the background of all texts is provable, but some pieces of information remain without explicit context. It is valuable also to record such stray particulars, even if they do not lead further at the moment.

The materials are thus fragmentary; moreover, they derive from the entire Mediterranean and cover over half a millennium. I first considered examining them regionally, following Ewa Wipszycka, who has argued against paralleling the churches of different regions according to their particulars.<sup>14</sup> However, it soon turned out that this principle would not serve the aim of this study: chronological difficulties aside, the origin of all sources is not quite traceable, and different versions of some texts overlap regions. I decided to consider the regional aspects in the conclusions part of the study, and to organize the materials as chronologically as possible in the text proper.

Regarding the significance of the reference literature, it may be stated that although the treatises of other scholars most often explain the original texts, and

---

<sup>14</sup> Wipszycka 1993, 181.

also contextualize them, in some cases the treatises themselves need to be discussed to clarify their background and possible intentions.

The method of the study is historical-critical. The materials are arranged in chronological and thematic order. As already mentioned, they consist of various text types, but they also include documents which have been proved not necessarily to be based on historical facts, like the papal lives in the Roman *Liber Pontificalis*. The use of these, along with other obscure sources, is not only justifiable but necessary. In fact, the subject of the study emerges from three strands of the literature, which shall be approached with caution: in Judaism, the Talmud; in the Eastern Orthodoxy, the explanations of the canons; and in the West, the early historiography of the Church of Rome. The background of each treated document is clarified as far as this is possible, and the individual texts are approached according to their character and contribution to the subject, whether lexical, historical, or circumstantial.

The emphasis of the present study is on the singers in parochial churches. Thus, the monastic rules which were formed during the study period are not treated here, although the difference between parochial and monastic singing practices is, on some occasions, touched upon in the course of the study. Of the divine services, the most important is the Eucharistic liturgy, and hence the development of the system of daily prayers as such is left outside this study, while some details of them are also occasionally alluded to.

The ecclesiastical legislation includes several regulations which concern all ecclesiastics and are repeated in separate collections and by different councils and synods. Such regulations are treated only at the moment they are relevant to the subject, even if they might have been promulgated earlier.

The study proper is divided into three main chapters. The first of them covers approximately the first three Christian centuries, from the era of the apostles to the first half of the fourth century. Beginning with the concepts of the ideal of ecclesiastical singing and ecclesiastical officials in the Apostolic Age, the

chapter follows the development of the hierarchy in both eastern and western documents. During the period, allusions to singing are sporadic and appear mostly in texts other than those which relate to the officials. These texts are examined in the last part of the first main chapter, which thus begins and ends with singing. The second chapter begins in the middle of the fourth century, when allusions to singers begin to emerge, and the role of psalm singing in the liturgy is recorded. This happened first in eastern Christendom, from which it is described to have spread into the western parts of the Empire. The third chapter treats the period from the fifth century to the seventh, beginning and ending with the eastern sources, the western ones being situated in between. Each of the three chapters is provided with a summary.

The reader should note that the concepts 'orthodoxy' and 'catholicism' as used here do not ordinarily refer to the Churches known by those names. When written in lower case, the adjectives 'orthodox' and 'catholic' refer to the adherents of the Council of Nicaea. When these adjectives begin with a capital letter, they refer to the Eastern Orthodox and Roman Catholic Churches as institutions.

Before entering upon the text proper, a further introductory section is presented. As mentioned above, the focus of my licentiate thesis was the fourth century, during which the order of the singer was established. In the conclusions of the thesis, I imagined a kind of group picture of the members of the Church: in the foreground were bishops, presbyters, and deacons, in their prominent vestments, surrounded by subdeacons, acolytes, readers, doorkeepers, and exorcists. Singers were hardly to be distinguished from the mass to which, naturally, ascetics, widows, orphans, and the common people also belonged. Inside, the Church was crowded, but how would it look from the outside?

In the fourth century, the social standing of the Church stabilized as it received imperial and legal protection. But until the final prohibition against heathen cults at the end of the century, and well after that, Christianity had numerous rivals. At

the time, the concept 'Christian' was not categorical. One could consider himself a Christian without being baptized, or having entered the catechumenate. Simultaneously, he could continue to take part in some other cult as well.<sup>15</sup> Imagining a group photograph of the representatives of all the cults practised in the Roman Empire of the fourth century CE, the Christian Church would possibly not be the most populous nor the most prominent. From this point of view, the question of the order of the singer also takes on a new dimension: would its establishment have been influenced by phenomena of other cults? As a matter of course, there was the Jewish cult, the mother religion of Christianity, with the voluntary reader of the synagogue as the possible model for the singer. However, not all Christian converts were born Jews, but instead were familiar with other cultic rites.

The following survey of the cultic environment of the ancient Church serves as an introduction to music and hierarchy in other cults which were active simultaneously with the spread of Christianity. The first part of the survey describes a selection of heathen cults while the second concentrates on Judaism. In addressing these themes, I have primarily used reference literature, and for two reasons, namely, the vastness of the subject matter, and the need to limit the number of pages I considered proper for this survey, in proportion to the length of the entire study.

In examining the relevant cults, I have sought for an answer to two questions: who attended the musical elements of the cult, and what kind of relationship did he, or they, have with the hierarchy of the cult? The minutiae of numerous remote cults appear laborious to read owing to the plethora of the foreign nomenclature. The section is also considerably burdened with footnotes owing to details requiring further explanation. However, the patient reader will become acquainted with the circumstances which surrounded the ancient Church, and to which the Church also had to pay attention every now and then.

---

<sup>15</sup> Cf. Clauss 1999, 424; 2000, 172.

## 1.2 Music and hierarchy in other cults

### 1.2.1 Heathen cults

#### The role of musicians in the Roman state cult

The pantheon of the Romans consisted of numerous divinities whose cults were maintained by priests and other officials. The sacrifices and other ceremonies pertaining to the Roman state religion observed strictly prescribed traditions and rules. Every detail of an individual act had to be perfect: were an error to occur at any moment during it, the whole process had to be repeated as expiation. However, an error discovered and corrected was not as bad as an error passing unnoticed. The requirement of perfection was imperative because the public rites concerned the well-being of the state. In Roman thinking, the relationship between humankind and the divinities was one of mutual agreement: to faultless rites, the gods would respond rightly.<sup>16</sup>

One of the basic elements of Roman society were associations called guilds (*collegia*). The origin of the college system is attributed to Numa Pompilius, the second king of Rome (715-673 BCE). Among his administrative renovations was the establishment of trade and priest guilds. The statutory law concerning these colleges was written in the oldest Roman code, the Law of the Twelve Tables (ca. 450 BCE). It gave citizens the right to assemble and organize freely within the limits of the public and the civil law.<sup>17</sup>

One of the most ancient of the trade guilds was the college of the Roman flute players (*collegium tibicinum Romanorum*), the flute (*tibia*) being the national instrument of the Romans. Its sound was considered to be protective against

---

16 This kind of religious thinking is very different from Judaism and Christianity. As stated by Watson 1992, 84: "It had no theology." See also Wille 1967, 37-38; Litzen 2009, 45ff.

17 XII Tables VIII, II, Scott XII, 72. For the Law of the Twelve Tables and Numa, see e.g. AKK 2000, 247, 372.

harmful noises and evil powers. The role of the playing, as well as the solemn character of the cultic rituals, is seen in the following citation:

Besides, other words are for consulting, others for repelling, others for praise, and we see that the highest magistrates have supplicated fixed prayers and, that none of the words would be omitted or said in an erroneous order, someone shall recite them from the script and another shall keep guard, still another is appointed to keep the silence, and the flute-player shall play so that nothing else is heard.<sup>18</sup>

Although the skill of the *tibicines* was essential at the rites, their pay was small, equalling the wage of a public crier (*praeco*). In rank, they were freedmen.<sup>19</sup> Their guild was administered by masters (*magistri*), the number of which varied from two to ten, with a quinquennial term. A member could be elected *magister* twice, and during his term, he used the name of some divinity. The *tibicines* celebrated their trade festival yearly with processions and a banquet in the temple of Jupiter on the Capitol. The college also had a permanent meeting place (*schola*).<sup>20</sup>

The flute players were, however, considered craftsmen compared with the players of the sacred trumpets (*tubicines sacrorum populi Romani*), who could receive the status of priest. The straight trumpets (*tubae*) were used at the most

---

18 Pliny, *Historia naturalis* 28.3.11, transl. in Watson 1992, 109<sup>5</sup>. The Natural History is the only preserved work of Pliny the Elder (23-79 CE). It was a current encyclopedia well into the Middle Ages, and is still an important document of the scientific thinking of antiquity. AKK 2000, 432-433.

19 Fleischhauer 1998, 376; 2001, 607. The Roman population consisted of freeborn persons – patricians, i.e. the Roman hereditary nobility, and plebeians – freedmen, and slaves. For their civil rights and social status, see Kaser 1968, 66ff.; AKK 2000, 252, 408, 432. The public criers proclaimed the orders of the government officials, and announced public meetings and spectacles. They belonged to the lowest class of public assistants and were often freedmen. AKK 2000, 452. According to an inscription from 44 BCE, the crier's salary was 300 *sestertii*. Wille 1967, 359. For the order of magnitude of this sum, see note 23 below.

20 The flutists also accompanied dirges and funeral processions. Scott 1957, 407-408, 410; Wille 1967, 33, 37; Fleischhauer 2001, 607.

solemn occasions: at imperial sacrifices, and at the purification of arms at the end of the war season.<sup>21</sup>

On the battlefield, musicians were considered non-commissioned officers. During the reign of Emperor Septimius Severus (193-211 CE), military instrumentalists – *bucinatores*, *cornicines* and *tubicines* – were permitted to form their own guilds.<sup>22</sup> According to sources from Northern Africa, the guilds were of considerable size: one guild of *cornicines* had thirty-five members, and another, of *tubicines*, thirty-seven. To become a member of either of the guilds, one had to pay a fee, the amount of which was double the applicant's annual salary. The fee was a sort of insurance against possible accidents or retirement. The guild's funds were also used to pay for the sacrifices of the guild, and the upkeep of the *schola*.<sup>23</sup>

Performing the rites perfectly did not presuppose, let alone allow, any personal emphases. The musical elements of the ceremonies were not aimed at entertaining or arousing emotions among the hearers.<sup>24</sup> The musicians served the sacred under the authority of priests and government officials.<sup>25</sup>

---

21 Wille 1967, 31-32. The trumpets themselves were purified twice a year.

22 The *bucinatores* blew curved trumpets (*bucinae*), also known as *lituus*. The instrument of the *cornicines* was the horn (*cornu*). The instruments were used for signalling and goading one's own troops, and daunting enemies. Wille 1967, 360; Fleischhauer 1998, 377-378; 2001, 607-608.

23 The sum for admittance to the guild was 750 *denarii* which makes the annual salary 375 *denarii*. We may note that the salary of a tibicen in the 1<sup>st</sup> cent. BCE was calculated in *sestertii*, a sesterce being one fourth of a *denarius*. Wille 1967, 360-361; Lewis and Short 1993, 1685; Fleischhauer 1998, 378; 2001, 608.

24 In inscriptions, the flute players are defined simply as "being present at the sacred worship" (*tubicines qui sacris publicis praesto sunt*). Wille 1967, 31-34.

25 Beside wind, stringed instruments were also used. All the groups of instrumentalists formed trade guilds, and a common college of flutists and players of strings (*collegium tubicinum et fidicinum romanorum*) is known to have existed. It was possibly the same as the sacred *collegium symphonicorum*. Vocal music was also used, the tradition of choir singing having been common since the pre-Christian era. The singing of young people, especially, was considered effective against all evil; it was used, e.g., in the cult of the emperor. Wille 1967, 47ff., 358-360; Fleischhauer 2001, 607.

## Roman priestly colleges

The Roman state religious apparatus included eight colleges of priests.<sup>26</sup> The priests were public officials in charge of keeping the cult of the divinity, or several divinities, assigned to them. For this purpose, they had the right to use public slaves and musicians; the *tibicen* in the above quotation probably attended a sacrifice of the *Pontifices*. This was the noblest of the colleges, originating from the reign of King Numa.<sup>27</sup>

The *Pontifices* controlled the larger part of the cultic life of Rome, having in their possession knowledge of all the divinities and the exact performance of rituals. Their archive included the formulae of prayers and invocations (*carmina*).<sup>28</sup> The Pontiffs had the right to interpret the Law of the Twelve Tables and to calculate the calendar, a process which was kept secret until the beginning of the fourth century CE.<sup>29</sup> In a word, the *Collegium Pontificum* maintained the traditions of Rome.

The organization of the trade guilds of the musicians, introduced above, was simple and clear: their masters were elected for a term, and the total number of members seems to have varied. In the priestly colleges, the number of the members and the requirements laid down for them were strictly prescribed. Only freeborn citizens without physical deficiencies were accepted, and at the time of

---

26 The eight colleges were ranked as higher and lower. The higher group were the *Pontifices*, *Augures*, *Quindecimviri sacris faciundis* and *Septemviri Epulones*, and the lower group were the *Fratres Arvales*, *Salii*, *Fetiales*, and *Titii*. The number of *collegia* is said to have corresponded to the number of items in the religious legislation of King Numa. Watson 1992, 89.

27 Wille 1967, 33. The word *Pontifices* means bridge constructors. It may derive from the building of the earliest bridge over the Tiber, the *Pons Sublicius*, constructed solely of wood. Szemler 1978, 334-340.

28 The word *carmen* has several meanings from a simple song to prophesy and incantation. Wille 1967, 38ff. See note 46 below.

29 Szemler 1978, 362ff.; Watson 1992, *passim*; Gordon 2001, 135-136.

their entering the *collegium*, both their parents had to be alive. Membership was usually for life, and new members were elected by co-optation.<sup>30</sup>

The structure of the *Pontifices* is the most complicated example of the priest colleges. The head of the *collegium* was the supreme pontiff (*pontifex maximus*) who was elected for life and considered inviolable.<sup>31</sup> Below him were sixteen major, and three minor pontiffs.<sup>32</sup> Also belonging to the college were the religious king (*rex sacrorum*) and three high priests (*flamines maiores*).<sup>33</sup> These, together with twelve lower flamens, represented the most ancient stratum of the Roman religion.<sup>34</sup> Further, the six Vestal virgins were subordinate to the *pontifex maximus*.<sup>35</sup>

As mentioned above, the colleges of priests had the right to use professional musicians at their solemnities. However, two of the lower *collegia* had specific musical rites performed by the priests themselves. The rite of the *Salii* priests is attributed to King Numa:

He likewise chose twelve *Salii* for Mars Gradivus, and granted them the distinction of wearing the embroidered tunic and over it a bronze breastplate, and of bearing the divine shields which men call *ancilia*,

---

30 Szemler 1978, 341, 351; Watson 1992, 9.

31 All emperors, from Augustus in 12 BCE to Valentinian in 375 CE, held the office of *pontifex maximus*. After the division of the Empire, the title was adopted by the bishop of Rome in the West. In the East, the emperor held it until the 6<sup>th</sup> century. Szemler 1978, 347; AKK 2000, 446.

32 *Pontifices maiores* and *pontifices minores*. The origin of the latter is not known. They worked as secretaries, and their presence was required at college functions. Their title was preserved until the end of the 3<sup>rd</sup> century CE. Szemler 1978, 338-339.

33 *Flamen* is the common noun for the Roman priest. The *flamines maiores* were dedicated to Jupiter (*flamen Dialis*), Mars (*flamen Martialis*), and Quirinus (*flamen Quirinalis*). They were appointed by the *pontifex maximus* and were of patrician origin. The life of the *flamen Dialis*, in particular, was strictly controlled. Prescendi 1998, 537.

34 The divinities served by the *flamines minores* are no longer known; cf. Szemler 1978, 343. Prescendi 1998, 537-539, remarks that although the original number of the *flamines minores* might have been reduced in the Christian era, the cult of the emperor produced new flaminates.

35 Szemler 1978, 342ff.; Watson 1992, 6.

while they proceeded through the City, chanting their hymns to the triple beat of their solemn dance.<sup>36</sup>

These processions through the city occurred at the beginning and at the end of the war season, which lasted from March to October.<sup>37</sup> At fixed stops on the route of the procession, the *Salii* performed the sacred weapon dance.<sup>38</sup> The dance was led by a foredancer (*praesul*) and a singer (*vates*).<sup>39</sup> In the last centuries of the practice of the cult, the text of the ancient songs was no longer understood; however, it could not be changed, lest it should lose its magic power. The definition given to the dance (*cum tripudiis*) has been connected with rhythmic stamping of the feet. The rhythm may have consisted of three beats at a time; possibly the dance also included parts which were performed three times.<sup>40</sup>

The college of the *Salii* consisted of twelve priests who were patricians, i.e. they belonged to the Roman nobility. The *magister* of the college was elected for one year, and the other named officials were the *praesul* and the *vates*. If a *Salii* priest became a member of another guild of priests, he had to leave the *Salii*.<sup>41</sup>

---

36 Livy I, 1, XX, transl. by Foster 1967, 71. According to the tradition, the first of the divine shields had fallen from heaven. Geiger 1920, 1874ff; about the uniform of the *Salii*, *ibid.* 1885-1886.

37 The *Salii* took also part at least to the second *tubilustrium*, the purification of the sacred trumpets. Geiger 1920, 1887-1890.

38 The name of the college was derived from the verb *salio*, meaning to leap or to dance. Geiger 1920, 1890; Wille 1967, 44. Weapon dances are considered the core of the Roman art of dance, the origin of which is attributed to the first king of Rome, Romulus, himself. Wille 1967, 187-188.

39 *Vates* was the title of an honoured wise man, who could be a poet or a prophet. At times of epidemics, a *vates* proclaimed appeals and prayers to expel the disease. Wille 1967, 188-189, 247, 443; Fleischhauer 1998, 376. A 5<sup>th</sup> century inscription of bishop Ticianus refers to him with the title *vates Christi*. ILCV I, 198, no. 1041.

40 The text was written in the oldest Roman metre, called *numerus Saturnius*. Wille 1967, 44-45, 150; Lewis and Short 1993, 1901.

41 Geiger 1920, 1878; Wille 1967, 358; Szemler 1978, 347; Fleischhauer 1998, 376. There are allusions to young maidens (*saliae virgines*) as well as to a boys' choir in connection with the *Salii*. Choirs of young people, especially in processions, had become popular at Rome by the second century BCE. Wille 1967, 47-49. See also Quasten 1973, 135; Geiger 1920, 1879.

The other *collegium* with a musical characteristic was the Arval Brethren (*Fratres Arvales*). It was constituted later than the colleges introduced above.<sup>42</sup> The Arvals kept the cult of Dea Dia to secure the year's crop, celebrating their festival at sowing time in May.<sup>43</sup> The festival lasted three days, consisting of a procession, sacrifices, and assemblies at the temple of the college as well as banquets at the house of the *magister*. During the official part of the rites, the Brethren wore specific garments.<sup>44</sup> As to matters financial, the state paid one hundred *denarii* to each of the Brethren who was present at the feast.<sup>45</sup>

During the ritual at the temple, the priests danced the *tripudium* and sang their song (*carmen Arvale*). The structure of the song consisted of lines directed to tutelar deities (*lares*), Mars, and Dea Dia. Each line was sung three times. The invocation was completed with a fivefold praise of Mars, securing his protection for the crops.<sup>46</sup> To avoid mistakes, the song was sung from books which were distributed to the priests by attendants (*acolytes*). An inscription indicates that at the performance of the song, the priests were formed into groups, probably for alternate singing.<sup>47</sup>

The number of the Arval Brethren was twelve, and the officials of the college were elected annually: a *magister* and a *flamen*, and a substitute for each of

---

42 The Arval Brethren were established in the 4<sup>th</sup> century BCE at the latest, but vanished during the Republic, and was subsequently restored by Augustus. Scheid 1997, 68; Watson 1992, 39.

43 Between the first and the second day of the festival was one day without ceremonies, as both days had to fall on an odd day; the second day was the climax of the feast. The festival days were announced by the Brethren in January. Wissowa 1896, 1473-1474; Scheid 1997, 67; Fleischhauer 2001, 607.

44 Wissowa 1896, 1475.

45 Syme 1980, 112. Unfortunately, my sources do not extend to the payments concerning the other *collegia*. Metzmacher 1924, 36, makes a connection between the *sportulae* of the Arval Brethren and the two gold coins (*solidi*) distributed by the archbishop to the clerics during the liturgy, as described in the Ordinaries of Laon and Reims, roughly a millennium after the time treated here.

46 Wille 1967, 39, 46; Graf 1997, 988. The various elements of the *carmen* aimed to alert the divinity to prayers: the god was called by name, and his deeds were praised. Quasten 1954, 902.

47 Inscr. Frat. Arv. 41. "*Sacerdotes clusi succincti libellis acceptis carmen descendentes tripodaverunt.*" Wille 1967, 39, 46. Cf. Abraham 1979, 42.

them. Every member had a personal servant (*calator*) chosen from among one's own slaves; the college also had use of slaves owned by the state.<sup>48</sup> The verger (*aedituus*) of the temple was probably a slave as well. Four adolescent boys of patrician rank also belonged to the *collegium*. Their duties included taking part in meals and assisting in some minor tasks.<sup>49</sup>

The archaic rituals of the Roman priest *collegia* flourished well into the Christian centuries; the latest mentions of the Arval Brethren are recorded in the first half of the fourth century.<sup>50</sup>

### **Features of some Hellenistic and Egyptian cults<sup>51</sup>**

Dea Dia, the goddess worshipped by the Arval Brethren, was also known by the name of Ceres and, in the Hellenistic world, as Demeter. Initially, her mysteries were performed only at Eleusis, which was the site chosen by Demeter herself. However, the cult had been adopted at Athens already around the middle of the last pre-Christian millennium. There it came to resemble a public cult, which also spread across the Mediterranean to Egypt.<sup>52</sup>

The officials of the cult belonged to two Eleusinian families: the main priest (*hierophantēs*) was from the family of Eumolpidai. The torchbearer (*dadouchos*) and the herald of the sacred (*hierokēryx*) were members of the family of Kerykes. All officials were appointed for life: the torchbearer was drawn by lot,

---

48 *Calatores* were, especially, servants of the priests. They were usually freedmen, and their duties included preparing the sacrifices and assisting at them. Klauser 1957, 908.

49 "*Pueri ingenui patrimi et matrimi senatorum filii*." Wissowa 1896, 1470-1471; Wille 1967, 358.

50 Scheid 1997, 68.

51 The cults treated in this section were mysteriological in character, but as this chapter does not enter into their particulars, a general title seems proper. The popularity of these cults was based on their rituals, 'liturgy'; cf. Schmemmann 1975, 83.

52 Pakkanen 1996, 31ff; Klauck 2000, 91.

and the herald was elected. At the initiation of new members, a priestess, titled according to the goddess Demeter and her daughter Kore, had an important role. The mysteries were supervised by a king (*basileios*) – who, according to the most ancient sources was elected annually – and a council of overseers.<sup>53</sup> The mysteries were financed by the members and the initiates; treasurers (*tamiai*) dealt with the actual monetary transactions. Also, a scribe (*grammateus*) was needed. The existing documents on the Eleusinian mysteries mention a number of minor officials, including hymn leaders (*hymnagōgoi*).<sup>54</sup>

Hymn singers (*hymnologoi*) were essential in most cults, for example for the rites of the Phrygian divinity Cybele.<sup>55</sup> In general, the musical elements of the cults seem to have been of two kinds. On the one hand, they included noisy and even violent use of the human voice and instruments, and on the other, the singing of solemn hymns, paeans.<sup>56</sup> In the mystery religions, the role of music was to purify and to propitiate, and also to banish demons.<sup>57</sup> The instruments were mostly wind instruments and percussion.<sup>58</sup>

---

53 The epigraphical evidence concerning both the *hierophantēs* and the *dadouchoi* extends until the latter half of the 4<sup>th</sup> century CE. At Athens, the council of the *epimēletai* consisted of ten men, one from each tribe. At Eleusis, the overseers were called *epistatai*. Burkert 1987, 37; Pakkanen 1996, 35ff.

54 Pakkanen 1996, 38ff.

55 Cybele was known to Romans as *Magna Mater*. AKK 2000, 286, 330.

56 The instrumentalists, at least, were professionals. Wille 1967, 60; Fleischhauer 2001, 607. The *paeans* were originally connected with Apollo, the protector of the arts. Price 1999, 37, mentions an association of Apollo-worshipping singers who made a procession from Miletos to Didyma, one of the most important cult sites of the divinity. The earliest evidence of Greek singer associations derives from the end of the 2<sup>nd</sup> century BCE. Wille 1967, 365; AKK 2000, 44.

57 At the initiation rites of the cult of Dionysus (the Latin Bacchus), a company of instrumentalists was needed to mask the cries caused by the pain of physical injuries. Wille 1967, 53. Temple singers and musicians belonged to the cults of Cybele, Dionysus, and Isis. Fleischhauer 2001, 607.

58 Of the wind instruments, we shall note the Phrygian or berecynthic *tibia* in the cult of Cybele; it had two pipes of unequal length. In the cult of Isis, the main instrument was the *sistrum*, a bright-sounding metal clapper rattled by the priests. Wille 1967, 54-58; Sendrey 1974, 38, 42-43; Fleischhauer 2001, 607.

The administrative model of the Eleusinian mysteries was common to many of the Hellenistic cults. The associations (*thiasoi* or *eranoi*) resemble the model of the Roman colleges: their masters were annually elected, and the organization usually included a council of commissioners, a treasurer, a secretary and, naturally, servants.<sup>59</sup>

Written words which were considered sacred (*hieroi logoi*) were essential in several cults, e.g. in the cult of Dionysus, among the Orphics, and in the Egyptian Isis cult.<sup>60</sup>

In the temples of Egypt, worship was conducted daily. The priests were occupied not only with sacrifices and rituals but with tending the statues of the gods in which the divinities were thought to reside. The permanent temple personnel consisted of higher ranks, lower ranks and simple servants.<sup>61</sup> The total number of officials was probably rather small. The most important of them were the high priest and the reader.<sup>62</sup> The office of the high priest, at least, was hereditary.<sup>63</sup> Ample pictorial evidence and archeological findings testify to the use of instruments and groups of musicians since ancient times; the temple musicians belonged to the priestly rank or to the nobility.<sup>64</sup>

---

59 Burtchaell 1992, 265-266. For the difference between *thiasoi* and *eranoi*, see Pakkanen 1996, 47-48.

60 The Orphic mysteries emerged in the middle of the last millennium BCE, whence the works attributed to Orpheus derive. Of these have been preserved, from the 2<sup>nd</sup> century CE, twenty-four rhapsodies, i.e. sacred orations, and eighty-seven Orphic hymns. Calane 2000, 59-60, 63; AKK 2000, 386.

61 Burkert 1987, 38-39. Cf. Quasten 1941, 149; Idelsohn 1948, 4; Sendrey 1974, 37ff.

62 Farmer 1957, 259, who also mentions an "hour priesthood" of laymen. Cf. p. 37 for the Jewish *mishmarot*.

63 This particular detail is mentioned by the historian Herodotus in the 5<sup>th</sup> century BCE: "Many (not one alone) are dedicated to the service of each god. One of these is the high priest; and when a high priest dies his son succeeds to his office." (Herodotus I, 321, transl. by A. D. Godley.) Sendrey 1974, 40, states that the first dynasty of musicians originated in Egypt.

64 This is a rather broad generalization, as the time span in the literature is very long, beginning from the 3<sup>rd</sup> millennium BCE. For further details, see e.g. Quasten 1941, 149; 1973, 65, 67; Idelsohn 1948, 4; Farmer 1957, 258ff.; Wille 1967, 63-65; Sendrey 1974, 37ff.; Fleischhauer 2001, 607.

In the beginning of the third century CE, Clement of Alexandria<sup>65</sup> recorded an Egyptian cultic procession to illuminate the "peculiar philosophy" of the nation. His description does not define whether the procession concerned a specific divinity, but the details of the text refer to the secret literature attributed to Hermes Trismegistos.<sup>66</sup> The first to arrive was the singer (*ōdos*) carrying "some symbol of music".<sup>67</sup> He had to master two books of Hermes: one with the hymns to the gods, and the other on the regulations concerning the life of the king. The singer was followed by the astrologer, likewise with the symbols of his profession. Also belonging to the procession were the sacred scribe, the dresser, and the prophet, who was the governor of the temple. All of them had to be erudite on the books of Hermes, which numbered forty-two.<sup>68</sup> What happened after the arrival of the procession remains unknown; as no priests are mentioned, the procession probably preceded the rituals proper.

The youngest cult to be treated here is the cult of Mithras, which came into the Roman Empire from Persia during the first century CE. It spread primarily through the military, and all its members were male, mostly soldiers and lower civil servants, who were freedmen or slaves. The cult included seven grades of initiation. These were trials demanding purity, self-discipline, and total obedience.<sup>69</sup>

---

65 Clement of Alexandria (ca.150-ca.215) was converted to Christianity, and became one of the Greek Fathers of the Church. His writings show thorough erudition both in philosophy and in theology. ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 364.

66 The identity of Hermes Trismegistos has been defined as a later and syncretistic manifestation of the herald of the Greek pantheon, Hermes (the Latin Mercury). AKK, 211. He might also be the Hellenistic version of Thoth, the Egyptian divinity of knowledge and wisdom, also considered the inventor of music. Farmer 1957, 257.

67 Clemens Alexandrinus, *Stromata* VI. Cap. IV: "[...] πρῶτος μὲν γὰρ προέρχεται ὁ ᾠδός, ἐν τι τῶν τῆς μουσικῆς ἐπιφερόμενος συμβόλων. Τοῦτόν φασι δύο βίβλους ἀνειληφέναι δεῖν ἐκ τῶν Ἑρμοῦ· ὧν θάτερον μὲν ὕμνους περιέχει θεῶν, ἐκλογισμὸν δὲ βασιλικοῦ βίου τὸ δεύτερον. [...]" PG IX, 253A.

68 According to Farmer 1957, 277, the text can not be based on subjective experience, but the sources used by Clement can be identified.

69 The grades were called Raven (*Corax*), Griffin or Male Bride (*Gryphus* or *Nymphus*), Soldier (*Miles*), Lion (*Leo*), Persian (*Perses*), Courier of the Sun (*Heliodromus*), and Father (*Pater*). They were connected with the planets: Mercury, Venus, Mars, Jupiter,

Mithras was the god of light: at Rome, he was called the Invincible Sun Mithras (*Sol invictus*). His followers convened in subterranean caves or cave-like sanctuaries, lit by candles. Incense was burned, and prayers and invocations were intensified with magical effects. These could be vocal, like combinations of vowels, or whistling, clicking with the tongue, even bellowing.<sup>70</sup> At the assemblies, the great story of Mithras killing the bull was narrated, and a meal of bread and wine was shared by the members.<sup>71</sup>

Mithraism and Christianity share similarities, of which the celebration of Sunday – the day of the sun – and the common meal were the most obvious. The vocal effects bear a resemblance to the later *jubilus*, sung with vowels only.<sup>72</sup>

### **The professional musicians of theatre and entertainment**

Finally, we shall consider the trade guilds of the professional musicians of the theatre and other entertainments.<sup>73</sup> The theatre musicians did not enjoy the

---

Moon, Sun, and Saturn. The Father supervised the initiations to all grades. According to the preserved inscriptions, most members were not initiated further than into the first grade. Burkert 1987, 99; Meyer 1987, 200ff.; Clauss 2000, 133ff. Although women could not partake in the cult, there are some indications of the existence of a sort of 'nuns' of Mithras. Wüst 1932, 2144.

70 Some examples of such vocal effects are the seven Greek vowels (*AEHOYΩ*), and the vowels of the Hebrew name of God, Yahweh, the effect of which could be strengthened by manipulation: IAO OAI AIO. See Meyer 1987, 211ff., where the text of the so-called Mithras Liturgy from ca. 300 CE is presented. Clauss 2000, 107-108; Klauck 2000, 230-231. Cf. Wellesz 1961, 64ff.

71 The bull was essential in the cult of Mithras. In one of the initiation rites, a bull was slaughtered over a pit containing the initiand. The *taurobolium* was also a part of the cult of Cybele. Burkert 1987, 6, 98; Clauss 2000, 31. A meal of bread and wine, uniting the partakers with each other and with the divinity, was familiar in many religions long before Christianity. Wüst 1932, 2146-2147; Clauss 2000, 108-109; Castrén 2011, 471.

72 The roots of the *jubilus* may also derive from the Jewish singing tradition. Cf. Bayer 2007, 281.

73 Musicians performed at the public games (*ludi*), which were a common amusement on the numerous festival days in the Roman calendar. The games did not need to be

esteem of the cult musicians: on the contrary, their profession rendered them dishonourable (*infames*). They did not possess full civil rights but were, however, permitted to form trade guilds.<sup>74</sup>

Greek dramatic art had been prominent in Rome since the second century BCE, and evidence of associations of Greek singers (*societates cantorum Graecorum*) has also been found in other cities in Italy. The guild of the Greek-originated artists was named after Dionysus (*Dionysiaci artifices*) and it provided programme for all kinds of festivities. The Roman artists called themselves actors of Apollo (*parasiti Apollinis*). A musicians' guild could also adopt its name from the instrument used, like the *collegium scabillariorum*, which is known to have existed in six cities of Italy, and was named after a sort of foot castanet (*scabellum*). The masters of the colleges were elected for five years at a time; the administrative overseers were called *curatores*. Guilds with a large membership were often divided into groups of ten (*decurions*).<sup>75</sup>

The professional musicians of antiquity, both those assisting at cultic rites and those entertaining on the stage, formed trade guilds, the organization of which followed the models general in society. Among the introduced cults, the members of the Roman priest colleges *Salii* and *Fratres Arvales* provided their own musical elements at their rites.

---

purely theatrical or musical in character to occupy the musicians; artistic items could be added in any sort of games. The games were financed by magistrates called *aediles*. The rank of the edile was one stage in the Roman administrative career (*cursus honorum*). AKK 2000, 311, 141, 113.

74 They had no right to appeal to the court neither in civil nor in criminal cases, and they could not serve in public office. The rank of *infames* also included e.g. condemned criminals, prostitutes, and procurers. Kaser 1968, 66; AKK 2000, 251.

75 Wille 1967, 361-364; Fleischhauer 2001, 609.

## 1.2.2 Music and hierarchy in Judaism

### The service in the Temple of Jerusalem

The preamble to the music of the Temple of Jerusalem may be considered to have happened in the time of the Judges, calculated as ca. 1030 BCE.<sup>76</sup> According to the Old Testament, before anointing Saul, the first king over Israel, Samuel told him to go to Gibeah where he would "meet a band of prophets coming down from the shrine with harp, tambourine, flute, and lyre playing in front of them; they will be in a prophetic frenzy."<sup>77</sup> The procession of the prophets has been interpreted as a manifestation of an established educational system founded by Samuel with a teaching programme comprising the Law, Scriptures, and singing. The existence of such a school – even several of them – has been explained as a prerequisite for the existence of the trained choir and orchestra needed for the bringing of the Ark of the Covenant to Jerusalem. The school would have lost its position after the establishment of the Temple, where the education of the Levite musicians was arranged from then onwards.<sup>78</sup>

The existence of prophet schools as organized institutions is disputable. While the educational purposes of the leaders of the people of Israel are evident in the Old Testament books, the particulars concerning the instruction of the supposed educational institutions of prophets are mere assumptions. However, guilds of prophets are apparent in the time of Samuel. The prophets were not merely seers filled with the divine spirit but professionals who attended public events.<sup>79</sup>

---

76 Levinson 1992, 135.

77 1 Sam 10:5. The translation is from NRSV 1989.

78 Sendrey 1974, 94ff., defines the school of the prophets as "the first public music school in human history", with the emphasis on the word 'public', as musical education in ancient Mesopotamia and Egypt was available for the priestly class only. Werner 1980, 617, states that "the roving 'bands of prophets' (1 Sam 10:5) seem to have produced hardly more than organized noise."

79 McCurdy 1906, 213-214; Sendrey 1974, 246-247. Cf. 2 Kings 2:3-7, where fifty pupils of the prophet are mentioned. The Hebrew expression 'sons of the prophets'

Literatim, in 1 Sam the instruments 'are playing in front of' the prophets, not 'played by' the prophets themselves. However, 1 Chron, describing the situation some generations later, states that the musicians of the Temple of Jerusalem were appointed "to prophesy with lyres, harps, and cymbals".<sup>80</sup> This is not to say that they would all have been considered prophets as seers; rather, it refers to the possibility of entering into a state of ecstasy through music.<sup>81</sup>

The musicians of the Temple were members of the tribe of Levi, which was appointed to Temple service, only the descendants of Aaron being entitled to the priesthood.<sup>82</sup> The title Levites usually refers to those who served as musicians and gatekeepers, with no direct connection with the actual performance of the offerings. The priests were in every respect superior to the Levites, and they also had the right to participate in their duties.<sup>83</sup> In the Mishnah, the instrumentalists are called "the servants of the priests".<sup>84</sup>

The Temple of Jerusalem was the sole site where offerings were officially allowed.<sup>85</sup> The sacrificial service was celebrated every day between dawn and sunset, beginning and ending with the common offerings (*tamid*).<sup>86</sup> During the

(בְּנֵי־הַנְּבִיאִים) is in NRSV 1989 translated as "the company of prophets".

80 1 Chron 25.

81 Paul and Sperling 2007, 569-571, who also refer to 2 Chron 29:30, 35:15.

82 This is the most simplified definition of the matter. For a discussion on the priesthood in Israel, see Haran 1978a, 1070-1073; further, it is possible that the family of Aaron did not belong to the tribe of Levi, *ibid.* 1083. See also Foley 1996, 36.

83 This was the situation in the era of the Second Temple. Before Exile, the standing of the Levites may have been higher. Safrai 1978, 970-971. The lesser tasks of the Temple were entrusted to two non-Israelite groups, the Gibeonites and Nethinim. For the Gibeonites, see Joshua 9. The origin of the Nethinim is disputable. Levine 1978, 552-553.

84 M Arakhin 2:3-6, Neusner 1988, 811-812. Safrai 1978, 978-979. The rabbinic literature preserving the particulars of the Judaic cult was written a considerable time after the destruction of the Temple. The Mishnah, i.e. the oral law of the Jews, was completed in its written form towards the end of the 2<sup>nd</sup> century CE. Neusner 1988, xv-xvi; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 1092, 659.

85 Jerusalem had become the cult centre of Yahweh in the 7<sup>th</sup> century BCE, but monotheism really prevailed only after the Babylonian exile. Lauha 1991, 5-12. As to the sole offering-place, cf. Joh 4:20-21.

86 The word נָמִיד has meanings of continuing, established, and perpetual; the word was used also of the shewbread which lay constantly in the temple. Fürst 1889, 635.

day, individual sacrifices were made, except on Sabbaths, new moons and festivals, when they were replaced with an 'additional sacrifice' (*musaf*), and the specific offerings of the festival.<sup>87</sup>

The Temple day began with the opening of the gates, at which the priests sounded the trumpets.<sup>88</sup> When the preparations for the *tamid* were completed – the separate duties were drawn by lot – one of the priests gave a signal with an instrument called the *magrefah*. It was thrown between the porch and the altar, and it produced a loud noise.<sup>89</sup> Hearing it, the priests and the Levites took their stand which, for the latter, was on a platform.<sup>90</sup> When the high priest was ready to offer the libation, two other priests blew their trumpets. At the moment of the libation, the cymbals were clashed and the Levites began to sing. At each break in the singing, the trumpets were sounded and the people prostrated themselves.<sup>91</sup>

---

For particulars concerning the *tamid*, see M Tamid, Neusner 1988, 863ff. Safrai 1978, 975.

87 Every Israelite was obliged to make offerings at certain occasions of his life; besides these, voluntary sacrifices were common. Gentiles were also allowed to bring sacrifices. Safrai 1978, 972ff.

88 M Arakhin 2:4, Neusner 1988, 812. The trumpets are always mentioned in the plural; the minimum number was two. Cf. Smith 1962, 139; Haran 1978a, 1077; Safrai 1978, 975; Levinson 1992, 135; Braun 2001, 34-35.

89 The original wording also allows us to understand that it was not a question of throwing but 'making a noise' on the *magrefah*. It is described as an instrument in the shape of a shovel, with ten pipes, and in each pipe ten holes; a little like an organ. Danby 1954, 585<sup>1</sup>, 587<sup>10</sup>. BT Arakhin 11 includes a discussion by rabbis about the shovel in the Temple which had produced a hundred different tunes. Goldschmidt 1981a, 672. Bayer 1978, 566, states that the *magrefah* was actually not an instrument at all, and its similarity with the organ was created by the sages of Talmud.

90 It was also a signal for the guard to see that unclean people stood where they were appointed to stand, at the Eastern gate. M Tamid 5:6, Neusner 1988, 870.

91 "At the break in the singing, they sounded a prolonged sound, and the people prostrated themselves. At every break in the singing was a prolonged blast, and at every prolonged blast, a prostration." M Tamid 7:3, Neusner 1988, 872. As to the blasts, another section of the Mishnah states that they were blown not with trumpets but with the *shofar*: during a *tamid* offering, the *shofar* was to be blown nine times. M Sukkah 5:5, Neusner 1988, 289-290. The *shofar* was the horn of a goat or a ram. For its possible origin and use, see Smith 1962, 136, 141; Sendrey 1974, 63; Lawergren 1997, 150, 164. After the destruction of the Temple, the *shofar* remained as the only instrument in cultic use, being used for signalling. Braun 2001, 35,

The minimum number of Levite musicians was twelve. According to the Mishnah, their main instruments were harps and flutes, the latter being played before the altar on twelve days of the year. The number of other instruments varied according to the day, but as percussion, a single pair of cymbals sufficed. The instrumentalists were adults while minor Levites could accompany the singing, "so as to add spice to the music".<sup>92</sup>

Each day of the week had a psalm of its own, as did all the festivals.<sup>93</sup> The particulars of the mode of presentation of the Temple psalmody – if it was choral unison, or responsorial, or antiphonal, or whether solos were frequently used – remain unknown to us. The emphasis, however, seems to have been more on ensemble than solo singing.<sup>94</sup> The Mishnah mentions one singer with technical virtuosity, though in an unfavourable sense: he did not want to instruct other singers in his vocal training method.<sup>95</sup>

As sacrifices were offered in the Temple throughout the day, the required number of priests was considerable – for the *tamid* alone, the number was thirteen. However, the number of priests and Levites who were entitled to serve at the Temple was many times higher. Further, the Israelites who did not belong to the tribe of Levi had the right to attend the sacrifices that were given for the nation. Both priests and Levites were divided into twenty-four divisions (*mishmarot*), and a similar division was made concerning all Israelites. One *mishmar* served twice a year, a week at a time. Those who did not live in Jerusalem travelled there for their turn of service; in fact, not all of the Israelites

---

remarks that the *shofar* first appears in iconography in the 2<sup>nd</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> centuries CE.

92 M Arakhin 2:3-6, Neusner 1988, 811-812. Safrai 1978, 978-979; Foley 1996, 37, on the significance of the number twelve.

93 M Tamid 7:4, Neusner 1988, 872-873. The respective Psalms from Sunday to Sabbath were the numbers 24, 48, 82, 94, 81, 93, and 92.

94 Foley 1996, 36-37.

95 M Shek. 5:1; M Yoma 3:11, Neusner 1988, 258, 270. Bayer 1978, 566. Cf. Idelsohn 1948, 18-19, who states that the Levites did not sing psalms only but also sections of the Pentateuch.

ever had the opportunity to perform their turn. Those who remained home, assembled at the times of the sacrifices to read certain sections of the Pentateuch.<sup>96</sup>

### **The hierarchy of the Temple**

The Temple of Jerusalem was not only a sanctuary: it was the national centre of Israel. The Great Sanhedrin, the supreme organ of judicial, political and religious matters concerning Palestine, was convened in the Temple. The president of the Sanhedrin was probably the high priest.<sup>97</sup> His second-in-command, and also the chief of the priests, was the prefect (*segan*), who supervised the daily sacrifices: it was he who gave the sign for the clashing of the cymbals which started the singing of the Levites.<sup>98</sup>

The title of the *segan*, as well as the other titles of the administrative personnel, derive from Persia or Assyria, and are of ancient origin.<sup>99</sup> The treasurers (*gizbarim*) assessed the value of the donations given to the Temple, and they received the tax payments; under Roman rule, the Jews continued to

---

96 The establishment of the divisions is narrated in 1 Chron 24-26; however, the information concerning the practice of the rotation is post-biblical. The *mishmarot* were further divided into subdivisions, 'houses' or 'families' (*batei avot*) which had their own leaders. It was strictly regulated which houses were to serve on each week. The *mishmar* which was present at the Temple was called the 'station', or 'standing men' (*ma'amad*). Liver and Sperber 1978, 89ff.; Foley 1982, 197.

97 The role of the Sanhedrin, and of the high priest as its leader is not an unambiguous question. The Sanhedrin is attested from the first decade of the Roman rule in Palestine until the end of the Jewish patriarchate ca. 425 CE. After the destruction of the Temple in 70 CE, the Sanhedrin convened in Jabneh. For more, see Mantel 1978, 836ff. The appointment of the high priest was, from Herod the Great (37-4 BCE) onwards, in the hands of the governing authorities. Instead of being lifelong, it became periodic. Later, the office of the high priest could even be bought. Avi-Yonah 1978, 959; Stern 1978a, 1087.

98 Haran 1978b, 1075; Safrai 1978, 973-974. The sign was given by waving the flag. Mishnah Tamid 7:3, Neusner 1988, 872. Goldschmidt 1981b, 314.

99 Safrai 1978, 970.

have the right to gather the annual tax of a half-shekel from male adults.<sup>100</sup> The treasurers provided for everything which was to be sacrificed, both at public and private offerings. The minimum number of treasurers was three while at least seven trustees (*amarkalim*) were needed as keepers of the keys of the storehouses. In control of the Temple treasury were two *catholici* whose title, with its Greek origin, remains obscure.<sup>101</sup> The rank order of the administrative officials below the high priest descended from the *catholici* to the *amarkalim*, the *gizbarim* occupying the lowest level.<sup>102</sup>

The archive, or the library of the Temple, preserved both the sacred scriptures and the national historical literature, employing scribes (*soferim*) and proofreaders. As the sacred texts required to be read correctly, familiarity with ancient manuscripts was essential. Thus, the scribes may rather be considered scholars.<sup>103</sup>

Priests and Levites received a thorough education in the performance of their duties. The required length of education for both the priests and the Levite musicians was five years. Although a youth of priestly rank was considered suitable for service at the Temple at the first physical signs of adolescence, he was not entrusted with any priestly duties before his twentieth birthday. The priests were authorized to act until 'old age' which, naturally, depended on the health and strength of the individual. The Levites, however, had to resign at the age of fifty years.<sup>104</sup>

Priests were not permitted to marry a divorced woman or a female with a questionable past, and the high priest was not to enter into matrimony with a widow. Consecration for the priesthood took seven days, and as a sign of

---

100 The right to assess a tax and to collect it autonomously, without the supervision of imperial magistrates, was an exceptional privilege. Burtchaell 1992, 222-223.

101 Safrai 1978, 973; Hüttenmeister 1990, 104<sup>120</sup>.

102 TJ Sheq. 49a, 35-44, Hüttenmeister 1990, 104.

103 Dov Gilat 1978, 79-81; Safrai 1978, 983-984.

104 BT Hulin I, vi, 2, Goldschmidt 1981a, 66-69. The section of Talmud is problematic because it partly concerns the time of the Tabernacle, and partly the Rabbinic era.

sanctity the priests had the right to wear linen robes.<sup>105</sup> During the reign of Agrippa II, the king of Judea in 53-100 CE, the Levites applied to him for permission to wear clothing similar to that of the priests. The singers also requested to be allowed to learn their songs by heart. Imposing on the vanity of the king, they assured that by this reform his name would be remembered. After consulting the Sanhedrin, the king gave his consent. Both concessions were against all traditions, and they were considered ominous.<sup>106</sup> The premonitions were realized when the uprising against Rome culminated in the destruction of the Temple in 70 CE. The offerings ceased from then on, and although the priests remained high in position, the Levites lost their occupation and standing immediately.<sup>107</sup>

### **The ancient synagogue service**

Since ancient times, the teaching of the Law had belonged to the priests. The sacrificial services of the Temple, however, did not include teaching.<sup>108</sup> The place of instruction was the synagogue, the core of each Jewish community. The Temple court also included a synagogue, which, it has been assumed, would have adopted some of the ritual practices of the Temple. These would then have been spread all over Israel and also in the diaspora by visitors, for instance by the members of the *mishmarot*.<sup>109</sup> However, the synagogue as an institution was not a branch of the Temple. The synagogues where the local assemblies met

---

105 Blidstein 1978, 1088; Haran 1978a, 1067-1068, 1081.

106 Josephus, *Jewish Antiquities*, XX, 216-218, Josephus IX, 1965, 502-504.

107 Sendrey 1974, 266-267.

108 Haran 1978b, 1080. In the liturgy preceding the offerings, the priests read the Ten Commandments, and the *Shema* (Deut 6:4-9, 11:13-21, and Num 15:37-41). Blessings for the people were also said. M Tam. 5:1; 7:3, Neusner 1988, 869, 872. Goldschmidt 1978, 393.

109 Safrai 1978, 983. For the diaspora during the Hellenistic-Roman period, see Stern 1978b, 8ff.

were secular in their character. This is supported by the Hebrew term *beth ha-knesset*, meaning 'a coming together', which, later, turned into 'a house of assembly'.<sup>110</sup>

The origin of the synagogue as an institution has remained obscure, although all Jewish sources claim its origin with Moses; this is also repeated in Acts 15:21. The obscurity lies not in the lack of alternatives but in their abundance: it has been stated that the provenance of the synagogue can be situated in all the historical periods of Israel, and in all regions where Jews have ever lived. One part of the problem is the wide use of the word in different connections; it is not until the first century BCE and the first century CE that the synagogue can be identified as an institution.<sup>111</sup>

The Gospel according to Luke narrates how Jesus of Nazareth went to the synagogue on the Sabbath. He was given the scroll of the prophet Isaiah from which he read a section. After returning the scroll to the servant of the synagogue (*hazzan*, Gr. *hypēretēs*), Jesus explained the prophecy.<sup>112</sup>

As is well known, Jesus had no official standing in the community. He was invited to read in the synagogue according to the same principle which entitled all Israelites to attend the public sacrifices in the Temple and to approach God. For the synagogue service to be performed, at least ten men had to be present.<sup>113</sup> At the beginning of the service, anyone of them could be chosen, by the ruler of the synagogue, to be the leader of the prayers and the reader of the Scriptures as the emissary of the community (*sheli'ah zibbur*).<sup>114</sup> This procedure was possible because all Jewish males were instructed to read.<sup>115</sup>

---

110 The primary sense of the word indicates an organized community. Burtchaell 1995, 202, 225; McKinnon 1986, 165.

111 Runesson 2003, 167, 316-317. Cf. Burtchaell 1995, 251.

112 Luke 4:16-22. The word *hazzan* is probably of Assyrian origin; there, *hazzunu* meant a director or an overseer. Foley 1982, 195.

113 M Megillah 4:3, Neusner 1988, 322.

114 Rabinowitz 1978, 583; Kublin 1978, 1542.

115 The instruction of children was considered a religious commandment. Even the synagogues of small communities maintained elementary schools which taught the

In the narration of Luke, Jesus explained the text which he had read. Naturally, not every reader was capable of that. The explanation was usually assigned to a priest or an elder.<sup>116</sup>

The rabbinic literature defines the principles of the reading at the synagogue service. The sections read in Hebrew were translated into the vernacular language. This was necessary not only in the Greek-speaking communities of the diaspora, but also in Palestine where the vernacular was Aramaic.<sup>117</sup> The translator was not allowed to read from a written translation, or to read in a louder voice than the reader.<sup>118</sup> To ensure the correctness of the translation, only one verse of the Torah was read and translated at a time. The Prophets were read in passages of three verses.<sup>119</sup>

At least on the Sabbath and on festivals, several readers were required.<sup>120</sup> Although the Torah could be read also by a minor,<sup>121</sup> the ideal reader would be "an experienced elder, who has children, and whose cupboard [house] is empty, so that his heart should be wholly in the prayer."<sup>122</sup> The reading of the Torah was

---

reading of the Torah and other sacred Scriptures. Older boys were also instructed in the oral law. Writing, however, was considered a professional skill, and it was not taught to everyone. Among the Jews, literacy was more common than elsewhere in Greco-Roman society. Gamble 1995, 7; Burtchaell 1995, 221. Cf. Foley 1982, 196. The Scriptures were written in *scriptio continua*, with no space between the words and also no punctuation; see Davies 1963, 10; Faivre 1977, 58-59; Gamble 1995, 203. Cf. Millard 1970, on the practice in Hebrew.

116 Precedence to read could also be given to a Levite. McKinnon 1986, 168. Cf. Faivre 1977, 58; Smith 1984, 4.

117 McKinnon 1986, 168; Burtchaell 1995, 222. In the diaspora, the Scriptures could be read directly in Greek without translation. Gamble 1995, 210.

118 Gamble 1995, 209.

119 Some sections were to be read only but not translated. M Megillah 4:10, Neusner 1988, 323-324. Gamble 1995, 210; Bradshaw 1992, 22.

120 M Megillah 4:2, Neusner 1988, 322. In the diaspora, only one reader sufficed. Gamble 1995, 211 and 325<sup>26</sup>.

121 M Megillah 4:6, Neusner 1988, 323. A minor was not allowed to read from the Writings, "the Scroll". Ibid. 2:4, Neusner 1988, 319.

122 M Taanit 2:2, Neusner 1988, 309.

executed on an elevated platform (*bimah*). The desk for reading other texts and prayers was sometimes situated below floor level.<sup>123</sup>

The Talmud requires of the reader a blameless life, a compliant character and a pleasant voice, with knowledge of both the biblical and rabbinical scriptures.<sup>124</sup> Vocal skills were required because the reading presupposed the use of a melody.<sup>125</sup> In the rabbinic literature, the matter is referred to by Rabbi Levi, who states: "Surely if one reads Scripture with proper sweetness and melody, it may be said of him, 'honey and milk are under your tongue.'"<sup>126</sup> Further, the practice of cantillating is commanded in the Talmud: "If one reads the Scripture without a melody or repeats the Mishnah without a tune, of him the Scripture says, *Wherefore I gave them also statutes that were not good* etc."<sup>127</sup>

The words 'melody' and 'tune' refer to the use of melodic accents to aid the memory. The question was not of remembering a 'melody' for musical reasons. The text written on the scroll did not contain punctuation: one had to know the structure of the text, and to master its accented and unaccented syllables, by which it became easier to understand and remember. The verse from Ezekiel seems to fit poorly with this idea. One explanation for the verse assumes that as the statutes themselves could not be considered as 'not good', the manner of the cantillation would have invited the rebuke. Readers whose voice was not pleasant, or who did not master the tradition, would thus have been the objects of the command.<sup>128</sup> The Ezekiel reference concerns, however, situations where scholars did not respect one another's opinions.<sup>129</sup>

---

123 M Megillah 4:1, Neusner 1988, 321. Idelsohn 1948, 105.

124 BT Taanit II, 16a. The English translation of the preceding section BT Taanit 16a reads: "[...] who is skilled in chanting, who has a pleasant voice, and possesses a thorough knowledge of the Torah, the Prophets and the Hagiographa, [...]". Epstein 1938, 76.

125 Bayer 1978, 577; Herzog 1978a, 1098.

126 Midrash Rabbah, The Song of Songs 4:25; Jacobson 2005, 11.

127 BT Megillah IV, 32a, Simon 1932, 194. The quotation is from Ezek 20:25.

128 Gamble 1995, 203, 225-226.

129 Simon 1932, 194; Goldschmidt 1933, 670.

To summarize, we may here consider the definition of Hanoch Avenary, regarding the character of the reading of the sacred texts:

Melodic enunciation has been connected with Bible recitation from the very beginning and has accompanied the Holy Scriptures through their translation into every tongue. Bible chant is the genuine expression of a spiritual concept and, as such, is opposed to the general trend of the Hellenistic period. Its restriction to a small range of notes and limited ornamentation is intentional, not "primitive", with the purpose of ensuring that the melody will never interfere with the perception of the words and the apprehension of their meaning and spiritual message.<sup>130</sup>

The principle of the text always taking priority over any musical elements is essential for the present study because the tradition of cantillation was adopted by the Christian Church.<sup>131</sup> But as to the time of Jesus, and to the time before the documentation of the oral law, we do not have detailed knowledge about cantillated reading in the synagogue service.<sup>132</sup> The written Talmud was formed centuries later, and the precise origin of the statutes given there is impossible to date.<sup>133</sup>

Before the destruction of the Temple, the synagogue service consisted of prayer, reading, and the homily.<sup>134</sup> There is no allusion to psalm singing in the synagogue in the texts of the Jewish authors in the first century CE, nor in the sources of the following centuries.<sup>135</sup> This is not to say that the Book of Psalms would never have been read but the practice of the Temple psalmody, with its instrumental accompaniment, had no place in the synagogue service. It is as late

---

130 Avenary 1978, 578. Cf. Idelsohn 1948, 35, 98; Herzog 1978a, 1098-1100.

131 Avenary 1978, 577, states that the Roman Church kept the practice in its original simplicity. In eastern Christendom, the tradition developed in the same way as in Judaism.

132 Gamble 1995, 226.

133 Smith 1984, 6. According to Idelsohn 1948, 103, the Megillah derives from the third century CE. None of the rabbis mentioned in the relevant section of the Talmud are mentioned in the Mishnah.

134 Runesson 2003, 377-378.

135 Smith 1984, 3ff.; McKinnon 1986, 159, 180-182; Foley 1996, 52ff., 74-75. Cf. Wellesz 1961, 34.

as after the completion of the Talmud – in the middle of the first Christian millennium – that indications of regular psalmody in the synagogue appear.<sup>136</sup>

However, the early synagogue liturgy included responses on the part of the people. The Talmud has preserved a detail concerning the great synagogue of Alexandria. It was so large that the moments of the responses had to be indicated with a cloth or a flag, waved by the *hazzan* standing on a platform in the middle of the synagogue.<sup>137</sup>

### **Musical practices of some Jewish communities in the first century CE**

Above, we have treated the public synagogue, membership of which was obligatory in the same way as belonging to an administrative district. There were also synagogues of a semi-public character, with a voluntary membership. These communities, generally called sects, did not exercise juridical or other public proceedings.<sup>138</sup>

One such voluntary-based group was that of the Essenes ('Healers'), evidently active in Palestine between the second century BCE and the second century CE. Their origin was urban; some of them lived outwardly in society while others dwelt in ascetic communities. In the first half of the first century CE, Philo of Alexandria described the Sabbath assembly at the synagogue of the Essenes. The service consisted of reading and homily, and the reader was a person other than the explainer, who is defined as being "of especial proficiency".<sup>139</sup>

---

136 McKinnon 1980, 84-85. The Babylonian Talmud was completed in the 6<sup>th</sup> century CE, but the compiling of the Talmud of Jerusalem remained unfinished in the 5<sup>th</sup> century. Lindroos 1992, 147, 153, 160-161.

137 BT Sukkah 51b, Goldschmidt 1933, 145. This testimony is early: the synagogue was destroyed during the reign of Emperor Trajan (98-117 CE). Rabinowitz 1978, 582. Cf. fn. 98 above.

138 Runesson 2003 *passim*, especially chapter 3, 213ff.

139 McKinnon 1986, 167, quotation from Philo, *Quod omnis probus liber sit*, 81-82.

The Essenes have been connected with the community of Qumran, in the vicinity of which the Dead Sea Scrolls were discovered. The contents of the Scrolls indicate an isolated community, and the preserved papyri include over two hundred psalm and hymn texts.<sup>140</sup>

As to the Egyptian community of the *Therapeutae* ('Devotees'), Philo depicted them as having dedicated themselves to prayer and study, primarily in solitude. When they assembled together, their supper at the feast was preceded and succeeded by the singing of hymns, which were "composed of many measures and set to many melodies". The hymns were sung in two choirs, one consisting of men and one of women, which sang both antiphonally and in unison.<sup>141</sup> The word 'antiphonally' has been interpreted to indicate the alternate singing of the choirs; the Greek radical 'antiphon' has the basic meaning of replying or resounding. It may mean also the octave interval, materialized by the pitches of male and female voices.<sup>142</sup>

### **The organization of the public synagogue**

The public synagogue was both the communal center and a place of study. After the destruction of the Temple, it was the natural site of Jewish religious worship. The synagogue was administered by the council of the elders and the ruler of the synagogue.

---

140 The date of the Dead Sea Scrolls has been estimated between 130 BCE and 50 CE. Mansoor 1978, 902; Runesson 2003, 223ff., 331ff; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 457, 562, 1608; Sendrey 1974, 151ff.

141 Philo, *The contemplative life* XI, 83-84, 88, Philo IX, 164, 166. The work of Philo was familiar to Eusebius of Caesarea (ca. 260-ca. 340), who quoted from it in his HE 2:17, erroneously understanding the Therapeutae to be Christians. ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 574, 1608.

142 Cf. Huglo 2001, 736.

The members of the council of the elders were not the oldest men in the community, although the requirements set for them are not known.<sup>143</sup> Their office seems to have been permanent. The size of the council depended on the size of the community: in cities like Jerusalem or Alexandria, the number of members was seventy or seventy-one.<sup>144</sup> Occasionally, the size of the council was regulated by the issue which it had to decide on. In general, the body of the elders was similar to a municipal council, although with a larger domain.<sup>145</sup>

The leader of the whole community was the ruler of the synagogue (*rosh ha-keneset*, Gr. *archisynagōgos*). He may also be defined as an executive, as he put into effect the decisions which were made by the council of the elders. According to inscriptions, several rulers of the synagogue were active in matters concerned with corporeal property, including the financing of construction work. The office of the ruler can be considered a professional one, as many of them are known to have officiated for their lifetime. Possibly, it was also hereditary: the so-called Theodotos inscription in the first century CE testifies to a priest and an *archisynagōgos* whose father and grandfather had been rulers of the synagogue as well.<sup>146</sup>

In Greek documents, the title of senior elder (*gerousiarchēs*) appears. It may have been a sort of honorary title, of which also others are known.<sup>147</sup> The title of the notables or leaders (*archōn*) appears in the terminology during the first

---

143 Cf. Weinfeld and Rabinowitz 1978, 578ff. The council of the elders (*zekenim*) was in Greek called the *gerousia* or *presbyterion*.

144 Cf. Num 11:16. BT Sukkah 51b, Goldschmidt 1980, 397.

145 Burtchaell 1992, 228-233.

146 The title of *archisynagōgos* does not occur in the writings of the contemporary authors Philo and Josephus. It was from this office that the later *rabbi* developed. Burtchaell 1992, 237ff.; Runesson 2003, 226ff.

147 The titles of the father (*patēr*) and the mother of the synagogue (*mētēr synagōgēs*) reflect Roman influence. The titles were probably merited because of large donations or other acts of benevolence. In some cases, however, the *mētēr* was honoured for her own sake, while sometimes it is evident that she was the spouse of the *patēr synagōgēs*. When the official titles occur in the feminine form, as *presbytera* and *archisynagōgissa*, the question is of "a consortial form of dignity". Burtchaell 1992, 237ff.

century CE but is no longer present in the Mishnah.<sup>148</sup> It may be that the notables emerged from the council of the elders; there is evidence to suggest that the notables were chosen for a period of a year.<sup>149</sup> Whereas the council of the elders has its parallel in the municipal council, the notables would correspond to the local governing authority.<sup>150</sup>

The only permanent official of the synagogue was the servant or the attendant (*hazzan*). He received his orders from the ruler of the synagogue by whom he was probably also recruited. The duties of the *hazzan* varied from taking care of the Scriptures to scourging a sentenced criminal.<sup>151</sup> Each synagogue also employed a scribe who, however, was not a scholar in the sense of the scribes of the Temple. The scribe of the synagogue was foremost a clerk or a secretary who acted, at need, also as a notary.<sup>152</sup>

As the synagogue was an organ of the community, its organization and activity had to follow the requirements set for all associations in the Roman Empire. It was, however, different from the Roman colleges and Hellenistic associations. It was ethnic, and its authority concerned the life of its members in more various matters than would be the case in a mere cult association. The basic structure of its organization consisted of the leader of the synagogue, a council of elders, and the servant of the synagogue.

---

148 In Luke 8:41, the ruler of the synagogue has the title *archōn*.

149 This resembles the custom of electing leaders in heathen associations. Burtchaell 1992, 261.

150 The existence of the notables may be the solution to the uncertainty of the number of the *archisynagōgoi*, see Beyer-Karpp 1954, 399-400. According to Burtchaell 1992, 236, 261, the "chief officers" may also have been notables.

151 Burtchaell 1992, 246-249.

152 An index of eleven scribe inscriptions indicates an age range from six to seventy years. Three of them were children; perhaps the office was kept in the family. Horsley 1981, 116; Burtchaell 1992, 251-253.

## The establishment of the singer of the synagogue

The destruction of the Temple in 70 CE had left the Levite musicians unemployed once and for all. Although some elements of the Temple service were adopted in the synagogue, psalmody was not instantly among them. Singing with instrumental accompaniment had been strongly connected with the sacrifices, and at their cessation, there was no more need for the choir and the orchestra of the Levites.

The reader of the synagogue service, in principle chosen from among the men present to serve as the messenger of the community, was presumed to have vocal abilities, as we have seen in the passages of the Talmud treated above. In the course of time, the office became in some respect permanent and more professional. By the sixth century, the *ḥazzan* was established as the regular *sheli'ah zibbur*. At the time, also a new genre of liturgical compositions (*piyyutim*) was created.<sup>153</sup>

A professional *ḥazzan* was not available everywhere, and adolescents of seventeen or eighteen years of age could be recruited. In the absence of other possibilities, even a boy of thirteen could be accepted for the office.<sup>154</sup>

The return of psalmody into the Judaic cult is attested in writing in the eighth-century tractate called *Soferim*. Psalms were frequently used in services; also, the daily Temple Psalms were reinstated, but now they were sung by the people. The allusion to the Temple liturgy was made with the announcement of the day:

---

153 The origin of the *piyyutim* has been connected with the *Novella* 146 of Justinian, prohibiting the reading of the commentaries in the synagogue. The songs would have substituted for the readings. Foley 1982, 199-200; Kessler 2004, 32. Idelsohn 1948, 106, sets the date of origin of the *piyyutim* after the rise of Islam. For the *ḥazzanim*, the status of whom rose in the Middle Ages, see Fleischer 1978, 573-574; Kublin 1978, 1542-1543; Rabinowitz 1978, 583. Cf. Seroussi 2001, 38-39, for the chronology.

154 Idelsohn 1948, 107-108, referring to the statement of Amran Gaon, the writer of the earliest prayer book.

"This is the first day of the week, on which the Levites in the Temple used to say: – Psalm xxiv."<sup>155</sup>

Although the official standing of the psalmody in the synagogue was established well after the middle of the first Christian millennium, psalm singing was practised in the synagogue earlier.<sup>156</sup> The Judaic inscriptions at Rome from the former half of the millennium include one which mentions a psalm singer.<sup>157</sup> His name was Gaianus, and the epitaph provides him with three titles: scribe, psalm singer, and a "lover of the Law", respectively. The first and the last title allude to the public synagogue and often refer to young people. Although the age of Gaianus is not given, we may assume that he was a young talent with vocal skills apt for officiating at synagogue services.<sup>158</sup>

As the professional *hazzan* had emerged by the fifth century, the date of the inscription would be of great interest. Unfortunately, it can be estimated only according to the age of the other inscriptions in the same catacomb. They derive from the third and fourth centuries CE, although the catacomb may also have been used over a longer period.<sup>159</sup> Thus, nothing conclusive can be stated regarding the date of the inscription.

The Judaic cult has a history of professional musicians serving at the Temple, and another history concerning the office of the *hazzan*, arising out of the role of the servant of the synagogue to become its cantor some four hundred years after

---

155 Singer 1915, 95. For the tractate *Soferim*, see Freedman 1978, 81; for the psalmodic elements, McKinnon 1986, 183ff.

156 This is attested also by Jewish scholarship, where it is stated that the Christians adopted the practice of psalm singing from the synagogue, not from the Temple. Herzog 1978b, 1330.

157 The title psalm-singer is rare in the Jewish epigraphy. There is another, probably earlier Hebrew inscription from Aphrodisias, Asia Minor, mentioning "one who voices psalms". The inscription is a list of donors for a soup kitchen, and includes over one hundred names. The sixth on the list is the name Benjamin, "psalm-singer [?]", as deciphered by Schiffman 1998, 197-198. See also Page 2010, 42, 84-85.

158 Epitaph for a Jewish Psalm-singer: "ἐνθάδε κίτε Γαϊανὸς γραμματεὺς ψαλμωδὸς φιλόνομος· ἐν ἰρήνῃ ἢ κοίμισις αὐτοῦ". Noy 1995, 399. Horsley 1981, 115, interprets the accents slightly otherwise.

159 Horsley 1981, 116.

the destruction of the Temple. In between these two histories, present sources can only offer allusive information on singing in the synagogue services.



## 2 The first three Christian centuries

### 2.1 The biblical basis of ecclesiastical singing

#### 2.1.1 Singing in the Pauline writings

In contrast to the cults touched upon in the preceding chapter, we are more knowledgeable about the beginning and the ideals of the Christian cult. Our first materials are the Pauline writings of the New Testament where, in the First Epistle to Corinthians, we read: "How is it then, brothers? When you come together, each has a song, a teaching, a revelation, a gift of tongues, an interpretation. Everything shall happen for instruction."<sup>160</sup>

When believers assembled together, they did not come to witness sacrifices or other rituals performed by priests and other officials. In the thinking of Apostle Paul, everyone who came had some spiritual gift to share with the others. As the first gift named by him was a song, it has been interpreted to indicate that the assemblies began with singing.<sup>161</sup> Naturally, we can not be sure if that was the practice, but the wording leads to the principle that everyone had the right to bring his spiritual gift to God in the presence of others, for the benefit of all. The gift could be a song, a prayer, or a teaching. In this respect, the Judaic concept of the messenger of the community continued in the Christian assembly. Practising one's spiritual gift did not presuppose any status as an official functionary in the congregation.<sup>162</sup>

---

160 1 Cor 14:26 (ca. 56 CE): "Τί οὖν ἐστίν, ἀδελφοί; ὅταν συνέρχησθε, ἕκαστος ψαλμὸν ἔχει, διδαχὴν ἔχει, ἀποκάλυψιν ἔχει, γλῶσσαν ἔχει, ἐρμηνείαν ἔχει· πάντα πρὸς οἰκοδομὴν γινέσθω." Greek Bible texts here and below: *Novum Testamentum Graece*, 28th revised edition, Edited by Barbara Aland and others, © 2012 Deutsche Bibelgesellschaft, Stuttgart.

161 Wetzel 1961, 273<sup>15</sup>; Martin 1974, 46; Nikolainen 1986, 116. Cf. Page 2010, 38-39.

162 Wetzel 1961, 278-279; Smith 1962, 77, 35-36. This is not to say that officials had not existed; below, we shall see the earliest mention of permanent officials, made ca. half a decade before the writing of 1 Cor.

The Corinthian Christians held in high regard the possession and practice of spiritual gifts, *charismata*. In his letter, Paul emphasizes that such gifts were not given to classify believers according to their individual *charismata* but to edify the entire community. The gifts contributed to the unity formed by the different members of the community: the body of Christ. It is for the purpose of ensuring this unity that apostles, prophets, and teachers have been established. For the same purpose, "deeds of power, then gifts of healing, forms of assistance, forms of leadership, various kinds of tongues" are given.<sup>163</sup> Paul urges believers to desire these gifts, and values prophesy the highest of them.

To explain his meaning, Paul compares prophecy with the gift of tongues, i.e. glossolalia. An intelligible prophetic message would benefit the community directly, but speaking in tongues was of no use if nobody was able to interpret what was being said. Further, glossolalia were manifested not only in speaking but also in singing. However, singing in tongues was not necessarily singing in some incomprehensible language but using the voice like an instrument. This was the most individual charisma, one in which no-one else could join. To emphasize his point, Paul asks the Corinthians: "What should I do then? I will pray with the spirit, but I will pray with the mind also; I will sing praise with the spirit, but I will sing praise with the mind also."<sup>164</sup> Praying and singing with the spirit required explanation; praying and singing with the mind consisted of understandable words.<sup>165</sup>

The original Greek word *psalms* in 1 Cor 14:26 is translated above simply as 'a song'.<sup>166</sup> The later Christian use of the word primarily to refer to the songs of the Old Testament Psalter would not correspond to the concept of *charismata*: to

---

163 1 Cor 12:28.

164 1 Cor 14:15. The concept of singing with the spirit, with Paul's emphasis on the prophetic gift reminds us of the 'prophesying' of the Levites in the Temple, see p. 35 above. Cf. Wetzel 1961, 274. Another dimension of singing with the spirit appears in Eph 5:19; cf. Seppälä 1999, 89-90, for patristic references.

165 Wetzel 1961, 273-274; Nikolainen 1986, 113-114.

166 NRSV 1989 translates the word as 'hymn'.

be able to sing a psalm, one did not need a specific spiritual gift but the ability to perform the singing according to the tradition.<sup>167</sup> The song a believer 'had' was probably a new, sometimes even spontaneous song in praise of Christ.<sup>168</sup>

What was sung among the believers, has been assumed to appear in two other verses in the Pauline corpus. These are:

Let the word of Christ dwell in you richly when you in all wisdom are teaching and admonishing one another, singing psalms, hymns and spiritual songs with gratitude in your hearts to God.<sup>169</sup>

[...] be filled with Spirit, talking to one another with psalms, hymns and spiritual songs, praising and singing with your heart to the Lord, [...].<sup>170</sup>

The substance of the first verse is a modification of 1 Cor 14:26, as it requires everything to happen for instruction. The occurrence of the phrase 'psalms, hymns and spiritual songs' in both verses is explained by its adoption by the writer of the Epistle to the Ephesians from the earlier-written Letter to the Colossians.<sup>171</sup> The wording itself has, since antiquity, occupied scholars interested in the essence of the songs of the early Christians.<sup>172</sup>

Of the three words, the only one appearing in the authentic Pauline texts is the word 'psalm', already touched upon in the connection with 1 Cor 14:26. As there

---

167 Wetzel 1961, 273<sup>14</sup>.

168 Söhngen 1954, 8; Hahn 1970, 58. Smith 1962, 77, 65-66, mentions that the singing of Old Testament psalms is testified in the New Testament only in verses Matt 26:30 and Mark 14:26, both of which say, *literatim*: "When they had sung the hymn, [...]" (ὕμνησαντες). Page 2010, 75, states that "it is impossible to tell from this passage whether the psalms were sung, intoned or spoken."

169 Col 3:16: "Ὁ λόγος τοῦ Χριστοῦ ἐνοικεῖται ἐν ὑμῖν πλουσίως, ἐν πάσῃ σοφίᾳ διδάσκοντες καὶ νοθετοῦντες ἑαυτοὺς, ψαλμοῖς ὕμνοις ᾠδαῖς πνευματικαῖς ἐν [τῇ] χάριτι ἄδοντες ἐν ταῖς καρδίαις ὑμῶν τῷ θεῷ."

170 Eph 5:18b-19: "ἀλλὰ πληροῦσθε ἐν πνεύματι, λαλοῦντες ἑαυτοῖς [ἐν] ψαλμοῖς καὶ ὕμνοις καὶ ᾠδαῖς πνευματικαῖς, ἄδοντες καὶ ψάλλοντες τῇ καρδίᾳ ὑμῶν τῷ κυρίῳ,"

171 Neither of the letters belongs to the indisputable authentic Pauline corpus, nor are they by the same writer. Hahn 1970, 69; Brown 1997, 600ff.; Leppä 2003, 15, 173.

172 For various attempts to explain the supposed genres, see e.g. Wellesz 1955, 2; 1961, 33ff.; Smith 1962, 62<sup>11</sup>; Abraham 1979, 51. Corbin 1960, 131, writes that 'poor Apostle Paul would be astonished to see the puzzle caused by his choice of words'.

the word could be translated as 'song', in these verses this meaning is compromised by the presence of the two other song genres – if different genres are, in fact, intended. The most stripped-down translation for the words would be 'songs, hymns and spiritual odes'. But, to reach a conclusion, the words need first to be considered individually.

The word 'psalms' may mean the songs from the Psalter, as the matter is one of exhortation. However, the Judaic traditions were hardly familiar to the Gentile-Christian addressees of these letters. Thus, the present psalms can be assumed to have been new songs; whether their form imitated the Hebrew psalmody, as some scholars have suggested, remains unknown.<sup>173</sup> The concept 'hymn' needs not be questioned because of the universality of the concept. Further, the books of the New Testament include hymn-like verses in abundance.<sup>174</sup> As to the 'spiritual odes', in the original Greek, the adjective 'spiritual' is placed after all the nouns. Thus, it may refer to them in general, indicating a distinction between spiritual and profane tunes.<sup>175</sup>

This kind of argumentation remains theoretical, and the answer is best sought from the side of the addressees, whose vernacular was Greek.<sup>176</sup> Thus, whoever evangelized them would have used the Septuagint for the Scriptures of the Old Covenant. There, the words psalm, hymn, and ode occur frequently in the

---

173 Hahn 1970, 58; Martin 1974, 47.

174 E.g. Col 1:15-20. Leppä 2003, 89-98, states that the composition of the hymn derives from the authentic Pauline letters and the Septuagint. See also Brown 1997, 603-604.

175 Thraede 1994, 920. The question of the spirituality of the songs has led Smith 1962, 79-80, to ask if the word *pneumatikos* would "indicate that the songs were given directly – inspired – by the Holy Spirit (I Cor 2, 13), or simply that they were sung by 'spiritual' (as over against 'natural') men (I Cor 2, 15-3, 1), 'expressing spiritual thoughts and feelings'?" Page 2010, 75, suggests that spiritual songs were simply 'songs sung in Christ'. In *ibid.*, 64, commenting on the apocryphal Acts of Paul, he remarks that the Greek word *ōdē*, in the vocabulary of the second century, meant songs "attributed to Moses and others in the books of the Synagogue". These would be the biblical canticles from the Old Testament, see e.g. ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 283. Wellesz 1961, 33, remarks that patristic authors made a difference between plain 'odes' and 'spiritual odes'.

176 Brown 1997, 601, 626-627.

superscripts of the Psalter and in other contexts, "more or less indiscriminately and interchangeably". Hence, the Christian writers acquainted with the Septuagint would have used the words without any thought of discriminating between them.<sup>177</sup> Nowadays, the three words are generally regarded as synonyms.<sup>178</sup>

According to these verses of the New Testament, singing was an essential part of the life of believers.<sup>179</sup> Singing was a means of praise as well as of instruction.

### **2.1.2 An outside attestation of Christian worship: the letter of Pliny**

Christian communities were not official associations in the Roman Empire. By heathen outsiders, Christians were first considered to be a new Jewish sect.<sup>180</sup> However, already in the middle of the first century CE they became objects of persecution by the Jews, both in Palestine and in Asia Minor. The conflicts revealed the divergence between the two groups.<sup>181</sup>

In the beginning of the second century, an imperial prohibition against all political associations – thus also including Christian communities – was declared by Emperor Trajan (98-117). In the province of Bithynia, the governor, Pliny the Younger, put the order into effect, and described his measures in a letter to the Emperor. The letter is the earliest external document concerning the worship of the Christians.<sup>182</sup>

---

177 Smith 1962, 63.

178 Haas 1982, 42; Thraede 1994, 918; Leppä 2003, 173<sup>765</sup>; Page 2010, 75.

179 1 Cor 12:27. The present study deliberately sets aside the Book of Revelation, with its abundance of references to singing. The liturgy described there is reminiscent of the Temple service; whether the Christian worship of the time is also reflected in these allusions cannot be ascertained. Cf. Brown 1997, 798-800.

180 The followers of Jesus were first called Christians at Syrian Antioch ca. 40-44 (Acts 11:26). As the name was initially used by outsiders, the 'Jesus movement' was probably considered not only religious, but quasi-political. Burtchaell 1992, 277-278.

181 Testimony to the persecutions can be found in Acts 8:1, 13:50, 17:5, and 18:20.

182 ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 1257-1258, 1301; AKK 2000, 433.

Pliny had interrogated people who had been suspected of being Christians. Some of them had confessed that, previously, they indeed had been believers but had since abandoned the faith for one reason or another, returning willingly to perform the rites required by the Empire. Regarding the contents of the Christian worship, they had stated that they "used to assemble on a certain day before dawn and to sing alternately a hymn to Christ as to God".<sup>183</sup>

In Pliny's letter, written in Latin, the Bithynian Christians are told to have sung in turns with each other (*carmen* [...] *dicere secum invicem*); the language spoken at the investigations was probably Greek.<sup>184</sup> The interrogated people may have said simply that they used to 'sing a hymn'. Translating this into Latin, Pliny has used a classic structure deriving from the Roman poet Horace: to 'sing a song'.<sup>185</sup> Without knowing the composition of the parties involved – probably male and female choirs – who sang, nor the structure of the hymn, nothing further can be stated about the actual singing.<sup>186</sup>

The statements by the suspects also included that they had "bound themselves by a solemn oath" (*sacramentum*) to avoid all frauds. Later on the day, the believers had met to share a meal.<sup>187</sup>

The investigation had been thorough, including the torturing of two servant girls (*ancillae*) who, according to Pliny, had been called *ministrae*. This title has been interpreted to mean deaconesses, in its later ecclesiastical sense. In Greek,

---

183 Pliny X, xcvi: "[...] Adfirmabant autem hanc fuisse summam vel culpae suae vel erroris, quod essent soliti stato die ante lucem convenire carmenque Christo quasi deo dicere secum invicem seque sacramento non in scelus aliquod obstringere, sed ne furta, ne latrocinia, ne adulteria committerent, ne fidem fallerent, ne depositum appellati abnegarent.[...] Quo magis necessarium credidi ex duabus ancillis, quae ministrae dicebantur, quid esset veri et per tormenta quaerere.[...]" Pliny II, 402-404.

184 Tripp 1984, 581; Bastiaensen 1997, 274.

185 Horace lived between 65 BCE-8 BCE. Wille 1967, 51, 376. Quasten 1954, 901-902; Salzman 1989, 391. Cf. McKinnon 1987a, 98. The word *carmen* could refer to different song types, cf. *Carmen Arvale* p. 27 above.

186 Smith 1962, 40; Martin 1966, 259-262; Salzman 1989, 392<sup>24</sup>.

187 Perhaps, the oath was a creed. About Pliny's letter, see e.g. Salzman 1989, 391-393; Martin 1966, 263-265; Wille 1967, 38-39, 376; Page 2010, 76-77; Castrén 2011, 448-451. Ramsay 1893, 196-225, pays no attention to the singing.

the expression would have been simply 'female servants'.<sup>188</sup> Thus, the maids were not necessarily officials of the congregation after the manner of the deaconesses of the later centuries.

The circumstances concerning the assembly of the Christians, preserved in Pliny's letter, reflect the spirit of the primitive Church. Its initial state, as testified in the Acts and in the letters of Paul, may be understood to have been enthusiastic and informal. Early on, however, it needed to become organized.

## **2.2 Offices and functions in the early Church**

### **2.2.1 Spiritual and practical offices**

The first leaders of the believers were, naturally, the apostles. In order of importance after them came prophets and teachers as laid down in 1 Cor 12:28. All three groups were primarily evangelists, or spiritual officials, because of the spiritual origin of their vocation. The apostles had received their mission from Jesus Christ himself, and prophets and teachers were given their calling without human interference. They may also have been blessed with other spiritual gifts: the working of miracles, the gift of healing, the ability to assist or minister, and the gift of tongues. While carrying out the Great Commission given by Jesus, the spiritual officials travelled from one Christian community to another, remaining only temporarily in one place. The local congregations, however, required permanent shepherding, also in matters practical. For this task, men capable of assisting and ministering were elected from among the parishioners.<sup>189</sup>

<sup>188</sup> In Greek, the gender of the servant – the deacon – is indicated simply with a masculine or a feminine article. The title 'deaconess' for the female deacon is of later origin. Cf. the translation in Pliny II, 405; Davies 1963, 2.

<sup>189</sup> Beyer-Karpp 1954, 401-402. The existence of regular officials is indicated in 1 Thess 5:12-13, the letter being the oldest preserved Christian document, written in 50

The election of the first practical officials is described in Acts.<sup>190</sup> The community of believers in Jerusalem consisted of Judaeo-Christians who represented two linguistic groups: one spoke Aramaic, and the other Greek.<sup>191</sup> The financial resources of the community were held in common, and the apostles decided on their distribution.<sup>192</sup>

It appeared that the widows who belonged to the Greek-speaking group were overlooked in the daily distribution of food. Having become aware of the matter, the apostles ordered the community to elect seven men, who were appointed with prayer and laying-on of hands, "to wait at tables".<sup>193</sup> The verb 'to wait' would suggest that they were considered servants, but elsewhere, the text does not allude to them as such.<sup>194</sup> In view of the qualities required of them, they were competent to do much more than simply distribute alms.<sup>195</sup> The appointing of the seven men for administrative duties, allowing the apostles to concentrate primarily on prayer and the ministry of the word, defines the two fields of activity in the congregations: spiritual and practical.

The practical officials were called overseers and servants, i.e. bishops and deacons. The titles were commonly used in the Hellenistic congregations founded by Paul.<sup>196</sup> In Palestine and Syria, where the majority of the believers were Judaeo-Christians, the common organizational model was the council of elders, i.e. of presbyters.<sup>197</sup> However, the different nomenclature does not imply

or 51 CE. Brown 1997, 457, 648<sup>26</sup>.

190 Acts 6:2-4. The events described in Acts begin in 36 CE. Brown 1997, 295.

191 Meimaris 1986, 154; Nikolainen 1985, 57-58; Brown 1997, 293-295. Burtchaell 1992, 282, states that the Greek-speaking members of the community would have been of Gentile origin.

192 Acts 4:32-37.

193 The number of men followed the practice of Judaic communities. The names of the men indicate that they were Hellenists. Klauser 1957, 890.

194 In Acts 21:8 one of the seven, Philip, is mentioned as an evangelist.

195 Thus, they resemble the later presbyters rather than the later deacons. Klauser 1957, 890-892; Grant 1970, 54; Burtchaell 1992, 345. Brown 1997, 294<sup>39</sup>, points out the difference between these men and the servants described in the Pastoral Letters.

196 E.g. Phil 1:1. According to Klauser 1957, 890, although the titles were taken from Hellenistic associations, the character of their functions was novel.

197 Beyer-Karpp 1954, 403; Nikolainen 1987a, 155-156; 1987b, 112; Burtchaell 1992,

any fundamental distinction between the Hellenistic and Judaeo-Christian communities. At the time, the words overseer and elder seem to be rather interchangeable in the texts of the Christian writers.<sup>198</sup> As the titles were common in the civil vocabulary of the time, their usage provided the Christian communities with an outward resemblance to other associations.<sup>199</sup>

One basic difference between the Christian communities and other associations was in the election of officials. Elections in heathen cults were based mostly on one's birth, and in Judaism the priesthood and the Levitical offices were hereditary. The Christians elected for themselves leaders whose way of life manifested faith. The requirements for overseer, servant, and elder are laid down in the Pastoral Letters. The principal preconditions include being a good head of the household, not a recent convert, and generally of good repute. All officials-to-be are to be probated before they are, with the imposition of hands, appointed to their duties.<sup>200</sup>

The writings deriving from the Apostolic Age indicate no hierarchical distinction between overseers and elders.<sup>201</sup> With time, the shared status of overseers and elders became almost on a par with that of the spiritual offices, for several reasons. First, apostles, prophets, or teachers were not always present in the community, which needed continuous administration. Second, as not all travelling prophets and teachers appeared to preach the pure gospel, local authorities were needed to ascertain their nature, and to protect believers from injurious influences.<sup>202</sup> Eventually, the generation of the apostles passed away

---

113, 141-142, 334-335.

198 Burtchaell 1992, 116, 296-297.

199 Burtchaell 1992, 78; Klauck 2000, 46.

200 1 Tim 3:1-13; 4:14; Tit 1:5-9. Cf. Gal 3:28. Faivre 1990, 9-10. Concerning female members of the congregation, regulations are also given (1 Tim 5:9ff.; Tit 2:3-5). Some of the women may have been permanent servants of the congregation. A female servant is mentioned in Rom 16:1-2; however, Davies 1963, 1, states that the term is not necessarily to be taken as technical. For the position of women, see e.g. Faivre 1990, 12-13; Burtchaell 1992, 177, 328-329; Wijngaards 2002, 15-17.

201 Burtchaell 1992, 35; Meimaris 1986, 204.

202 Didache 15:1-2, The Fathers of the Church 1, 183. Beyer-Karpp 1954, 402-404.

and prophesying decreased; the history of the teachers continued for longer but their status did not remain unambiguous.<sup>203</sup>

At the beginning of the second century, a distinction emerges between overseers and elders. The overseer clearly becomes the presiding elder of the community, holding the so-called monarchic episcopate. The concept derives from the letters of Ignatius, the bishop of the Syrian Antioch.<sup>204</sup> To illuminate the relationship between overseer and elders, Ignatius uses the metaphor of a cithara, the resonating body of the instrument paralleling the overseer, with the elders as its strings. With the metaphor, Ignatius depicts the harmony which shall prevail among the believers. To produce its proper sound, all the components of the instrument must be in readiness; likewise, to function together, the members of the congregation have to maintain mutual discipline.<sup>205</sup>

According to Ignatius, the administrative structure of the congregation consists of an overseer and a council of elders, along with servants who are subordinate to both of them.<sup>206</sup> Theologically, the overseer represents the heavenly Father and the elders the apostles. Further, the council of the elders presided over by the overseer is considered the body of the apostles led by Christ, whose temporal ministry the servants shall imitate.<sup>207</sup>

The offices of the overseer, elders and servants form the threefold ministry which became permanent in the Christian Church. A threefold structure was common in antiquity. Likewise, the organization of the Christian communities has also been compared with the Roman priest colleges: the overseer paralleling

---

203 Cf. the *doctor* of the Apostolic Tradition p. 74 below .

204 Ignatius suffered martyrdom during the persecution by Emperor Trajan ca. 110 at Rome. During the journey to his fate, he wrote six letters to the congregations of Asia Minor and one to Polycarp, the overseer of Smyrna. In the latter half of the 4<sup>th</sup> century, six new letters were added to the collection. Altaner-Stuiber 1993, 47-48; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 817-818.

205 Ign Eph 4, ANF 1, 51. Ignatius uses an instrument metaphor also in Phil 1. Cf. Seppälä 2012, 22-24.

206 Klauser 1957, 893; Burtchaell 1992, 345, 308-310. See also Hawkins 1992, 347-349.

207 Ign Magn 6, Trall 2-3, Smyrn 8, ANF 1, 61, 67, 89.

the presiding *magister*, the elders the *flamen* priests, and the servants as servants in both organizations, although the Christian servants were not slaves.<sup>208</sup> An analogy is possible also with the Judaic community whose three organs were the ruler of the synagogue, the elders, and the *hazzan*.<sup>209</sup>

The communities of believers identified themselves with neither colleges nor synagogues but assemblies (*ekklēsiai*). In general parlance, the word meant a summoned assembly of all citizens in general, and a local meeting in particular. Among the Christians, it also became used in both senses. Every baptized Christian was a member of the local *ecclesia*, whose meetings he attended, and of the universal *ecclesia* formed by all believers.<sup>210</sup> The traditional translation of the word, church, may mean either type, depending on the context.

### 2.2.2 The office of reading

The letters which form the greater part of the New Testament have been preserved probably because they were publicly read and freely copied. That was also the aim of the apostles: at the end of the First Letter to the Thessalonians, Paul writes, "I solemnly command you by the Lord that this letter be read to all of them". The writer of the Colossians demands, "And when this letter has been read among you, have it read also in the church of the Laodiceans; and see that you read also the letter from Laodicea."<sup>211</sup> As to the actual reading, we do not know who was in charge of it or whether the reading took place in circumstances which may be considered liturgical. In the New Testament, the only verse which

---

208 Cf. Harnack 1886a, 94-95.

209 Burtchaell 1992, 276, 111, 335.

210 Linton 1959, 906, 912-914; Brown 1997, 301; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 333, 78. Cf. Page 2010, 34.

211 1 Thess 5:27, Col 4:16. The quotations are from NRSV. Cf. also Acts 15:24-31. The 'letter from Laodicea' remains an enigma. The Epistle to the Laodiceans, belonging to the New Testament Apocrypha, is of later origin. Schneemelcher 1964, 128-132; Altaner-Stuiber 1993, 140; Brown 1997, 600<sup>2</sup>.

alludes to the person of the reader is at the beginning of the Book of Revelation: "Blessed is the one who reads aloud the words of the prophecy, [...]"<sup>212</sup>

He who read to the assembly may have been the overseer. In 1 Tim, he is encouraged to read, exhort, and teach. The sequence of the letter implies that the teaching is to be based on the Scriptures, as also does 2 Tim.<sup>213</sup> With respect to the apostolic letters themselves, we do not know whether they were already considered sacred Scriptures.

The writings of the time do not directly allude to the reading of the Hebrew Scriptures or of the written teachings of Jesus at the assemblies of believers. Indirectly, the use of the former is indicated in some of the New Testament letters. When writing to congregations with members of Judaic background, Paul regularly refers to the Scriptures of the Old Covenant. In his letters to Gentile Christian communities, the role of the Scriptures is less important.<sup>214</sup>

The reading of both the New and the Old Covenant writings is recorded in the middle of the second century at Rome by Justin Martyr.<sup>215</sup> In his First Apology, Justin states that at the beginning of the Sunday morning service "the narratives

---

212 Rev 1:3, quoted from NRSV. Gamble 1995, 219, points out the allusions to reading in 1 Tim 4:13 and Rev 1:3. Both texts were written in Asia Minor at approximately the same time – on the assumption that 1 Tim derives from the end of the first century, while Rev was written probably between 92 and 96 CE. Whereas in 1 Tim the task of reading belongs to the highest official in the community, in Rev no official status is required of the reader. Cf. Harnack 1886a, 82; Gamble 1995, 206. For the setting of the date of the writings, see Brown 1997, 654, 774.

213 1 Tim 4:13: "ἕως ἔρχομαι πρόσεχε τῇ ἀναγνώσει, τῇ παρακλήσει, τῇ διδασκαλίᾳ." Cf. 2 Tim 3:16-4:2. The difference between the instruction by the overseer and that of the charismatic teachers was that the latter taught and preached, often under divine inspiration, without using written texts. Gamble 1995, 9.

214 Burtchaell 1992, 272, 284-285; Gamble 1995, 211ff.

215 Philosopher Justin had converted from paganism. He was one of the apologetes, authors who publicly defended Christianity and its adherents in the hostile Roman empire. The Apology of Justin was directed to the family of Emperor Antoninus Pius (138-161). ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 915, 87. Of the writings attributed to Justin, the two Apologies and the Dialogue with Trypho are genuine, whereas the statement rejecting the use of musical instruments in the Church (Question 107 in *Quaestiones et responsiones ad orthodoxos*) is not, and derives from the fifth century. McKinnon 1987a, 20-21, 107; Corbitt 2010.

of the apostles or the writings of the prophets are read for as long as it is possible." The rather imprecise expression referring to the duration of the reading has been explained by reference to the custom of reading until all were present, confirmed in later centuries. For the reader, Justin uses a participle construction: "After he who is reading has paused [...]". Although the substantivized participle may be translated as 'the reader', the character of the forms used implies that, at the time, there was probably no one individual who was 'the reader' to the assembly.

This conclusion rests upon two titles recorded by Justin. One is the president (*proestōs*) of the assembly, who gives the homily after the reading, and thereafter leads the common prayer and the celebration of the Eucharist. The other title is that of the servant, mentioned in the plural (*diakonoi*). They are to deliver the sacramental elements for parishioners absent from the common service.<sup>216</sup>

In all, Justin names three functions: reading, administering – including all the duties of the president – and serving, executed by persons who were specifically assigned to perform this task. This has been argued to be the case on the basis of Justin's well-attested attention to detail; for example, had the reader been one of the servants, he would have mentioned the matter. By the same reasoning, we may conclude that worship lacked singing: had anything been sung at the service, it would have been noted down by Justin. Yet, the reading of the Old Covenant books probably included chapters of the Psalter. In another section of

---

216 Sancti Justinii Apol. I, 67. "[...] καὶ τῇ τοῦ ἡλίου λεγομένη ἡμέρᾳ πάντων κατὰ πόλεις ἢ ἀγροῦς μενόντων ἐπὶ τὸ αὐτὸ συνέλευσις γίνεται, καὶ τὰ ἀπομνημονεύματα τῶν ἀποστόλων, ἢ τὰ συγγράμματα τῶν προφητῶν ἀναγινώσκονται μέχρις ἐγχωρεῖ. Εἶτα παυσάμενου τοῦ ἀναγινώσκοντος, ὁ προεστὼς διὰ λόγου τὴν νοουθεσίαν καὶ πρόκλησιν τῆς τῶν καλῶν τούτων μιμήσεως ποιεῖται.[...] καὶ ἡ διάδοσις καὶ ἡ μετάληψις ἀπὸ τῶν εὐχαριστηθέντων ἐκάστῳ γίνεται, καὶ τοῖς οὐ παροῦσι διὰ τῶν διακόνων πέμπεται." PG VI, 429B-C. Recalling the above-mentioned letter of Pliny, written some forty years earlier, we note that among the Bithynian Christians, the morning assembly and the common meal had been separate. In Rome, both the liturgy of the word and Communion were celebrated together. This procedure had thus taken place by the middle of the second century. Hahn 1970, 84; Martin 1974, 139.

the same Apology, Justin mentions hymns as offerings of thanks to the Lord.<sup>217</sup> Thus, the Roman ecclesia did sing. We should be cognisant that, as Justin wrote to the imperial family, his emphasis was to describe a community organized according to the Roman social order, not to record all the details of its rites.<sup>218</sup>

### 2.2.3 Divine service and ecclesiastical ranks in the writings of Tertullian

Some forty years after Justin, Tertullian in his Apology is even more laconic, mentioning only prayer and reading as the elements of worship in the church of Carthage.<sup>219</sup> Neither does Tertullian mention who were in charge of these tasks, but states that the community was taken care of by the elders (*seniores*).<sup>220</sup>

In his other writings, the title of elder shifts to that of presbyter.<sup>221</sup> Other ecclesiastical grades appear in his treatment of the danger of lapsing into idolatry, which could threaten even the most faithful of believers: bishop, deacon, widow, virgin, teacher (*doctor*) or martyr, i.e. a surviving witness of persecution.<sup>222</sup> The reader (*lector*), here for the first time mentioned as an individual rank, emerges in Tertullian's criticism of heretics:

---

217 Apology I, 13, ANF 1, 166, with a note observing that the hymns may have been of biblical origin or of recent composition. See also McKinnon 1987a, 20.

218 Faivre 1990, 32-33; Page 2010, 64-67, 102.

219 Tertullian (ca. 160-220), a convert from paganism, is considered the first Latin Father of the Church. His Apology was written in 197, during the reign of Emperor Septimius Severus (193-211). ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 1591-1592. For apologists in general, see Castrén 2011, 487-491.

220 Tert. Apologeticum XXXIX: "3. Coimus ad litterarum divinarum commemoratio-nem, si quid praesentium temporum qualitas aut praemonere cogit aut recognoscere. [...] 5. Praesident probati quique seniores, honorem istum non pretio, sed testimonio adepti, neque enim pretio ulla res dei constat." CCSL I, I, 150.

221 From now on, the title *presbyter* is used for the elder, and *deacon* for the servant.

222 Tert. De praescriptione haereticorum III: "5. Soli enim Dei filio seruabatur sine delicto permanere. Quid ergo si episcopus, si diaconus, si uirgula, si uirgo, si doctor, si etiam martyr lapsus a regula fuerit? Ideo haereses ueritatem uidebuntur obtinere?" CCSL I, I, 188.

[...] Nowhere is it easier to promote than in the camps of the rebels where for the promotion suffices that one is present. Thus, today they have one man as their bishop, tomorrow another; today's deacon is tomorrow a reader; and the one who is presbyter today is layman tomorrow. For even laymen do they entrust with the priestly duties.<sup>223</sup>

However, individual officials are not mentioned in the section of one of his later writings, where Tertullian seems to describe the order of the divine service. Referring to the spiritual gifts received by a Montanist sister, he writes: "Whether it be in the reading of Scriptures, or in the chanting of psalms, or in the preaching of sermons, or in the offering up prayers, in all these religious services matter and opportunity are afforded to her of seeing visions."<sup>224</sup> With the addition of the psalmody, the sequence is identical to the earlier description given by Justin. In both, the service began with reading, and the order of the sermon and the prayers was the same. As Tertullian lists the elements in an impersonal manner, there is no way of finding out who was responsible for the singing, or for conducting it.

Singing belonged also to the meals shared by the believers. By heathens, these occasions had evidently been criticized for being "extravagant as well as infamously wicked". Tertullian answers these allegations with a variation on the motes and beams metaphor, stating that the banquets of the heathens are a completely different category: for example, Tertullian mentions the *Salii* who get

---

223 Tert. De praescriptione haereticorum XLI, 7-8, transl. from ANF 3, 263. Milasch 1905, 242<sup>21</sup>, states that in this chapter, Tertullian refers to singers (*Psalten*). Davies 1963, 11. Cf. Faivre 1990, 114; Gamble 1995, 218; Page 2010, 104.

224 Tert. De anima IX, 4 "4. Est hodie soror apud nos reuelationum charismata sortita, quas in ecclesia inter dominica sollempnia per ecstasin in spiritu patitur ; conuersatur cum angelis, aliquando etiam cum domino, et uidet et audit sacramenta et quorundam corda dinoscit et medicinas desiderantibus sumit. Iam uero prout scripturae leguntur ut psalmi canuntur aut allocutiones proferuntur aut petitiones delegantur, ita inde materiae uisionibus subministrantur. [...]" CCSL II, 792. 4, transl. from ANF 3, 188. See also Page 2010, 82. Montanism was not essentially a heresy but "an apocalyptic movement", emphasizing asceticism and spiritual gifts, especially prophecy. In his later years, Tertullian became a supporter of the movement. ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 1107-1108; 1591-1592.

into debt to be able to finance their feasts.<sup>225</sup> Among the Christians, on the contrary, the character of the meal derives from its Greek name *agape*, meaning affection and charity. Beginning with prayers, the *agape* continues with a modest and moderate supper after which all remain together to sing before the concluding prayers. As to the singing, any person 'having a song' – as Apostle Paul would say – is welcomed to step in the middle to sing (*canere*), either from the scriptures or a song of their own composition.<sup>226</sup>

In another writing, Tertullian refers to singing from the Scriptures, i.e. from the Psalter, with the verb *psallere*.<sup>227</sup> The manner of psalmody was evidently responsorial, including common refrains. At the divine service, both psalms and hymns were sung, accompanying the bringing of the spiritual sacrifice, the prayer, to the altar.<sup>228</sup> At home, Tertullian recommends husband and wife to sing: "Between the two echo psalms and hymns; and they mutually challenge each

---

225 Cf. pp. 25-26 above.

226 Tert. Apologeticum XXXIX: "16. Cena nostra de nomine rationem sui ostendit: id uocatur quod dilectio penes Graecos. [...] 18. [...] Post aquam manulem et lumina, ut quisque de scripturis diuinis uel de proprio ingenio potest, prouocatur in medium Deo canere : hinc probatur quomodo biberit. Aequae oratio conuiuim dirimit." CCSL I, I, 152, 153. The more or less contemporary (ca. 185-195, Asia Minor) apocryphal Acts of Paul confirm the practice of singing at meals, mentioning "singing of the psalms of David, and songs". (Ch. 9, Schneemelcher 1989, 235.) This is the first occasion that we encounter the definition 'psalms of David', alluding to the Book of Psalms. The meal may have been the Eucharist or the *agape*; unfortunately just before the mention of psalms and songs there is a lacuna in the text. Altaner-Stuiber 1993, 136; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 1238.

227 Tert. De ieiunio XIII: "7. Et hoc quam dignum fide auspicante congregari undique ad Christum! Vide, quam bonum et quam iucundum habitare fratres in unum! Hoc tu psallere non facile nosti, nisi quo tempore cum compluribus cenas." CCSL I, II, 1272.

228 Tert. De oratione XXVII: "1. Diligentiores in orando subiungere in orationibus alleluia solent et hoc genus psalmos, quorum clausulis respondeant qui simul sunt. Et est optimum utique institutum omni quod praeponendo et honorando Deo competit saturatam orationem uelut opimam hostiam admouere. [...] XXVIII. 1. Haec est enim hostia spiritalis, quae pristina sacrificia deleuit. [...] 4. Hanc de toto corde deuotam, fide pastam, ueritate curatam, innocentia integram, castitae mundam, *agape* coronatam cum pompa operum bonorum inter psalmos et hymnos deducere ad Dei altare debemus omnia nobis a Deo impetraturam." CCSL I, I, 273. Page 2010, 83-84. The concept of the altar includes both a concrete and an abstract metaphor, the abstract altar being one's spirit.

other which shall better chant (*canere*) to their Lord."<sup>229</sup> The encouragement for the spouses to compete with each other has been interpreted as an indication of antiphonal psalmody.<sup>230</sup>

The most minutiae concerning the liturgy are given by Tertullian in the writing against the public games (*ludi*).<sup>231</sup> Such mundane entertainments were not considered appropriate for Christians; nevertheless, some of them attended both church and games.<sup>232</sup> Tertullian reproaches such persons with forgetting the prophetic words while they watch a tragic actor, and the psalms while they listen to "the piping of an effeminate *tibicen*". He goes on to ask:

How is it to tend from the church of God to the church of the devil, from the sky, as they say, to the sty?<sup>233</sup> To tire the same hands you elevated to God, afterwards with applause to an actor? To praise a gladiator from the same mouth with which you said *Amen* to the Holy; indeed, to shout *from everlasting to everlasting* to anyone else but to God and Christ?<sup>234</sup>

The 'Amen to the Holy' may refer to the Communion where the Amen would be said by the communicant at the moment of receiving the sacramental

---

229 Tert. Ad uxorem II, VII: "8. Sonant inter duos psalmi et hymni, et mutuo prouocant, quis melius Domino suo cantet. Talia Christus uidens et audiens gaudet. [...]" CCSL I, I, 394. 8. Transl. from ANF 4, 48.

230 McKinnon 1987a, 44.

231 For the *ludi*, see fn. 73 above. Active professional athletes and actors could not join Christian congregations without renouncing their profession. Jones 1964, 977, 1020.

232 The same phenomenon seems to have prevailed in Alexandria, where Clement (see fn. 65 above) expressed his disapproval of those who immediately after leaving the church, "foolishly amuse themselves with impious playing, and amatory quavering, occupied with flute-playing, and dancing, and intoxication, and all kinds of trash. They who sing thus, and sing in response, are those who before hymned immortality, [...]". The Instructor III, XI, transl. from ANF 2, 290.

233 The phrase "from the sky to the sty" is from ANF 3, 90.

234 Tert. De spectaculis XXV: "3. Nemo denique in spectaculo ineundo prius cogitat nisi uideri et uidere. sed tragoedo vociferante exclamationes ille alicuius prophetae retractabit et inter effeminati tibicinis modos psalmum secum comminiscetur, et cum athletae agent, ille dicturus est reperiendum non esse. [...] 5. quale est enim de ecclesia dei in diaboli ecclesiam tendere, de caleo, quod aiunt, in caenum? illas manus quas ad deum extuleris postmodum laudando histrionem fatigare? ex ore, quo Amen in Sanctum protuleris, gladiatori testimonium reddere, εἰς αἰῶνας ἅπ' αἰῶνος alii omnino dicere nisi deo et Christo?" CCSL I, I, 248-249.

elements.<sup>235</sup> In the original text, the expression 'from everlasting to everlasting' is written in Greek in the middle of a sentence in Latin; thus, Greek was probably still used in the liturgy.<sup>236</sup>

In light of all the details given in the writings of Tertullian, we may conclude that, at the time, both the singing of psalms and hymns, and liturgical responses were an established part of worship in the church of Carthage.<sup>237</sup>

## 2.2.4 The offices in the Apostolic Tradition

With respect to the establishment of the ecclesiastical hierarchy, the fundamental source is the earliest comprehensive church order, the Apostolic Tradition. The order is estimated to reflect the practices of the Roman church in ca. 215, including detailed instructions about the appointment of ecclesiastical officials, also defining their order of precedence.<sup>238</sup> Here, for the benefit of understanding

---

235 This is the case in the translation of Schaff, reading: "[...] out of the mouth, from which you uttered Amen over the Holy Thing [...]". ANF 3, 90.

236 Bastiaensen 1997, 275. Cf. Page 2010, 16-17.

237 Tertullian states also that heretics had their own psalms to sing. McKinnon 1987a, 44-45.

238 The attribution of the Apostolic Tradition to Hippolytus of Rome (ca.170-ca.236) is not undisputed. Alexandria and Syria have also been suggested as the place of its provenance. The original Greek text has survived only in fragments, but it has been completed by means of later manuscripts in other languages. The edition used here comprises two versions: the text entirely in Latin, and the so-called Oriental version. The latter is a compilation from Sahidic, Arabic, and Ethiopic texts, and is given in Latin with Greek additions. The texts can be dated only approximately: the Latin text derives probably from the end of the 4<sup>th</sup> century, and the Sahidic – a dialect of Coptic – is even later. The Arabic version derives from the Sahidic, and the Ethiopic version from the Arabic. SC 11<sup>bis</sup>, 16-19; Bradshaw 1992, 83-84, 90-92; Dix 1992, lviii; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 91, 535, 773-774; Page 2010, 50. See also *The Study of Liturgy*, 87-89. With regard to the disappearance of the original Greek version, it has been stated that Hippolytus "wrote in Greek and the Roman church was now thoroughly Latinized". Kelly 1986, 14-15. Cf. Jones 1963, 17. The Ethiopic version of the Apostolic Tradition also includes a passage treating psalm singing at the Communion service, see pp. 127-128 below.

the spiritual concepts which appear also in later sources, we shall shortly outline the roles of all the offices and ranks mentioned in the text: bishop, presbyter, deacon, confessor, widow, reader, virgin, subdeacon, and spiritual healer.

The bishop is considered sovereign as the high priest of God. The ritual of his ordination includes the imposition of hands by other bishops who shall be present, and a prayer which invests him with the powers of the apostles. A presbyter is ordained by his own bishop, and the other presbyters in the congregation shall join in the imposition of hands, praying for him "the spirit of grace and counsel".<sup>239</sup> Hierarchical principles appear in the ordination of the deacon, who

[...] is not appointed<sup>240</sup> to be the counsellor of the whole clergy but to care for the weak and to inform the bishop about them. He is also not appointed to receive the spirit of excellence which the presbyters share but the spirit which is given with the authorization of the bishop.<sup>241</sup> Therefore the bishop alone ordains him. As to the presbyter, when the bishop and all the presbyters participating in his ordination lay hands on him [the presbyter], it is because the spirit which is shared by them descends upon him. But the presbyter only receives it; he has not the power to give the clerical order. That is why he is not allowed to appoint clerics. The presbyter only seals when the bishop ordains.<sup>242</sup>

239 AT 2, 7, SC 11<sup>bis</sup>, 40, 56.

240 The different versions of the text include technical differences: the Latin version speaks solely about ordaining (*ordinari*), and the Oriental version about appointing (*instituire*, Gr. *kathistastai*) and ordaining (*ordinari*, *kheirotonein*). The present translation is made primarily from the Oriental version.

241 Translated from the Latin, which reads: "*non accipiens communem praesbyteri <i>spm eum cuius participes praesbyteri sunt, sed id quod sub potestate episcopi est creditum.*" Dix 1992, 16.

242 AT 8. "De diaconis. Episcopus autem instituet (καθιστασθαι) diaconum qui electus est, secundum quod praedictum est. Episcopus ponet manus suas super eum. Propter quid diximus quod solus episcopus ponet manus suas super eum? Haec est causa (αίτία) rei : quia non ordinatur (χειροτονεῖν) in sacerdotium sed in ministerium (ὑπηρεσία) episcopi, ut faciat quae iubet ei. Neque instituitur (καθιστασθαι) ut sit consiliarius (σύμβουλος) totius cleri (κλήρος) sed ut curas agat infirmorum et moneat episcopum de eis. Neque instituitur (καθιστασθαι) ut accipiat spiritum (πνεῦμα) magnitudinis cuius presbyteri participantur (μετέχειν) sed ut sit dignus (ἄξιος) ut episcopus credat (πιστεύειν) ei quae oportet. Propterea episcopus solus est

The words 'clerical order' and 'clerics' require some attention. With their roots in the earliest Christian texts, the concepts have here taken on their definitive meaning of the permanent officials of the Church, in a word, the clergy.<sup>243</sup> According to the Latin version of the Apostolic Tradition, the clergy consist of the officials entitled to receive the imposition of hands: the bishop, presbyters, and deacons.

The Oriental version of the text introduces the ranks of confessor, widow, reader, virgin, and spiritual healer.<sup>244</sup> The confessor parallels the martyr in the vocabulary of Tertullian. A confessor who had been imprisoned could be appointed deacon or presbyter without the imposition of hands, as he had already been proven to possess the spirit by the virtue of his confession. A confessor who had experienced no physical sufferings was to be appointed with the imposition of hands to the grade he was considered worthy of. The matter was important because new officials were needed to fill the offices which were vacated in persecutions. The number of confessors also increased, causing a need for regulations as some of them tended to become too conscious of their merit, and considered themselves to be above other believers.<sup>245</sup>

---

qui ordinat (χειροτονεῖν) diaconum. Quoad presbyterum autem, quia episcopus <et omnes presbyteri> participantur (μετέχειν) eius, imponant manum super eum, quia spiritus unus est qui descendit super eum. Presbyter enim accipit solum; non est ei potestas (ἐξουσία) dare clerum (κλήρος). Quapropter non potest instituere (καθίστασθαι) clericos (κληρικός). Signat (σφραγίζειν) autem presbyterum tantum cum episcopus ordinat (χειροτονεῖν)." SC 11<sup>bis</sup>, 58-60. See Bradshaw 1990, 72.

243 The word clergy derives from the Greek word *klēros* which has several meanings, e.g. 'a lot' and 'an inheritance'. From the very beginning, the followers of Christ called themselves *klēronomoi*, as chosen from among the people of God and also as heirs to the heavenly kingdom; e.g. Acts 20:32, Gal 3:39, Col 1:12. Cf. Acts 1:26. Schmemmann 1975, 100; Faivre 1990, 5-6.

244 These have been considered 'lay ministries'. Faivre 1990, 80-81; 1977, 48-49; Gamble 1995, 221. Harnack 1886a, 87-88 states that they possessed a rank, not an office.

245 AT 9. "De confessoribus. Confessor (ὁμολογητής) autem, si fuit in vinculis propter nomen domini, non imponetur manus super eum ad diaconatum (διακονία) vel presbyteratum (-πρεσβύτερος). Habet enim honorem (τιμή) presbyteratus (-πρεσβύτερος) per suam confessionem (ὁμολογία). Si autem instituitur (καθίστασθαι) episcopus, imponetur ei manus. Si autem confessor (ὁμολογητής)

The widows are appointed, "not ordained, but called by that title", for the duty of praying. It is emphasized that ordination only applied to the clergy who answered for the liturgy: a widow did not receive the imposition of hands because she had no liturgical duties.<sup>246</sup> The word 'liturgy', generally meaning any public service or other service, with its derivatives also has several meanings in the ecclesiastical vocabulary. All divine services were liturgies, but here is meant the most important of them, the Eucharistic liturgy.<sup>247</sup>

The appointment of the reader includes no laying-on of hands either. The bishop shall give him 'the book', which is not further specified. Different manuscripts define it as 'a gospel' or 'a book of the Apostles', probably alluding to the same kind of book.<sup>248</sup> Considering that the Apostolic Tradition derives from Rome, we may here make a note of the earliest inscription of a reader, simply with the words 'Favor the reader'. It has been estimated to derive from the second century.<sup>249</sup>

Virgins shall not be appointed because they have made their choice voluntarily.<sup>250</sup> The subdeacon is nominated to follow the deacon, i.e. to be his

---

est qui non est ductus coram potestate (ἐξουσία) neque castigatus est (κολάζειν) in catenis, neque inclusus est in carcere, [...] si autem confessus est (ὁμολογεῖν), quocumque officio (κλήρος) sit dignus, imponatur manus super eum." SC 11<sup>bis</sup>, 27-28, 64. Faivre 1990, 82.

246 AT 10. "De viduis. Vidua (χήρα) autem cum instituitur (καθίστασθαι) non ordinatur (χειροτονεῖν) sed eligitur ex nomine. Si autem vir eius mortuus est a tempore magno, instituitur (καθίστασθαι). [...] Instituitur (καθίστασθαι) vidua (χήρα) per verbum tantum et se iungat cum reliquo. Non autem imponetur manus super eam, quia non offert oblationem (προσφορά) neque habet liturgiam (λειτουργία). Ordinatio (χειροτονία) autem fit cum clero (κλήρος) propter liturgiam (λειτουργία). Vidua (χήρα) autem instituitur (καθίστασθαι) propter orationem : haec autem est omnium." SC 11<sup>bis</sup>, 66. Faivre 1990, 75ff.

247 Lampe 1961, 795; Sophocles 1914, 709.

248 AT 11. "De lectore. Lector (ἀναγνώστης) instituetur (καθίστασθαι) cum episcopus dabit ei librum, non autem imponetur manus super eum." SC 11<sup>bis</sup>, 66; Dix 1992, 21.

249 "FAVOR LECTOR". ILCV I, 245, nr. 1265A. Leclercq 1929, 2246; Kaufmann 1917, 267. Page 2010, 106, dates the inscription later, to the middle of the 3<sup>rd</sup> century. For reader inscriptions in general, see Faivre 1977, 388-389, and Page 2010, 124-127.

250 AT 12. "De virgine. Non imponetur manus super virginem (παρθένος), sed propositum (προαίρεσις) tantum facit eam virginem (παρθένος)." SC 11<sup>bis</sup>, 68. Dix

assistant.<sup>251</sup> Traditionally, there were seven deacons; in a city like Rome, their duties must have been considerable in number, thus necessitating more workers. The establishment of the subdeaconate probably occurred in the latter half of the second century.<sup>252</sup> Finally, persons possessing the gift of healing are mentioned. They receive no specific title, and they are not appointed, as their works shall testify to their calling.<sup>253</sup> In a latter section of the church order, the teacher (*doctor*) of the catechumens is mentioned. He could be either a cleric or a layman.<sup>254</sup>

The itemized statutes of the Apostolic Tradition form the basis for the ranks of the ecclesiastical hierarchy. From now on, the rank of reader is considered one of the regular offices of the Church.

## 2.2.5 The reader in the *Didascalia Apostolorum* and the Apostolic Church Order

The Syriac *Didascalia Apostolorum*, which belongs to the genre of church orders, was written in the form of a sermon ca. 230. The text is directed to all

---

1992, 21.

251 AT 13. "De subdiacono. Non imponetur manus super subdiaconum, sed nominabitur (ὀνομάζειν) ut sequatur diaconum." SC 11<sup>bis</sup>, 68.

252 Harnack 1886a, 91; Davies 1963, 6-7; Bradshaw 1990, 93.

253 AT 14. "De gratiis curationum. Si quis autem dicit: accepi gratiam curationis in revelatione (ἀποκάλυψις), non imponetur manus super eum. Ipsa enim res manifestabit an dixerit veritatem. SC 11<sup>bis</sup>, 68.

254 AT 19. "De impositione manus super catechumenos. Cum doctor post prece[m] imposuit manum super catechumenos, oret et dimittat eos. Sive clericus (ἐκκλησιαστικός), sive laicus (λαϊκός), faciat sic. [...]" SC 11<sup>bis</sup>, 76. Faivre 1990, 78-79, states a tendency would have existed for the *doctor* to belong to the clergy, which the writer of the Apostolic Tradition "discreetly opposed". Page 2010, 240, mentions that in a 10<sup>th</sup>-century antiphoner the reader is called *doctor*; "implying advanced literate and even theological skills". See also du Cange 1938, 454.

believers as well as to the ecclesiastical ranks, which are named bishop, deacon, deaconess, presbyter, reader, widow, and orphan.<sup>255</sup>

All but one of these are provided with sacred metaphors, which derive from the Temple of Jerusalem, the priests and Levites of which have now become presbyters and deacons, orphans and widows, the bishop being the high priest. Other allegories are based on the Trinity, comparing the bishop to God, the deacon to Christ, and the deaconess to the holy Spirit.<sup>256</sup> Further, widows and orphans are to be seen as the altar, and the presbyters as the apostles.<sup>257</sup>

The reader is not referred to by any model taken from the Temple, or from the Divinity: instead, he appears in the section which treats of the alms to be distributed at the suppers given for indigent widows. Each of them was entitled to receive a share of alms, and the stipends of the ecclesiastical officials were also distributed on the same occasion. In calculating the stipends, the widow's share was the basic unit: the bishop was entitled to receive two double shares, and deacons and presbyters one double share. The same amount was also given to the reader, if he was present, while the share of the bishop was to be set apart even if he were not present.<sup>258</sup>

At the time, not all bishops were erudite; on the requirements of the bishop, the text reads: "But if it be possible, let him be instructed and apt to teach; but if he know not letters, let him be versed and skilled in the word [...]." <sup>259</sup> Nevertheless, the author exhorts all believers – directing this instruction to males – to read the

---

255 The original Greek text has for the most part been lost, and the text is based on Latin and Syriac translations. Bradshaw 1992, 87-88; Achelis-Flemming 1904, 243, 378.

256 The deaconesses were females who had made a vow of celibacy, and thus were virgins or widows. OKK 1980, 178; Davies 1963, 5-6.

257 DA IX: "For they [i.e. bishops] are your high priests; but the priests and Levites now are the presbyters and deacons, and the orphans and widows [...]. And the deaconess shall be honoured by you in the place of the Holy Spirit; and the presbyters shall be to you in the likeness of the Apostles; and the orphans and widows shall be reckoned by you in the likeness of the altar." Transl. of Connolly 1929, 36. Achelis-Flemming 1904, 45.

258 DA IX, Connolly 1929, 37; Achelis-Flemming 1904, 46.

259 DA IV, Connolly 1929, 10; Achelis-Flemming 1904, 13.

holy scriptures and, indeed, nothing else. Those who want to sing hymns, shall sing the Psalms of David.<sup>260</sup> With regard to divine services, the text treats the Easter vigil, where the prophetic books, the Gospel, and the Psalms are read.<sup>261</sup> On the actual practice of singing or reading, nothing is mentioned.

The qualities of the reader are further defined in the Apostolic Church Order, written either in Syria or in Egypt, probably at the end of the third century.<sup>262</sup> The ecclesiastical ranks treated in the document are those of bishop, presbyter, deacon, reader, and widow.<sup>263</sup> The reader shall not just read but also explain the texts, as is written in the name of the apostle Jacob:

As a reader shall be appointed, after he has been carefully proven, no chatterbox, no drinker or jester, but well-behaved, obedient, prudent, the first to arrive at the assemblies on the day of the Lord, dutiful, skilled to explain, aware of working in the position of the evangelist. Because he who fills the ears of those who do not understand shall be written into the account written by God.<sup>264</sup>

Between these two documents may lie half a century or more, and possibly also a geographical distance. Nevertheless, it seems that in the community of the *Didascalía*, the presence of the reader was not a matter of course, as he is not mentioned among the ranks which possess sacred paragons. The Apostolic Church Order considers the reader equal to the evangelist, a spiritual teacher.

260 DA II, Connolly 1929, 4; Achelis-Flemming 1904, 5.

261 DA XXI, Achelis-Flemming 1904, 111-112, 288, 374; Connolly 1929, 93.

262 Traditionally, the date of the text has been set at the end of the 3<sup>rd</sup> century; the earlier date between the years 200-235 is given by Alistair Stewart-Sykes in 2006, mentioned in Berger 2011, 139<sup>46</sup>. The Apostolic Church Order has been preserved in several languages. Harnack 1886b, 215-216; Bradshaw 1992, 84-86, 88-89; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 90.

263 Harnack 1886b, 225-226.

264 The Apostolic Church Order 19: "Ἰάκωβος εἶπεν · ἀναγνώστης καθιστανέσθω πρῶτον δοκιμῇ δεδοκιμασμένος, μὴ γλωσσοκόπος, μὴ μέθυσος μήτε γελωτολόγος, εὐτροπος, εὐπειθής, εὐγνώμων, ἐν ταῖς κυριακαῖς συνόδοις πρῶτος σύνδρομος, εὐήκοος, διηγητικός, εἰδὼς ὅτι εὐαγγελιστοῦ τόπον ἐργάζεται. ὁ γὰρ ἐμπιπλῶν ὧτα μὴ νοοῦντος ἔγγραφος λογισθήσεται παρὰ τῷ θεῷ." Harnack 1886b, 234, remarks also that as this order precedes the corresponding stipulation regarding the deacon in the text, it proves how important the reader was.

### 2.2.6 Readers in the letters of Cyprian of Carthage and Cornelius of Rome

Until the middle of the third century, the persecutions of Christians were local in character. Emperor Decius (249-251) instigated the first general persecution, which was systematic and occasioned the church serious problems. One of these was the replacement of clerics who became imprisoned or were put to death. Further, under fear and torment, many believers repudiated their faith in some way or another. When matters settled down, they sought to return to the Church, which, however, considered them fallen. The question of how to deal with these people was especially difficult when they had belonged to the clergy.<sup>265</sup>

The ecclesiastical life of the time is illuminated by the letters of Cyprian, the bishop of Carthage.<sup>266</sup> On one occasion, he mentions two subdeacons and an acolyte<sup>267</sup> – a member of the second sub-category of the diaconate – who had lapsed during the persecution. When subsequently these wanted to return, Cyprian states that he could not decide the matter alone. He orders, however, that, for a time, those returning to the church were not to receive their monthly remuneration; this is one of the earliest allusions to the payment of regular wages to ecclesiastics.<sup>268</sup>

The first stage of a clerical career was evidently the office of reader. This appears in the case of Aurelius, a youth who had confessed twice. Cyprian already estimates him worthy of a higher rank, but first Aurelius was to be instructed in reading, "to come to the desk after the scaffold".<sup>269</sup> Another young

---

265 The problem of the fallen (*lapsi*) continued until the Council of Nicaea 325. ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 951, 88, 976.

266 Cyprian acted as the bishop of Carthage from ca. 248 to his death in 258, but he had to sojourn in exile during the persecution of Decius. At the time, he contacted his congregation by letters. ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 1308. All the letters referred to in this section are from the year 250.

267 Cf. p. 27 above.

268 Epistle XXVII, ANF 5, 306. Cf. Faivre 1990, 108.

269 Epistle XXXII, the quotation from ANF 5, 311-312.

confessor, Celerinus, was to join him; Cyprian already plans to grant both youths the rank of presbyter. This would also give them a better income.<sup>270</sup> Thus, it seems that also during the persecution, the church was able to retain its officials.

Cyprian also mentions that he had appointed Satorius to be a reader, after this, "once and again", had served in the office on Easter Sunday. The wording implies that practical training for reading was implemented in the real situation of the divine service and, that bishop alone decided on the appointment of readers.<sup>271</sup>

In 250, the church of Rome lost its bishop Fabian to the persecution. The new bishop was elected fourteen months later, the two presentees Cornelius and Novatian seriously disagreeing on the procedure concerning fallen clerics. On the election of Cornelius, Novatian, with his supporters, raised a schism which had to be settled by a synod, the result being the excommunication of the Novatianists.<sup>272</sup> After the synod, Cornelius wrote a letter to Fabius, the bishop of Antioch, to inform him about Novatian and his undertakings, also mentioning the number of the people of his church: "forty-six presbyters, seven deacons, seven sub-deacons, forty-two acolytes, fifty-two exorcists, readers, and door-keepers, and more than fifteen hundred widows and distressed persons."<sup>273</sup>

The list given by Cornelius is a valuable document concerning both the number of the clergy and the organization of the church; the reason for entering the numbers of each rank in the letter may have been the recent modification to the administrative structure of the Roman Church. According to the *Liber Pontificalis*, the reform had been established by the late bishop Fabian who "divided the districts for the deacons and appointed seven subdeacons to

---

270 Epistle XXXIII, ANF 5, 312-314. Cf. Wipszycka 1993, 213; Page 2010, 105-106.

271 Epistle XXIII, ANF 5, 301.

272 The synod excommunicated the Novatianists and agreed with an earlier decision by a Carthaginian council that the fallen clerics would, after a period of repentance, be readmitted to the Church but as laymen. Kelly 1986, 16-19; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 594, 418, 1165.

273 Eusebius HE 6.43.11, edition of Louth 1989, 216.

supervise seven notaries so that they would reliably collect the acts of the martyrs, [...]"<sup>274</sup>

The roots of this structural reform were probably in the secular administration. Since the era of Emperor Augustus, the city of Rome had been divided into fourteen districts. For each of them, an overseer was elected yearly; among his responsibilities were e.g. the granting of building licenses for the shrines of the Lares, and the making of local offerings. The system was modified just before the era of Fabian by the emperors Elagabalus (218-222) and Alexander Severus (222-235). The former had aimed to appoint city prefects for each region, but he did not live long enough to carry out the plan. The latter established fourteen curators as a kind of lower mayoral office. The territorial division by Fabian thus followed the existing municipal structure, each of the seven deacons answering for an area of two municipal districts.<sup>275</sup>

The rank of acolytes, deriving from the diaconate, appears in the ecclesiastical vocabulary at the same time in both Rome and Carthage. The number of Roman acolytes, forty-two, comprises six acolytes for each of the seven ecclesiastical regions, the subdeacon being 'a kind of head acolyte', and all of them subordinate to the deacon.<sup>276</sup>

The number of regions is not derivable from the number of other officials: forty-six presbyters, and fifty-two exorcists, readers, and doorkeepers in all. By alluding to the combined total of the three offices, the number leaves us uninformed about the number of men officiating in each separate rank.<sup>277</sup>

---

274 Vita Fabiani: "Hic [Fabianus] regiones divisit diaconibus et fecit VII subdiaconos qui septem notariis inminerent ut gesta martyrum fideliter colligerent, [...]." LP I, 65.

The earliest versions of the *Liber Pontificalis* probably derive from the 6<sup>th</sup> century. Faivre 1977, 347; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 977.

275 Galles 1981, 18. Cf. Harnack 1886a, 101-103.

276 Regarding the noun *acolyte*, see p. 27 above; Liddell and Scott 1940, I, 52; TLL I, 419; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 594; Davies 1963, 7-8; Galles 1981, 18; Kelly 1986, 16-17.

Harnack 1886a, 96, compares the acolytes with the *calatores* of the Arval Brethren.

277 Cf. Harnack 1886a, 60-61; Page 2010, 104, 117-118.

The title of exorcist appears here for the first time, but his function may be considered as succeeding that of the spiritual healer of the Apostolic Tradition. In principle, every believer potentially had the power to banish evil spirits. The reason for the establishment of a separate rank for this task was that the number of believers, including the numbers of distressed individuals, was constantly growing. The office of the exorcist may have combined pastoral care and charity: first, the exorcists answered for the purification of the catechumens before baptism. This was a solitary act; on a continuous basis were treated the energumens. These were people who were considered to be possessed by evil spirits; nowadays such individuals might be diagnosed as mentally ill or epileptics. It is not possible to state if the office of the exorcist was established primarily for the benefit of the catechumens or energumens.<sup>278</sup>

The office of doorkeeper does not need explanation. The appearance of all three ranks – exorcists, readers, and doorkeepers – together has been explained by the character of their offices which, although connected with the sacred, were purely mechanical: the exorcists had fixed formulas to say, the readers the scriptures to read from, and the doorkeepers were merely the porters of the sanctuary.<sup>279</sup>

### **2.2.7 Two documents from the time of the Diocletian persecution**

In 303, Emperor Diocletian initiated the Great Persecution against Christians, with the purpose of annihilating them both corporeally and spiritually.<sup>280</sup> One

---

278 Davies 1963, 8-10. The rank of exorcist appears for the first time in inscriptions in the 3<sup>rd</sup> century. The epitaph of Flavius Latinus, the bishop of Brescia, lists his ecclesiastical career which had begun with twelve years as an exorcist, continued with fifteen years in the presbyterate, and was completed by three years and seven months in the episcopate. Kaufmann 1917, 246; ILCV I n. 1038, 198; CIL V, n. 4846.

279 Harnack 1886a, 61, 97<sup>89</sup>.

280 ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 482-483, 1257-1259.

document deriving from the time reports the confiscation of the property of the church of Cirta, in North Africa, also giving some details of the rank of the readers.

The confiscation was executed by the local *flamen* of the emperor, Munatius Felix, who was assisted by at least one public servant.<sup>281</sup> On their arrival in the church, the bishop was present with three presbyters, two deacons, four subdeacons and six grave-diggers.<sup>282</sup> Everything was taken, from vessels, lamps, and candlesticks made of precious metals to the baptismal clothing.<sup>283</sup> The scriptures were also demanded, and one of the subdeacons brought a book (*codex*). This did not satisfy the *flamen* who insisted on receiving all the church scriptures.<sup>284</sup> Two subdeacons answered that the books were in the possession of the readers. When the *flamen* asked for the readers, the subdeacons pretended they did not know anything about them, and were arrested.

Eventually, the identity of the seven<sup>285</sup> readers was revealed, and the confiscators arrived, first, at the house of the reader Eugenius, who surrendered four books. Thereafter, two scribes led them to the houses of the other readers: Felix the tailor gave five books, Victorinus eight, and Proiectus five bigger books and two smaller ones. Victor the grammarian – probably a school-teacher and also the church copyist – produced two books and four *quiniones*.<sup>286</sup> The

---

281 S. Optati Milevitani Libri VII. Appendix. I. Gesta apud Zenophilum, CSEL XXVI, 187-188.

282 The word translated as grave-diggers, *fossores*, may also mean just plain workers. Du Cange III, 579; Dix 1945, 24, calls them sextons.

283 The amount of clothing was not small: eighty-two tunics of females and sixteen tunics of males, thirteen pairs of men's shoes, and forty-eight pairs of women's shoes.

284 Luijendijk 2008, 351, remarks that the books had probably been hidden by the readers; the text reveals that the book cupboards in the church were empty.

285 Cf. p. 42 above.

286 These smaller books were unbound (*quiniones*). Speaking about books (*codices*) indicates that the question was no longer about the scroll which had earlier been the standard form of the scriptures, but about a leaf book. Its earliest form had been made of wooden writing-tablets which were bound together. Changing the material from wood to papyrus or to parchment produced a lighter book with the possibility of binding more sheets together. Gamble 1995, 44ff.

*flamen* was convinced that he had more scriptures and insisted on having all of them, without result, while from Euticius the Caesarean<sup>287</sup> the confiscators received nothing. At the house of Coddeo, six books were delivered by his wife. The *flamen* was not satisfied and sent the public servant to search for more, without avail. In all, thirty-seven volumes were confiscated from the church of Cirta.<sup>288</sup>

The persecution continued, and one year later the church of the Egyptian village of Chysis was the object of a repeated confiscation. The preserved document reveals that a reader had to report on the property of the church. He assured the authorities that the church possessed nothing more, neither articles of value, nor slaves, nor beasts: the only valuable property of the church, a bronze gate, had already been taken away. The subscription of the document reads: "I, Aurelios Ammonios swore the oath as aforesaid. Aurelios Serenos wrote for him because he does not know letters."<sup>289</sup>

The wording indicates a reader ignorant of letters. To explain the case, it has been stated that as the vernacular of Chysis was Coptic, Aurelios Ammonios would not have been able to write in Greek, which was the language of the papyrus.<sup>290</sup> However, the similarities between the Coptic and the Greek alphabet mean that a person literate in Coptic would not have been incapable of signing in Greek. Only a short formula with a signature was required; that would not have been insuperable. But, as the subscription alludes to an oath sworn "by the genius of our lords the emperors", these being Diocletian and Maximian, and

---

287 Harnack 1886a, 63<sup>16</sup>, states that *Caesariensis* would mean an imperial servant. It may also allude to the region Mauretania Caesariensis, or the town Caesarea on its coast. Lewis and Short 1993, 265. There were at least two other cities with the name Caesarea in antiquity: in Palestine, and in Cappadocia, Asia Minor.

288 Afterwards, the weakness of the bishop and his subordinates was condemned by a synod. There, one of those who had delivered scriptures claimed to have surrendered medical scriptures instead of biblical. Hefele 1873, 145.

289 OP XXXIII, 106-107.

290 OP XXXIII, 108; Gamble 1995, 3-4.

Constantius and Galerius, to sign would have been an act of apostasy, which Aurelios Ammonios thus avoided.<sup>291</sup>

The significance of these two documents lies in their human dimension. All seven readers in the church of Cirta were evidently part-time officials, although the document mentions only the trade of three of them.<sup>292</sup> At Chysis, the reader, probably in a similar position, was the last man left to report on the non-existent belongings of the church.

### **2.3 References to ecclesiastical singing in the first centuries**

This chapter began with the point of origin of ecclesiastical singing, but the subject was put in abeyance in order to trace the development of the ecclesiastical hierarchy and the rank of the reader in it. In this process, we encountered singing only in the Syriac *Didascalia*: first, in the instructions for the believers to sing the psalms of David, and second, in the allusion to the psalmody during the Easter vigil. Other writings from the late second and third centuries include occasional mentions of singing, and thus serve as circumstantial evidence in the attempt to outline its character.

Until now, no attention has been paid to the fact that among the believers, doctrinal emphases varied between distinct groups. Further, not all the writings attributed to the apostles were considered genuine. The gospels and acts which eventually remained outside the corpus of the New Testament form a literary genre of their own, the New Testament Apocrypha.<sup>293</sup>

---

291 Wipszycka 1993, 212-213.

292 Dix 1945, 25-26, states that the church of Cirta was small, and thus "the majority of its clergy were quite evidently 'of the people'." Cf. Luijendijk 2008, 347<sup>16</sup>.

293 ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 85.

The canonical gospels of Matthew and Mark mention that before leaving for the Mount of Olives, Jesus sang a hymn with his disciples.<sup>294</sup> The apocryphal Acts of John convey the text of the hymn, with the description of its singing: having arranged the disciples in a circle, holding hands with each other, Jesus stepped in the middle of the circle to lead the hymn. After every verse sung by him, the disciples responded with an Amen.<sup>295</sup>

Had the book been accepted as part of the canonical New Testament, perhaps singing in a circle would have come to form part of the liturgy. The reason why the Acts of John did not become a canonical book is its Gnostic emphasis; syncretizing Christianity with other religious and philosophical concepts, Gnosticism was considered heretical.<sup>296</sup> The same applies to the works of Bardesanes, who was a deacon or a presbyter in the church of Edessa. Inspired by the form of the biblical psalms, he wrote the same number – one hundred and fifty – of hymns to be sung as their interludes. They were written to melodies possibly composed by his son, Harmonios. The hymns became well-known not only in Syria but throughout the whole of the Orient.<sup>297</sup>

---

294 Matt 26:30, Mark 14:26.

295 Acts of John 94-96, Schneemelcher 1989, 165-168. The Greek text derives from the 2<sup>nd</sup>/ 3<sup>rd</sup> century, but the particulars of its provenance are not definable. Altaner-Stuiber 1993, 137-138; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 881; Page 2010, 30-32.

296 The meaning of the term Gnosticism, which emerged in the second century, denotes striving for knowledge (*gnōsis*) of God and of mankind. Gnosticism comprised several directions and movements, and caused controversy for centuries. ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 683-684; Castrén 2011, 468-469. Of the books of the New Testament Apocrypha, the Acts of Thomas also include hymn texts. Two of the total of four are set in liturgical environments: at the act of purification before baptism and at the consecration of the Eucharist, rendered by the Apostle himself. Schneemelcher 1989, 303ff., 343-348. The Acts of Thomas were written before the middle of the third century, and they have been preserved in Syriac and Greek. Altaner-Stuiber 1993, 138; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 1613.

297 Bardesanes, who is considered the originator of Syriac poetry, lived in 154-222; his followers were called 'Bardisanites', and included the presumed writer of the Acts of Thomas, Philip. The sect survived for several centuries. Leclercq 1910, 493-495; Nau 1923, 398-401; Wellesz 1961, 40; McVey 1989, 26; Velimirović 1990, 4; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 1613, 157; Zmorzanka 2000.

The significance of Bardesanes for ecclesiastical singing is manifested indirectly. As his hymns are stated to have become popular, it has been assumed that the ecclesiastical singing of the time, around the turn of the second and the third Christian centuries, had already become very formal, even stagnated. This would explain why the change in the repertoire was welcomed by the people.<sup>298</sup>

Indeed, the Acts of Thaddaeus assume the early establishment of the psalmody in Syria. According to the text, the Apostle, together with King Abgar, "destroyed heathen temples and instituted churches, and after ordaining one of the disciples overseer, and elders and servants, taught them the rule of psalmody and the holy liturgy".<sup>299</sup> As Syria is the central region in the early history of ecclesiastical singing, it could well be that the tradition of psalmody had been established there since the time of the apostles. However, the provenance of the apocryphal text remains too obscure to allow further conclusions to be drawn.

Perhaps, the psalmody was considered self-evident, as the preserved documents seem to mention only those who departed from tradition. Some forty decades after Bardesanes, the notorious Paul of Samosata, who was elected bishop of the Syrian Antioch in 260, appears on the scene. Paul had gained prosperity through business activity, which he continued to conduct after entering on an ecclesiastical career, giving thus general offence. In the realm of theology, he adhered to a Christological doctrine, which considered Jesus Christ a mere human being who had acquired the epithet 'Son of God' because of his

---

298 Idelsohn 1948, 99.

299 *Acta Thaddaei*: "5. Ὁ δὲ Θαδδαῖος σὺν τῷ Ἀβγάρῳ κατέλυσεν εἰδωλεῖα καὶ ἔκτισεν ἐκκλησίας, <καὶ> χειροτονήσας ἕνα τῶν μαθητῶν αὐτοῦ ἐπίσκοπον καὶ πρεσβυτέρους καὶ διακόνους, παρέδωκεν αὐτοῖς τὸν κανόνα τῆς ψαλμῶδίας καὶ τῆς ἱερᾶς λειτουργίας." Lipsius 1990, 275. The apostle who is mentioned in Matt 10:3 and Mark 3:8 has been identified with Jude and Addai, who is considered to have been the founder of the church of Edessa in Syria. The text has been preserved in several versions and languages, but of its date nothing definite can be stated; according to Altaner-Stuiber 1993, 139, the Greek *Acta Thaddaei* would derive from as late as the 6<sup>th</sup> century. See also Schneemelcher 1989, 436-437; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 1596.

good and righteous deeds.<sup>300</sup> Furthermore, Paul confused ecclesiastical moral conceptions by favouring relations between the sexes in a so-called spiritual marriage. He also favoured women by permitting them to sing in the church. The public singing of women was considered objectionable because it was common among pagan cults and also among heretics; for example, Bardesanes and his followers had introduced female choirs.<sup>301</sup>

A description of the malpractices of Paul is preserved in a synodical letter. Among other matters, it states how Paul "abandoned the psalms sung to our Lord Jesus Christ as if they had been new and composed by younger men; he himself introduced women to sing psalms in the middle of the church on Easter day, and whoever heard them, shuddered."<sup>302</sup> The wording implies that the choir was conducted by Paul himself.

The essence of the psalms which Paul abandoned, and the essence of those sung by the women, is not known to us. The allusion to the recent provenance of the former is enigmatic; the original Greek noun has also been translated as 'hymns'.<sup>303</sup>

---

300 The definition given here is an extreme simplification. See e.g. ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 1242.

301 Quasten 1941, 163; 1973, 116ff.; Werner 1959, 345.

302 *Epistola synodica ex concilio Antiocheno secundo*: "[... ] ψαλμούς δὲ τοὺς μὴν εἰς τὸν κύριον ἡμῶν Ἰησοῦν Χριστὸν παύσας, ὡς δὴ νεωτέρους καὶ νεωτέρων ἀνδρῶν συγγράμματα · εἰς ἑαυτὸν δὲ ἐν μέσῃ τῇ ἐκκλησίᾳ τῇ μεγάλῃ τοῦ πάσχα ἡμέρα, ψαλμῶδεῖν γυναικῆς παρασκευάζων, ὧν καὶ ἀκούσας ἂν τις φρίξειεν· [... ]" Mansi I, 1098. The case of Paul was treated by several synods, and he was deposed in 268. Hefele 1873, 135ff.; Lebeau 1967, 26; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 1242; Seppälä 2012, 42.

303 Eusebius HE 7.30, edition of Louth 1989, 247. As to the vocabulary, see Lampe 1961, 1540; cf. Wellesz 1961, 40.

## 2.4 Summary

This chapter examined the development of the hierarchical structure of the Christian Church in its earliest centuries. At the core of the Christian ecclesia was the celebration of the Eucharist, which, as an outward act, separated the Christians from the Jews: although Judaeo-Christians probably also aimed to attend the synagogue, they were no longer welcome. To survive, Christian assemblies had to adopt features of the legally constituted associations of Roman society. These features were introduced to the emperors of Rome in the report by Pliny on the Bithynian Christians, and by the apologists Justin and Tertullian, the former in Rome, the latter in Carthage. The emperors of Rome changed, some of them being more suspicious of Christians than others, instigating persecution of the believers either locally or generally. During times of unrest, though, the Church managed not only to survive but also to settle on its organization, the structure of which was based on the Pastoral Letters. The functional offices of the overseer, elder and servant, turned into the hierarchical orders of the bishop, presbyters and deacons in course of time. All these had a role in the celebration of the Eucharist, and formed thus the highest ecclesiastical ranks.

Jesus of Nazareth had fulfilled the prophecies of the Bible, and his disciples testified to his resurrection and ascension not only by word of mouth but also in writing: thus, reading was characteristic in Christian assemblies. In 1 Tim, both teaching and public reading of scriptures is urged, and the New Testament letters in general were meant to be read also for other communities than those to whom they were originally addressed. The reading of apostolic writings in the liturgical environment is first recorded after the middle of the second century by Justin Martyr, who in his Apology mentions the reading of both them and prophetic scriptures at the beginning of the Sunday morning assembly. The person of the reader remains undefined until the turn of the second and third centuries, when

Tertullian refers to the reader as an ecclesiastical official in Carthage. The Apostolic Tradition, deriving probably from Rome in the first quarter of the third century, defines his standing: the reader shall be appointed by the bishop, who gives him a book, but he does not receive the imposition of hands like the three higher orders.

The third-century Apostolic Church Order – originating either in Syria or Egypt – however, requires the reader to have the skills of an evangelist; not only for the purpose of reading the texts but also for that of explaining them. In the Syriac *Didascalia*, the reader is mentioned as the equal of the presbyters and deacons in the distribution of alms; the remuneration of ecclesiastical ranks is confirmed also by Cyprian of Carthage in the middle of the century. In his letters, Cyprian implies that the office of reading was the first stage in an ecclesiastical career. Indeed, in the contemporaneous letter of Cornelius of Rome, readers are included, along with exorcists and doorkeepers as part of a combined group, mentioned after all other ecclesiastical ranks – including two sub-categories of the diaconate, namely subdeacons and acolytes – while the numbers of all other ranks are recorded separately.

The letters of Cyprian also implied several readers; a documented number of readers of a church exists for the Egyptian town of Circa, where, at the time of the Diocletian persecution, it was seven. If this was the permanent number, we do not know; the readers were evidently part-time officials, as the other occupations of some of them are recorded in the document which describes the visits to their homes for the confiscation of their books. The reason for the readers keeping the books at home had either to do with rehearsing the readings, or with attempting to hide the books from persecutors.

According to Justin Martyr, apostolic and prophetic books were read. Among the latter would have belonged the Psalter, although nothing about psalm singing is implied there. Elsewhere in his First Apology, Justin mentions the singing of hymns. From the turn of the second and third centuries on, psalms and hymns

are alluded to in the writings of Tertullian, both in the divine service and at meals. Tertullian also provides evidence of common responses, and, indirectly, for reading and psalm singing as parts of the beginning of the divine service.

The singing of the biblical psalms is emphasized in the Syriac *Didascalia Apostolorum* and in the sources concerning the third-century Syrian heretics Bardesanes and Paul of Samosata. Thus, it seems that there was an established tradition of psalmody, which was not to be disturbed by new songs, let alone heretical ones. However, the only references to the leader of the singing appear in the letter condemning Paul of Samosata – who evidently conducted his female choir himself – and in the apocryphal Acts of John, where Jesus himself is described as leading the hymn sung by his disciples.



## 3 The fourth century

### 3.1 The establishment of ecclesiastical life

#### 3.1.1 Ecclesiastical and imperial legislation in the Constantinian era

In the era of Constantine I, the position of the Christians underwent major changes, with the Emperor himself convening the first general council of the Church at Nicaea in 325.<sup>304</sup> The main reason for the council was to strengthen the unity of the Church and to put an end to the various schisms. Although the emphasis was on doctrinal issues, the canons of the council also outline the principles concerning the different ecclesiastical orders.

The canons of Nicaea confirm the three-fold hierarchical structure, separately mentioning the titles of bishop, presbyter and deacon. The existence of other ranks is implied in periphrases like "all who are examined in the canon", "many in the canon" and "each of those in the canon", indicating that the number and titles of the lower orders varied locally.<sup>305</sup>

All the phrases given above include the word 'canon', which is used in three meanings.<sup>306</sup> First, ecclesiastical regulations in general are separate canons. Together these form 'the canon' as the body of the law of the Church, and

---

304 Although the Council of Nicaea is considered the first universal council, eastern Christendom was better represented there than western Christendom. The exact number and names of all those present are not known; according to the tradition, the number of participants was 318, but a more likely estimate would be between 220 and 250. Of these, only eight are thought to have been from the West. The Council promulgated twenty genuine canons, the Creed, and a synodal letter; an official account of the council may never have been written. Tanner 1990, 1-2; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 1144-1145.

305 In the translation of Tanner: "in general anyone enrolled in any rank of the clergy" (Nic. 16), "enrolled [among the clergy]" (Nic. 17), and "all in general whose names have been included in the roll" (Nic. 19). Tanner 1990, 13, 14, 15. Cf. OKK 1980, 65, in the explanation of 17<sup>th</sup> Apostolic Canon. Cf. Wipszycka 1993, 181.

306 The word *kanōn* refers to objects from a straight rod to a practical yardstick or ruler; hence the concept of a rule. Liddell and Scott 1998, 347-348; Ohme 2004, 2, 8-9.

possess absolute authority.<sup>307</sup> The term canon refers also to the roll, or list, on which the names of all the ecclesiastics of a local church were recorded.<sup>308</sup>

The second canon of Nicaea repeats one of the principles concerning the ecclesiastical orders. Based on 1 Tim 3:6-7, it warns about appointing recently converted persons to the clergy, alluding to cases where a bishop or a presbyter has been ordained immediately after baptism.<sup>309</sup> As the era of the persecutions, during which rapid ordinations had sometimes been necessary, was over, the concern over a sufficient time-lag between baptism and ordination must have been for another reason.

The reason was probably the strengthened status of the Church, favoured by Constantine by legislative measures ever since the granting of freedom of religion throughout the Empire in 313. For a start, clerics were relieved from civil obligations and public services.<sup>310</sup> Some of these duties, like the collection of taxes, were experienced as burdensome and disagreeable while some were costly for wealthier citizens who were obliged to join the municipal council. Such exemptions had earlier been privileges of the priests of the state religion, and the enactment was the first step on the way to Christianity becoming the official religion of the Roman Empire.<sup>311</sup>

As the exemptions granted were significant, persons with affluence were tempted to enter upon an ecclesiastical career. To hinder malpractice, another decree was issued. It restricted recruitment to the appointment of substitutes for

---

307 Nic. 13, Tanner 1990, 12.

308 Hefele 1873, 420-421; Sparksman 1981, 38-39; Ohme 2004, 15 ff.

309 Nic. 2, Tanner 1990, 6-7.

310 CT XVI, 2, 1-2, Pharr 1952, 440-441. For compulsory public services, *ibid.* 577, 578-579. Cf. Eusebius, HE 10,7, on the text of a letter to the African proconsul Anulinus. ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 405, 1086. The body of the laws, *Codex Theodosianus*, includes statutes from both the eastern and the western Empire from Constantine I to Emperor Theodosius II (408-450). It was published in 438. Kaser 1968, 5; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 1601; AKK 2000, 106.

311 Norwich 1990, 32; Cameron 1993, 66; Clauss 1993, 164. A corresponding exemption from curial duties was also granted to the officials of the synagogue. Jones 1964, 93, 946.

deceased clerics and the election of their successors. These were to be chosen solely from among men "who have slender fortunes and who are not held bound to such compulsory municipal services".<sup>312</sup> Further, already in the year following the Council of Nicaea, Constantine issued a sanction: if a person bound to the performance of municipal duties was found to have been received into the clergy, he was to lose his ecclesiastical status and return to his civil obligations.<sup>313</sup>

### 3.1.2 The structure of the ecclesiastical hierarchy

The Nicaean canons include some regulations concerning clerical appointments. First, at the ordination of a bishop, all bishops of the province, or at least three of them, were to be present.<sup>314</sup> The details of the appointment of presbyters and other clergy are not defined but, indirectly, the canons indicate the practice of the imposition of hands.<sup>315</sup>

Among the groups of heretics discussed at the Council were the Cathars.<sup>316</sup> In spite of their evident differences of opinion with the orthodox Christians, the Council decided that officials of the Cathars who were willing to return to the Apostolic Church would preserve the ecclesiastical ranks they had acquired. In cases where this would have created a congregation with two bishops, the episcopate could be divided between them. But, if that was not possible, the Cathar bishop was to be nominated presbyter or *chorepiscopus*.<sup>317</sup>

---

312 CT XVI, 2, 3, given in 320; 329, Pharr 1952, 441. Cf. Jones 1964, 89ff.

313 CT XVI, 2, 6, Pharr 1952, 441. Jones, 1964, 910, assumes this regulation to have become "a dead letter".

314 Nic. 4, Tanner 1990, 7.

315 Nic. 8, 9, 10, Tanner 1990, 9-11.

316 In the ecclesiastical history, the term Cathars has been used in connection with more than one group. ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 301.

317 Nic. 8, Tanner 1990, 9-10.

The title of *chorepiscopus* derives from his administrative district, countryside (Gk. *chōra*). Initially, the country bishop was appointed to administer his region retaining the same rights as the bishop of a city.<sup>318</sup> Gradually, however, he became subordinated to the bishop of the metropolis of the province. In the earlier ecclesiastical legislation, the *chorepiscopus* appears in the canons of the Synod of Ancyra in 314, which forbade him to ordain presbyters or deacons.<sup>319</sup> After the Council of Nicaea, the Synod of Antioch in 341 set readers, subdeacons, and exorcists under the governance of the country bishop. Only with the consent of the bishop proper could he ordain a deacon or a presbyter.<sup>320</sup> Eventually, the Synod of Sardica in 343 stated that it was not worthy for a bishop to serve in a village or in "a petty town", which could be tended by a presbyter.<sup>321</sup>

The same Synod of Sardica also laid down the order of advancement in an ecclesiastical career. Its apex, the episcopate, was naturally the centre of interest to persons who were esteemed in the society because of their wealth or erudition. The rank of bishop was achievable only through sufficient periods of service in the ranks of reader, deacon, and presbyter, deemed to demonstrate the worthiness of the person.<sup>322</sup>

318 Clement of Rome, Epistle I to Corinthians 42, 4: "Κατὰ χώρας οὖν καὶ πόλεις κηρύσσοντες καθίστανον τὰς ἀπαρχὰς αὐτῶν, δοκιμάσαντες τῷ πνεύματι, εἰς ἐπισκόπους καὶ διακόνους τῶν μελλόντων πιστεύειν." SC 167, 168-170.

319 Ancyra 12, NPNF 2-14, 68-69. ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 59-60. For a survey of the *chorepiscopus*, see Meimaris 1986, 214.

320 Antioch 10, NPNF 2-14, 113-114, including a section of an ancient epitome in which the ranks subordinate to the country bishop are exorcists, readers, subdeacons, and singers. The explanation of Aristenos also adds singers. Σύνταγμα II, 143-144.

321 Sardica 6, NPNF 2-14, 420. The concern about the proper dignity of a bishop continued at the Synod of Laodicea, replacing the rank of the *chorepiscopus* with *periodeutes*, to which office anyone of the clergy could be nominated. Meimaris 1986, 215, 254-255.

322 Sardica 10: "[...] ἐάν τις πλούσιος ἢ σχολαστικὸς ἀπὸ τῆς ἀγορᾶς ἀξιόιτο ἐπίσκοπος γίνεσθαι, μὴ πρότερον καθιστάσθαι, ἐὰν μὴ καὶ ἀναγνώστου καὶ ὑποδιακόνου, καὶ διακόνου καὶ πρεσβυτέρου ὑπηρεσίαν ἐκτελέσῃ, ἵνα καθ' ἕκαστον βαθμὸν, ἐάνπερ ἄξιος νομισθεῖται εἰς τὴν ἀψίδα τῆς ἐπισκοπῆς κατὰ προκοπὴν διαβῆναι δυναθεῖται. Ἐξεῖ δε ἐκάστου τάγματος ὁ βαθμὸς οὐκ ἐλαχίστου δηλονότι χρόνου μῆκος, δι' οὗ ἡ πίστις αὐτοῦ καὶ ἡ τῶν τρόπων

Interpretations of this principle of gradational advancement (*per gradum*) will be encountered below, especially in western documents of the later decades of the century. For now, the chronological treatise continues drawing on from the south-eastern Mediterranean.

### 3.1.3 The Egyptian Canons of Hippolytus

As mentioned above, the Apostolic Tradition may not derive from Rome: both Alexandria and Syria have been thought to be its place of origin.<sup>323</sup> Some support for the former may be given by the Egyptian Canons of Hippolytus, which is probably the earliest derivative from the Apostolic Tradition.<sup>324</sup> The Canons of Hippolytus begin with the formulae for ordinations. The bishop, presbyter, and deacon all receive the laying-on of hands, while "he who is to be appointed a reader shall have the same virtues as the deacon, and he does not receive the laying-on of hands first, but the bishop gives him the Gospel."<sup>325</sup>

---

καλοαγαθία, καὶ ἡ στερρότης, καὶ ἡ ἐπιείκεια γνώριμος γενέσθαι δυνήσεται· καὶ αὐτὸς, ἄξιος τῆς θείας ἱεροσύνης νομισθεὶς, τῆς μεγίστης ἀπολαύει τιμῆς. [...]" PG 137, 1461A. The Synod of Sardica was intended to be the second general council, but in the event it turned out to be an assembly of western bishops. The Synod is, nevertheless, universally recognized. Hefele 1873, 539ff.; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 1455.

323 Cf. p. 70<sup>238</sup> above.

324 The canons, misleadingly named after Hippolytus of Rome, were written ca. 336-340. The text of the 38 canons is extant only in Arabic into which it has come through Coptic from the original Greek. Bradshaw 1992, 92-93, 117; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edition), 774. The translations given here are based on the Latin edition of Hans Achelis in 1891, and the German edition of Wilhelm Riedel in 1900.

325 Canones Hippolyti VII: "48. Qui constituitur ἀναγνώστης, ornatus sit virtutibus diaconi, neque manus ei imponatur primo, sed evangelium ab episcopo ipsi porrigatur. 49. [Ἐποδιάκονος secundum hunc ordinem.] 50. Neque ordinetur caelebs. Si est sine uxore, nisi postquam testimonium pro ipso exhibitum sit ad contestandam integritatem ejus a vicinis ipsius, ita ut certum sit, eum a corruptione alienum fuisse eo tempore, quo ibi habitabat. 51. Neque alicui imponatur manus tamquam caelibis (virgini), nisi quando ad maturam staturam perductus pro fidei habetur et testimonio commendatus est. 52. [Ἐποδιάκονος et ἀναγνώστης,

The requirement that the reader and the deacon have the same virtues indicates an intentional relation of comparability between the two ranks. As the reader did not receive the laying-on of hands 'first', this may signify that this would be performed later on, at his advancement to the diaconate. The deacon had to be able to teach the catechumens; thus, it would be natural that the reader, already possessing knowledge of the Scriptures, was promoted deacon in due course. According to Hans Achelis, book learning was not necessary for the bishop and presbyters, whose offices demanded other capacities: for instance, when persecutions had caused a shortage of ecclesiastical officials, confessors and martyrs could be taken directly into the presbyterate. Thus, deacons and readers represent here a particular level of erudition.<sup>326</sup>

To the same canon has been added, rather clumsily and probably afterwards to complete the list of ranks: "Subdeacon, according to this order." The canon stipulates then that young unmarried men were not to be taken into the clergy without an assurance, given e.g. by their neighbours, of staying far from females, also in maturity when they would receive the imposition of hands.<sup>327</sup> Further, the canon states: "The subdeacon and reader, when praying alone, shall stand behind, but the subdeacon shall serve in front of the people."<sup>328</sup> The latter remark seems unnecessary because the subdeacon would, naturally, fulfil his assigned duties. Regarding the word 'behind', we shall consult a later church order, the *Testament of Our Lord (Testamentum Domini)*.<sup>329</sup> According to it, the bishop

---

quando soli orant, consistant in posteriore parte; ὑποδιάκονος autem serviat coram hominibus.] Achelis 1891, 70-74.

326 Achelis 1891, 174, 176-177. Page 2010, 162, considering the skills of young readers, observes that the requirement laid down in this canon was best fulfilled when deacons simply answered for the reading.

327 Achelis 1891, 71, 151-152. In the Latin translation, the sentences are separated from the text with square brackets. The German translation is consistent. Riedel 1900, 198, comments on the edition of Achelis.

328 Cf. Riedel 1900, 204.

329 The provenance of the *Testament of Our Lord*, also based on the Apostolic Tradition, is disputed; it derives most probably from the late 4<sup>th</sup> or from the 5<sup>th</sup> century, from Asia Minor or from Syria. Sperry-White 1991, 6; Bradshaw 1992, 95-96; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 1593.

shall stand, at the moment of the Eucharist, "first in the midst [of them] and the presbyters immediately after him; after them, the widows immediately behind the presbyters on the left side, the deacons behind the presbyters on the right side, then the readers behind them, the subdeacons behind the readers, the deaconesses behind the subdeacons."<sup>330</sup> Perhaps 'behind' refers to this moment.

On the general course of the divine service, the Canons of Hippolytus order:

Always, when the bishop communicates the sacred mysteries, deacons and presbyters shall assemble with him, wearing white clothes which are more beautiful and shining than the clothes of the whole congregation. But good deeds are better than clothes. Readers also shall wear festive clothing, and stand on the place of reading, and they shall take turns with each other until the whole congregation has convened. After that the bishop shall pray and complete the sacrament.<sup>331</sup>

In the sources of this study, this is the first allusion to vestments that we call liturgical. The wording leaves one to ponder whether the white apparel of the bishop, deacons and presbyters would have been in the possession of the church, while the readers perhaps had to acquire their clothing at their own expense.<sup>332</sup> The canon also reveals that the readings were situated at the beginning of the whole service, as they had been since the time of Justin Martyr. Psalm singing is also mentioned, in connection with the Eucharist:

And having distributed the Eucharist to the people, they [presbyters and deacons?] shall enter [the altar] reciting all the time because of the power of the sacred place, and the psalms shall substitute for them the

---

330 Sperry-White 1991, 13-14. The Latin edition: Rahmani 1899, 37.

331 Canones Hippolyti XXXVII: "201. Quotiescunque episcopus mysteriis frui vult, congregentur diaconi et presbyteri apud eum, induti vestimentis albis pulchrioribus toto populo, potissimum autem splendidis. 202. Bona autem opera omnibus vestimentis praestant. 203. Etiam ἀναγνώσται habeant festiva indumenta, et stent in loco lectionis, et alter alterum excipiat, donec totus populus congregetur. 204. Postea episcopus oret et preficiat missam." Achelis 1891, 118-119. Riedel 1900, 224.

332 Cf. pp. 177-178 below.

bells of the robe of Aaron. At the time no one shall sit but pray, and do nothing else but prostrate themselves before the altar.<sup>333</sup>

The wording implies that the singing belonged to those who were entitled to enter the altar and administer the Eucharist; these would be the bishop, presbyters, and deacons. Moments of psalmody common to all are referred to in three other canons. None of these moments occurs in the Eucharistic liturgy, but instead at the probation of a catechumen, at the end of the agapes, and at the daily morning assembly, which consists of prayer, psalms, and reading of the scriptures.<sup>334</sup> Thus, psalmody was presupposed to be familiar to the whole congregation.

---

333 Canones Hippolyti XXIX: "1. [...] 210. [Nemo intra velum aliquid loquatur, nisi orationem vel quae pro cultu necessaria sunt, praeterea omnino nihil; ne fiat aliquod opus in loco illo. 211. Ubi autem absolverunt communionem populi, intrent, ut recitent. 212. Omni hora intrent propter potestates loci sacri, et sint illis psalmi pro tintinnabulis, quae erant in tunica Aaronis, neve sedeat quis illo tempore, sed orent, neve aliud quicquam agant, inclinentque genua et prosternentur ante altare." Achelis 1891, 121; Riedel 1900, 219. The allusion to Aaron, Ex 28:35.

334 Canones Hippolyti XIX: "102. Catechumenus baptismo initiandus si ab iis, qui eum adducunt, bono testimonio commendatur, eum illo tempore, quo instruebatur, infirmos visitasse et debiles sustentasse seque ab omni perverso sermone custodisse, laudes cecinisse, [...]." Achelis 1891, 91; the translation of Riedel 1900, 210, does not mention singing. Ibid. XXXII: "164. Si agape fit vel coena ab aliquo pauperibus paratur κυριακή tempore accensus lucernae, praesente episcopo surgat diaconus ad accendendum. [...] 168. Psalmos recitent, antequam recedant." Achelis 1891, 105-106; Riedel 1900, 221. Ibid. XXI: "217. Congregentur quotidie in ecclesia presbyteri et ὑποδιάκονοι et ἀναγνώσται omnisque populus tempore gallicinii, vacentque orationi, psalmis et lectioni scripturarum cum orationibus secundum mandatum apostolorum: Dum venio, attende lectioni." Achelis 1891, 122. Cf. Riedel 1900, 214.

### 3.1.4 Psalm singing according to Athanasius of Alexandria

One of the great fourth-century Fathers is Athanasius of Alexandria.<sup>335</sup> Perhaps the most famous reference to his attitude towards voice control derives from Augustine of Hippo, who testifies that Athanasius "obliged the reader of the psalm to give utterance to it with so slight an inflection of voice that it was more like speaking than singing."<sup>336</sup> Athanasius himself defined two modes of representation of the Holy Writ, with which

God shall be praised not only with continuity but also with an expanded voice. With continuity shall be said the books of the Law and the Prophets, and all narrative books, the New Testament included. The words which shall be said with an expanded voice are those of psalms and songs.<sup>337</sup>

---

335 Athanasius (ca. 296-373) became bishop of Alexandria in 328, but doctrinal and personal disputes forced him to leave the see five times during his episcopate. ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 119-120.

336 The Confessions of Augustine X, 33, 50, NPNF 1-01, 156. Cf. Wellesz 1961, 33. The concern about the character of the melodies was expressed more than a century before Athanasius by Clement of Alexandria. Writing against the use of the instruments, as well as against the singing of the heathens, Clement defined the psalm as "a melodious and temperate praise": "For temperate harmonies are to be admitted; but we are to banish as far as possible from our robust mind those liquid harmonies, which, through pernicious arts in the modulations of tones, train to effeminacy and scurrility. But grave and modest strains say farewell to the turbulence of drunkenness. Chromatic harmonies are, therefore, to be left to immodest revels, and to florid and meretricious music." Clement of Alexandria, *The Instructor (Protrepticus)* II, IV, ANF 2, 249. See also Wellesz 1961, 92-93. Concerning the quality of harmonies commented on by Clement, see fn. 345 below.

337 S. Athanasii *Epistola Ad Marcellinum* 27. "[...] Οὐκ ἔστι δὲ οὕτως · οὐ γὰρ τὸ ἦδον καὶ πιθανὸν ἐζήτησεν ἡ Γραφή · ἀλλὰ καὶ τοῦτο ὠφελείας ἔνεκεν τῆς ψυχῆς τετύπωται διὰ πάντα μὲν, μάλιστα δὲ διὰ δύο ταῦτα · πρῶτον μὲν, ὅτι ἔπρεπε τὴν θεῖαν Γραφὴν μὴ μόνον τῇ συνεχείᾳ, ἀλλὰ καὶ τῇ κατὰ πλάτος φωνῇ τὸν Θεὸν ὑμνεῖν. Κατὰ συνέχειαν μὲν οὖν εἴρηται, οἷά ἐστι τὰ τοῦ νόμου καὶ τῶν προφητῶν, καὶ τὰ ἱστορούμενα πάντα, μετὰ τῆς Καινῆς Διαθήκης · κατὰ πλάτος δὲ λέγεται, οἷά ἐστι τὰ τῶν ψαλμῶν καὶ ᾠδῶν καὶ ᾠδαίων ῥήματα · καὶ οὕτως γὰρ σωθήσεται τὸ ἐξ ὅλης ἰσχύος καὶ δυνάμεως ἀγαπᾶν τὸν Θεὸν τοὺς ἀνθρώπους. Δεύτερον δὲ, ὅτι, ὡσπερ ἀρμονία τοὺς ἀλύτους συντιθεῖσα μίαν τὴν συμφωνίαν ἀποτελεῖ, οὕτως, ἐπειδὴ καὶ ἐν τῇ ψυχῇ διάφορα κινήματα φαίνεται, καὶ ἔστιν ἐν αὐτῇ τὸ λογίζεσθαι, καὶ τὸ

The concept of continuity is readily interpreted to mean recitation as such: the use of the traditional modes for the reading of the Torah and the prophetic writings.<sup>338</sup> The expanded voice in psalms and songs may likewise refer to the use of psalm modes, the 'songs' thus being the biblical odes.<sup>339</sup> This is implied in another section of the text, where Athanasius states it was the will of the Lord "to sing the odes melodiously, and to read the psalms with song."

According to Athanasius, reading with an expanded voice provides the believers with a further benefit: it calms both the mind and the body. In the total harmony thus brought about, a human being is able totally to obey the will of God.<sup>340</sup> Singing is thus not aimed at pleasing the ear: it is not some kind of aesthetic art. Psalms are to be sung "both with tongue and with mind", i.e. with intelligence.<sup>341</sup> Singing with the mind also means that the psalms shall not be altered or remodelled. This is argued in terms suggestive of a kind of 'copyright'

---

ἐπιθυμῆναι, καὶ τὸ θυμοειδές, ἐκ δὲ τῆς τούτων κινήσεως καὶ ἡ τῶν μελῶν γίνεται τοῦ σώματος ἐνέργεια, βούλεται ὁ λόγος μὴ ἀσύμφωνον εἶναι τὸν ἄνθρωπον ἑαυτῷ, μηδὲ δίστασθαι πρὸς ἑαυτόν· [...]" PG XXVII, 37D-40A. No date can be given for The Letter to Marcellinus but its authenticity is not doubted. NPNF2-04, lxxv.

338 Cf. pp. 43-44 above.

339 Cf. Seppälä 1996, 50. The tradition of the thirteen biblical odes, called in the western tradition canticles, is ancient. The list of them appears in one of the oldest manuscripts, the Codex Alexandrinus from the 5<sup>th</sup> century. Wagner 1911, 7-8; Sophocles 1914, 1184-1185; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 283, 370-371.

340 Ad Marcellinum 28. "[...] ἵνα, ὡς ἐν ἀρμονίᾳ τὸ πληκτρον, οὕτως αὐτὸς ὁ ἄνθρωπος ψαλτήριον γενόμενος, καὶ τῷ πνεύματι προσέχων ὀλοκλήρως, καὶ πᾶσι τοῖς μέλεσι καὶ τοῖς κινήμασιν ὑπακούη, καὶ δουλευῇ τῷ βουλήματι τοῦ Θεοῦ. Τῆς δὲ τοιαύτης τῶν λογισμῶν ἀταραξίας καὶ ἀκύμονος καταστάσεως εἰκὼν καὶ τύπος ἐστὶν ἡ τῶν Ψαλμῶν ἐμμελῆς ἀνάγνωσις. Ὡσπερ γὰρ τὰ τῆς ψυχῆς νοήματα γνωρίζομεν καὶ σημαίνομεν δι' ὧν προφέρομεν λόγων, οὕτως, τῆς πνευματικῆς ἐν ψυχῇ ἀρμονίας τὴν ἐκ τῶν λόγων μελωδίαν σύμβολον εἶναι θέλων ὁ Κύριος, τετύπωκεν ἐμμελῶς τὰς ᾠδὰς ψάλλεσθαι, καὶ τοὺς ψαλμοὺς μετ' ᾠδῆς ἀναγινώσκεσθαι. [...]" PG XXVII, 40B-C. In describing this harmony, Athanasius uses metaphors based on musical instruments: how a number of flutes may resound in unison, and how a man responds to a psalm like a psaltery responds to a plectrum.

341 Ad Marcellinum 29, PG XXVII, 40D-41B.

pertaining to the writers of the psalms who, now in eternity, would hear and recognize their own words, and join with the temporal singers in the spirit.<sup>342</sup>

The treatise includes advice on the proper psalms for different occasions. In it, three of the psalms connected with the days of the week occur on the same days that they used to be sung in the Temple.<sup>343</sup> This also confirms the maintenance of certain Judaic traditions. Regarding the practice of singing, Athanasius alludes to the practice of responsorial psalmody between the deacon and the congregation.<sup>344</sup> The principles of psalm singing laid down by Athanasius are representative of the view of a traditional and carefully prescribed performance.

### 3.1.5 The impact of the Arian heresy on Christian singing

During the second decade of the fourth century, the question of the essence of Christ was revived. Presbyter Arius, who belonged to the clergy of Alexandria, began to promulgate the Christology which denied the full divinity of Jesus Christ. Arius not only preached but arranged the doctrine into familiar and popular melodies which soon were sung everywhere.<sup>345</sup> The heresy spread

342 Ad Marcellinum 31, PG XXVII, 41D-44A.

343 On Sunday, Psalm 24; on Wednesday, Psalm 94; on Friday, Psalm 93. Ad Marcellinum 23. Cf. M Tamid 7:4, Neusner 1988, 872-873.

344 Apologia pro fuga sua 24 (357 CE): "[...] Ἐγὼ δὲ ἄλογον ἡγούμενος ἐν τοσαύτῃ συγχύσει καταλείψαι τοὺς λαοὺς καὶ μὴ μᾶλλον προκινδυνεύειν αὐτῶν, καθεσθῆις ἐπὶ τοῦ θρόνου, προέτρεπον τὸν μὲν διάκονον ἀναγινώσκειν ψαλμόν, τοὺς δὲ λαοὺς ὑπακούειν· “Ὅτι εἰς τὸν αἰῶνα τὸ ἔλεος αὐτοῦ “ καὶ πάντας οὕτως ἀναχωρεῖν καὶ εἰς τοὺς οἴκους ἀπιέναι. [...]" SC 56<sup>bis</sup>, 234. The responsorial verse was: "For his mercy endureth forever", from Psalm 135 (in the LXX, Psalm 136 in the Hebrew Psalter). NPNF 2-04, 263-264.

345 Arius (ca.250-ca.336) also published a book which his adherents took for a new Bible. The book was called *Thalia* (Feast) – a popular title in antiquity – and it was probably published after 321. Only fragments of the work have been preserved in some of the writings of Athanasius. In the work *De synodis Arimini et Seleucia celebratis* II, 15, Athanasius estimates that Arius in his verse imitated the Egyptian poet Sotades "in the dissolute tone of his metre". The metre used by Sotades (in fact, there were two poets of that name, and Athanasius' attribution of the origin of the poet is erroneous) was Ionic, which, owing to the contents of the verses, had a

rapidly throughout the whole of Christendom and was the first time condemned by a synod as early as in 320, along with the excommunication of Arius himself. The sentence, like the many which followed, had almost no effect.<sup>346</sup>

The heresy did not terminate with the death of Arius but strengthened with new branches being formed. Locally, the relative strength of the orthodox and heterodox parties varied. In the middle of the fourth century at Antioch, the Eustathian controversy had the upper hand.<sup>347</sup> Its adherents attended the same liturgies with the orthodox Christians, and the doctrinal differences were manifested in singing: "When they [the clergy and the people] sang hymns to God, they were, according to custom, divided into choirs, and, at the end of the odes, each one declared what were his own peculiar sentiments."<sup>348</sup> The 'sentiments', meaning doctrinal emphases, appeared in the wording of the doxology added to complete the psalm. Its orthodox form, "Glory to the Father and the Son and the Holy Spirit, now and forever and to the age of ages", was

---

notorious flavour. The preserved fragments of the Thalia, however, do not corroborate its writing in any of the several Ionic metres. (The detail as such has no relevance to this study, but we should notice a comment made by Philip Schaff on the translation of *De synodis*: "The Church adopted Doric music, and forbade the Ionic and Lydian." NPNF 2-04, 457<sup>3502</sup>.) Hefele 1873, 269, 276; Cabrol 1907, 2816; Le Bachelet 1937, 1782; Gentz 1950, 648; Jones 1964, 964; Seppälä 2012, 43.

346 Hefele 1873, 258ff; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 99-100, 104, 1001-1002, 1552-1553.

347 Eustathius of Sebaste (c.300-after 377) had been a pupil of Arius. ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 576.

348 Sozomenus, HE III, 20. "[...] ἔπειτα δὲ ὡς εἰκὸς νεωτέρων αὐτοὺς πειραθήσεται πραγμάτων, ἔξον ἀκινδύνως ἔχειν οὐς ἔχουσιν. ἐπεὶ καὶ κρατούντων αὐτῶν τῶν τῆδε ἐκκλησιῶν οὐ παντελῶς οἷς ἐδόξαζον ὁ πᾶς κληρὸς καὶ ὁ λαὸς ἐπίθοντο, ἀλλὰ κατὰ χορούς, ὡς ἔθος ἐν τῷ ὑμνεῖν τὸν θεόν, συνιστάμενοι, πρὸς τῷ τέλει τῶν ᾠδῶν τὴν οἰκείαν προαίρεσιν ἐπεδείκνυον. καὶ οἱ μὲν πατέρα καὶ υἱὸν ὡς ὁμότιμον ἐδόξαζον, οἱ δὲ πατέρα ἐν υἱῷ, τῇ παρενθέσει τῆς προθέσεως δευτερεύειν τὸν υἱὸν ἀποφάνοντες. [...]" GCS 1960, 135; transl. from NPNF 2-02, 299. PG 67, 1101-1102, translates the Greek 'odes' into Latin as 'hymns'. Cabrol 1907, 2814-2815. Sozomen wrote his Ecclesiastical History in the early fifth century, using, as his main source, the corresponding work of Socrates Scholasticus, written a little earlier. Both historians dwelled at Constantinople. ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 1525, 1513.

established to fight against the former, heterodox way of reading, "Glory to the Father by the Son in the Holy Spirit, [...]"<sup>349</sup>

At the time, the bishop of Antioch was Leontius. He favoured the Arian doctrine but, in order to keep his see, sought to hide his tendency. Leontius is reported to have said the doxology so quietly that the people who stood near him were able to hear only the last words, "For ever and ever".<sup>350</sup> In recruiting his clergy, Leontius patronised the Arians and ignored the orthodox. Among the latter were two lay ascetics Flavian and Diodore, who were active promoters of singing: they are reported to have been the first to divide the choir into two parts for alternate singing of the Davidic psalms.<sup>351</sup> This kind of singing was first practised at vigils celebrated in the shrines of the martyrs, where it won great popularity. On becoming aware of the matter, Leontius invited the choirs to sing in the church as well.<sup>352</sup> On part of the bishop, this was nothing but a pretence of tolerance: he expected that after his time, protests would arise over the different kinds of singing. Whether Leontius meant the content of the singing or its manner, remains unknown. Nevertheless, alternate singing became a new

---

349 Leclercq 1921, 1525-1528; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 682. The orthodox wording of the doxology, known in the West as *Gloria Patri*, is stated to have been translated from Syriac to Greek by Flavian and Diodore, see below. Stuiber 1959, 222-223; the note of Valesius, PG 67, 1101-1102.

350 Theodoret, HE II, 24: "Ἡ δὲ ἀξιάγαστος ξυνωρὶς Φλαβιανὸς καὶ Διόδωρος, ἱερατικῆς μὲν λειτουργίας οὐδέπω τετυχηκότες, τῷ δὲ λαῷ συντεταγμένοι, νυκτῶρ καὶ μεθ' ἡμέραν εἰς τὸν ὑπὲρ τῆς εὐσεβείας ζῆλον διήγειρον ἅπαντας. οὗτοι πρῶτοι διχῆ διελόντες τοὺς τῶν ψαλλόντων χοροὺς ἐκ διαδοχῆς ἄδειν τὴν Δαυϊτικὴν ἐδίδαξαν μελωδίαν· καὶ τοῦτο ἐν Ἀντιοχείᾳ πρῶτον ἀρξάμενον πάντοσε διέδραμε καὶ κατέλαβε τῆς οἰκουμένης τὰ τέρματα. [...]" GCS Neue Folge 5, 153. The Ecclesiastical History of Theodoret of Cyrrhus (d. ca. 460) covers the period from the rise of Arianism to 428. ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edition), 1600.

351 Theodoret, op.cit. The ancient practice of antiphonal singing has also been attributed to a heavenly vision received by Ignatius of Antioch. Socrates, HE VI,8, SC 505, 298, NPNF 2-03, 144; Seppälä 2012, 23-24. Later on, both Flavian and Diodore entered the clergy, proceeding eventually to the episcopate, Flavian at Antioch in 381, and Diodore at Tarsus in 378. ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edition), 342, 483.

352 Theodoret, op.cit. The English translation in NPNF 2-03, 84-85, numbers the chapter as the 19<sup>th</sup>.

fashion. From Antioch, it is said to have spread "in all directions, and penetrated to the ends of the earth."<sup>353</sup>

The new kind of singing – or the new popularity of singing – seems also to have provoked criticism. A quarter of a century later, in 375, Basil of Caesarea wrote to the Neocaesarean clergy: "But as to the charge about the singing of psalms, with which especially those who slander us try to frighten the more simple, I have this to say: the customs now in vogue are in harmony and accord with all the churches of God."<sup>354</sup> As an example of these customs, Basil describes the celebration of a vigil. Beginning with prayers, it continues with psalm singing, which is executed first in turns while the people are divided into two groups, and subsequently responsorially, one singer leading and all others responding.<sup>355</sup> Thus consisting of singing and praying, the vigil is completed with "the psalm of confession to the Lord", which everyone rendered in their own words. Were the recipients of the letter to renounce these practices, writes Basil, they would renounce the Egyptians, Libyans, Thebans, Palestinians, Arabians, Phœnicians, Syrians, even "those who dwell near the Euphrates, and in a word all among whom vigils and prayers and common psalmody have been prized."<sup>356</sup> The appeal to all the nations of the Eastern Mediterranean confirms that psalm singing was common throughout Christendom.

---

353 Sozomen op.cit.; Theodoret op.cit.

354 Basil III, 187.

355 The response could be the last verse sang by the soloist, or a sigh of prayer, such as *Kyrie eleison*. Seppälä 2012, 47. Du Cange 1688, 583, refers to the letter of Basil in the entry of the *κανονάρχης*, defining the latter practice as antiphonal. The title canonarch means literally the leader of the canons, the word meaning here a genre of hymns, the structure of which is attributed, considerably later than the letter of Basil, to Andrew of Crete (c.660-740). ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edition), 277, 60.

356 Basil, Letter CCVII: "[...] Ἐκ νυκτὸς γὰρ ὀρθρίζει παρ' ἡμῖν ὁ λαὸς ἐπὶ τὸν οἶκον τῆς προσευχῆς, καὶ ἐν πόνῳ καὶ θλιψῇ καὶ συνοχῇ δακρύων ἔξομολογούμενοι τῷ Θεῷ, τελευταῖον ἔξαναστάντες τῶν προσευχῶν εἰς τὴν ψαλμωδίαν καθίστανται. καὶ νῦν μὲν διχῇ διανεμηθέντες ἀντιψάλλουσιν ἀλλήλοις, ὁμοῦ μὲν τὴν μελέτην τῶν λογίων ἐντεῦθεν κρατύνοντες, ὁμοῦ δὲ καὶ τὴν προσοχὴν καὶ τὸ ἀμετεώριστον τῶν καρδιῶν ἑαυτοῖς διοικούμενοι. Ἐπειτα πάλιν ἐπιτρέψαντες ἐνὶ κατάρχειν τοῦ μέλους, οἱ λοιποὶ ὑπηχοῦσι· [...]" Transl. from Basil III, 186-189. Cf. Corbin 1960, 122.

The word Basil uses to refer to singing is psalmody (*psalmōdia*), with which biblical Psalms may be understood, although the general meaning of the word *psalmos*, song, should also be kept in mind. Basil does not identify who conducted the psalmody; it has been suggested that his description was of a monastic vigil where anyone present would have been capable of leading psalms.<sup>357</sup>

### 3.1.6 First mentions of individual singers

In one of his homilies, Basil comments on the behaviour of the participants at a divine service in a parish church. He observes that only few of the adults are concentrating on the prayers while others yawn and turn around watching for the psalm singer (*psalmōdos*) to end, so as to be able to leave the church. The children, on the contrary, attend keenly, as they are liberated from their studies for the time of the service.<sup>358</sup> The moment of the psalmody was not the end of the entire liturgy but the end of the part which the catechumens were allowed to attend.

In the Greek lexica, the noun used by Basil is translated as 'psalmist', which usually refers to the biblical composer of the Psalms, David.<sup>359</sup> Here, the text clearly indicates a solo singer, as the people are described as "watching for when

357 McKinnon 1987b, 68.

358 S. Basili Magni Homilia dicta tempore famis et siccitatis 3. "[...] Ὀλίγοι λοιπὸν μετ' ἐμοῦ καὶ τῆς προσευχῆς, καὶ οὗτοι ἰλιγγιώντες, χασμῶμενοι, μεταστρεφόμενοι συνεχῶς, καὶ ἐπιτηροῦντες πότε τοὺς στίχους ὁ ψαλμῳδὸς συμπληρώσει, πότε, ὡς δεσμοτηρίου, τῆς ἐκκλησίας, καὶ τῆς ἀνάγκης τῆς προσευχῆς ἀφαιρεθήσονται. Οἱ δὲ δὴ παῖδες οἱ σμικρότατοι οὗτοι, οἱ τὰς δέλτους ἐν τοῖς διδασκαλείοις ἀποθεμενοι, καὶ συμβοῶντες ἡμῖν, ὡς ἄνεσιν μᾶλλον καὶ τέρψιν τὸ πρᾶγμα μετέρχονται, ἐορτὴν ποιούμενοι τὴν ἡμετέραν λύπην, ἐπειδὴ τῆς ἐπαχθείας τοῦ παιδευτοῦ, καὶ τῆς φροντίδος τῶν μαθημάτων πρὸς ὀλίγον ἐλευθεροῦνται. [...]" PG XXXI, 309C. The year of the homily is 368. Stegmann 1925, 257.

359 Sophocles 1914, 1178; Lampe 1961, 1540; likewise, Liddell and Scott.

the psalm singer completes the verses". Whether the singer was a member of the clergy of a layman, remains unknown.

Two early inscriptions from Asia Minor refer to skilled singers. The epitaph of deacon Nestor Telephides from the third or fourth century praises the presbyter Gaios, who had officiated at the funeral rites, to be "far the best in hymns". Evidently, Gaios was not only a singer but also a composer, because the text suggests that his hymns were to be taught to succeeding generations as well.<sup>360</sup> The other inscription does not include any ecclesiastical title. It is a lengthy, poetic text in commemoration of Nikatorios, who "acquired the greatest honour of all mortals among the holy people and delighted the flock of the Highest God enchanting everybody with sacred songs and lessons".<sup>361</sup> The age of Nikatorios is entered but the text has been damaged so that now, only the number eight is decipherable; as the name of his father is mentioned in the text, Nikatorios was probably younger rather than elderly. The date of the inscription itself is not undisputed either: earlier research had placed it in the third century but it may date from one or two centuries later.<sup>362</sup>

Singing and reading are also combined in the possibly earliest datable reference to the singer as an ecclesiastical official. In the middle of the fourth century in Constantinople, the political and doctrinal maelstrom of the time had led to the exile of the bishop of the city, Paul. His supporters were slain, among them the notaries, "Martyrius the subdeacon, and Marcian, a singer (*psaltēs*) and

---

360 Page 2010, 45-46, 87, considers this inscription to be the earliest to refer to the singer.

361 The epitaph of Nikatorios from Hadrianoi of Mysia, lines 3-6: "Νεικατόρις πιτυτὸ[ς] Ξενοφῶντος γονετοῦ [παῖς], / [ὄ]ς τειμήν πλείστην ἐκτῆ[σ]ατο πᾶσι βροτοῖσιν / [εἶν] [ἀγί]ῳ τε λαῶ θεοῦ ὑ[ψί]στου ποίμνεια τέρπ[εν] / [καὶ] ψαλμοῖς τε ἀγείοις κ' [ἀνα]γνώσασσι{ν} πάντας ἔθει[λγεν], [...]". Merkelbach und Stauber 2001, 125.

362 Leclercq 1913, 345, and Kaufmann 1917, 201, take the age of 18 for granted and estimate the date of the inscription earlier than Merkelbach and Stauber.

a reader of the Holy Scripture."<sup>363</sup> The separate order of the singer appears some decades after this, in the canons promulgated by a local synod.

## 3.2 The establishment of the order of the singer

### 3.2.1 The singer in the canons of the Synod of Laodicea

The written history of the order of the ecclesiastical singer begins at the Synod of Laodicea of Phrygia ca. 380.<sup>364</sup> All that is extant of the synod is a collection of fifty-nine canons, the written form of which has given rise to some doubts concerning the particulars of the Synod itself.<sup>365</sup> In any case, both the Eastern and the Western Churches have acknowledged the synod.<sup>366</sup> The synod convened

---

363 Sozomenus HE IV, 3, 1. "Προῆλθε γὰρ τὸ κακὸν καὶ μέχρι φόνων· καὶ γὰρ δὴ ἄλλοι τινὲς ἀνηρέθησαν καὶ Μαρτύριος καὶ Μαρκιανός, οὓς συνοίκους ὄντας Παύλου λόγος ἀνδρείως ἀποθανεῖν παραδοθέντας ὑπὸ Μακεδονίου τῷ ὑπάρχῳ ὡς αἰτίους γενομένους τῆς Ἐρμογένους κακῆς ἀναιρέσεως καὶ τῆς κατ' αὐτοῦ στάσεως. ἦν δὲ ὁ μὲν ὑποδιάκονος, ὁ δὲ Μαρκιανὸς ψάλτης καὶ ἀναγνώστης τῶν ἱερῶν γραφῶν. [...]" GCS 1960, 141. NPNF 2-02, 301.

364 Μενεβίσογλου 1990, 397-404, provides us with the best argument for the date of the synod. Earlier estimations of the date cover the years between 343 and 381: Hefele 1873, 747-750; Milasch 1905, 93; Wagner 1911, 43; Werner 1959, 121; Corbin 1967, 71; Quasten 1973, 246; Abraham 1979, 55; Foley 1982, 211; PSK 1983, 29. Pétridès 1910, dates the synod after 381. Cf. McKinnon 1987a, 118; Page 2010, 89ff. In antiquity, there were eight or nine different cities called Laodicea in South-Western Asia. Dressler 1967, 379-380; Honigmann-Ruge 1924, 712.

365 In the original Greek wording, the canons form two series. As some statutes appear in both series, it has aroused speculation that the canons were documented twice, or that they derive from two different synods. It is also possible that the canon collection is a compilation from unknown sources. The date of the synod can be defined only by the wording of the Greek and Latin titles of the canon collection. The earliest written reference to the synod is made by Theodoret of Cyr (393-466) in his Commentary to Colossians. Joannou 1962a, 128; Gaudemet 1985, 47<sup>53</sup>, 75<sup>1</sup>.

366 The synods honoured by the Orthodox Church are defined in the second canon of the Synod of Trullo in 691. The corresponding list of the synods of the Roman Catholic Church is attested in Dist. XVI, c. 11, *Corpus Iuris Canonici I*, 47.

to restore ecclesiastical discipline.<sup>367</sup> This is evident also in the constitutive regulation concerning the singer:

*Who shall sing on the platform.*

Apart from canonical singers, who go up onto the platform and sing from parchments, no others shall sing in the church.<sup>368</sup>

The use of the epithet 'canonical', connected with ecclesiastical singers, is unique.<sup>369</sup> It sets the singers as subordinate to the ecclesiastical rule, the canon.<sup>370</sup> However, the canons of Laodicea do not define how the singers became canonical, i.e. the process of their appointment.<sup>371</sup> In the preceding chapter, the mention of the Constantinopolitan singer and reader Marcian implies the existence of such singers before the present synod, but as he was also a reader, Marcian would surely have been appointed to the clergy.

In the original Greek, canonical singers are called *psaltai*, translating plainly 'singers'. In the classical vocabulary, *psaltēs* meant a player of the psaltery (*psaltērion*). In the church, where only vocal music was cultivated, the association with the instrument disappeared early and *psaltēs* became the title of the ecclesiastical singer.<sup>372</sup>

367 This statement was given by the 17<sup>th</sup>-century Severinus Binius, quoted in Mansi II, 594.

368 Laod. 15. "Περὶ τῶν ἐν ἄμβωνι ψάλλειν ὀφειλόντων. Περὶ τοῦ μὴ δεῖν πλὴν τῶν κανονικῶν ψαλτῶν, τῶν ἐπὶ τὸν ἄμβωνα ἀναβαινόντων καὶ ἀπὸ διφθέρας ψαλλόντων, ἑτέρους τινὰς ψάλλειν ἐν ἐκκλησίᾳ. *De his qui debeant in ambone, id est in pulpito, psallere.* Quod non oporteat amplius praeter eos, qui regulariter cantores existunt, qui et de codice canunt, alios in pulpito conscendere et in ecclesiis psallere." Joannou 1962a, 136. Instead of the edition of Migne, here is used the edition of Joannou where the canons are provided with titles.

369 As an adjective, the word is rarely used. In a text attributed to Basil – rather contemporaneously with the Synod of Laodicea – the epithet 'canonical' is used in connection with virgins and widows. In another text, monks are defined as 'canonicals'. Ohme 2004, 17.

370 This becomes even more evident in the Latin text which translates, "singers, in accordance with the rule". Joannou 1962a, 136. For the word *canon*, see p. 91 above. Page 2010, 90, suggests also that 'canonical' might mean 'orthodox'.

371 Only one of the canons concerns the appointment to the ranks, prescribing that the exorcist was to be appointed by the bishop (Laod. 26).

372 Sophocles 1914, 1178; Lampe 1961, 1540. For the singer of secular songs, the title was *tragōdos*, meaning not only a singer but also an actor. Sophocles 1914, 1087;

The singers were required to be able to sing from the parchments, or books: keeping to the written texts eliminated mistakes, the occurrence of which may not always have been accidental.<sup>373</sup> Naturally, the singers had to be familiar with the particular melodic structures; whether the parchments they used were provided with some kind of a written notation, however, remains unknown.<sup>374</sup> The singing was to alternate with reading:

*At the assemblies, there shall be reading between the psalms.*

The psalms shall not be joined together at the assemblies, but after every psalm there shall be a text.<sup>375</sup>

The information about the new popularity of psalm singing is confirmed by this canon; according to the Byzantine explainers of the canons, this regulation was introduced because the continuous singing exhausted the assembled congregation.<sup>376</sup>

---

Seppälä 2005a, 24.

373 Faivre 1977, 231.

374 The use of ekphonetic signs probably began in the 4<sup>th</sup> century but ekphonetic neum writing vanished eventually. Seppälä 1996, 64ff.; 2005a, 22-23. As is known, fragments of an early notation derive already from BCE, and a Christian hymn with a notation has been preserved on a papyrus from late 3<sup>rd</sup> century Egypt (P Oxy XV, 1786, indicating both the pitch and the rhythm, and short melismas.). Mathiesen 2001, 344. See also Wellesz 1961, 152-156; Wille 1967, 369; Hollemann 1972, 188; Foley 1996, 100; Page 2010, 543<sup>d</sup>. Would the singers have used parchments (διφθέρα), as the Greek canon reads, they would have been scrolls; the Latin version of the canon uses the word *codex*, indicating that the texts were in the form of a book. Gamble 1995, 49ff. See also PG CXXXVII, 1359-1362; Seppälä 1999, 273; 2005b, 21-22; 2012, 57.

375 Laod. 17. "Περὶ τοῦ ἐκ διαλείμματος ἀναγινώσκεισθαι κατὰ τὰς συνάξεις ψαλμούς. Περὶ τοῦ μὴ δεῖν ἐπισυνάπτειν ἐν ταῖς συνάξεσι τοὺς ψαλμούς, ἀλλὰ διὰ μέσου καθ' ἕκαστον ψαλμὸν γίνεσθαι τὴν ἀνάγνωσιν." Joannou 1962a, 137.

376 PG CXXXVII, 1364; NPNF 2-14, 133.

Singers and readers have been described as sharing the platform.<sup>377</sup> They also shared the same position in the hierarchy, evident from the order:

*Readers and singers shall not serve with orarions.*

Readers and singers shall not wear the orarion and thus read or sing.<sup>378</sup>

The *orarion*, i.e. stole, was at this time worn by deacons. Subdeacons were not allowed to use it either.<sup>379</sup>

All ecclesiastical grades are listed in the canon, which has been defined as "the apogee of the legislation concerning the inferior offices".<sup>380</sup> Defining three categories, it orders:

*No one of the ecclesiastics shall enter taverns.*

No one of the hieratics, from presbyters to deacons, and so on in the ecclesiastical order to subdeacons, readers, singers, exorcists, doorkeepers, or any of the class of the ascetics, ought to enter a tavern.<sup>381</sup>

---

377 Müller 1964, 25. The platform as a place of proclaiming or performing was common practice in antiquity both in political life and cults, for instance in mystery cults and Judaism, where the platform is called the *bimah*. The platform mentioned in the present canon was called the *ambōn*; canon 56 of Laodicea refers also to the *bēma*, the place of the bishop and the presbyters. Ed., EJ 4, 1002; Schneider 1950, 364; Schneider 1954, 129-130; Seppälä 2012, 60-62.

378 Laod. 23. "Περὶ τοῦ μετὰ ὠραρίων ἀναγνώστας ἢ ψάλτας μὴ ἐνεργεῖν." Ὅτι οὐ δεῖ ἀναγνώστας ἢ ψάλτας ὠράριον φορεῖν καὶ οὕτως ἀναγινώσκειν ἢ ψάλλειν." Joannou 1962a, 140.

379 Laod. 22. forbids subdeacons to wear the *orarion*, the significance of which is allegorized in several ways in the patristic literature: it may derive from the cloth with which the *hazzan*, in large synagogues, signalled the people (see p. 45 above), or from ancient Roman garments. The use by priests of the stole is attested only after the middle of the first Christian millennium. Klauser 1957, 902; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.) 1186, 1545; Lampe 1961, 1557; BT Sukkah, 51b, Goldschmidt 1980, 397-398. Cf. NPNF 2-14, 142. See also Page 2010, 91 and 162-165.

380 Faivre 1977, 230-231; also the canon concerning exorcists is written in the negative form, excluding those who have not been appointed by the bishop, from exorcizing (Laod. 26).

381 Laod. 24. "Περὶ τοῦ μηδένα τῶν ἐκκλησιαστικῶν ἐν καπηλείοις εἰσιέναι." Ὅτι οὐ δεῖ ἱερατικούς ἀπὸ πρεσβυτέρων ἕως διακόνων, καὶ ἐξῆς τῆς ἱερατικῆς τάξεως ἕως ὑπηρετῶν καὶ ἀναγνώστων καὶ ψαλτῶν καὶ ἐπορκιστῶν καὶ θυρωρῶν, καὶ τοῦ τάγματος τῶν ἀσκητῶν, εἰς καπηλεῖον εἰσιέναι." Joannou 1962a, 140.

The hieratics – meaning those belonging to the priestly class – the ecclesiastical order, and the ascetics were all subordinated to the same disciplinary rules.<sup>382</sup>

The five ranks forming the ecclesiastical order complete the development of the ecclesiastical hierarchy in the East, confirming also the establishment of the exorcist and the doorkeeper.<sup>383</sup>

The last of the canons of Laodicea concerns the books which were to be used in the church.

*What shall be sung and read in the church.*

No secular songs shall be sung in the church, nor uncanonical books shall be read, but only the canonical books of the New and the Old Testament.<sup>384</sup>

The canon allows only the books of the Bible to be read; on singing, a prohibition is given against 'secular songs'.<sup>385</sup> The original word used of the songs is, naturally, *psalmoi*, and the adjective (*idiōtikoi*) means 'private'.<sup>386</sup> The history of ecclesiastical singing attests to private songs that were written in the style and form of the biblical psalms. Some of these included heretical content, or were awkward or trivial; referring to such psalms, the adjective 'private' also contains a note of scorn. However, with time, songs of private origin had become established in the divine services.<sup>387</sup> The present canon with its

---

382 Sophocles 1914, 593; Faivre 1977, 228ff. As seen in middle-century Antioch, the ascetics Flavian and Diodore were defined as laymen (see p. 103 above). All three classes are defined as 'hieratics, clerics, and ascetics' e.g. in Laod. 30. NPNF 2-14, 149.

383 In the West, exorcists and doorkeepers were reckoned among the ecclesiastics already in 250 by Cornelius of Rome. See p. 78ff. above.

384 Laod. 59. "Περὶ τῶν ὀφειλόντων ἐν τῇ ἐκκλησίᾳ ψάλλεσθαι καὶ ἀναγινώσκεσθαι. Ὅτι οὐ δεῖ ἰδιωτικούς ψαλμούς λέγεσθαι ἐν τῇ ἐκκλησίᾳ οὔδε ἀκανόνιστα βιβλία ἀναγινώσκεσθαι, ἀλλὰ μόνα τὰ κανονικὰ τῆς καινῆς καὶ παλαιᾶς διαθήκης." Joannou 1962a, 154. The composition of the Bible was not universally settled at the time of the Synod of Laodicea, and to some collections, a list of biblical books was added as the 60<sup>th</sup> canon of the Synod. Hefele 1873, 776-777; Joannou 1962, 128-129; Page 2010, 93.

385 Lampe 1961, 668, gives the interpretation 'secular' as opposite to 'sacred'.

386 E.g. Hefele 1873, 774; NPNF2-14, 158; PSK 1983, 37.

387 An example of a modelling on the biblical psalms is the 151<sup>st</sup> psalm which occurs in

definition emphasizes that only the accepted repertoire was to be sung in church.<sup>388</sup>

The question of the character of the accepted repertoire requires some consideration. While we may be sure that the 'psalms' mentioned in the 17<sup>th</sup> canon were from the Psalter, it was not the source of everything sung in the divine services. In his explanation of the present canons, the Byzantine scholar Theodore Balsamon refers to the time before "the arrangement of the Ecclesiastical Psalmody", which probably happened at the Synod of Laodicea. Here, the noun 'psalmody' does not mean solely the singing of psalms but ecclesiastical singing in general, which is the sense of the word in the tradition of the Orthodox Church.<sup>389</sup>

### 3.2.2 The singer in the Apostolic Constitutions

Rather contemporaneously with the Synod of Laodicea was compiled the largest of the ancient church orders, the Apostolic Constitutions. It is based on three

---

some versions of the LXX, describing the victory of David over Goliath. Werner 1959, 259<sup>81</sup>. Cf. Sendrey 1974, 423. The question of private creations is touched upon also in the 18<sup>th</sup> canon of Laodicea, concerning the prayers at nones and at vespers, which were always to be the same. According to Balsamon, the reason of this order lies in the custom of some who, "out of arrogance, composed hymnodic prayers for vespers, and read them. Being accused thereupon, they said they had not done anything wrong and had not dismissed the prayers given by the Fathers. Those they had put into the nones, and their own they sang as vesper hymns. The Fathers thought that the traditional prayers were sufficient both at the nones and the vespers and, simply, at all gatherings. Thus, it was not allowed to compose one's own prayers." Theod. Balsamon In Can. XVIII Conc. Laod. PG CXXXVII, 1365A.

388 Hefele 1873, 774-775. NPNF2-14, 158-159, 135, mentions some early *Psalmi idiotici* which have survived until our days: *Gloria in excelsis*, *Te Deum*, and *Phos hilaron*.

389 The reference is made in the explanation of canon 16, which concerns the divine service on the Sabbath, i.e. Saturday. Used above is the translation of NPNF 2-14, 133; in fact, Balsamon does not use the Greek word *psalmōdia* but the word *psaltōdēmata*, which refers to a wider concept than the mere singing of psalms. PG CXXXVII, 1364A-B. Hefele 1873, 762. Seppälä 1999, 274-275; 2012, 91.

earlier church orders which were supplemented and formed into a body of eight books by a single author in Syria, probably at Antioch.<sup>390</sup>

The six first books are based on the Syriac *Didascalia*, where sacred paragons were defined for the bishop, presbyter, and deacon, deaconess, widows, and orphans.<sup>391</sup> The corresponding paragraph in the Apostolic Constitutions has added to the number of the Levites also "those who read for you, and singers and doorkeepers".<sup>392</sup> The wording sets the readers a little apart from the others, perhaps because their rank also chronologically precedes that of singers and doorkeepers.

In the *Didascalia*, the reader appeared in the section relating to the distribution of the shares at the suppers for indigent widows, where, if he was present, he was entitled to receive the same amount as a presbyter or deacon. In the Apostolic Constitutions, the amount of the distributed shares for deacons and presbyters remains the same as in the *Didascalia*, i.e. double the share which was given to each of the women. Also, the condition for receiving his share is the same for the reader, but the amount has been changed: "If a reader is present,

---

390 The entire title of the church order is *Ordinances of the Holy Apostles through Clement*, attributing the text to Clement of Rome (*fl. c. 96*), whose Epistle to Corinthians testifies to the ecclesiastical circumstances at the end of the 1<sup>st</sup> century CE. Other works which are connected with his name form a body of 'Clementine literature', the origin and validity of which still are matters of dispute. The Apostolic Constitutions were compiled probably between 375-380, thus perhaps slightly antedating the Synod of Laodicea. The first six books of the church order are based on the Syriac *Didascalia*, the seventh book on the *Didache* – likewise of Syrian origin but a century earlier than the *Didascalia* – and the eighth on the Apostolic Tradition (see pp. 70-74 above). Funk 1891, 183-190, 202; SC 320, 55-57; Bradshaw 1992, 85ff.; Altaner-Stuiber 1993, 255-256; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 90, 360-361, 365-366; Page 2010, 95-96. The 2<sup>nd</sup> canon of the Synod of Trullo states that the Apostolic Constitutions were outside the Canons of the Orthodox Church, except for the section of the 85 Apostolic Canons in the 8<sup>th</sup> book of the Constitutions. PG CXXXVII, 521A, NPNF2-14, 361.

391 Cf. pp. 74-76 above.

392 AC II, 26. "3.[...] οἱ δὲ ἱερεῖς ὑμῶν οἱ πρεσβύτεροι, καὶ οἱ λευῖται ὑμῶν οἱ νῦν διάκονοι καὶ οἱ ἀναγινώσκοντες ὑμῖν καὶ οἱ ᾠδοὶ καὶ οἱ πυλωροί, αἱ διάκονοι ὑμῶν καὶ αἱ χῆραι καὶ αἱ παρθένοι καὶ οἱ ὀρφανοὶ ὑμῶν. 4. Ὁ δὲ τούτων πάντων ἀνώτερος ὁ ἀρχιερεὺς ἐστίν, ὁ ἐπίσκοπος." SC 320, 236-238. Cf. ANF 7, 410, which sets the text at the end of chapter 25.

he shall take one share because of the honour of the prophets. Likewise also the psalm singer (*psaltōdos*) and doorkeeper."<sup>393</sup> It is possible that the establishment of the new grades altered the situation of the reader.

Although informing us about the ecclesiastical ranks, the church order tends to use impersonal expressions. For instance, in the instructions for the bishop, we read: "[...] when you are beginning the prayer after the reading, the psalmody and the explaining of the Scriptures [...]."<sup>394</sup> This summary is explained some chapters further on:

In the middle shall the reader, standing on his high place, read the books of Moses and Joshua the son of Nun, of the Judges and the Kings, of the Chronicles and those of the return [from Exile], besides the books of Job and Solomon and the books of the sixteen prophets. When two texts have been read, someone other shall sing the hymns of David, and the people shall join the refrains.<sup>395</sup>

---

393 AC II, 28. "3. Ὡσεὶ δὲ ἐκάστη τῶν πρεσβυτίδων δίδοται, διπλοῦν διδόσθω τοῖς διακόνοις εἰς γέρας Χριστοῦ. 4. Τοῖς δὲ πρεσβυτέροις, ὡς ἂν κάμνωσιν περὶ τὸν τῆς διδασκαλίας λόγον, διπλῆ καὶ αὐτοῖς ἀφοριζέσθω ἡ μοῖρα εἰς χάριν τῶν τοῦ Χριστοῦ ἀποστόλων, ὧν καὶ τὸν τόπον φυλάσσουσιν ὡς συνέδροι τοῦ ἐπισκόπου καὶ τῆς Ἐκκλησίας στέφανος· εἰσὶν γὰρ συνέδριον καὶ βουλή τῆς Ἐκκλησίας. 5. Εἰ δὲ καὶ ἀναγνώστης ἔστιν, λαμβανέτω καὶ αὐτὸς μοῖραν μίαν εἰς τιμὴν τῶν προφητῶν· ὡσαύτως καὶ ψαλτωδὸς καὶ πυλωρός." SC 320, 244. The amount of the shares is given in AC VIII, 31, 2, which concerns the division of the remaining sacramental elements. The bishop shall receive quadruple the share to which subdeacons, readers, singers, and deaconesses are entitled. The presbyter shall receive a triple, and the deacon a double share.

394 AC II, 54. "1. Διὰ τοῦτο, ὧ ἐπίσκοποι, μελλόντων ὑμῶν εἰς προσευχὴν ἀπαντᾶν μετὰ τὴν ἀνάγνωσιν καὶ τὴν ψαλμωδίαν καὶ τὴν ἐπὶ ταῖς γραφαῖς διδασκαλίαν, ὁ διάκονος πλησίον ὑμῶν ἑστῶς μετὰ ὑψηλῆς φωνῆς λεγέτω· "Μὴ τις κατὰ τινος, μὴ τις ἐν ὑποκρίσει", ἵνα, ἐὰν εὔρεθῇ ἐν τισὶν ἀντιλογία, συνειδήσει κρουσθέντες δεηθῶσιν τοῦ Θεοῦ καὶ διαλλαγῶσιν τοῖς ἀδελφοῖς." SC 320, 304.

395 AC II, 57. "5. Μέσος δὲ ὁ ἀναγνώστης ἐφ' ὑψηλοῦ τινος ἑστῶς ἀναγινωσκέτω τὰ Μωϋσέως καὶ Ἰησοῦ τοῦ Ναυῆ, τὰ τῶν Κριτῶν καὶ τῶν Βασιλειῶν, τὰ τῶν Παραλειπομένων καὶ τὰ τῆς Ἐπανόδου, πρὸς τούτοις τὰ τοῦ Ἰωβ καὶ τὰ Σολομώντος καὶ τὰ τῶν Ἐξκαίδεκα προφητῶν. 6. Ἄνα δύο δὲ γενομένων ἀναγνωσμάτων, ἕτερος τις τοῦ Δαυὶδ ψαλλέτω τοὺς ὕμνους, καὶ ὁ λαὸς τὰ ἀκροστίχια ὑποψαλλέτω." SC 320, 312.

This constitution confirms the 17<sup>th</sup> canon of Laodicea which ordered reading between psalms, and specifies this by requiring two texts to be read in sequence. The reader is mentioned as an established office, but the person who sang the hymns of David, i.e. the Psalms, is referred to simply as 'someone other'. Considering that one author put the entire text together, one may wonder why did he not use the word 'singer' here, as it had already been recorded. The wording does not suggest either that the 'someone other' was another reader; perhaps he could be anyone capable of leading the psalms.<sup>396</sup>

The same manner of writing continues in the directions given to the bishop concerning the reception of the people who arrived at the church during the liturgy. These are received by the deacons while the bishop shall continue whatever he is doing, for instance listening "to him who is singing or reading".<sup>397</sup> The basic text of the *Didascalia* mentions mere listening without defining what the bishop would be listening to.<sup>398</sup>

According to the second book of the Apostolic Constitutions, the singing consisted of solo singing with common responses. More details are given in the eighth book of the Constitutions, which includes the oldest preserved description of the entire Eucharistic service.<sup>399</sup> It is called the Clementine Liturgy, referring to Clement of Rome. Below, we shall survey the entire course of the liturgy.

---

396 Cf. Seppälä 2012, 47-48.

397 AC II, 58. "4. Εἰ δὲ ἐν τῷ καθέζεσθαι ἕτερός τις ἐπεισέλθοι εὐσχήμων καὶ ἔνδοξος ἐν τῷ βίῳ, ἢ ξένος ἢ ἐγχώριος, σὺ ὁ ἐπίσκοπος ὁ προσλαλῶν τὸν περὶ Θεοῦ λόγον ἢ ὁ ἀκούων τοῦ ψάλλοντος ἢ τοῦ ἀναγινώσκοντος, μὴ προσωποληπτῶν καταλίπῃς τὴν διακονίαν τοῦ λόγου, [...]." SC 320, 322.

398 DA XII, Achelis-Flemming 1904, 69-70; Connolly 1929, 57-58.

399 ANF 7, 532, states that the liturgy would never have been used while Najim, 2005, argues that it was celebrated in the whole patriarchate of Antioch. Beckmann 1956, 18.

### 3.2.3 The course of the Clementine Liturgy

The liturgy begins with readings from the Law and the Prophets, from 'our' – i.e. apostolic – Letters and Acts, and the Gospels. The Greek text makes no mention of psalm singing.<sup>400</sup> After the reading of the Gospel, the bishop delivers the sermon, after which the deacon tells the hearers to leave.<sup>401</sup> This is succeeded by a series of prayers called litanies, read by the deacon and joined by the people with "Lord, have mercy", after every verse. The first of the prayers are said for groups who are not allowed to partake of the Eucharist: catechumens, energumens, illuminated and penitents.<sup>402</sup> Each group is dismissed after its proper litany, which is completed by the episcopal blessing and the common Amen.<sup>403</sup> Eventually, there remain only the faithful. The litany said for them includes a prayer for every ecclesiastical order: the three orders of bishop, presbyters, and deacons – with subdeacons – each receive a prayer of their own,

---

400 Beckmann 1956, 19; ANF 7, 483. In the version of V. Rev. Dr. Michel Najim, the beginning of the liturgy is divided between readings and psalmody in the following way: after the first two texts (Gen 28:10-19 and Joel 2:23-32) have been read by the reader, Psalm 18 (in *LXX*; Psalm 19 in the Hebrew Psalter) is sung responsorially, the refrain being from the fifth verse of the Psalm. The reader continues with Acts 1:12-17, 21-26, followed by Rom 10:11-18 and the singing of Psalm 96 (in the Hebrew Psalter, XX in *LXX*), with Alleluias as a refrain to precede the reading of Matt 10:32-33, 37-38, and 19:27-30, by the deacon. CLT, 1-4.

401 The hearers were the second-grade penitents. There were four penitentiary grades, of which the first was the most severe: those condemned to it were called mourners, who were only allowed to enter the outer porch of the church building. The place of the hearers was in the hall of the church, on both sides of the main door. OKK 1980, 164.

402 For energumens, see p. 80 above. As the preparation for baptism took several years, there was more than one rank of catechumens; those called illuminated were to be baptized next Easter. Beckmann 1956, 21-22; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 300. The penitents who stayed present until the liturgy of the faithful, belonged to the fourth grade, called bystanders. Between them and the hearers, there were the fallers who stayed on their knees during the liturgy, and who were dismissed together with the illuminated. OKK 1980, 164; the English titles are from Meyendorff 1999, 2, who presents the grades of penitents by Gregory Thaumaturgus (d. ca. 270), including a fifth grade, formed by those called participants.

403 ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 984-985.

while a common prayer is said for readers, singers (*psaltēs*), virgins, widows, and orphans.<sup>404</sup> After the last blessing and its Amen, the deacon says: "Let us attend." The bishop wishes the peace of God on all, and the people respond "And with thy Spirit." The deacon exhorts the people to salute each other with the holy kiss.<sup>405</sup>

One of the subdeacons brings water and pours it on the hands of the priests as a symbol of the purity of the souls of those who are dedicated to God. The deacon repeats the proclamation that none of the catechumens, hearers, unbelievers, and heterodox shall remain, and the Eucharistic elements are brought to the bishop.<sup>406</sup> The celebration of the Eucharist begins with the three-part responsory between the bishop and the people.<sup>407</sup> The following Eucharistic prayer includes the singing of the hymn of the Seraphim (Is 6:3): "Holy, holy, holy, Lord of hosts, heaven and earth are full of thy glory: Thou art blessed for ever. Amen."<sup>408</sup> After the words of institution, a prayer is said for the Church, all bishoprics, and ecclesiastics: the bishop himself, presbyters, deacons, and the whole clergy. Further, holy persons are prayed for, listed in groups: patriarchs, prophets, bishops, presbyters, and deacons, subdeacons, readers, singers (*psaltōn*), virgins, widows, and, finally, lay persons. The people respond to the prayer with the Amen.<sup>409</sup>

The bishop says the greeting of peace, answered by the people with "And with thy spirit." This is followed by the bidding prayer with the same structure as the

---

404 Beckmann 1956, 24; ANF 7, 485; CLT 9. In this chapter, none of the lists of the clerics mentions doorkeepers, who were listed in the 24<sup>th</sup> canon of Laodicea.

405 CLT 12 has here an addition between the kiss of peace and the washing of the hands of the priests: "I will love thee, O Lord, my strength; the Lord is my firm foundation, my refuge and my deliverer", said by the people.

406 CLT 12 includes here the addition of Ps 24: 7-10, sung by the people.

407 The responsory reads: "The grace of Almighty God, and the love of our Lord Jesus Christ, and the fellowship of the holy Spirit be with all of you. - And with thy spirit. - Lift up your mind. - We lift it up to the Lord. - Let us give thanks to the Lord. - It is meet and right so to do." Beckmann 1956, 27; ANF 7, 486; CLT 12.

408 Beckmann 1956, 30; ANF 7, 488; CLT 15.

409 Beckmann 1956, 32; ANF 7, 490; CLT 17.

litanies: the people respond with "Lord, have mercy" after each verse said by the deacon. The bishop completes the prayer, and the Amen is followed by the deacon saying: "Let us attend." The bishop says: "The holies for those who are holy", and the people respond:

One holy, one Lord, Jesus Christ in the glory of God, the Father, blessed for ever. Amen.

Glory to God in the highest and peace on earth, approval among men.

Hosanna to the Son of David!

Blessed is he who comes in the name of the Lord. God, Lord who appeared to us.

Hosanna in the highest!<sup>410</sup>

The hymn being completed, the Eucharist is administered in descending order from the bishop to presbyters, deacons, and subdeacons, readers, singers (*psaltai*), and ascetics. These are followed by the female ranks – deaconesses, virgins, and widows – and the last to communicate are the children, and the rest of the people. During this, Psalm 33 is sung, this time evidently without common refrains, as the following chapter begins with: "When he who sings has paused, [...]"<sup>411</sup> After the Sacrament, the deacon says the bidding prayer, and the

410 Beckmann 1956, 34; ANF 7 490; CLT 19.

411 AC VIII, 13. "12. Καὶ ὁ ἐπίσκοπος προσφωνησάτω τῷ λαῷ οὕτως · Τὰ ἅγια τοῖς ἁγίοις. 13. Καὶ ὁ λαὸς ὑπακουέτω · Εἰς ἅγιος, εἰς Κύριος, Ἰησοῦς Χριστός, εἰς δόξαν Θεοῦ Πατρὸς ἐν ἁγίῳ Πνεύματι · εὐλογητὸς εἰ εἰς τοὺς αἰῶνας · ἀμήν. Δόξα ἐν ὑψίστοις Θεῷ καὶ ἐπὶ γῆς εἰρήνη, ἐν ἀνθρώποις εὐδοκία · ὡσαννὰ τῷ Υἱῷ Δαυὶδ, εὐλογημένος ὁ ἐρχόμενος ἐν ὀνόματι Κυρίου Θεὸς Κύριος καὶ ἐπεφάνη ἡμῖν, ὡσαννὰ ἐν τοῖς ὑψίστοις. 14. Καὶ μετὰ τοῦτο μεταλαμβάνετω ὁ ἐπίσκοπος, ἔπειτα οἱ πρεσβύτεροι καὶ οἱ διάκονοι καὶ οἱ ὑποδιάκονοι καὶ οἱ ἀναγνώσται καὶ οἱ ψάλται καὶ οἱ ἀσκηταί, καὶ ἐν ταῖς γυναιξὶν αἱ διακόνοι καὶ αἱ παρθένοι καὶ αἱ χῆραι, εἶτα τὰ παιδιά, καὶ τότε πᾶς ὁ λαὸς κατὰ τάξιν μετὰ αἰδοῦς καὶ εὐλαβείας ἄνευ θορύβου. 15. Καὶ ὁ μὲν ἐπίσκοπος διδότης τὴν προσφορὰν λέγων · Σῶμα Χριστοῦ. Καὶ ὁ δεχόμενος λεγέτω · Ἀμήν. Ὁ δὲ διάκονος κατεχέτω τὸ ποτήριον καὶ ἐπιδιδούς λεγέτω · Αἷμα Χριστοῦ, ποτήριον ζωῆς. Καὶ ὁ πίνων λεγέτω · Ἀμήν. 16. Ψαλμὸς δὲ λεγέσθω ὁ λγ' ἐν τῷ μεταλαμβάνειν πάντας τοὺς λοιπούς. 17. Καὶ ὅταν πάντες μεταλάβωσιν καὶ πᾶσαι, λαβόντες οἱ διάκονοι τὰ περισσεύσαντα εἰσφερέτωσαν εἰς τὰ παστοφόρια. 14. 1. Καὶ ὁ διάκονος λεγέτω παυσαμένου τοῦ ψάλλοντος· [...]." SC 336, 208-210. The psalm number given in the passage follows the LXX; in the Hebrew Psalter, the number is 34.

bishop the thanksgiving prayer. After the people have answered Amen, the deacon exhorts them to bow down and receive the blessing, said by the bishop. The blessing is completed with the common Amen, and the words of dismissal by the deacon.<sup>412</sup>

From the minutiae of the liturgy, the duties of the singers may be derived. First, they led the responses, of which the "Lord, have mercy" is the most frequent. It also had to be uttered the instant after each verse, requiring the song leader to be alert.<sup>413</sup> The singers also must have led the two hymns, the one in the course of the Eucharistic prayer, and the other preceding the partaking of the Eucharist. The singing of the Eucharistic psalm is expressed with a participle, indicating that it was sung solo but giving no information as to the person of the singer.

### **3.2.4 The ecclesiastical order in the Apostolic Constitutions**

At the time of the writing of the Apostolic Constitutions, the ecclesiastical discipline seems to have left a lot to be desired. This becomes evident in the third book of the church order, where a specific regulation forbids laymen to perform tasks which belonged to priests, like administering the Eucharist, baptizing, ordaining, and blessing. Not only laymen but lower clerics also seem to have aspired to such privileges, as is seen here:

But we do not allow any of the other clerics, like readers, singers, door-keepers and subdeacons to baptize, but only bishops and presbyters, assisted by the deacons. Those who dare to do this will receive the same retribution as did the Korahites.<sup>414</sup> And we do not allow presbyters to

---

412 Beckmann 1956, 35-36; ANF 7, 491; CLT 19-20.

413 The edition of Najim records the 'Lord, have mercy' to be sung seventy-seven times.

In the edition, all responses and hymns are addressed to the people.

414 Cf. Numeri 16.

ordain deacons, or deaconesses, or readers, or subdeacons, or singers (*ōdous*), or doorkeepers, but only the bishops: because this is the ecclesiastical order and agreement.<sup>415</sup>

As stated above, the canons of the Synod of Laodicea did not define who appointed the canonical singers but mentioned only the appointment of exorcists by the bishop.<sup>416</sup> Here it is confirmed that the bishop ordained all ranks; the instructions for the appointment of bishop, presbyter, deacon, deaconess, subdeacon, reader, confessor, virgin, and exorcist are given in the eighth book of the Apostolic Constitutions.

Whereas the source text of this part, the Apostolic Tradition, mentioned that the reader was not to receive the imposition of hands, the Apostolic Constitutions grants this to him.<sup>417</sup> The prayer on appointment states that the order of the reader is the first grade in the ecclesiastical career, and invokes the prophetic spirit to instruct him "so that he would show himself to be worthy of a

---

415 AC III, 11. "1. Ἄλλ' οὔτε τοῖς λοιποῖς κληρικοῖς ἐπιτρέπομεν βαπτίζειν, οἷον ἀναγνώσταις ἢ ψάλταις ἢ πυλωροῖς ἢ ὑπηρέταις, ἀλλ' ἢ μόνοις ἐπισκόποις καὶ πρεσβυτέροις, ἐξυπηρετουμένων αὐτοῖς τῶν διακόνων. 2. Οἱ δὲ τολμώντες τοῦτο τῶν Κορειτῶν ὑπόισουσι τὴν δίκην. 3. Οὐκ ἐπιτρέπομεν δὲ πρεσβυτέροις χειροτονεῖν διακόνους ἢ διακονίσσας ἢ ἀναγνώστους ἢ ὑπηρέτας ἢ ὠδοῦς ἢ πυλωρούς, ἀλλὰ μόνοις τοῖς ἐπισκόποις · αὕτη γὰρ ἐστὶ τάξις ἐκκλησιαστικὴ καὶ ἄρμονία." SC 329, 146.

416 Cf. fn. 380 above.

417 Manuscripts differ on this; ANF 7, 493<sup>1</sup>, mentions that the Oxford manuscript repeats the wording of the Apostolic Tradition.

higher order by Christ, [...]."<sup>418</sup> The order of the reader seems to be considered a preparatory office for further orders, not a lifelong rank.<sup>419</sup>

Returning to the privileges and restrictions, the bishop, who alone had the right to ordain, was also the only person who could remove a person from his rank when such a punishment was demanded. As to other punitive sanctions, other higher orders had specified rights. The presbyter could separate his inferiors from the ecclesiastical communion. In the absence of the presbyter, the deacon could separate the subdeacon, reader, singer, and deaconess, none of whom had any such rights: "It is not allowed to the subdeacon to separate anyone, nor to the reader, nor to the singer (*psaltēs*), nor to the deaconess; not [to separate] a cleric, nor a layman, because they are inferior to the deacons."<sup>420</sup>

418 AC VIII, 22. "1. Περὶ δὲ ἀναγνωστῶν ἐγὼ Ματθαῖος ὁ καὶ Λεὺϊς ὁ ποτε τελώνης διατάσσομαι. 2. Ἀναγνώστην προχέρισαι ἐπιθεὶς αὐτῷ τὴν χεῖρα, καὶ ἐπευξάμενος πρὸς τὸν Θεὸν λέγε · 3. Ὁ Θεὸς ὁ αἰώνιος, ὁ πολὺς ἐν ἐλέει καὶ οἰκτιρμοῖς, ὁ τὴν τοῦ κόσμου σύστασιν διὰ τῶν ἐνεργουμένων φανεροποιήσας καὶ τὸν ἀριθμὸν τῶν ἐκλεκτῶν σου ἐν ὅλῳ τῷ κόσμῳ διαφυλάττων · αὐτὸς καὶ νῦν ἐπίδεδε ἐπὶ τὸν δούλόν σου ἐγχειριζόμενον τὰς ἀγίας σου γραφὰς ἀναγινώσκειν τῷ λαῷ σου, καὶ δὸς αὐτῷ Πνεῦμα ἅγιον, πνεῦμα προφητικόν. 4. Ὁ σοφίσας Ἐσδραν τὸν θεράποντά σου ἐπὶ τὸ ἀναγινώσκειν τοὺς νόμους σου τῷ λαῷ σου, καὶ νῦν παρακαλούμενος ὑφ' ἡμῶν σοφίσον τὸν δούλόν σου καὶ δὸς αὐτῷ, ἀκατάγνωστον διανύσαντα τὸ ἐγχειρισθῆν αὐτῷ ἔργον, ἅξιον ἀναδειχθῆναι μείζονος βαθμοῦ διὰ Χριστοῦ, δι' οὗ σοι δόξα καὶ τὸ σέβας ἐν ἀγίῳ Πνεύματι εἰς τοὺς αἰῶνας · ἀμήν." SC 336, 224.

419 The ideal of appointing readers men – or youths – who would be capable of taking further orders was stated by Cyprian of Carthage in the middle of the 3<sup>rd</sup> century, as well as by the Apostolic Church Order at the end of the century. Contemporary with or a little later than the Apostolic Constitutions, the church order *Testamentum Domini* recalls both the rite of appointment of the reader of the Apostolic Tradition, and the ideal of the requirements laid down for him in the Apostolic Church Order. Cf. *Testamentum Domini* I.45, Sperry-White 1991, 45.

420 AC VIII, 28. "2. [...] Ἐπίσκοπος καθαιρεῖ πάντα κληρικὸν ἅξιον ὄντα καθαιρέσεως πλὴν ἐπισκόπου· μόνος γὰρ οὐχ οἴός τε. 3. Πρεσβύτερος [...] χειροθετεῖ, οὐ χειροτονεῖ, οὐ καθαιρεῖ, ἀφορίζει δὲ τοὺς ὑποβεβηκότας, ἐὰν ὦσιν ὑπεύθυνοι τῇ τοιαύτῃ τιμωρίᾳ. 4. Διάκονος οὐκ εὐλογεῖ · οὐ δίδωσιν εὐλογίαν, λαμβάνει δὲ παρὰ ἐπισκόπου καὶ πρεσβυτέρου · οὐ βαπτίζει, οὐ προσφέρει · τοῦ δὲ ἐπισκόπου προσενεγκόντος ἢ τοῦ πρεσβυτέρου, αὐτὸς ἐπιδίδωσιν τῷ λαῷ, οὐχ ὡς ἱερεὺς, ἀλλ' ὡς διακονούμενος ἱερεῦσιν. 5. Τῶν τε ἄλλων κληρικῶν τὸ τοῦ διακόνου ἔργον ποιῆσαι οὐδεὶ ἐξόν. 6. Διακόνισσα οὐκ εὐλογεῖ, ἀλλ' οὐδέ τι ὧν ποιούσιν οἱ πρεσβύτεροι ἢ οἱ διάκονοι ἐπιτελεῖ, ἀλλ' ἢ τοῦ φυλάττειν τὰς θύρας καὶ ἐξυπηρετῆσθαι τοῖς πρεσβυτέροις ἐν τῷ

Hierarchical inferiority meant concessions concerning marital status. A subdeacon, singer, reader, or doorkeeper was allowed to marry also after entering the clergy while the bishop, presbyter, and deacon were to remain in the marital state which they were in at the time of their ordination.<sup>421</sup>

Laying down of the principles concerning the different ecclesiastical orders is completed in the last chapter of the eighth book of the Apostolic Constitutions. The chapter consists of eighty-five short regulations which are also known as an independent entity called the Apostolic Canons. The canons are intended to establish the fundamental orders of the Church.<sup>422</sup>

---

βαπτίζεσθαι τὰς γυναῖκας διὰ τὸ εὐπρεπές. 7. Διάκονος ἀφορίζει ὑποδιάκονον, ἀναγνώστην, ψάλτην, διακόνισσαν, ἂν ἢ τι τοιοῦτον μὴ παρόντος πρεσβυτέρου. 8. Ὑποδιακόνω οὐκ ἔξεστιν ἀφορίσαι, οὔτε μὴν ἀναγνώστη οὔτε ψάλτη οὔτε διακόνισση, οὐ κληρικόν, οὐ λαϊκόν· ὑπηρεταὶ γὰρ εἰσιν διακόνων." SC 336, 230-232. Based on the last reference – the Greek word *hypēretai*, used in AC III, 11 above, for subdeacons – the translation of ANF VII, 494, reads that readers, singers and deaconesses were "ministers to the deacons". Cf. Sparksman 1980, 31, 36.

421 AC VI, 17. "1. Ἐπίσκοπον καὶ πρεσβύτερον καὶ διάκονον εἴπομεν μονογάμους καθιστάσθαι, κὰν ζῶσιν αὐτῶν αἱ γαμεταί, κὰν τεθνήκασιν, μὴ ἐξεῖναι δὲ αὐτοῖς μετὰ χειροτονίαν ἢ ἀγάμοις οὔσιν ἔτι ἐπὶ γάμον ἔρχεσθαι, ἢ γεγαμηκόσιν ἑτέροις συμπλέκεσθαι, ἀλλ' ἀρκεῖσθαι ἢ ἔχοντες ἦλθον ἐπὶ τὴν χειροτονίαν. 2. Ὑπηρετάς δὲ καὶ ψαλτωδοὺς καὶ ἀναγνώστας καὶ πυλωροὺς καὶ αὐτοὺς μὲν μονογάμους εἶναι κελεύομεν· εἰ δὲ πρὸ γάμου εἰς κλήρον παρέλθωσιν, ἐπιτρέπομεν αὐτοῖς γαμεῖν, εἴγε πρὸς τοῦτο πρόθεσιν ἔχουσιν, ἵνα μὴ ἀμαρτήσαντες κολάσεως τύχωσιν. 3. Οὐδενὶ δὲ τῶν ἐν τῷ κλήρῳ κελεύομεν ἢ ἐταίραν ἢ οἰκέτιν ἢ χήραν καὶ ἐκβεβλημένην λαμβάνειν, ὡς καὶ ὁ Νόμος λέγει. 4. Διακόνισσα δὲ γινέσθω παρθενοσ ἀγνή· εἰ δὲ μήγε, κὰν χήρα μονόγαμος, πιστὴ καὶ τιμίᾳ." SC 329, 346-348. The same order is given in the Apostolic Canons, confirming matrimony as the normal state of all Christians; only ascetics could abstain from it. However, marrying twice after receiving baptism prevented one from joining the clergy at all, as did also living with a wife with a questionable past. Marrying after one's appointment was allowed only to readers and singers. AC VIII, 47, 17, 18, 27.

422 The Apostolic Canons belong to the *corpus canonum* of the Orthodox Church, the other parts of the Apostolic Constitutions being rejected by the Synod of Trullo in 691. OKK 1980, 317-324; NPNF 2-14, 361; PG 137, 521A. In the East, the Apostolic Canons are considered to have been established, at the latest, at the beginning of the 4<sup>th</sup> century, as both the Council of Nicaea in 325 and the Synod of Antioch in 341 made use of them. In the West, the origin of the Apostolic Canons has been estimated to have been at a later date although their content is considered ancient. The first Latin version of the collection was made ca. 500, and consisted of fifty canons, which remained the number of canons in Latin. A Greek version with eighty-five

To this end, the Apostolic Canons begin by defining areas of competence. A bishop shall be ordained by two or three bishops, while a single bishop shall ordain a presbyter, a deacon and other clerics.<sup>423</sup> The explanation given for this canon is that the bishop, presbyters and deacons belong to the sacred hierarchy while the others are called "ministers of the church".<sup>424</sup> Throughout the Apostolic Canons, the latter are referred to as belonging to "the catalogue of clerics", preceded by a separate mention of presbyter and deacon, or, of "the hieratic list".<sup>425</sup> Each church kept a list of its clergy; although it was called hieratic, it did not consist only of the names of those in the sacred hierarchy, "but also subdeacons, readers and even singers", writes Milasch, arguing that these were subordinated to the rule because of the severity of the ecclesiastical discipline at the time.<sup>426</sup>

All the ecclesiastical ranks appear in the following disciplinary canons:

A bishop, or a presbyter, or a deacon who loiters at dice or drinking, shall either give it up or be deposed.

A subdeacon, or reader, or a singer behaving in the same way, shall either give it up or be separated. A layman shall be treated likewise.<sup>427</sup>

The game of dice was unacceptable for two reasons. First because, engraved on the sides of the dye, instead of numbers or spots, there used to be symbols of heathen divinities, which were abominations for Christians. Second, winning at gambling was considered tantamount to theft.<sup>428</sup>

---

canons appeared after the middle of the 6<sup>th</sup> century, and became the established number of the canons in the East. Hefele 1873, 794; Funk 1891, 197; Milasch 1905, 81ff., 161-165; Joannou 1962a, 1; SC 336, 11; Μενεβίσογλου 1990, 101ff.

423 AC VIII, 47, 1. Cf. AC III, 11 above. Milasch 1905, 278. In the manuscript on which the English translation in the edition of Schaff and the Finnish edition of the Canons are based, this canon is divided into two, separating the ordaining of the bishop and the ordaining of all the other ranks. ANF 7, 500; OKK 1980, 39-42.

424 OKK 1980, 41. The ordination of the sacred hierarchy is performed inside the altar, the others are appointed outside it.

425 E.g. Apostolic Canons 8, 15, 17, 18, 51, 63, 70.

426 AC VIII, 47, 15, 51. Cf. OKK 1980, 65.

427 AC VIII, 47, 42-43. Cf. Milasch 1905, 238.

428 Hefele 1873, 191; OKK 1980, 91.

On the subsistence of the clergy, we recall the earlier orders about the size of the shares that were to be distributed to the clergy after a banquet and after Communion. The Apostolic Canons emphasize that everyone entitled to a share was to receive it. The shares were divided from the gifts people brought to the church. In principle only bread and wine, and oil and incense were allowed to be left there, but other wares, as well as first fruits, were to be sent to the house of the bishop and the presbyters, who distributed from them also to deacons and other clerics. The gifts were divided into three parts: one for the wages of the clergy, another for the supplies of the church, and the third part for the poor.<sup>429</sup>

Several of the Apostolic Canons emphasize absolute observance of the hierarchical discipline: those in the lower ranks were not to interfere in, or to try to take on the duties of those higher in rank, nor to insult them.<sup>430</sup>

The 60<sup>th</sup> Apostolic Canon treats the character of the writings which were not to be used publicly in the church, drawing a distinction between canonical and apocryphal books. The latter are also called pseudepigraphic, as they often are attributed to apostles, or are even titled gospels.<sup>431</sup> The list of canonical books is given in the 85<sup>th</sup> Apostolic Canon, and includes some which did not remain in the canon of the Bible: three Maccabees and Sirach in the Old Testament, and the Epistles and Constitutions of Clement in the New Testament, omitting the Revelation.<sup>432</sup>

The canons of the Synod of Laodicea together with the Apostolic Constitutions, including the Apostolic Canons, are the basic normative sources for the establishment of the order of the singer. To these can be added a detail from an epistle which has been attributed to Ignatius of Antioch, but which was

---

429 AC VIII, 47, 4. OKK 1980, 42-44. See also Jones 1964, 894. If clerics in need were left without their portions, he who had neglected his obligations was first to be separated from the ecclesiastical communion. The second time, he was to be deposed. AC VIII, 47, 59. For the grades of punishments of the clergy, see OKK 1980, 51-54.

430 Apostolic Canons 31,39, 55, 56.

431 AC VIII, 47, 60. OKK 1980, 108-110.

432 OKK 1980, 136-137.

probably written by the author of the Apostolic Constitutions.<sup>433</sup> The Epistle to the Antiochians ends with a greeting to all the ecclesiastical ranks: the presbyterate, deacons, subdeacons, readers, singers (*psaltas*), doorkeepers, ascetes, exorcists, confessors, deaconesses, virgins, and widows.<sup>434</sup> The list corresponds with the nomenclature we have already encountered.<sup>435</sup>

### 3.2.5 Singers in other fourth-century sources

The singer also appears in other late fourth century documents. One of them is the Coptic collection of one hundred and seven canons attributed to Athanasius of Alexandria.<sup>436</sup> The canons mention the lower orders of subdeacons, readers, singers and doorkeepers. The canons are of a disciplinary character: the bishop is required to check often that both the reader – mentioned in the singular – and the

---

433 See pp. 112-113 above.

434 Pseudo-Ignatius, Ad Antiochenes XII. "Ἀσπάζομαι τὸ ἅγιον πρεσβυτέριον. Ἀσπάζομαι τοὺς ἱεροὺς διακόνους, καὶ τὸ ποθεινὸν μοι ὄνομα, ὃν ἐπίδοιμι ἀντὶ ἐμοῦ ἐν Πνεύματι ἁγίῳ, ὅταν Χριστοῦ ἐπιτύχω· οὐ ἀντίψυχον γενοίμην. Ἀσπάζομαι ὑποδιακόνους, ἀναγνώστας, ψάλτας, πυλωροὺς, τοὺς κοπιῶντας, ἐπορκιστὰς, ὁμολογητὰς. Ἀσπάζομαι τὰς φρουροὺς τῶν ἁγίων πυλώνων, τὰς ἐν Χριστῷ διακόνους. Ἀσπάζομαι τὰς χριστολήπτους παρθένους, ὧν ὀνάιμην ἐν Κυρίῳ Ἰησοῦ. Ἀσπάζομαι τὸν λαὸν Κυρίου ἀπὸ μικροῦ ἕως μεγάλου, καὶ πάσας τὰς ἀδελφάς μου ἐν Κυρίῳ." PG V, 908A-B.

435 Regarding the confessors, cf. pp. 159-161 below.

436 The canonical corpus of the Orthodox Church includes three genuine canons of Athanasius which are actually letters; these 107 'canons' do not belong to it. Μενεβίσογλου 1990, 540-541. The attribution of the canons to Athanasius may derive from the Ecclesiastical History of Socrates who alludes to a work of Athanasius titled *Synodicon* (Socrates, HE I, 13). The text originates probably from the latter half of the 4<sup>th</sup> century, and consists of only one canon, deriving in Coptic from the 6<sup>th</sup>/7<sup>th</sup> century. This was divided into 107 statutes in the translation into Arabic by Michael of Tinnîs in 1049. Riedel 1904, IXff. The English translation does not include the titles of the canons, which were published in German by Riedel in 1900. See also Bradshaw 1992, 203.

singers – mentioned in the plural – use only the canonical books.<sup>437</sup> Further, the singers

shall not sing the writings of Meletius<sup>438</sup> and of the ignorant, that sing without wisdom, not as David and in the Holy Spirit, but like the songs of the heathen, whose mouths ought to be stopped. But if they sing not in the Holy Spirit, let them sing not (at all). It is written, 'Ye shall not add thereto neither take from it.'<sup>439</sup>

The readers are to be left to work in peace; the canon concerning them remarks that they are not "bound to the service of the subdeacons", but to be honoured because they read the sacred Scriptures.<sup>440</sup> They shall also understand what they read, to be able to teach others "without grudging, but rather the more with gladness, because that those do ask what is good." The singers shall sing nothing else but the book of Psalms, and "likewise teach others without grudging to sing".<sup>441</sup> At the celebration of the Eucharist it is the readers, not the singers who "shall sing in the word of God or shall repeat of the Psalms".<sup>442</sup>

Two derivatives of the Apostolic Tradition give details concerning the practice of singing. One of them has been touched upon earlier, namely the *Testamentum Domini*.<sup>443</sup> We recall that in the group of the ecclesiastics, there were no singers. Neither is any kind of singing mentioned in the description of the Eucharist.<sup>444</sup>

---

437 Canons of Athanasius 18 and 11, Riedel 1904, 28, 23, who remarks that the epithet describing the books may be either 'catholic' or 'canonical'.

438 The ecclesiastical history includes two Meletian schisms. The allusion to Meletius here probably refers to the bishop of Lycopolis who lost his see at the council of Nicaea; the schism rose again at the episcopate of Athanasius and continued long thereafter. ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 1067-1068.

439 Canons of Athanasius 12, Riedel 1904, 24, who notes the similarity with the 59<sup>th</sup> canon of Laodicea, and points out the word "ignorant" as referring to the private psalms mentioned there.

440 Canons of Athanasius 35, Riedel 1904, 32.

441 Canons of Athanasius 58-59, Riedel 1904, 39. The wording of the latter is unfortunately a little obscure: did the singers grudge singing, or, grudge teaching others to sing.

442 Canons of Athanasius 78, Riedel 1904, 48-49.

443 See p. 96<sup>329</sup> above.

444 Rahmani 1899, 199, remarks that the moment of the distribution of the Eucharist lacks the singing of Psalm 33, mentioned in the Apostolic Constitutions, as well as by

The course of the daily morning prayers is given in greater detail. First, the prayer at dawn (*laudatio aurora*) repeatedly includes the acclamation: "We praise you, we bless you, we give you thanks, we beseech you, our God."<sup>445</sup> After the completion of the prayer, the text orders: "They shall sing four psalms and songs: one by Moses, the others of Solomon and of the other prophets. The singers: little boys, two virgins, three deacons, three presbyters."<sup>446</sup> The church order also mentions singing at the agapes, again by little boys.<sup>447</sup> The instructions given for different situations include the reference to responsorial singing: "To him, who sings in the church, shall virgins and boys respond singing."<sup>448</sup>

The Ethiopic version of the Apostolic Tradition also refers to a singer group, and to responsorial singing, in this case at the evening Eucharist:

And after the supper, they shall rise praying,<sup>449</sup> and children shall say psalms, and virgins. And afterwards the deacon, taking the chalice of the mixed sacramental elements, shall say one of the psalms with the Hallelujah. And if the presbyter later so orders, more of the same psalms. And after the bishop has offered the chalice, he [the deacon] shall sing a psalm from among those which are suitable for the chalice, with the Hallelujah which is said by all. At the recitation of the psalms, all shall say the Hallelujah which means: We praise him who is God; glory and praise to him who created the whole world with the word only.

---

three ecclesiastical authors.

445 Testamentum Domini I: XXVI. "[...] Populus dicat: Te laudamus, tibi benedicimus, tibi confitemur, Domine, teque supplicamus, Deus noster." Rahmani 1899, 51; English transl. Sperry-White 1991, 32.

446 Testamentum Domini I: XXVI. "[...] Psallant psalmos et cantica quatuor, unum quod ex Moyse, alia ex Salomone et ex prophetis (alia) sic: Psallentes pueruli, duo virgines, tres diaconi, tres presbyteri. [...]" Rahmani 1899, 55; *ibid.* 168, remarks that the virgins mentioned in the document represent both genders.

447 Testamentum Domini II. "De agapibus. Psalmos spirituales dicant pueruli, et cantica ad accensionem lucernae. Universus populus psallens voce consona respondeat: Alleluja." Rahmani 1899, 135.

448 Testamentum Domini II: XX. "Ei, qui in ecclesia psallit, virgines et pueri respondeant psallentes. [...]" Rahmani 1899, 143.

449 In the French translation, the former part of the sentence is separated from the latter part. The editor Bernard Botte notes that it fits poorly in that place, and assumes that it has been added to indicate the end of the paragraph. SC 11<sup>bis</sup>, 101.

And after the psalm is completed, he [the bishop] shall bless the chalice<sup>450</sup> and distribute of the fragments to all believers.<sup>451</sup>

Here may be added two references to singers made by Cyril of Jerusalem. Once, he exhorts his audience to listen "to him who is singing" the Eucharistic Psalm.<sup>452</sup> Elsewhere he writes: "We know the excellent psalmists (*psalmōdoi*) of the Church who imitate the army of the angels, and always praise God in song." The edition of Migne provides this section with a footnote stating that in the church of Jerusalem, others than the specific psalmists (*psalmistae*) never sang.<sup>453</sup>

---

450 Dix 1992, 52, remarks that the word chalice, although present in all manuscripts, may be an error for the word 'bread'.

451 AT 25. "[...] Et surgent ergo post cenam orantes, pueri dicent psalmos, et virgines. Et postea diaconus, mixtum calicem oblationis cum accipiet, dicet psalmum de illis in quibus scriptum est alleluia. Et postea presbyter si praecipit, etiam ex iisdem psalmis. Et postea (quam) episcopus obtulit calicem, (eorum) cum conveniunt calici psalmum dicet, omnem cum alleluia, dum dicent omnes. Cum recitabunt psalmos, dicent omnes alleluia, quod dicitur : laudamus qui est deus ; gloria et laus ei qui creavit omne saeculum per verbum tantum. Et perfecto psalmo, benedicet calicem et de fragmentis dabit omnibus fidelibus." SC 11<sup>bis</sup>, 100-102. Cf. Dix 1992, 50ff. Page 2010, 52-53, observes that the groups of both children and virgins are mentioned gender neutrally.

452 S. Cyrilli Hierosol. Archiep. Catechesis Mystagogica V. "20. Μετὰ ταῦτα, ἀκούετε τοῦ ψάλλοντος, μετὰ μέλους θεοῦ προτρεπομένου ὑμᾶς εἰς τὴν κοινωσίαν τῶν ἁγίων μυστηρίων καὶ λέγοντος : " Γεύσασθε καὶ ἴδετε, ὅτι χρηστὸς ὁ Κύριος." [...] PG XXXIII, 1124B. Cf. 118<sup>411</sup> above. Cyril was the bishop of Jerusalem ca. 349-387. The text, deriving from 385 or later, may be written by his successor. ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 442-443.

453 S. Cyrilli Hierosol. Archiep. Catechesis XIII. "26. [...] Οἶδασιν οἱ σπουδαῖοι τῆς Ἐκκλησίας ψαλμῶδοι οἱ τὰς ἀγγελικὰς μιμούμενοι στρατιάς, καὶ πάντοτε τὸν Θεὸν ἀνυμνοῦντες · οἱ καταξιούμενοι ψάλλειν ἐν τῷ Γολγοθᾶ τούτῳ, καὶ λέγειν: [...]."\* PG XXXIII, 804C-805A. \* The following verse is Ps. 21:9 (in LXX; Ps. 22:9 in the Hebrew Psalter). "Nota (1) *Studiosi Ecclesiae psalmistae*. Erant forte aliqui ex his psalmistis in baptizandorum numero ; nam Hierosolymis locum habere potuit, quod observabatur in Ecclesia Alexandrina, ut lectores et cantores ὑφηγηταὶ sumerentur promiscue tam ex catechumenorum quam ex fidelium numero, teste Socrate, lib. v *Hist. eccl.*, cap. 22. Psalmistae isti ecclesiae Resurrectionis addicti et afflixī, *semper*, hoc est tam nocte quam die, certis horarum canonicarum intervallis canebant. Nondum in Ecclesia Hierosolymitana usus institutus erat, ut alii praeter psalmistas canerent. His enim quasi proprium jus et dignitatem attribuit quod ad cantandum essent deputati. [...]" PG XXXIII, 803D.

On the psalmists, some light is cast by the Pilgrimage of Egeria, more or less contemporary with the episcopate of Cyril.<sup>454</sup> The author, visiting Jerusalem, describes the daily liturgy, which begins with the nocturnal office attended by both monastics and laity, each group consisting of males and females, by which "hymns are sung and psalms responded to, as also are antiphons: and with every hymn there is a prayer. Two or three presbyters at a time, and also deacons, alternate daily with monks at the prayers for each of the hymns or antiphons."<sup>455</sup>

The singing of hymns, psalms, and antiphons belongs to the liturgy of the hours as well as to the Sunday morning service. The vigil between Saturday and Sunday began with three responsorial psalms, each of them succeeded by a prayer. The first psalm was read by one of the presbyters, the second by a deacon, and the third simply by "some cleric". After the psalms, there followed the reading of the gospel by the bishop, and a procession to the cross, accompanied with hymn singing. After yet one more psalm and prayer, the bishop completed the vigil by blessing the people.<sup>456</sup>

---

454 Egeria (aka. Silvia and Aetheria) was a nun or a devout ascetic from Hispania who travelled in eastern Christendom, probably in the years 381-384. ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 534.

455 *Itinerarium Egeriae* 24. "1. [...] Et ex ea hora usque in luce dicuntur ymni et psalmi respondentur, similiter et antiphonae : et cata singulos ymnos fit oratio. Nam presbyteri bini uel terni, similiter et diacones, singulis diebus uices habent simul cum monazontes, qui cata singulos ymnos uel antiphonas orationes dicunt." SC 296, 234-236.

456 *Itinerarium Egeriae* 24. "9. [...] et quemadmodum ingressus fuerit populus, dicet psalmum quicumque de presbyteris et respondent omnes ; post hoc fit oratio. Item dicit psalmum quicumque de diaconibus, similiter fit oratio, dicitur et tertius psalmus a quocumque clerico, fit et tertio oratio et commemoratio omnium. [...]" SC 296 , 242-244. Cf. Page 2010, 156.

### 3.2.6 John Chrysostom on singing

In the parochial churches, the state of the ecclesiastical singing did not always reach the required standard. One witness to the situation is John Chrysostom, who was ordained first deacon and later presbyter in the church of Antioch.<sup>457</sup> At the time, the city was a prominent centre of the theatrical arts; in one of his homilies, John pays attention to some attenders

who with no respect for God treat the sayings of the Spirit as nothing special, and give vent to disorderly voices and conduct themselves no better than lunatics, cavorting and shaking their whole bodies, giving evidence of behaviour inconsistent with a spiritual condition. Poor wretch that you are, you should utter the angelic praises to the Creator with dread, [...] instead, in this place you introduce the manners of actors and dancers [...].<sup>458</sup>

In another homily, Chrysostom recalls the earlier practice of singing together in the house churches. Now, however, the churches have become "worse than houses", lacking the appropriate discipline. The prevailing general tumult and chatting leads him to ask:

But canst thou not be silent? Well then, go out, not to become a mischief to others also. For in truth there ought to be but one voice in the church always, even as there is but one body. Therefore both he that reads utters his voice alone, and the Bishop himself is content to sit in silence; and he who chants chants alone; and though all utter the response, the voice

---

457 John Chrysostom was ordained priest at Antioch by Bishop Flavian who had been one of the early promoters of the psalmody. During the last years of his life from 398 to 404, John was the patriarch of Constantinople. ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 342-343; Wellesz 1961, 81-83. The homilies of John Chrysostom include numerous details on singing, of which only a few are treated here. These clearly refer to practices in the divine service. For other occasions, see e.g. *Homilia in psalmum XLI*, 1-2, where Chrysostom treats the significance of psalm singing in everyday life and entertainments. PG 55, 155-158.

458 Homily One on Isaiah 6, St. John Chrysostom, 49.

is wafted as from one mouth. And he that pronounces a homily pronounces it alone.<sup>459</sup>

Here, neither the reader nor the singer are called by any title but a participle form indicating their function, as the emphasis of Chrysostom is on restoring order, including the precision of the response.

During the episcopate of Chrysostom in Constantinople, the Arians remained vigorous. They were forbidden to assemble in the city churches, and so they convened outdoors. In the mornings of festivals, and on the first and the last day of the week, they would walk in a procession through the city, singing and thus tempting new adherents. To prevent the orthodox from joining the heretics, Chrysostom entered into competition with the Arians by organizing counter processions, which responded to the singing of the heretics with orthodox hymns. According to the ecclesiastical historian Socrates, the Arians practised antiphonal singing, which the orthodox then adopted, and have kept ever since.<sup>460</sup>

The character of the melodies sung in the Arian processions is not known to us, but evidently, they were beguiling: it has been stated that orthodox hymnography was an outcome of the struggle against the heresies of the time. When compared with their songs, psalm singing with its simple responses probably appeared too plain, and hymns were added to the liturgy.<sup>461</sup>

---

459 In Epist. I ad Cor. Homil. XXXVI. "[...] Καὶ γὰρ μίαν ἐν ἐκκλησίᾳ δεῖ φωνὴν εἶναι ἀεὶ, καθάπερ ἑνὸς ὄντος σώματος. Διὰ τοῦτο καὶ ὁ ἀναγινώσκων μόνος φθεγγεται· καὶ αὐτὸς ὁ τὴν ἐπισκοπὴν ἔχων ἀνέχεται σιγῇ καθήμενος· καὶ ὁ ψάλλον ψάλλει μόνος· καὶ πάντες ὑπηχώσιν, ὡς ἐξ ἑνὸς στόματος ἡ φωνὴ φέρεται· καὶ ὁ ὁμιλῶν ὁμιλεῖ μόνος." PG LXI, 315; transl. from NPNF1-12, 221. See also Quasten 1941, 152.

460 The information given by Socrates Scholasticus (d. 450) appears also in the Ecclesiastical History of Sozomen (5<sup>th</sup> cent., drew on the work of Socrates). Eventually, the rivalry between the processions led to violence, in the course of which the leader of the orthodox singers, the empress's eunuch, was wounded. Due to the incident, the emperor put an end to the public assemblies of the Arians. Socrates HE VI, 8, Sozomen HE VIII, VIII, NPNF 2-2, 144, 404. ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 1513, 1525. Cf. Seppälä 2012, 43.

461 Seppälä 2012, 43.

We recall that Arius had made use of popular tunes in spreading his doctrine. The first to do this was, according to our sources, the Syrian Bardesanes, utilizing the compositions of his son, Harmonios.<sup>462</sup> Now, these melodies became provided with orthodox texts by the deacon Ephraem Syrus, whose preserved works include hundreds of hymns, along with homilies mostly written in verse. Ephraem is also reported to have assembled choirs of female ascetes and to have rehearsed them for singing in the church.<sup>463</sup> In the preceding century, Paul of Samosata had been condemned for allowing a choir of women to sing in his church; it seems that since that time, the atmosphere had changed.<sup>464</sup>

Ephraem also acted against the Apollinarian heresy, thus called after its originator, the bishop of Syrian Laodicea, who was condemned at several synods between 360 and 390. Among the charges against him, a Roman synod listed the modification of biblical songs, and the composition of new psalms. None of those have been preserved, evidently because Ephraem managed to get hold of the books of Apollinarius, and glued their pages together. The matter was exposed in the court, driving Apollinarius to despair and shame.<sup>465</sup>

---

462 See p. 84 above.

463 Theodoret HE IV, 26, NPNF2-3, 129; Sozomen HE III, XVI, NPNF 2-2, 295-297. In his writings, Ephraem Syrus (ca. 306-373) wrote against several heresies, e.g. the doctrine of Mani (see fn. 533 below). From the original Syriac, his works were soon translated into Greek and other languages. Nau 1939, 189-190; Corbin 1960, 137-140; Wellesz 1961, 40-41, 149; NPNF 2-13, 130; McVey 1989, 3, 28; Velimirović 1990, 4-5; Altaner-Stuiber 1993, 343; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 551.

464 Cf. Quasten 1941, 153-154, 158.

465 Concilium Romanum III. In quo Apollinaristarum hæresis damnata. "[...] Eundem ex antiquis ecclesiasticis canticis ex divina scriptura acceptis, novos in ecclesiam a se editos psalmos, & diversa genera canticorum introduxisse, atque multiplicitate librorum sibi gloriam comparare studuisse, testatur Gregorius Nazianzenus prædicta epist. 1. ad Cleodon. his verbis. *Quod si prolixo libri, & nova psalteria, Davidique ex adverso resonantia, & versuum lepos, pro tertio quodam testamento habentur; nos quoque psalmos elaboravimus & multa conscribemus ac modulabimur.* Hos libros teste Gregorio Nysseno serm. de S. Ephrem, apud fœminam quamdam depositos, S. Ephrem per simulationem hæreseos acceptos, ut ex iis se contra adversarios instrueret, glutine compactos reddidit : quos cum Apollinaris a fœmina postulatos, in iudicio publico & controversia quadam legi mandasset, *cernens*, inquit Greg. Nyss. *ita firmiter connexos, ut prorsus explicari nequirent, tanto rubore atque pudore suffusus est, animoque usque adeo perturbatus, ut ex eo consessu abiens, quasi*

### 3.3 The arrangement of singing in western Christendom

#### 3.3.1 An apocryphal introduction

The *Liber Pontificalis* attributes the establishment of the ecclesiastical singing to Pope Damasus I.<sup>466</sup> In the church of Rome, Latin became the standard language probably in the first half of the third century, and Latin translations of the books of the Bible had begun to emerge already in the previous century.<sup>467</sup> However, the existing translations – now called the Old Latin versions – did not form a coherent body. For this reason, Damasus requested a new translation of the whole Bible from his secretary Jerome.<sup>468</sup> The preserved correspondence of Damasus and Jerome includes some apocryphal letters on the translation of the book of Psalms. The letters also treat of the state of the singing in the Roman Church.<sup>469</sup>

In his letter, Damasus asks not only for a translation of the Psalter but also for directions on the Greek manner of psalmody which he knows Jerome to have mastery of. Damasus explains that his church is "so attached to simplicity that only on Sunday, one passage of the Apostles is recited, and one chapter of the Gospel said, and the custom of the psalmody is not kept, and our ears do not

---

*mentis atque consilii inops & exanimatus, in morbum lapsus sit; illamque ignominie notam ita ægre & moleste tulit, ut parum admodum abfuerit, quin tum mortem obiret.*

Mansi III, 481-482. The italicized sections are from Epistola CI ad Cledonium contra Apollinarium ep. I, PG XXXVII, 175, 194, and De vita S. Patris Ephraem Syri, PG XLVI, 842. The year of the synod is obscure. Cf. Hefele 1873, 740; NPNF 2-13, 131.

The doctrine of Apollinarius the Younger (ca. 310-ca. 390) concerned the nature of Christ, emphasizing his divinity and leaving his humanity incomplete. Apollinarius was twice separated from the Church, and condemned at four synods altogether. Altaner-Stuiber 1993, 313-314; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 86.

466 Damasus (ca. 304-384) was the bishop of Rome in 366-384. ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edition), 448-449.

467 Kelly 1986, 15; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edition), 955.

468 Jerome (ca. 345-420), one of the Latin Church Fathers, acted as Damasus' secretary during the last years of his pontificate. ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edition), 867, 1483, 1710-1711.

469 Cf. Mansi III, 428-429; PL 30, 303C-305A.

know the grace of the hymn."<sup>470</sup> Jerome, in his answer, wishes that the psalms would sound in Rome "day and night", and also prescribes use of the doxology *Gloria Patri* at the end of each psalm at matins and vespers, the Hallelujah being added at nocturns.<sup>471</sup> Eventually, the *Liber Pontificalis* states that Damasus "ordered that in all churches the psalms would be sung day and night, and he instructed this to presbyters, bishops, and monasteries."<sup>472</sup>

According to these writings, there would have been no ecclesiastical singing worth mentioning at Rome before the pontificate of Damasus.<sup>473</sup> One may also argue over whether the word 'only' in his letter refers to Sunday in the sense that on other days there were no readings at all. Or, was he emphasizing that on Sunday, the most important of the days of the week, only one passage of both the New Testament reading genres were recited. Anyhow, whether the advice of Jerome had anything to do with the matter or not, psalmody had been practised in the church of Rome at least since the reign of Damasus.

---

470 Epistola III. Damasi Papæ ad Hieronymum presbyterum. "[...] Peto etiam tua caritatem, ut sicut a rectore tuo Alexandro episcopo nostro didicisti, Græcorum psallentiam ad nos dirigere tua fraternitas delectetur : qui tantæ apud nos simplicitatis indago est, ut tantum in die dominica apostoli una recitetur, & evangelii capitulum unum dicatur, & nec psallentium mos tenetur, nec hymni decus in ore nostro cognoscitur. [...]" Mansi III, 428-429.

471 Epistola XLVII Hieronymi ad Damasum. "Legi litteras Apostolatus tui, poscentes, ut secundum simplicitatem Septuaginta interpretum canens, Psalmographum interpretari festinem propter fastidium Romanorum: ut ubi obscuritas impedit, apertius, et Latine trahatur sensus. Precatur ergo cliens tuus, ut vox ista psallentium in sede Romana die noctuque canatur; et ut in fine cujuslibet psalmi, sive matutinis horis, sive vespertinis conjungi præcipiat Apostolatus tui ordo: *Gloria Patri, et Filio, et Spiritui sancto : Sicut erat in principio, et nunc, et semper, et in sæcula sæculorum. Amen.*" PL XXX, 304.

472 Vita Damasi Papae I. "[...] Hic constituit, ut psalmi die noctuque canerentur per omnes ecclesias, qui hoc præcepit presbyteris, episcopis, ac monasteriis. [...]" Mansi III, 420.

473 Cf. Kaufmann 1917, 272<sup>3</sup>, who attributes the foundation of the first Roman *schola cantorum* to Silvester I, and the introduction of the antiphonal singing at Rome to Damasus.

### 3.3.2 Singer epigrams

Information about the Roman psalm singers appears in their epitaphs, which were written in verse, known as epigrams.<sup>474</sup> One of the singers was the deacon Redemptus, whose death had evidently been unexpected:

Hold the tears, grief; are you, holy people, looking for Redemptus  
the Levite? Suddenly took him the kingdom of heaven to itself.  
His voice, flowing like the sweetest nectar and honey  
celebrated the ancient prophet with gentle melodies.<sup>475</sup>

The 'ancient prophet' refers to David; the use of the title Levite for a deacon belongs to the tradition of analogies between the Old Testamental temple hierarchy and the church of the New Covenant. A deacon with a good voice thus corresponded a Levitical singer.<sup>476</sup> The title could also be granted to a reader, as in the case of Florentius whose name means 'most flourishing'.

Whoever you are, seeing the grave and asking about the life of the  
buried,  
I died after a life of thrice ten years, and twice four,  
returning the redeemed gift of my body to Christ:  
at his sacred worship I served, in the order of the reader,  
receiving the standing of Levite with the skills of my *Florentius* voice.<sup>477</sup>

---

474 Damasus himself wrote a lot of epigrams, the corpus of which, *Epigrammata Damasiana*, consists of fifty-nine pieces. However, not all of them are genuine, which is also the case with the epigrams treated in this section. Ferrua 1942, 46. See also Shepherd 1970, 849.

475 Elogium Redempti (lines 1-4): "Stringe dolor lacrimas ; quaeris plebs sancta Redemptum / levitam? Subito rapuit sibi regia caeli. / dulcia nectario promebat mella canendo, / prophetam celebrans placido modulamine senem." Ferrua 1942, 31-32, 234. For readability, the use of the different fonts by Ferrua has been omitted here. The epigram on Redemptus is not datable.

476 Ferrua 1942, 235. For the characteristics of the language used in the epigrams, see Page 2010, 165-166, 170-171.

477 Elogium Florentii Levitae (lines 1-5): "Quisque vides tumulum, vitam si quaeris operti, / ter morior denos et post bis quattuor annos, / servatum Christo reddens de corpore munus: / cuius ego in sacris famulus vel in ordine lector, / officio levita fui Florentius ore." Ferrua 1942, 243. Florentius is estimated to have died at the earliest in 384.

Primarily, deacons were occupied with the ecclesiastical administration. They assisted the bishop and were in charge of charity, thereby acquiring experience, which was a good recommendation for appointment to the higher orders. Being a skilled singer meant extra credit, as the epitaph of bishop Leo testifies:

the duty of mine was to clothe the naked suppliants  
to deal out to paupers the harvest the year had grown  
to the people I wanted to sing the songs of the prophet  
thus meriting to shepherd Christ's people as bishop<sup>478</sup>

A further detail concerning the skills required of the singer is implied in the epitaph of the archdeacon Sabinus, which may be translated as: "[...] but I, the singer of psalms with voice and with skill, sang the sacred words with divers tunes".<sup>479</sup> 'Divers tunes' probably refers to different modes.

The archdeacon was the chief of the deacons in bigger congregations, or the right-hand man of the bishop (*diaconus episcopi*).<sup>480</sup> Archdeacon Deusdedit is mentioned in the former role, remembered as "first in the order of Levites a singer (*cantor*) of Davidic songs".<sup>481</sup> The use of the noun *cantor* here has been interpreted as the adoption of the title into the ecclesiastical vocabulary.<sup>482</sup> On this matter, we shall cite from the genuine correspondence of Jerome, who writes to a widow:

---

478 Elogium Leonis Episcopi (lines 6-9): "haec mihi cura fuit nudos vestire petentes / fundere pauperib' quidquid concesserat annus / psallere et in populis volui modulante profeta / sic merui plebem Christi retinere sacerdos [...]" Ferrua 1942, 240, 211, who remarks that the word *sacerdos*, basically meaning 'priest', shall here be taken as 'bishop'.

479 Sepulcrum Sabini archidiaconi (lines 9-10): "[ast eg]o, qui uoce psalmos modulatus et arte / [diue]rsis cecini uerba sacrata sonis". ICLV I, 1194, 231-232. In the translation, an unsolved question is whether the last word should not rather be 'tone' than 'tune'. There is no date for the epigram.

480 Kaufmann 1917, 263; Klauser 1957, 900; Meimaris 1986, 178-180.

481 Deusdedit leuitarum primus (lines 1-2): "+ hic leuitarum primus in ordine uiuens / Dautici cantor carminis iste fuit." ICLV I, 1195, 232. The date of the epigram can not be exactly defined; the text, although damaged, includes the words 'between wars'. It may mean the time after 410, the invasion of the Goths. ILCV I, 232; Kaufmann 1917, 273.

482 Gurlitt 1950, 553-554.

Avoid the company of young men who, with their curly hair, head-dresses and adornments shall not be seen under your roof. A male singer (*cantor*) shall be expelled like poison; like the deadly songs of the Sirens, repulse from your houses the female lute and cithara players and the diabolic choir of the kind.<sup>483</sup>

Here, the *cantor* is clearly a profane singer, as he is mentioned among other objectionable musicians.<sup>484</sup> In another letter, Jerome alludes to an ecclesiastical singer, calling him *psaltēs*, in the Greek manner. Both letters happen to have the same subject matter: the delicacy of visiting lone females, and disapproval of outward beautifying by artificial means. The other letter is directed to a presbyter, who is advised not to make such a visit on his own and, in addition, to choose his companions carefully: "If a reader, or an acolyte, or a singer (*psaltēs*) attends you, they shall not be adorned with clothes but with behaviour, nor shall they curl their hair with irons, but their appearance shall denote modesty."<sup>485</sup> Further, Jerome defines the difference between profane and ecclesiastical singing in his Commentary of the Ephesians, writing:

---

483 Sancti Hieronymi Epistula LIV, 13: "Iuuenum fuge consortia. comatulos, comptos atque lasciuos domus tuae tecta non uideant. cantor pellatur ut noxius; fidicinas et psaltrias et istius modi chorum diaboli quasi mortifera sirenarum carmina proturba ex aedibus tuis. [...]" CSEL LIV, 479. In like manner, Jerome admonishes the widow Salvina for being met by "a curled procurator, or a singer (*cantor*) of the devil with his poisonous charm, or a beardless and good-looking youth." She was not be inclined to any theatrical arts but keep with her own sex, with choirs of widows and virgins. Epistola LXXIX ad Salvinam 9, PL XXII, 730.

484 Cf. p. 33 above. See also P-W Neue Bearbeitung III:2, 1899; TLL III, 291.

485 Sancti Hieronymi Epistula LII, 5: "[...] si propter officium clericatus aut uidua tibi uisitatur aut uirgo, numquam domum solus introeas talesque habeto socios, quorum contubernio non infameris. si lector, si acolythus, si psaltes te sequitur, non ornentur uestibus, sed moribus, nec calamistro crispent comas, sed pudicitiam habitu polliceantur. [...]" CSEL LIV, 423-424. The letter was written in 394. Visits to female parishioners did not always concern matters spiritual; twenty-four years before the present letter, an imperial decree ordered that any gifts received by clerics would be confiscated and placed in the public treasury or given to the emperor. However, if the clerics happened to be some kind of *chargés d'affaires* for the wealth of a lady who wished to bequeath him on her death, they were permitted to keep the bequest. CT XVI, 2, 20. Pharr 1952, 443-444.

We shall thus sing and praise the Lord rather in spirit than in voice. For it is said: *Praising and singing with your heart to the Lord*. The youths shall learn this: those who are appointed to sing in the church shall learn to sing to the Lord not in the voice but in the heart: not in the guttural manner of the tragic actors; but gently to remedy the sounding of theatrical melodies and songs in the church, but in fear and in deed, in the knowledge of the Scriptures. If someone would otherwise be called discordant but he possesses good deeds, before God he is a sweet singer. Thus shall sing the servant of Christ, not pleasing with his voice but with the words which are said : alike the evil spirit was expelled from Saul (I Kings XVI), so shall it be expelled from them who are possessed by it, so that it shall not be introduced in those who make the house of God a stage of people.<sup>486</sup>

The mention of the youths has been interpreted to signify "that young men other than those adults who exercise the office of singer may be heard singing in church. There is the suggestion of levels of importance; possibly the *adolescentuli* augmented the services of those adults officially constituted to

---

486 S. Eusebii Hieronymi Commentariorum in epistolam ad Ephesios Lib. III. Cap. V. Vers. 19. "[...] Et canere igitur et psallere, et laudare Dominum magis animo quam voce decemus. Hoc est quippe quod dicitur : *Cantantes et psallentes in cordibus vestris Domino*. Audiant hæc adolescentuli : audiant hi quibus psallendi in ecclesia officium est, Deo non voce, sed corde cantandum : nec in tragædorum modum guttur et fauce ; dulci medicamine colliniendas, ut in ecclesia theatrales moduli audiantur et cantica, sed in timore, in opere, in scientia Scripturarum. Quamvis sit aliquis ut solent illi appellare *κακόφωνος* , si bona opera habuerit, dulcis apud Deum cantor est. Sic cantet servus Christi, ut non vox canentis, sed verba placeant quæ leguntur : ut spiritus malus qui erat in Saule (I Reg. XVI), ejiciatur ab his qui similiter ab eo possideator, et non introducatur in eos qui de Dei domo scenam fecere populorum." PL XXVI, 528C-529A. 'Making the house of God a stage of people' was a matter vehemently opposed by Jerome. In one of his letters to Damasus, Jerome criticizes priests who, omitting the reading of the Scriptures, prefer to read comedies and to sing the amorous Bucolics of Virgil. S. Eusebii Hieronymi Epistola XXI, 13: "At nunc etiam Sacerdotes Dei, omissis Evangeliiis et Prophetis , videmus Comœdias legere , amatoria Bucolicorum versuum verba canere, tenere Virgilium :[...]" PL XXII, 386. On the other hand, Jerome praises the Roman people for their eager partaking in the liturgy and compares their *Amens* with the thunder from heaven. S. Eusebii Hieronymi Commentar. in Epist. ad Galat. lib. II, cap. III.: "Romanæ plebis laudatur fides (*Rom. I, 8*). Ubi alibi tanto studio et frequentia, ad ecclesias et ad martyrum sepulcra concurritur? ubi sic ad similitudinem cœlestis tonitru *Amen* reboat, et vacua idolorum templa quatiuntur?" PL XXVI, 381A.

sing."<sup>487</sup> The writings of Jerome clearly testify to the singers in the Roman church, although not stating what they sang; in the epigrams, the deacons are mentioned to have sung the psalms of David.<sup>488</sup>

### 3.3.3 The ecclesiastical hierarchy of the Roman Church

The ranks of the Roman clergy were established by the middle of the third century when Cornelius, in his letter to the bishop of Antioch, listed the orders which were below the bishop: presbyter, deacon, subdeacon, acolyte, exorcist, reader, and doorkeeper.<sup>489</sup> Later on, the appropriate sequence of proceeding through the grades became an important issue. Its general principle is attributed to Pope Gaius (283-296) who, according to the *Liber Pontificalis*, "constituted that all orders in the Church would advance as follows: to merit the standing of a bishop one has to serve first as doorkeeper, reader, exorcist, acolyte, subdeacon, deacon, and presbyter, after which he can be ordained bishop."<sup>490</sup>

The process became further enriched with details in three documents which bear the name of Pope Silvester I (314-335).<sup>491</sup> According to the *Liber Pontificalis*, Silvester laid down the terms for service in each grade: an aspiring cleric was to begin in the rank of reader, and to occupy the office for thirty years. These would be followed with the same number of days as an exorcist. The succeeding ranks of acolyte, subdeacon, and *custos martyrum*, i.e. a guard of the

487 Sparksman 1980, 253-254.

488 Page 2010, 99, points out that in the Vulgata, Jerome uses the word *cantor* for the Levite musicians of the Temple, "which suggests he regarded it as an established term of office for Christian ritual singers."

489 Cf. pp. 78-80 above.

490 Vita Gaii: "Hic [Gaius] constituit ut ordines omnes in ecclesia sic ascenderetur, si quis episcopus esse mereretur, ut esset ostiarius, lector, exorcista, sequens, subdiaconus, diaconus, presbiter, et exinde episcopus ordinaretur." LPI, 73.

491 The documents related to Silvester I are best considered apocryphal; although his pontificate was long, for posterity it left very little solid information. See Kelly 1986, 27-28; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 1566.

graves of the martyrs, required a quinquennium each. The last terms and orders before the episcopate were seven years in the diaconate, and three years in the presbyterate.<sup>492</sup> The total sum of service was thus fifty-five years and one month; the first thirty years as a reader indicate that service in the church would have begun early in childhood.<sup>493</sup>

A slightly modified list is given in the *acta* of the council of 275 bishops, who, it is claimed, assembled at Rome in 326.<sup>494</sup> There, Silvester states:

If someone desires to enter the clergy, it is righteous that he serves one year as a doorkeeper, twenty years as a reader, ten years as an exorcist, five years as an acolyte, five years as a subdeacon, and five years as a deacon. If he attains the worth of a presbyter and officiates in this order six years, meeting with approval by all, not in the pursuit of his own interest or greediness, and not snatching the grade from anyone else, he shall be consecrated bishop by the whole church, if no one of the parishioners opposes, and the whole congregation agrees. And the bishops said: It is decided.<sup>495</sup>

Here, one might think that the age of commencement must have been beyond childhood for the incumbent to be able to do the work of a doorkeeper. But, as the length of service preceeding the episcopate exceeds half a century, doorkeeping may have been more or less symbolic for children or adolescents.

---

492 Vita Sylvestri I. "Hic [Silvester] constituit, ut si quis desideraret in ecclesia militare aut proficere, ut esset lector annos XXX, exorcista dies XXX, acolitus annos V, subdiaconus annos V, custos martyrum annos V, diaconus annos VII, presbiter annos III, [...]." LP I, 77.

493 Faivre 1977, 345. Cf. Hefele 1873, 440.

494 Mansi II, 1081; Hefele 1873, 438. The acts of the council of 275 bishops belong to the collection of the so-called 'Symmachian Forgeries', which were written during the episcopate of Pope Symmachus (498-514). Kelly 1986, 9; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 1567.

495 Concilium Romanum III. "*De præficiendis in ordinibus & proficiendis*. (Silvester episcopus dixit:) Si quis clericatum promereri desiderat, hoc justum est, ut sit ostiarius annum 1. lector annos 20. exorcista annos 10. acolythus ann. 5. subdiaconus an. 5. diaconus an. 5. Et si ad honorem presbyterii accedat, & faciens in eo ordines annos 6. si fuerit omnium votiva gratia, non præmio, non invasione cupiditatis, nulli prorumpens gradum, sic ab omni ecclesia eligatur consecrandus episcopus, nullo de membris ecclesia intercedente, & omni ecclesia conveniente. Et dixerunt episcopi : Placet." Mansi II, 1083.

A third version belongs to the *Constitutio Silvestri*, a document attributed not only to Silvester but also to Emperor Constantine. There, the thirty years as a reader are followed with a single day as an exorcist, a decennium as an acolyte, and five years as a subdeacon, before the higher orders.<sup>496</sup>

The principle introduced by the documents becomes clear but the variation concerning the period of service in some of the ranks seems rather random, if not absurd. The required terms for an exorcist are thirty days, ten years, or just one day; the term for an acolyte is, according to two of the documents, five years, but in the third, ten years. As all of the documents are supposed to derive from the same pontificate of twenty-one years, it is conceivable that changes in the number of aspiring clerics or the needs of the parishioners may have caused the differences. Another explanation lies, however, in the system itself. A single day as an exorcist can not be considered a real period of service but a necessary moment in the career of an advancing cleric.<sup>497</sup> As to the system, Alexandre Faivre has remarked that the duties connected with a grade seem not to have been as important as the grade itself: the grade made its occupant 'a holy person', the extent of whose holiness increased at each promotion. Structurally, the principle of advance by gradation in the ecclesiastical hierarchy – the *cursus clericus* – corresponds to the system of the Roman civil *cursus honorum*.<sup>498</sup>

The meticulous regulations attributed to Silvester I, and the criticisms concerning their aim should not lead us astray. A regulation concerning the

---

496 PL VIII, 837B.

497 That the rank of exorcist is the object of the major changes and can be reduced into a single day, may relate to the view that it was considered purely mechanical. An experienced reader would have had no problems reading exorcism formulae. Cf. p. 80 above.

498 Jones 1964, 913; Faivre 1977, 352, 418. The concept of the *cursus honorum* means literally the course of civil offices. The course began usually either with ten years of military service or, with shorter military service and some lower civil office. Promotion from one office to another was linked with age; at the time studied here, one could become a quaestor at the age of 25 years, and a praetor at 30. The consulate, which earlier was achieved at age 43, could be received at 33 years of age. The offices of edile and tribune also preceded the consulate, which always was for a fixed term. LAK I, 515. Cf. AKK 2000, 113, 630; Lendering 2002.

periods of service in the ecclesiastical orders was actually promulgated by Pope Siricius in 385. His letter to Himerius, the bishop of Tarragona, is considered the earliest preserved papal decretal.<sup>499</sup> There, Siricius defines two ways of progressing in the clergy.

First, one who had been dedicated to the Church as a child, i.e. by his parents, was to be baptized before puberty, and included among the readers. From his maturity to the age of thirty years, he was to serve as acolyte and subdeacon. During these years, he could also enter upon matrimony. Thirty years was the minimum age for ordination into the diaconate, where service was to last for five years. The last stage before the order of the bishop was a decennium in the presbyterate.

Second, Siricius takes into account those who aspired to the clergy at a mature age. Immediately after their baptism, they were to serve as a reader or an exorcist for two years, succeeded by a quinquennium as an acolyte or a subdeacon. As to the higher orders, the process was the same as in the life-long career.<sup>500</sup>

---

499 Kelly 1986, 35; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn), 1506. The essential parts of the letter are included in the CIC. In the East, the decretal of Siricius is considered to have been the foundation of 'the new theory of the papacy' which manifested itself in the Council of Chalcedon 451, and, for its part, promoted the developing division of Christendom. OKK 1980, 294ff.

500 Dist. LXXVII. C. 3. "Quicumque itaque se ecclesiae uouit obsequiis a sua infantia, ante pubertatis annos baptizari et lectorum debet ministerio sociari; qui ab accessu adolescentiae usque ad trigesimum etatis annum si probabiliter uixerit, una tantum, & ea, quam uirginem communi per sacerdotem benedictione percepit, uxore contentus, acolytus et subdiaconus esse debet, postquam ad diaconii gradum (si se ipsum primitus, continentia preeunte, dignum probauerit) accedat. Ubi si ultra quinque annos laudabiliter ministrauerit, congrue presbiteratum consequatur. Exinde post decennium episcopalem cathedram poterit adipisci, si tamen per hec tempora integritas suae uitae ac fidei eius fuerit approbata. Qui uero iam etate grandaeuus, melioris propositi conuersatione prouocatus, ex laico ad sacram miliciam peruenire festinat, desiderii sui fructum non aliter obtinebit, nisi eo quo baptizatur tempore statim lectorum aut exorcistarum numero societetur, si tamen eum unam habuisse uel habere et hanc uirginem accepisse constet uxorem. Qui, dum initiatus fuerit, expleto biennio, per quinquennium aliud acolytus et subdiaconus fiat, et sic ad diaconatum, si per hec tempora dignus iudicatus fuerit, prouehatur. Exinde iam accessu temporum presbiterio uel episcopatu, si eum plebis ac cleri euocauerit electio, non inmerito

Siricius himself had begun as a reader and, according to his epitaph, he was soon ordained deacon, serving the Popes Liberius (352-366) and Damasus. After the presbyterate, he held the episcopate for fifteen years.<sup>501</sup> His career thus followed the pattern of the *cursus clericus*.

With the decretal of Siricius, the development of the hierarchy at Rome is completed. The number of the degrees included in the ascending hierarchy is seven: reader, acolyte, exorcist, subdeacon, deacon, presbyter, and bishop. The rank of doorkeeper remains outside the proper hierarchy.<sup>502</sup> None of the documents examined in this section have alluded to the office of singing, which, evidently, had no hierarchical significance.

### **3.3.4 A suggestion on the reason for the absence of the singer**

Thus, no canonical singers appear among the ecclesiastical grades of the Roman Church, as the members of other ranks are mentioned as answering for the psalmody. There is, however, one specific explanation for the absence of the singer, based on the provenance of the ecclesiastical orders. In several ancient treatises, the orders are connected with the events of the human life of Jesus of Nazareth.<sup>503</sup> According to the tradition, each order derives from some deed by him, narrated in the Gospels. For instance, when establishing the Eucharist, Jesus officiated as a bishop, and when washing the feet of the disciples, he

---

societur." CIC I, 272-273. The years required in each order were modified by Pope Zosimus (d. 418) who required the reader to serve for five years, subdeacon for four, and deacon for five years. Jones 1964, 913.

501 ILCV I, 181.

502 Andrieu 1925, 253. Cf. Crehan 1958, 83-84.

503 One of the treatises is attributed to Jerome, although without a precise date of origin. See Sparksman 1980, 148<sup>103</sup>.

served as a deacon. With his instruction at the Temple of Jerusalem and at the synagogues, he established the order of the reader.<sup>504</sup>

The treatises have been examined by Joseph Crehan who, in his article, also recalls the 15<sup>th</sup> canon of the Synod of Laodicea which, in his words, "took the singing away from the people". Crehan supposes that the appointment of professional singers would have been necessary for maintaining discipline at divine services which, at the time, were attended by lots of new and unversed converts. Thus in the East; but

when the Church came face to face with Western barbarians, it would similarly be necessary to have professional singers at first, though their work may often have been assigned to readers. The temporary character of the office is shown by the fact that in all the lists of the seven (or eight) orders of Christ it is never said that He sanctified the office of cantor by sharing it.<sup>505</sup>

The comment regarding the lists of the orders is correct, but in fact, Jesus 'shared the office of cantor' according to the Gospels of Matthew and Mark, which mention how he sang a hymn with his disciples after the Passover meal.<sup>506</sup> For some reason or another, this has not been reckoned as sharing an office. The

---

504 S. Hieronymi Epistola XII. De VII ordinibus ecclesiae III. "*De tertio gradu Ecclesiae, qui Lectorum ordo est.* – Tertius lectorum ordo est, qui Deo, Christo et prophetis datur, secundum quod scriptum est : *Exalta vocem tuam, et dic : Omnis caro fenum, et omnis gloria hominis sicut flos feni : aruit fenum, et flos decidit, verbum autem Domini manet in aeternum (Isa. XL. 6, 7, 8).* Denique Dominus noster legens in templo, formam lectoris assumpsit. Hi sunt ergo lectores, qui cantant canticum Moysi et Agni ; *hi sunt qui sequuntur immaculatum Agnum quocumque ierit, qui cum mulieribus se non coinquinaverunt, virgines enim sunt (Apoc. XIV, 4).* Horum numerus est angelorum ; et nomen angeli convenienter sacerdoti adaptatur, qui usque adeo aequales tibi sunt per haec officia sanctitatis, sicut scriptum legis : *Sacerdos qui de ore suo profert justitiam, et exquirentibus annuntiat veritatem, angelus omnipotentis Dei est (Malach. II, 7).*" PL XXX, 156D-157A. Here, the readers are the singers of the new song, described in the Revelation; treating the grade of the Levites, i.e. deacons, the writer states how one of them is assigned to pray, another to sing: "*Illi orare, huic psallere mandatur.*" Ibid., 158B. The letter does not belong to the corpus of Jerome's genuine writings.

505 Crehan 1958, 84.

506 Matt 26:30; Mark 14:26. Cf. Sparksman 1980, 130.

logic seems inconsistent, compared with some other interpretations: for instance, the subdeaconate is once connected with the water-into-wine miracle at the wedding of Cana, and another time with the driving of the merchants out of the Temple.<sup>507</sup> Neither of these incidents became repetitive or permanent in ecclesiastical life, as singing did.

Recalling the singing of the hymn described in the apocryphal Acts of John, one is tempted to ponder if its inclusion in the Bible would have influenced the matter. There, Jesus truly officiates as a singer, being situated in the middle of the ring of disciples, who respond to him with Amen.<sup>508</sup> Perhaps, ecclesiastical singing would then have developed in other directions, and the order of the singer would belong to 'the orders of Christ'.

### **3.4 The spreading of the eastern manner of singing**

#### **3.4.1 Biographical details of Ambrose of Milan**

The model of a gradually advancing ecclesiastical career was created in order to hinder the recently converted, or persons with other than devout reasons, from entering the clergy. Although conventionally the term in each grade was calculated in years, the principle occasionally had to be modified. One such case was the promotion of Ambrose of Milan, who was proposed for the episcopate while still a catechumen.

In 374, the episcopal see of Milan had become vacant after the death of the Arian bishop Auxentius. The disputes between the Arians and the orthodox were still acute, and the consular governor Ambrose was considered to be the best

---

<sup>507</sup> Crehan 1958, 81, 85.

<sup>508</sup> Cf. p. 84 above.

person to exert a soothing influence on them. First, he sought to avoid ordination; possibly he had never intended to become a cleric. Eventually, the request of the people was granted, and the biography of Ambrose, written by his secretary Pauline, states: "After being baptized, it is said that he completed all the ecclesiastical offices, and on the eighth day he was ordained bishop with the general favour and pleasure of all."<sup>509</sup> The completion of the *cursus clericus* would thus have happened from the Sunday of his baptism to the Sunday of his ordination to the episcopacy.

The biography was written a quarter of a century after the death of Ambrose.<sup>510</sup> That probably explains why the words are chosen so carefully: "it is said that he completed [...]", indicating that Pauline had become Ambrose's secretary after his ordination. Nevertheless, the *cursus* of Ambrose became furnished with details in the twentieth century. The biography by F. H. Dudden states that whereas the baptism and the confirmation of Ambrose took place on Sunday, he was appointed doorkeeper on Monday, reader on Tuesday, and exorcist on Wednesday. The offices of acolyte and subdeacon were combined on Thursday, to include all eight grades in the number of the days available. On Friday, Ambrose was ordained deacon, and on Saturday presbyter; thus, he was prepared to be ordained bishop on Sunday. The account has been widely accepted, although it is not supported by any early documents.<sup>511</sup>

The original sentence written by Pauline probably aimed to show that the ordination of Ambrose did not violate the ecclesiastical custom of gradational advancement. However, the Latin word *officia*, translated above as 'offices', can, as is often the case, also be interpreted otherwise. Instead of meaning that Ambrose received the ordinations separately day after day, it might signify that

---

509 Vita S. Ambrosii IX. IX. "[...] Baptizatus itaque fertur omnia ecclesiastica officia implesse, atque octava die episcopus ordinatus est summa cum gratia et laetitia cunctorum. [...]" PL XIV, 32B.

510 Ambrose lived 339/340-397, and Pauline wrote the biography ca. 422, at the request of Augustine of Hippo. ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 49, 1243.

511 Fischer 1970, 527-528. F. H. Dudden published the biography in 1935.

he officiated as a doorkeeper, a reader etc., as far as it was possible during one week.<sup>512</sup>

The biography by Pauline also includes an important mention concerning ecclesiastical singing. Describing the disquiet caused by the Arians, Pauline remarks: "At this time, antiphons, hymns, and vigils were for the first time sung in the church of Milan." The text goes on to state that thenceforth, they were preserved not only in Milan, but also in other western provinces.<sup>513</sup> The establishment of a new manner of singing is confirmed by Augustine of Hippo, who had been present in the church of Ambrose. After describing how the congregation had convened in the church at night to seek refuge from their Arian persecutors, Augustine states,

At this time it was instituted that, after the manner of the Eastern Church, hymns and psalms should be sung, lest the people should pine away in the tediousness of sorrow; which custom, retained from then till now, is imitated by many, yea, by almost all of Thy congregations throughout the rest of the world.<sup>514</sup>

Inquiring into the origin of 'the manner of the Eastern Church', we shall recall the letter of Basil of Caesarea with the assurance that the custom of psalmody was observed everywhere in Christendom. Perhaps Basil himself had something

---

512 As an example, Fischer takes the verb *famulari*, to serve; it did not require an ordained deacon to be able to serve God. Fischer 1970, 529ff. Nevertheless, the idea that holiness can be acquired by occupying an order, criticized by Alexandre Faivre, is also evident here. Cf. p. 141 above.

513 Vita S. Ambrosii XIII. "[...] Hoc in tempore primum antiphonæ, hymni, ac vigiliæ in ecclesia Mediolanensi celebrari cœperunt. Cujus celebritatis devotio usque in hodiernum diem non solum in eadem ecclesia, verum per omnes pene Occidentis provincias manet." PL XIV, 33D-34A.

514 Aug. Confessiones IX, VII, 15. "[...] Tunc hymni et psalmi ut canerentur secundum morem orientalium partium, ne populus maeroris taedio contabesceret, institutum est: ex illo in hodiernum retentum multis iam ac paene omnibus gregibus tuis et cetera orbis imitantibus. [...]" Transl. from Augustine II, 30. It has also been suggested that "the manner of the Eastern Church" became popular because the people were bored with the responsorial psalmody. Leeb 1967, 92-93, commenting on the view of Ernesto Moneta-Caglio, whose later research tallies with Leeb's. See Foley 1996, 101, and also Cattin 1984, 31-32.

to do with it: he and Ambrose are known to have been in regular contact. Possibly their correspondence also touched upon the art of psalmody.<sup>515</sup>

In the same way as the ordination of Ambrose, the incident in the basilica of Milan has stimulated the imagination of scholars. It has been stated that Ambrose taught the people hymns of his own making, but, in a letter, Ambrose himself reports having "repeated Psalms with the brethren".<sup>516</sup>

Of the genres of antiphons, hymns, and vigils listed by Pauline, only the hymns have hitherto appeared regularly. The character of the antiphons, occurring here for the first time, is not defined, but they seem to have been independent pieces.<sup>517</sup> Here, we shall recall the details of the travel account of Egeria which seem to support the mention of antiphons, hymns, and vigils by Pauline. Further, the responsorial psalmody used at Jerusalem may represent 'the manner of the Eastern Church' alluded to by Augustine, which has repeatedly been argued to refer to the antiphonal psalmody. According to one view, the wording of Augustine on the character of the psalmody would be literally translated as 'in the manner of the eastern differentiation of roles', i.e. the alternation between singers or singer groups.<sup>518</sup>

The biography by Dudden describes the congregation as singing alternately in two choirs, thus rendering the 'carefully trained and practised soloists' redundant. This adds to the western tendency to ignore professional singers: Brian Joseph

---

515 NPNF 2-8, xxix. McLynn 1997, 75.

516 NPNF 2-10, 426. The hymns of Ambrose had become popular already before the death of Auxentius; thus, people would have been able to sing them at the nightly vigil described by Augustine. Ambrose is considered the father of the Latin hymnody, although he was not the first to write hymns in Latin. He was preceded by Hilary of Poitiers (ca.315-ca.367), who had sojourned in the East, and followed the structure of Syrian poetry in his texts. The structure of the Ambrosian hymns is strophic with no refrains, although the epithet Ambrosian has been used in connection with other types as well. Of the hymn texts considered Ambrosian, only four have definitely been proven to be genuine. As to the melodies used at the time of Ambrose, these can only be surmised. Leeb 1967, 25-29; Cattin 1984, 18-20; Corbin 1960, 141-145; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.) 769, 809-810.

517 Taitto 1989, 73-74; Nowacki 1994, 640; Huglo 2001, 736.

518 Wille 1967, 377.

Sparksman concludes that the congregation of Milan "had begun to sing with new vigor, a vigor that diminished the need for the control or support of the official singer." Although admitting that Dudden has no solid evidence for the double-choir psalmody, Sparksman nevertheless agrees with him.<sup>519</sup> It is as if the 'carefully trained and practised', or 'official', singers were something unwished-for.

### 3.4.2 The singer in the writings of Ambrose

In his own writings, Ambrose recommends psalm singing for everyone, irrespective of gender, age, or social standing. Psalmody creates inward harmony for the singers, and also reciprocal harmony between all who sing together in the church, responding with refrains or Amens.<sup>520</sup> According to Ambrose, when everyone is occupied with the psalm, there is less likelihood of anyone making a disturbing noise, such as during the readings: thus, singing together is the guarantee of good discipline.<sup>521</sup>

The titles of reader and singer appear rarely in the writings of Ambrose. Once, he says: "also today the Holy Spirit has spoken through the voice of the small

---

519 Sparksman 1980, 75.

520 Ambrosius, *Expositio Evang. Sec. Luc. Lib. VII*, 238. "[...] Hæc est enim symphonia , quando concinit in Ecclesia diversorum actuum atque virtutum, velut variarum chordarum indiscreta concordia , psalmus respondetur, amen dicitur. Hæc est symphonia quam scivit et Paulus ; et ideo ait : *Psallam spiritu , psallam et mente* (I *Cor. XIV*, 13). [...]" PL XV, 1763A.

521 Ambrosius, *Enarratio in psalmum I*, 9. "Mulieres Apostolus in Ecclesia tacere jubet. Psalmum etiam bene clamant : hic omni dulcis ætati, hic utrique aptus est sexui. Hunc senes rigore senectutis deposito canunt, hunc veterani tristes in cordis sui jucunditate respondent, hunc juvenes sine invidia cantant lasciviæ, hunc adolescentes sine lubricæ ætatis periculo et tentamento concinunt voluptatis, iuenculæ ipsæ sine dispendio matronalis psallunt pudoris, puellulæ sine prolapsione verecundiæ cum sobrietate gravitatis hymnum Deo, inflexæ vocis suavitate modulantur. Hunc tenere gestit pueritia, hunc meditari gaudet infantia, quæ declinat ediscere. Ludus quidam est iste doctrinæ majoris profectus, quam cum seria traditur disciplina." [...]" PL XIV, 968.

reader [...]"<sup>522</sup> The adjective may refer to a reader who was an adolescent. Ambrose alludes to the singers as a rank: "Whence [Christ], on the cross, giving up his spirit, said to the Father: Into your hands I commit my spirit. Not as some add: *Lord*, as the singers (*psaltae*) do, [...]"<sup>523</sup> The addition criticized by Ambrose derives from Ps. 31:6: "Into your hands I commit my spirit, redeem me, O Lord, the God of truth." It may have been that the words of the psalm were so familiar to the reader of the Gospel – who was a member of the higher orders – that the addition came as a matter of routine.<sup>524</sup>

Ambrose also uses the noun *psalmista*, but in six cases out of seven he is referring to the psalm writer. However, in a text describing his life change from consular governor to bishop, he reports how he learnt to listen to the song of a *psalmista*, instead of to the voice of a public crier.<sup>525</sup>

In his treatise on the ecclesiastical offices, Ambrose defines the proper use of the voice. He writes that "the first office is the manner of speaking", in the sense that everyone shall first learn to speak correctly. If one does not know how to speak, he should keep silent.<sup>526</sup> In every art of speech, including singing, the first

---

522 Ambrosius, De excessu fratris sui Satyri Lib. I, 61. "[...] hodie quoque per vocem lectoris parvuli, Spiritus sanctus expressit : [...]" PL XVI, 1309D. A reader is mentioned in three cases altogether, but in two, nothing can be deduced on whether he was a cleric. Leeb 1967, 41-42

523 Ambrosius, De interpellatione Job et David Lib. II, VI, 23-24. 23. "[...] Unde in cruce positus [Christus], cum emitteret spiritum, ad Patrem ait : "In manus tuas commendo spiritum meum. (*Luc. XXIII, 46*)" 24. Non ergo aliqui addant: *Domine*, ut psaltæ faciunt, quoque neque in Latino codice inveni meo neque in Græco, neque in Evangelio, quod est evidentius. [...]" PL XIV, 860.

524 Leeb 1967, 42, referring erroneously to Psalm 36 instead of Psalm 31.

525 Ambrosius, De poenitentia Lib. II, VIII, 72. "[...] Dicitur enim : Ecce ille non in ecclesiae nutritus sinu, non edomitus a puero, sed raptus de tribunalibus, abductus vanitatibus sæculi hujus, a præconis voce ad psalmistæ assuefactus canticum, in sacerdotio manet non virtute sua, sed Christi gratia, et inter convivas mensæ cœlestis recumbit." PL XVI, 514C-515A. Cf. Page 2010, 100.

526 Ambrosius, De officiis ministrorum I, VIII, 35: "Primum igitur officium est loquendi modus. Hoc sacrificium laudis Deo dependitur, hoc reverentia exhibetur, cum Scripturæ divinæ leguntur, hoc honorantur parentes. Scio loqui plerosque, cum tacere nesciant. Rarum est tacere quemquam, cum sibi non prosit loqui. Sapiens ut loquatur, multa prius considerat, quid dicat, aut cui dicat, quo in loco, et tempore. Est ergo et tacendi et loquendi modus : est etiam facti modus. Pulchrum igitur tenere mensuram

rule is modesty; one shall gradually begin with psalmody and singing, and only thereafter shall he begin to speak.<sup>527</sup> The quality of the voice is to be masculine: neither soft or weak, nor broken or rough. Bodily motions are to be avoided: both the voice and the bearing shall be natural. Ambrose also warns about assuming "a theatrical accent".<sup>528</sup>

In filling offices, the bishop shall observe the clerics and consider their personal inclinations, as "one is more fitted for the post of reader, another does better for the singing, a third is more solicitous for exorcising those possessed with an evil spirit, another, again, is held to be more suited to have the charge of the sacred things."<sup>529</sup> On the offices mentioned by Ambrose – reader, singer, exorcist, and *sacrarii custos* – a footnote in the edition of Migne comments that they represent examples only: the psalmist, for example, was never an order 'among us'. All the ranks mentioned belong to the members of the lower clergy who, according to the needs of each church, were sometimes more, and sometimes less, numerous.<sup>530</sup>

---

officii." PL XVI, 37C.

527 Ibid., XVIII, 67. "[...] Denique in ipso canendi genere prima disciplina verecundia est : imo etiam in omni usu loquendi ; ut sensim quis aut psallere, aut canere, aut postremo loqui incipiat ; ut verecundia principia commendent processum." Ibid., 47C. Cf. NPNF 2-10, 12.

528 Ibid., XIX, 84: "Vox ipsa non remissa, non fracta, nihil femineum sonans, qualem multi gravitatis specie simulare consuerunt, sed formam quamdam et regulam ac succum virilem reservans. Hoc est enim pulchritudinem vivendi tenere, convenientia cuique sexui et personæ reddere. Hic ordo gestorum optimus, hic ornatus ad omnem actionem accommodus. Sed ut molliculum et infractum aut vocis sonum, aut gestum corporis non probo : ita neque agrestem ac rusticum. Naturam imitemur : ejus effigies, formula disciplinæ, forma honestatis est." Ibid., 53A. XXIII, 104. "Nam de voce quid loquar, quam simplicem et puram esse satis arbitror : canoram autem esse naturæ est, non industriæ. Sit sane distincta pronuntiationis modo, et plena succi virilis : ut rhythmum affectet scenicum, sed mysticum servet." Ibid., 59A. The quotations are cited from NPNF2-10, 18.

529 NPNF 2-10, 36.

530 De officiis ministrorum I, XLIV, 215. "Alius distinguendæ lectioni aptior (32), alius psalmo gratior, alius exorcizandis qui malo laborant spiritu, sollicitior, alius sacrario opportunior habetur. Hæc omnia spectet sacerdos, et quid cuique congruat, id officii deputet. Quo etenim unumquemque suum ducit ingenium, aut quod officium decet, id majore impletur gratia." Ibid., 94A-B. Note (32). "Quamvis hic nulla fiat mentio acolythi et ostiarii, minime tamen hinc sequitur eorum ordines in Ecclesia tum

Whatever the clerical status of the one who 'did better for the singing' was, he sang the psalm verses alone, and the people responded to him. According to Helmut Leeb, Ambrose is the first Latin author to use the concepts 'to respond to a psalm' (*psalmum respondere*) and 'a psalm is responded to' (*psalmus respondetur*), to describe answering in unison a psalm sung by a soloist. The answer (*responsorium*) was to be a short verse which would be easy to learn. These expressions would thus solve the argument about the manner of singing introduced by Ambrose at Milan.<sup>531</sup>

First, Leeb emphasizes that the concept of 'antiphonal singing' simply means two parties who sing in turns. Second, the Greek word 'antiphon' translates into Latin as 'response': hence the concept of responsorial psalmody. Although Ambrose himself never mentions having established any innovations in the church, he is the first to mention psalm singing in the church of Milan. Thus, 'the manner of the Eastern Church' would have been responsorial psalmody.<sup>532</sup>

### 3.4.3 Augustine on singing

The enormous number of the writings of Augustine of Hippo treat fundamental matters of ecclesiology and theology, and he is also considered the first Christian theoretician of music.<sup>533</sup> With respect to ecclesiastical singing, Augustine

---

temporis non exstitisse, cum illi quatuor qui recensentur, tantum exempli causa memorentur. Quod autem cum lectore atque exorcista numerantur psalmista et sacrarii custos, quorum apud nos jam nulli sunt ordines ; hoc inde putamus factum quod cum minores illi clericatus ecclesiasticæ tantum institutionis sint, pro variis necessitatibus modo aucti, modo imminuti ab Ecclesia reperiuntur. [...]" Ibid., 93-94D.

531 Leeb 1967, 53ff., who discusses the use of the term by other authors in *ibid.* 79-80, 111-113.

532 Leeb 1967, 94-98, 102-103.

533 Augustine (354-430) is one of the greatest Latin Church Fathers, alongside Ambrose, Jerome, and Gregory I, the four of them being titled 'Doctors of the Church'. Augustine was the bishop of the North African city of Hippo from 396 until his death. ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 128-130, 494; Corbin 1960, 69; Wille 1960, 370. Before

confirms the practice of responsorial psalmody, whereas to the psalm reader, he often alludes in an impersonal manner.<sup>534</sup> In one of his sermons, however, Augustine states: "We had prepared us for a short psalm which we had ordered the reader to sing; but at the moment, as we saw, he in his confusion read another one instead."<sup>535</sup>

Augustine uses the words concerning singing and reading rather interchangeably. In the Confessions, he ponders whether the psalms should be sung or read, recalling Athanasius of Alexandria who preferred a very moderate inflection of the voice which made singing resemble speaking. Although concluding that singing "with a clear and skilfully modulated voice" would be of great benefit, Augustine remains alert to the danger produced by a beautiful melody which leads the listener's thoughts away from the words which are sung.<sup>536</sup>

Those who sing shall, nevertheless, be skilled. Augustine urges them: "Sing to him a new song; sing well, shouting in joy."<sup>537</sup> One must always sing well to God, so as not to insult his ears. In the same way as one prepares himself for a

---

his conversion to Christianity, Augustine adhered to the Manichaeans. They were a Gnostic sect founded by Mani in the third century in southern Persia; the doctrine spread widely, surviving in the easternmost regions until well into the second millennium. The music and hierarchy of the Manichaeans would provide materials for a study of their own, as they had their own psalm-book, and only the most perfect of the members (*electi*) could be appointed into the hierarchy while the hearers (*auditores*) remained laity. The numbers of the hierarchy – preserved by Augustine – reveal a supreme leader, twelve *magistri*, seventy-two bishops with deacons, and three hundred priests. According to another source, the members of the sect were divided into five degrees: *magistri*, the illuminated, priests, the truthful, and hearers. Bardy 1927, 1885; Klauck 2000, 485. See also ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 1027-1028; Castrén 2011, 469.

534 E.g. McKinnon 1987, 157, 159, 162 (nrs 357, 364, 374).

535 Augustinus, Enarratio in psalmum CXXXVIII. "1. Psalmum nobis brevem paraveramus, quem mandaveramus cantari a Lectore ; sed ad horam, quantum videtur, perturbatus, alterum pro altero legit. [...]" PL XXXVII, 1784.

536 Augustinus, Confess. Lib. X, XXXIII, 50. NPNF 1-01, 156.

537 Augustinus, Enarratio I in psalmum XXXII, 3. "[vers. 3] *Cantate ei canticum novum: cantate ei canticum gratiæ fidei. Bene cantate in jubilatione : bene cantate ei in lætitia.*" PL XXXVI, 275.

performance in front of an excellent musician, so shall he also prepare himself for singing in front of God. The end of the verse, 'shouting in joy', is glossed by Augustine as 'in jubilation'. He explains this to mean wordless singing: the incomprehensible joy one experiences in his heart can not be expressed in words.<sup>538</sup> For Augustine, a hymn is constructed from three elements: singing, praise, and God; thus, a hymn is sung praise to God.<sup>539</sup>

Commenting on Psalm 149, Augustine emphasizes that in choir singing, the harmony must be perfect. Any discordance, even by only one singer, insults the ears, and does not differ from heresy.<sup>540</sup> Some choir terminology appears in the treatise on Psalm 87, where Augustine remarks that "as in Latin the terms *Precentor* and *Succentor* are used to denote in music the performer who sings the first part, and him who takes it up; just so in this song of the Passion, Christ

---

538 Augustinus, Enarratio II in psalmum XXXII, 8. "[...] *Cantate ei canticum novum : bene cantate ei*. Quærit unusquisque quomodo cantet Deo. Canta illi, sed noli male. Non vult offendi aures suas. Bene canta, frater. Si alicui bono auditori musico, quando tibi dicitur, Canta ut placeas ei, sine aliqua instructione musicæ artis cantare trepidas, ne displiceas artifici ; quia quod in te imperitus non agnoscit, artifex reprehendit : quis offerat : Deo bene cantare, sic judicanti de cantore, sic examinanti omnia, sic audienti? Quando potes afferre tam elegans artificium cantandi, ut tam perfectis auribus in nullo displiceas? [...] *In jubilatione* cane : hoc est enim bene canere Deo, in jubilatione cantare. Quid est in jubilatione canere ? Intelligere, verbis explicare non posse quid canitur corde. [...]" PL XXXVI, 283. The use of the word 'jubilation' has been connected with the later melismatic *jubilus* at the end of the Alleluia for which, however, there is no solid evidence. Corbin 1960, 112, presupposing the *jubilus* into the end of the 4<sup>th</sup> century. Cf. McKinnon 1987a, 156.

539 Augustinus, Enarratio in psalmum CXLIII, 17: "*Hymnus omnibus sanctis ejus*. Hymnus scitis quid est? Cantus est cum laude Dei. Si laudas Deum, et non cantas, non dicis hymnum : si cantas, et non laudas Deum, non dicis hymnum : si laudas aliud quod non pertinet ad laudem Dei, etsi cantando laudes, non dicis hymnum. Hymnus ergo tria ista habet, et cantum, et laudem, et Dei. Laus ergo Dei in cantico, hymnus dicitur. [...]" PL XXXVII, 1947-1948.

540 Augustinus, Enarratio in psalmum CXLIX, 7. "[ver. 3.] Laudent nomen ejus in choro. Et chorus quid significat ? Multi noverunt chorum; et quia in civitate loquimur, prope omnes norunt. Chorus est consensio cantantium. Si in choro cantamus, concorditer cantemus. In choro cantantium quisquis voce discrepaverit, offendit auditum, et perturbat chorum. Si vox inconvenienter cantantis disturbat concentum cantantium, quomodo disturbat hæresis dissonans concentum laudantium? Chorus Christi jam totus mundus est. Chorus Christi ab oriente in occidentem consonat. [...]" PL XXXVII, 1953.

going before is followed by the choir of martyrs unto the end of gaining crowns in Heaven."<sup>541</sup> The allusion to choir singers here illustrates a theological allegory, but also refers to antiphonal singing.

Augustine's position on ecclesiastical singing is cautious but, ultimately, positive. He emphasizes careful preparation and concentration on the words instead of the melody.

### 3.5 Summary

The reign of Emperor Constantine I meant a new beginning for the Christian Church. It was no longer outlawed or persecuted but could act publicly, and its officials were granted significant exemptions from civil duties. The ecclesiastical ranks, in the civil legislation of the time as well as in the decrees promulgated by the first ecumenical council, are mentioned in expressions that emphasize the existence of the ecclesiastical canon, i.e. the rule governing the life of the Church and everybody who worked for it. Only the orders of bishop, presbyter, and deacon are mentioned, as also is that of the country bishop (*chorepiscopus*). His standing is also treated by local synods both before and after the Council of Nicaea, on which occasions lower orders also appear, as the country bishop was allowed to appoint only readers, subdeacons, and exorcists. The gradational principle governing advancement in the ecclesiastical hierarchy was laid down in the Synod of Sardica in 343, and required promotion through the ranks of the reader, deacon, and presbyter into the episcopate.

---

541 Augustinus, Enarratio in psalmum LXXXVII, 1. "[...] Proinde quemadmodum dicuntur in arte musica, sicut ea docti homines latine dicere potuerunt, præcentor et succentor ; præcentor scilicet qui vocem præmittit in cantu, succentor autem qui subsequenter canendo respondet : ita in hoc cantico passionis, præcedentem Christus subsequitur chorus martyrum in finem cœlestium coronarum. [...]" PL XXXVII, 1109-1110. Transl. from NPNF 1-8, 424. Cf. Wille 1960, 373.

An Egyptian church order of the time, the Canons of Hippolytus, stipulates that a reader must possess the same virtues as a deacon, thereby hinting at the presumed advancement in the hierarchy. The reading is situated in the beginning of the liturgy, several readers taking turns with each other. Psalm singing is mentioned at the Eucharist by the officials who had the right to enter the altar, i.e. the bishop, presbyters, and deacons. The common psalmody is connected with other occasions, but, evidently, all parishioners were assumed to be able to take part in singing.

The characteristics of psalmody are defined by Athanasius of Alexandria, who differentiates the modes of representation of the biblical books. Using the concepts of 'continuity' and 'an expanded voice', he applies the former to the narrative books, while the latter is to be used in reading 'psalms and hymns and spiritual songs', i.e. 'odes and psalms', the odes probably being the poetic sections of the Bible, apart from the Psalter. On the psalmodists, Athanasius, in another writing, refers to the deacon who recited the verses, which were responded by the people.

Ecclesiastical life in the fourth century was strongly characterized by the struggle against Arianism. The heresy started in Alexandria, and spread throughout Christendom, not least by means of singing: the initiator of the schism, the presbyter Arius, also set his doctrine into popular melodies.

From the middle of the century on, antiphonal, or alternate, singing emerged in the Church. Its introduction is attributed to two Antiochene ascetes who are reported to have divided the choir into two parts. Although the manner of antiphonal singing was ancient, it seems to have been considered a novelty in the Church, and is said to have spread rapidly everywhere. In a famous letter, Basil of Caesarea describes a vigil with both antiphonal and responsorial psalmody, arguing for their universality among believers.

Little by little, individual singers appear, while the establishment of the order of the singer is attested by the canons of the Synod of Laodicea, and the

Apostolic Constitutions, both from ca. 380. The criteria concerning the canonical – thus uniquely termed in the 15<sup>th</sup> canon of Laodicea – singer include proficiency in the ability to sing from the books. This requirement sought to guarantee adherence to the Scriptures. The liturgy included in the Apostolic Constitutions indicates prayer responses and hymns which, evidently, were the main duty of the singers. The Psalms seem to remain in the repertoire of the readers, at the beginning of the liturgy, or of the members of the higher orders, at the Eucharist. The Testament of Our Lord, as well as the Oriental version of the Apostolic Tradition, and the Pilgrimage of Egeria, each describe a group of singers, consisting of both clerics and laymen: the latter were small children and ascetes.

In western Christendom, beginning with the Church of Rome, we encountered deacons and readers who, in their epigrams, were either praised for their vocal skills, paralleled with the Levites of the Old Covenant, or mentioned as singers of the 'ancient prophet', i.e. David. The title of psalm singer (*psaltēs*) is used once by Jerome who elsewhere refers to 'those who are appointed to sing in the church' without defining their rank. Regarding the nature of ecclesiastical singing, Jerome's apocryphal correspondence with Pope Damasus implies that psalmody 'in the Greek manner' was introduced at Rome. The reference was probably to responsorial psalmody; that was also taught, by Ambrose, to the congregation of Milan.

Both eastern and western authors discuss the essence of singing. It is not to please the ear but to benefit the soul; Athanasius of Alexandria describes how the singing of psalms calms both the mind and the body, and brings the person into total harmony with God – John Chrysostom is appalled to see and hear the singers in the church of Antioch, without any harmony in their use of the voice, let alone in their bodies. Jerome is also repelled by theatrical effects, but emphasizes the character of the singer over the quality of his voice, while both

Ambrose of Milan and Augustine of Hippo underline the importance of adequate vocal skills, as well as proper preparation for the duty of singing.

## 4 From the fifth to the seventh century

### 4.1 Hispanic and Gallic documents

#### 4.1.1 The confessor of the canons of Toledo I

The title 'confessor' became common in the third century as the title for those who had survived persecutions. Confessors also often became appointed to ecclesiastical orders.<sup>542</sup> In 400, the title appears in the canons of the First Council of Toledo.<sup>543</sup>

A female who has made a vow to God, or a widow, shall not sing antiphons in her house with a confessor or with her servant, in the absence of the bishop or the presbyter. A vesper shall not be celebrated elsewhere than in the church. However, if it is celebrated at home in the presence of the bishop, the presbyter or the deacon shall read it.<sup>544</sup>

In previous research, the confessor mentioned in this canon has been presumed to be a singer.<sup>545</sup> The reason for this is probably based on the content of the canon, which concerns a daily office celebrated at home. As to the word

---

542 See p. 72 above. The original meaning of the word is also found in the fifth century: Christianity as such was no longer outlawed, but its orthodox representatives were threatened by Arianism, spread by the Germanic tribes invading the western provinces. The persecutions also produced martyrs, of whom a famous example is the North African reader who was killed in the middle of a Hallelujah when an arrow hit his throat. Vict. Vit. *De persecutione vandalica* Lib. I, XIII, PL LVIII, 197B.

543 Generally, the title 'council' is used only of ecumenical councils, while the word 'synod' means regional assemblies. The Hispanic synods are called councils because they convened at the capitals of the provinces. Cf. Brown 1996, 220.

544 Concilium Toletanum I, IX.: "*Ut nulla professa vel vidua absente sacerdote in domo sua sacerdotale officium vel lucernale impleat. Nulla professa vel vidua, absente episcopo vel presbytero, in domo sua antifonas cum confessore vel servo suo faciat : lucernarium vero nisi in ecclesia non legatur; aut si legitur in villa, praesente episcopo, vel presbytero vel diacono legatur.*" PL 84, 330C.

545 Hefele 1875, 78, alluding to the analogy between confessor and singer made in the 17<sup>th</sup> century by Charles du Fresne du Cange, and based solely on the ninth canon of Toledo I. Du Cange II, 497. The interpretation was repeated by Kaufmann 1917, 217, and Gaudemet 1958, 106. Cf. Sparksman 1980, 118-119.

'antiphons', we recall its two meanings, which were treated above: first, the alternate singing of two parties, and second, antiphons as a separate genre of ecclesiastical compositions.<sup>546</sup> The connection between confessing and singing has been made for linguistic reasons: in the *Vulgata*, the verb *confiteri* is repeatedly connected with praise of God.<sup>547</sup> Augmenting the meaning into 'praising God with singing', confessor has been regarded as the title of the singer of the Hispanic Church.<sup>548</sup>

The target of the canon, and of the Council itself, was a heresy initiated in the latter half of the fourth century by the layman Priscillian. His devotees practised ascetism and assembled at private houses where a *doctor* of their own instructed the scriptures, especially the New Testament Apocrypha.<sup>549</sup> The greater part of the Priscillianists consisted of females, whose attendance at meetings had actually been forbidden by the Synod of Zaragoza in 380.<sup>550</sup> That the Council of Toledo, consisting of nineteen Spanish bishops, saw it necessary to regulate the celebration of the divine offices at home indicates that the matter was considered serious. The conditional permission to celebrate a vesper in a private house was an attempt to control the heresy.

Another canon of the Council parallels the confessor with a layman. The canon orders that "religious maidens", i.e. virgins, were not to associate with "a confessor, or with any layman, or with any man of no kin". A further restriction is given concerning readers who belonged to the clergy: with them, virgins were to have no dealings unless they happened to be full or half-siblings.<sup>551</sup>

---

546 Du Cange I, 301. See pp. 129 and 147-148 above.

547 E.g. 1 Chron 16:34-35, 25:3, 29:13, Ps 88:6.

548 Du Cange II, 497.

549 Orlandis/Ramos-Lisson 1981, 39ff. Priscillianism also spread in Italy, and was condemned by several synods during the latter half of the fourth century. ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 1329-1330.

550 Hefele 1873, 744-745; Barty 1936, 391-400.

551 Concilium Toletanum I, VI. "*Ut religiosa puella virorum familiaritatem non habeat. Item ne qua puella Dei aut familiaritatem habeat cum confessore aut cum quolibet laico, sive sanguinis alieni, aut convivium sola, nisi ubi sit seniorum frequentia, aut honestorum, aut viduarum honestarumque, ubi honeste confessor quilibet cum*

In the general sense of the word, confession concerns faith: in like manner to the 'religious maiden' of the canon, the confessor may be defined as a 'religious man' (*vir religiosus*).<sup>552</sup> Until the early Middle Ages, esteemed religious laymen could be entitled to hear confessions, which was primarily the privilege of priests and eventually also remained so.<sup>553</sup> Thus, there is no provable connection between a confessor and a singer.

#### 4.1.2 The appointment of the *cantor*

The earliest western regulation concerning the appointment of the singer is also the first to clearly use the word *cantor* to mean an ecclesiastical singer. Hitherto, cantor has primarily referred to the Roman singer-actor.<sup>554</sup>

The regulation itself has a somewhat obscure provenance. First, it is recorded as among the canons of the Fourth Council of Carthage in 398.<sup>555</sup> The canons are repeated, partly modified and in a different order, in a collection titled *Statuta*

---

plurimorum testimonio convivio interesse possit : cum lectoribus autem in ipsorum domibus non admittendas penitus nec videndas, nisi forte consanguinea soror sit, vel uterina." PL 84, 330A. The company proper to a virgin consisted of widows or of older and respectable men. In their society, a confessor could also attend the house of a virgin.

552 Orlandis/Ramos-Lisson 1981, 45.

553 Hanna 1914. In inscriptions from the late 4<sup>th</sup> century onwards, the title is sometimes mentioned beside the ecclesiastical grade, e.g. 'bishop and confessor'. ILCV I, 1043, 1004. See also nrs 1293, 1986, 2019. A rather late Hispanic inscription is provided with the abbreviation *Ɔfr*; which has been explained to mean "confessor rather than *confrater*", ILCV I, 2019A. Later, in the Middle Ages, confessor was rather synonymous with monk. Du Cange II, 497-498. There are also examples of both Greek and Latin Church Fathers with confessor as an honorary title. Beccari 1914, 215; Botte 1941, 137ff.; Crehan 1958, 84<sup>7</sup>. Cf. Page 2010, 348.

554 Cf. Gurlitt 1950, 555; Müller 1964, 33-34.

555 Concilium Carthaginense IV, X. Mansi III, 952; PL 84, 201B; PL 130, 344B. It is to be noted that the data on Carthaginian Councils differs between the West and East. In the latter, the Council of Carthage in 419 has primary validity, its canons being a collection of those of all former councils. Hefele 1875, 68ff; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 293; OKK 1980, 197<sup>1</sup>.

*Ecclesiae Antiqua*. The present setting of the statutes derives from Gaul, where it is probable that it was compiled in the latter half of the fifth century by Gennadius of Marseilles.<sup>556</sup>

The *Statuta* include ordination formulae for all ecclesiastical ranks, of which the bishop alone ordains the presbyter, deacon, exorcist, and reader; at the ordination of subdeacon, acolyte, and doorkeeper, he is assisted by the archdeacon. At the ordination of a reader, the bishop shall first introduce him, describe his faith, life and character to the people present after which he gives him a book, saying: "Take this, and become the proclaimer of the Word of God, and if you fulfil your duty faithfully and profitably, you will be counted among those who have served in the preaching of the Word of God."<sup>557</sup>

The statute concerning the singer is situated after those of all the aforementioned ranks, and reads:

The psalmist, or singer (*cantor*), may undertake the office of singing without the bishop being cognisant of it, by the sole order of a presbyter who says: See to it that what you sing with your mouth, you believe in the heart, and what you believe in your heart, you prove with your deeds.<sup>558</sup>

This is followed by the consecration of virgins, which is, again, executed by the bishop.<sup>559</sup> The office of the singer is thus an exception in between the ranks that

---

556 Munier 1960, 209ff.; Bradshaw 1992, 108<sup>70</sup>; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 1539, 663; Page 2010, 214. For a survey concerning the alleged origin of the collection, see Sparksman 1980, 117.

557 SEA 96: "Lector cum ordinatur, faciat de illo verbum episcopus ad plebem, indicans eius fidem ac vitam atque ingenium ; post haec, exspectante plebe, tradat ei codicem de quo lecturus est, dicens ad eum: Accipe, et esto verbi dei relator, habiturus, si fideliter et utiliter impleveris officium, partem cum his qui verbum dei ministraverunt." Munier 1960, 98. In the preceding statute (95), the exorcist likewise receives a book, evidently a smaller one (*libellum*) which includes the exorcisms. No introduction is mentioned. *Ibid.*, 97.

558 SEA 98: "Psalmista, idest cantor, potest absque scientia episcopi, sola iussione presbyteri, officium suscipere cantandi, dicente sibi presbytero : Vide ut quod ore cantas, corde credas et quod corde credis operibus probes." Munier 1960, 99.

559 SEA 99-102, Munier 1960, 99-100. The last item concerns widows and devout females (*sanctimoniales*) who fulfil the duties of deaconesses, and who shall receive

are appointed by the bishop. According to the text, the bishop does not need even to be informed about the singer's appointment 'by the sole order of a presbyter'. This has been interpreted to indicate that the writer of the canon wanted to make a declaration regarding the authority of presbyters.<sup>560</sup>

It is, however, likely that the reason for the arrangement lay elsewhere, as one of the *Statuta* is directed to "the presbyters who manage the parish churches".<sup>561</sup> Small congregations unable to maintain a bishop were tended by a presbyter. On the other hand, in large parochial regions limited autonomy could be given to presbyters. Giving presbyters permission to appoint singers independently would thus have had the purpose of facilitating their recruitment. The same procedure may have operated in the great cathedrals, where more singers were needed. As the bishop would have had more important matters to consider than the filling of lower-level vacancies, a presbyter could well have been given the right to appoint singers.<sup>562</sup>

However, it may be that the above reasoning is unnecessary: the canon concerning the singer may simply be a casual addition made by the compiler. Coming across it in one or another collection, he would have added it "for completeness' sake; it need not mean that in his own church cantors were initiated by this act and formula".<sup>563</sup>

---

the necessary instruction for their duties. Of their ordination, nothing is said. The text also alludes to widows, who were dependent on the church.

560 Sparksman 1980, 117-118.

561 SEA 87. "Presbyteri, qui per dioceses ecclesias regunt, non a quibuslibet episcopis, sed a suis, nec per iuniorem clericum, sed aut per seipsum aut per illum qui sacrarium tenet, ante paschae sollemnitatem, chrisma petant." Munier 1960, 94. The canon concerns supplying the chrism before Easter. For the concept of *dioceses ecclesias* in the meaning of 'Landkirche', see Hefele 1875, 676. At the time, *diocesis* did not refer only to a bishopric but was also used of smaller parishes tended by a presbyter. Orlandis/Ramos-Lisson 1981, 89<sup>72</sup>. For *chorepiscopus*, see p. 94 above.

562 Munier 1960, 175-176.

563 Crehan 1958, 84, quoted by Sparksman 1980, 117. The title *psalmista* was characteristic in the Gallican rite of later centuries. Andrieu 1925, 246-249; Galles 1981, 19; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 652-653. See also Cattin 1984, 45-47.

Both in the *Statuta* and in the canons of Carthage IV, singers are situated after the rank of doorkeepers who, like all the preceding grades, receive an episcopal ordination. Such is not granted the singers, despite their being recorded as belonging to the clergy in the canons of the Third Council of Carthage. Repeating the ancient order that a cleric shall not be received in another church without the consent of his own bishop, the Council points out that readers, psalmists, and doorkeepers are to "keep the title of clerics".<sup>564</sup> Probably the matter was not undisputed: on the one hand, the formula for the ordination of the singer does not exclude the possibility that the bishop could appoint him. On the other hand, based on the canons of Laodicea – and providing they had circulated wider – the singer was a rather recent addition to the ecclesiastical personnel. In western Christendom, as we have seen, it was customary that persons already occupying an ecclesiastical grade also answered for singing.

One example of this appears in Vienne, where, in 473, the brother of the bishop of the city, the presbyter and monk Claudianus, had died. The elegy written in memory of him by Sidonius Apollinaris, the bishop of Clermont, states, "well was he skilled to chant psalms and to direct the choir; for his grateful brother, he taught trained groups of singers to chant before the altar".<sup>565</sup> A literal translation of the beginning would define Claudianus as 'a singer of psalms and a teacher of singing'. To the groups of singers, the Latin text refers with the word 'classes'. Thus, there is no way of knowing whether there was a specific title for those singers, or whether they were clerics or laymen.<sup>566</sup> In light

---

564 Concilium Carthaginense Tertium, XXI. "*Ut nullus episcopus alienum clericum audeat retinere vel ordinare. Ut clericum alienum, nisi concedento ejus episcopo, nemo audeat retinere vel promovere in ecclesia sibi credita : clericorum autem nomen etiam lectores et psalmistæ et ostiarii retinent.*" PL 84, 192A. Hefele 1875, 66, dates the council in 397. Cf. Gaudemet 1958, 99.

565 Sidonius Apollinaris, Elegy for Claudianus (lines 13-15): "psalmodum hic modulator et phonascus / ante altaria fratre gratulante / instructas docuit sonare classes". Le Blant II, 404, 54. Transl. by Dalton 1915. For Sidonius and Claudianus, see ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 1498, 359, 1026; Page 2010, 178, 183ff.

566 The suggestion of clerics, Page 2010, 186; of laymen, Sparksman 1980, 98.

of the statute concerning the appointment of the psalmist, the presbyter Claudianus would have been authorized to recruit the singers.

## 4.2 Eastern sources of the fifth and the sixth centuries

### 4.2.1 Catechumen readers and singers in the Church of Alexandria

The Ecclesiastical History of Socrates Scholasticus includes a chapter on the diversity of practices in Christendom. Among them is a detail concerning the Church of Alexandria where, according to Socrates, even catechumens could officiate as readers and psalm singers while everywhere else only baptized persons were appointed to such tasks.<sup>567</sup> He refers to singers with a word meaning prompters, explained as "psalm reciters, whose duty it was to sing the first words of the psalm, which the people continued".<sup>568</sup> At the time, the rank of the singer in Egypt was probably that of layman. This is suggested by a contemporary text which alludes to 'clerics and singers', separating singers from the clergy proper.<sup>569</sup>

Regarding the status of the catechumenate of readers and singers in Alexandria, we should note that many of those who received a Christian upbringing as adults, postponed the moment of baptism until their deathbed. Being aware of the penance and punishments required to atone for sins

---

567 Socrates, HE V, 22: "[...] Ἐν τῇ αὐτῇ δὲ Ἀλεξανδρείᾳ ἀναγνώσται καὶ ὑποβολεῖς (77) ἀδιάφορον, εἴτε κατηχούμενοί εἰσιν, εἴτε πιστοὶ τῶν πανταχοῦ Ἐκκλησιῶν πιστοὺς εἰς τὸ τάγμα τοῦτο προβαλλομένων." PG LXVII, 636B-637A. The Ecclesiastical History of Socrates (ca. 380-450) continues the history of Eusebius until the year 439. ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 1513.

568 (77) *Valesii annotationes*: "Καὶ ὑποβολεῖς. [...] psalmi pronuntiatores. Horum munus videtur fuisse, prima psalmi verba præcinere. Populus deinde reliqua succinebat. [...]" PG LXVII, 635.

569 Wipszycka 1993, 205.

committed after baptism, they considered it best to receive the sacrament at the end of their life when the danger of committing further sins was over.<sup>570</sup>

#### 4.2.2 Readers and singers in the canons of the Council of Chalcedon

The fourth ecumenical council, convened at Chalcedon in 451, addressed primarily doctrinal matters but also promulgated some disciplinary canons.<sup>571</sup>

One of them orders

*That hieratics shall not marry heretics.*

Because in some provinces readers and singers are allowed to marry, the holy synod determines that none of them shall take a heterodox wife.<sup>572</sup>

The canon tallies with the fourth-century legislation of the Apostolic Constitutions which permitted readers and singers to marry after their appointment to the clergy.<sup>573</sup> Here, we shall recall the earlier appearance of the word 'hieratics' which, in the 24<sup>th</sup> canon of the Synod of Laodicea, referred to

570 Infant baptism had begun to take place during the fourth century. Jones 1964, 981-982.

571 The aim of the Council was to combat the Eutychian heresy which denied the human nature of Christ. ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 315, 577.

572 Concilium Chalcedonense ΙΔ: "*Περὶ τοῦ μὴ δεῖν ἱερατικούς πρὸς αἰρετικούς ἐπιγαμίας ποιεῖν. Ἐπειδὴ ἐν τισὶν ἐπαρχίαις συγκεχώρηται τοῖς ἀναγνώσταῖς καὶ ψάλταις γαμεῖν, ὥρισεν ἡ ἅγια σύνοδος μὴ ἐξεῖναί τινα αὐτῶν ἑτερόδοξον γυναῖκα λαμβάνειν. Τοὺς δὲ ἤδη ἐκ τοιούτων γάμων παιδοποιήσαντας, εἰ μὲν ἔφθασαν βαπτίσει τὰ ἐξ αὐτῶν τεχθέντα παρὰ τοῖς αἰρετικοῖς, προσάγειν αὐτὰ τῇ κοινωσίᾳ τῆς καθολικῆς ἐκκλησίας, μὴ βαπτισθέντα δὲ μὴ δύνασθαι ἔτι βαπτίζειν αὐτὰ παρὰ τοῖς αἰρετικοῖς, μήτε μὴν συνάπτειν πρὸς γάμον αἰρετικῶ ἢ Ἰουδαίῳ ἢ ἑλληνι, εἰ μὴ ἄρα ἐπαγγέλλοιτο μετατίθεσθαι εἰς τὴν ὀρθόδοξον πίστιν τὸ συναπτόμενον πρόσωπον τῷ ὀρθόδοξῳ. Εἰ δὲ τις τοῦτον τὸν ὅρον παραβαίῃ τῆς ἁγίας συνόδου, κανονικῶ ὑποκείσθω ἐπιτιμῶ.*" Tanner 1990, 93-94. OKK 1980. 266-268. The concept of heretic included not only heterodox Christians, but also Jews and heathens. The canon goes on to state what was to be done about the already existing mixed marriages: the children of such families had to be baptised into the catholic church and heterodox spouses should convert to the orthodox faith. In fact, the text is a compilation of canons 10 and 31 of the Synod of Laodicea.

573 Cf. p. 122 above.

presbyters and deacons, while the lower ranks were defined as the 'ecclesiastical order'.<sup>574</sup> Here, the purpose of using this word may be to emphasize the dignity of all ecclesiastical ranks.<sup>575</sup> The Latin title of the canon, however, does not mention singers, stating: "Although in some provinces the readers are allowed to take wives, they shall not unite themselves with heretics."<sup>576</sup>

A matter of interpretation appears in the canon which concerns letters of recommendation; an ecclesiastical official unable to present such a letter from his own bishop could not be received in another church. In the canon, these officials are specified as "foreign clerics and readers". The separation of readers from other clerics seems peculiar; further, the title of the canon and the text proper differ from each other. The title only mentions 'clerics', while the canon proper speaks of 'clerics and readers'.<sup>577</sup> As readers had belonged to the clergy

---

574 Cf. p. 110 above.

575 As to the lower orders, Leclercq 1929, 2249, alludes to a manuscript of the canons of Chalcedon in which the reader of the present canon is in Greek called the 'archreader', and in Latin *primicerius lectorum*. I have not been able to trace the version. For the title of *primicerius*, see pp. 191-192 below.

576 Concilium Chalcedonense XIV. "*Quod in quibusdam provinciis lectores uxores accipere permittantur, ne praesumpserint se haereticis coniungere.*" Tanner 1990, 93. Probably, the rank of singer was not common everywhere; even readers seem to have been infrequent 'in some provinces', as, at the time of the Council of Chalcedon, the clergy of the episcopal church of Edessa is told to have consisted of fourteen priests, thirty-seven deacons, twenty-three subdeacons, and only one reader. Jones 1964, 912. (The readers of the Finnish translation of the canons of Chalcedon may observe that in the 2<sup>nd</sup> canon of the Council, directed against simony, the singer (*kanttori*) also appears, OKK 1980, 243) The Greek texts of the canons available to me – the edition of Tanner, PG 137, and the Athenian Syntagma – do not record the singer, but the explanations of Balsamon and Zonaras mention singers in the classification concerning the manner of appointment of the ecclesiastical ranks. These are divided into three categories: singers and readers are mentioned as being assigned (σφραγίζονται) – Zonaras remarks that they also receive the imposition of hands (χειροθεσία) – while bishops, presbyters, and deacons are ordained (χειροτονούνται), and the other officials, like stewards (οἰκονόμοι), advocates (ἔκδικοι), and sextons (παραμονάριοι) are chosen (προβάλλονται). PG CXXXVII, 384-385.

577 Concilium Chalcedonense ΙΓ: "*Περὶ τοῦ μὴ δεῖν κληρικούς ἀπιόντας χωρὶς γραμμάτων συστατικῶν λειτουργεῖν. Ξένους κληρικούς καὶ ἀναγνώστας ἐν ἑτέρᾳ πόλει διχα συστατικῶν γραμμάτων τοῦ ἰδίου ἐπισκόπου μηδὲ ὅλως μηδαμοῦ λειτουργεῖν.*" Tanner 1990, 93.

since the end of the second century CE, their differentiation from 'clerics' seems incomprehensible. But, if only deacons and those above them were considered to be clerics – as in the Latin version of the Apostolic Tradition – the wording is logical.<sup>578</sup> Another Greek edition, however, refers to 'foreign and unknown clerics'.<sup>579</sup> This may explain the matter, as in Greek, the word 'unknown' (*agnōstas*) differs from the word 'readers' (*anagnōstas*) only in the first two letters: the problem is probably the result of a misspelling in the manuscript used for the translation.<sup>580</sup>

#### 4.2.3 An apocryphal canon attributed to the Council of Nicaea

According to the canons of Chalcedon, readers and singers were clerics, even hieratics: the authority of the Council of Chalcedon, as one of the ecumenical councils, renders the matter indisputable. A little after the Council of Chalcedon, Gelasius of Cyzicus presented a collection of apocryphal canons deriving from the Council of Nicaea.<sup>581</sup> Among them, ecclesiastics are distinguished in the following way:

*About the sanctified.*

The model and image for the sanctified shall be the heavens, and the bishop shall keep the seat of the Lord as he is the head of the church, which is in his power. The presbyter shall keep the seat of the seraphs,

---

578 Recalling the Latin version of the Apostolic Tradition, we see that bishop, presbyter and deacon were the only clerics in it. See p. 72 above.

579 Concilium Chalcedonense II. "Ξένους κληρικούς καὶ ἀγνώστους, ἐν ἑτέρα πόλει, δίχα συστατικῶν γραμμάτων τοῦ ἰδίου ἐπισκόπου, μηδὲ μὴ μηδαμοῦ λειτουργεῖν." Σύνταγμα II, 250.

580 Hefele 1875, 518. Cf. OKK 1980, 266.

581 Gelasius of Cyzicus (*fl.* 475) wrote a history of eastern Christendom based on four earlier ecclesiastical histories (of Eusebius, Rufinus, Theodoret of Cyrrhus, and Socrates). Concerning the Council of Nicæa – which we know issued twenty genuine canons – Gelasius declared that he utilized of three old manuscripts that his father had received from the bishop of Cyzicus. PG LXXXV, 1179-1180; Godet 1947, 1182-1183; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 658.

the deacon that of the cherubs: the subdeacon shall be at hand to serve them.

*That laymen shall not mount the platform.*

Laymen are not allowed to mount the platform except for those who have been assigned to read or to sing from the books.<sup>582</sup>

The word 'sanctified', used of the bishop, the presbyter, and the deacon, emphasizes the sacredness of the hierarchy, which imitates the celestial order.<sup>583</sup>

The order of the subdeacon does not possess a heavenly counterpart. Readers and singers are defined as laymen without any indication of how they were to be 'assigned'; recalling the definition of Zonaras above, the assignation included the imposition of hands.<sup>584</sup> The genuine Nicaean canons refer to ecclesiastics in general in periphrases, and only the orders of bishop, presbyter, and deacon are separately mentioned. Thus, the concept of 'assigned' laymen would be in accord with them.

#### 4.2.4 Singing in the hierarchical system of Dionysius (the Pseudo-)Areopagite

In the beginning of the sixth century, a systematical analysis of the heavenly and ecclesiastical hierarchies was introduced in the writings attributed to Dionysius Areopagite.<sup>585</sup> Briefly, the principles of the analysis are the concept of the order

---

582 Gelasii Cyziceni, *Historia Concilii Nicaeni* II, 31, 3: "*Περὶ τῶν ἱερωμένων.* τοὺς ἱερωμένους εἰς τύπον καὶ εἰκόνα χρη εἶναι τῶν ἐπουρανίων, καὶ τὸν μὲν ἐπίσκοπον ἐπέχειν τὸν <θρόνον> αὐτοῦ τοῦ κυρίου ὡς κεφαλὴν μετ' αὐτὸν ὄντα τῆς ἐκκλησίας ἧς παρέλιψε, τὸν δὲ πρεσβύτερον τὸν σεραφικὸν ἐπέχειν θρόνον, τὸν δὲ διάκονον τὸν χερουβικόν· τὸν ὑπηρέτην εἰς διακονίαν τούτων εἶναι προσήκει. 4. *Περὶ τοῦ μὴ δεῖν λαϊκοὺς ἀνιέναι ἐν τῷ ἄμβωνι.* περὶ τοῦ μὴ δεῖν λαϊκοὺς ἀνιέναι ἐν τῷ ἄμβωνι πλὴν τῶν τεταγμένων ἀναγινώσκειν ἢ ψάλλειν ἐν ταῖς διφθέρασις." GCS Neue Folge Band 9, 89.

583 Cf. p. 75 above.

584 See fn. 576 above.

585 In the Orthodox tradition, Dionysius Areopagite – mentioned in Acts 17:34 – is considered to have been the pupil of Hierotheos, the first bishop of Athens. The

of the universe based on a single centre – God, or according to Dionysius, the One – surrounded by concentric circles, each of which consists of three entities, corresponding to the holy number of the Trinity. The ecclesiastical hierarchy is the counterpart of the heavenly hierarchy, likewise arranged in groups of three. Here, the highest level consists of acts, not persons, namely of the consecration of the chrism, baptism, and the Eucharist. The three ecclesiastical orders entitled to administer these sacraments are the bishop (*hierarkhēs*), priests, and deacons (*leitourgoi*). Those outside the clergy are monks, laymen, and persons excluded from the Eucharist, i.e. penitents.<sup>586</sup>

Dionysius also refers to liturgical practices. In the description of the mystery of illumination, the bishop summons the whole clergy together, and sings first a hymn of praise (*hymnos*) from the Scriptures, not necessarily from the Psalter.<sup>587</sup> During the liturgy, the bishop, having returned to the altar after the incensing, begins "the sacred melodies of the psalms", joined by everybody present, and which are succeeded by the readings. The moment of the Eucharist is also preceded by singing. In all these instances, the bishop is declared to be the leading singer.<sup>588</sup>

---

epithet 'Pseudo' is caused by the fact that the writings attributed to him derive from the 6<sup>th</sup> century. ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> ed.), 485; Seppälä 2012, 15-18.

586 The whole creation and everything in it shall be united with God, and the union is attainable in a threefold process consisting of purgative, illuminative, and unitive phases or 'ways'. The phases are connected with the aforementioned ranks: the penitents are to be purged, the illuminated catechumens shall be baptized, and the monks already lead a unitive life. This is a highly condensed description of the system presented in the treatises of Dionysius, and is based on ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> ed.), 332, 485, 1349, 1435, 1656. See also af Hällström 2004, 34-35.

587 S. Dionysii Areopagitæ, De eccles. hierarch. II, II, IV. "Ἐἶτα πάντας τοὺς τοῦ κλήρου (τούτους γὰρ λέγει ἱεράν διακόσμησιν) ἐφ' ᾧ καὶ συνεργήσωσι καὶ συνεορτάσωσι, συγκαλεῖται, καὶ ὕμνον τινὰ ἱερολογεῖ ἐκ τῶν θείων λογίων. Σημείωσαι γὰρ, ὅτι ἐκ πάσης τῆς ἱεράς Γραφῆς δυνατὸν ὕμνον προσφέρειν τῷ Θεῷ, οὐ μὴν ἐκ μόνου τοῦ Ψαλτῆρος · ἢ τὴν ᾠδὴν Ἰσως Μαρίας τῆς ἀδελφῆς Μωϋσέως, · "Αἰσωμεν τῷ Κυρίῳ · ἢ τὸν λγ' ψαλμόν, ἢ καὶ μέρος τούτου, Προσέλθετε πρὸς αὐτὸν, καὶ φωτίσθητε." PG III, 413.

588 S. Dionysii Areopagitæ, De eccles. hierarch. III, II: "Ὁ μὲν ἱεράρχης [...] ἀναλύσας δὲ πάλιν ἐπὶ τὸ θεῖον θυσιαστήριον, ἀπάρχεται τῆς ἱεράς τῶν ψαλμῶν μελωδίας, συναδούσης αὐτῷ τὴν ψαλμικὴν ἱερολογίαν ἀπάσης τῆς ἐκκλησιαστικῆς διακοσμήσεως. Ἐξῆς δὲ διὰ τῶν λειτουργῶν ἢ τῶν

The structure of the manner of presentation is simple. The purpose of the singing, familiar from the treatise of Athanasius, is to bring the believers into a state of harmony and concord. Thus, penitents, energumens, and catechumens are also allowed to listen to it, as well as to the reading. Ecclesiastical singing is considered to reflect the celestial hymns which have been revealed to mankind by prophets and saints – in fact, by the seraphim, expressed in Isaiah 6:3. In the angelic hierarchy, seraphim form the highest category; according to one interpretation, the celestial hierarchies consist of choirs of angels, and the writings of Dionysius would thus describe 'a singing system'. Although the theory of such a system is not watertight, it offers an explanation as to why it is the bishop who acts as the singer: as the heavenly singing is led by the highest angels, so the leader of ecclesiastical singing has to be the highest in the hierarchy of the Church. Further conclusions on the liturgical particulars are, however, not to be drawn.<sup>589</sup>

#### 4.2.5 Singers in the Justinian legislation

Emperor Justinian I revised the Code of Theodosius and published it in 529. Thus, the fundamental legislation concerning the Church and its officials remained the same. The main body of the Justinian laws (*Codex Justinianus*) does not touch upon our topic; however, singers are mentioned in the collection of new laws (*Novellae*).<sup>590</sup>

---

ἁγιογράφων δέλτων ἀνάγνωσις ἀκολούθως γίνεται · [...]." PG III, 425.

589 For the interpretation of Andrew Louth, see af Hällström 2006, 267-273.

590 The collections of the Roman legislation during the reign of Emperor Justinian (527-565) later became the title *Corpus Iuris Civilis*. The collections *Digesta*, or *Pandektai*, and *Institutiones* were published in 533, and *Codex Iustinianus* in 534. The fourth collection (*Novellae*) includes laws which were given by Justinian after the *Codex*, while the collection itself was compiled after his death. Kaser 1968, 5; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 915-916; AKK 2000, 111-112.

First, singers appear in the regulation concerning the number of clerics to be allowed in churches. The number was laid down at the time of the building of each church, but thereafter it tended to increase. This caused severe economic problems, which could even lead to the indebtedness of the church. Evidently, to avoid such problems, the imperial decree concerning the clergy of the basilica of Sancta Sophia and the three churches annexed to it was promulgated. The numbers of all ranks were: sixty presbyters, one hundred deacons, forty deaconesses, ninety subdeacons, one hundred and ten readers, and twenty-five singers. The number of doorkeepers was one hundred, but they were not classed among the clerics.<sup>591</sup>

The difference between the number of the readers and the number of the singers is significant. This has been explained by the extent of their respective duties: beside texts, the readers would also have read the acclamations. Thus, the main responsibility of the singers would have been the singing of the hymns.<sup>592</sup>

---

591 Novella III, 1, 1, CIC III, 21. At the time the legislation was enacted, the actual number was higher. However, none of the ordained clerics was to be removed, but new ordinations were forbidden until the number corresponded with that already prescribed. Regarding the observance of the decree, in the following century the number of ecclesiastics is known to have grown uncontrolledly and had to be 'reduced' to 80 priests, 150 deacons, 40 deaconesses, 70 subdeacons, 160 readers, and 25 singers – the number of all other ranks, except that of deaconesses and singers, having increased from that laid down in the original statute. Wellesz 1961, 165. The question of the number of clerics was also treated in another decree ordering that in the event of the death of a presbyter, deacon, reader, or singer, the deceased was not to be replaced before an examination of the total number of the clergy. If it exceeded the number which was prescribed for the church, new ordinations were not to be made. Where the number of clerics of the order of the deceased was insufficient but the corresponding number in a nearby church was excessive, the replacement could be transferred from there. Novella XVI, 1, CIC III, 116.

592 Milasch 1905, 427-428; Wellesz 1961, 113; Seppälä 1999, 264, referring to Τρεμπέλα 1961, 128. In the 6<sup>th</sup> century, the Byzantine hymnography became enriched with the hymns (*kontakia*) of deacon Romanus Melodus who, according to tradition, received the gift of hymnody by a miracle. Wellesz 1961, 157, 179-184; Velimirović 1990, 36; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 1411; Kessler 2004, 32; Seppälä 2012, 115-116.

Singers are omitted in the statute which defines the minimum ages for different ranks; there, readers are required to have reached the age of eighteen.<sup>593</sup> Neither does the decree on the matter of mundane entertainments, repeating the corresponding canons of the Synod of Laodicea and the Apostolic Canons, mention singers: it forbids bishops, presbyters, deacons, subdeacons, readers, and "all other ecclesiastics, no matter of what holy association or order they may be members", to gamble or to watch the games.<sup>594</sup>

Although wealthy persons were initially only reluctantly received into the clergy, clerics were not necessarily indigent or doomed to poverty. Presbyters, deacons, subdeacons, singers, and readers, "all of whom we call clerics", were allowed to administer their property independently. The order set clerics on an equality with soldiers, who had a corresponding right (*castrense peculium*). The right entitled them e.g. to donate or to bequeath their property as they wished.<sup>595</sup>

---

593 Novella CXXIII, 13, CIC III, 604. A bishop or a presbyter was to be thirty-five years old, a deacon or a subdeacon twenty-five, and a deaconess forty. The 23<sup>rd</sup> canon of patriarch Epiphanius set the minimum age limit for a presbyter at thirty years, and for a deacon, at twenty-five. Riedel 1900, 292. Canon XI of the synod of Neocæsarea ca. 319 had also set the minimum age for a presbyter at thirty years. Joannou 1962a, 80, NPNF 2-14, 84.

594 If someone was caught in such behaviour, he was separated for three years, and sent to a monastery. The quoted section is translated by S. P. Scott, who also has published a translation from the Latin text of the canon, the section reading, "and all other members of any religious organization, who have been regularly appointed, [...]". Scott XII, 35. Novella CXXIII, X, 1. "Ἀπαγορεύομεν δὲ τοῖς ὀσιωτάτοις ἐπισκόποις καὶ πρεσβυτέροις καὶ διακόνοις καὶ ὑποδιακόνοις καὶ ἀναγνώσταις καὶ παντὶ ἄλλῳ οἰουδήποτε εὐαγοῦς τάγματος ἢ σχήματος καθεστῶτι ταβλίζειν ἢ τῶν τὰ τοιαῦτα παιζόντων κοινωνοῦς ἢ θεωρητὰς γίνεσθαι ἢ εἰς οἰανδήποτε θέαν τοῦ θεωρῆσαι χάριν παραγίνεσθαι. Εἰ δὲ τις ἐξ αὐτῶν τοῦτο ἀμάρτοι, κελεύομεν τούτον ἐπὶ τρεῖς ἐνιαυτοὺς ἀπὸ πάσης εὐαγοῦς ὑπηρεσίας κωλύεσθαι καὶ μοναστηρίῳ ἐμβάλλεσθαι. [...]" CIC III, 602-603. Cf. AC VIII, 47, 42-43, p. 123 above.

595 Novella CXXIII, XIX. "Τοὺς δὲ πρεσβυτέρους καὶ διακόνους καὶ ὑποδιακόνους καὶ ἀναγνώστους καὶ ψάλτας, οὓς πάντας κληρικοὺς καλοῦμεν, τὰ πράγματα τὰ ἀφ' οἰουδήποτε τρόπου εἰς τὴν αὐτῶν δεσποτείαν περιελθόντα ἔχειν ὑπὸ τὴν ἰδίαν ἐξουσίαν προστάττομεν καθ' ὁμοιότητα τῶν *castrensiῶν peculiorum*, καὶ δωρεῖσθαι κατὰ τοὺς νόμους καὶ ἐπ' αὐτοῖς διατίθεσθαι, εἰ καὶ ὑπὸ τὴν τῶν γονέων εἰσὶν ἐξουσίαν, οὕτω μέντοιγε ὥστε τοὺς τούτων παῖδας ἢ τούτων μὴ ὑπόντων τοὺς γονεῖς αὐτῶν τὸ νόμιμον μέρος κομίζεσθαι." CIC III, 608-609.

That singers are mentioned in some sections but not in others, is no coincidence. Between singers and readers, there is an essential difference, which appears in the decrees concerning the clerical marriages. Although readers and singers are mentioned as the only ones allowed to marry after entering the clergy, further regulations on the matter only concern readers. They state that if a reader were to remarry, or if he were to marry a widow, a divorcée, or a woman otherwise unsuitable, he would not advance to higher orders.<sup>596</sup> In the case of the singers, such a marriage would not have been acceptable either, but the rank of the singer was not one of the ecclesiastical grades from which one could advance to the higher ranks, according to the principle laid down by the Synod of Sardica in 343.<sup>597</sup> Thus, singers remained a class of their own.

## **4.3 Western sources**

### **4.3.1 Minor sixth-century references to nomenclature and status**

The contribution of the western sources of the sixth century appears rather meagre. First, there was no imperial law connected with the Church, as the earlier Roman provinces had eventually turned into kingdoms of heathen or heretic tribes.<sup>598</sup> Second, we only encounter readers, apart from two exceptions. The first of these is the inscription to Andreas, who is called the leader of the

---

596 Novella XXII, XLII, CIC III, 176; CXXIII, XIV, 2, CIC III, 605. Concerning clerical marriages, the Christian Church observed the regulations deriving from the Old Testament, given in Lev 21.

597 See p. 94 above.

598 The kingdoms of the Visigoths, Burgundians, and Ostrogoths each had their own legislation, none of which has any bearing on our topic. Kaser 1968, 4-5; Sparksman 1980, 88ff.

singers (*princeps cantorum*<sup>599</sup>). He had served at the church of Mertilla, situated within the boundaries of modern Portugal, and had died at the age of thirty-six in 525.<sup>600</sup> Unfortunately, this is all what we know for sure.<sup>601</sup> The other exception introduces the bishop Nicetius of Lyon, who is remembered as a conductor of singing. The wording of the inscription implies that he instructed the singers in the rule of the psalmody, and was the first to arrange the choir to sing alternately in his church.<sup>602</sup>

The canonical sources of the time mention that readers were entrusted with the psalmody. The Council of Vaison in 529 orders that young readers receive an education consisting of psalmody, Scriptures, and the divine law, as well as spiritual guidance from the presbyters, who also accommodated them.<sup>603</sup>

The young readers would have been children who had been dedicated to the Church by their parents; orders about them were also given by the Second Council of Toledo in 531.<sup>604</sup> Such children were to join the rank of the reader

---

599 The title derives from the *Vulgata*, I Chron 9:33: "Hi sunt cantores, principes per familias Levitarum, qui in exedris vacantes morabantur, it ut die et nocte iugiter suo ministerio deservirent." *Nova Vulgata, Liber I Paralipomenon*. ILCV I, 1300, 250.

600 Andreas, princeps cantorum: "Andreas, famulu dei, princeps cantorum sacrosancte aeclisiae Mertilliane, uixit annos XXXVI, requieuit in pace sub. d. terteo kal. Apriles aera ΔLX trisis." ILCV I, 1300, 250. The year in the inscription text is indicated with the expression of "era 563". Kaufmann 1917, 273, calls the setting of the date a 'provincial dating'. ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 486, 1567; Kelly 1986, 52-54; Page 2010, 234.

601 Page 2010, 249, makes a suggestion that singers there would have been organized into a sort of college, and not only in Mértola but also in Naples and, perhaps, also in Rome.

602 Nicetius, lines 11-12: "psallere praecepit normamque tenere canendi / primus et alterutrum [alternum] tendere voce chorum." Nicetius died probably in 573. Le Blant I, 25, 57-60.

603 Concilium Vasense secundum, 1. "I. *De presbyterorum observatione*. Hoc placuit, ut omnes presbyteri qui sunt in parochiis constituti, secundum consuetudinem quam per totam Italiam satis salubriter teneri cognovimus, juniores lectores quantoscunque sine uxore habuerint, secum in domum ubi ipsi habitare videntur recipiant, et eos quomodo boni patres spiritualiter nutrientes psalmos parare, divinis lectionibus insistere et in lege Domini erudire contendant ut et sibi dignos successores provideant et a Domino prœmia æterna recipiant. [...]" PL LXXXIV, 261B-C. The council also granted readers come of age the right to marry. SC 353 states the Council of Vaison in 529 not as the second, but the first.

604 In some sources, the year of the Council is erroneously given as 527. Orlandis/

immediately after being tonsured.<sup>605</sup> The bishop himself was responsible for their training, which was given in a kind of boarding school, in "the house of the church". After turning eighteen, readers were asked if they had the intention to marry. Those who did not could be promoted to the subdeaconate at the age of twenty, and to the diaconate a quinquennium later. Those who entered upon matrimony had no access to the higher orders.<sup>606</sup>

The choice regarding the intention to marry was the first decisive factor in a reader's ecclesiastical career; the character of his spouse was the second. The Council of Tarragona in 516 had ordered that if the wife of a reader, or of a doorkeeper, was found to be adulterous, her husband was to leave her or to be

---

Ramos-Lisson 1981, 61.

605 The tradition of the clerical tonsure is considered to derive from the fourth century, when it was adopted from eastern monastics, which in turn derived from the ancient custom of cutting the hair of slaves. Riley 1967, 110; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 1631-1632. In the civil legislation, clerics are referred to as tonsured (*coronati*) in 407. CT XVI, 2, 38, Pharr 1952, 447. We shall return to the matter of the tonsure below.

606 Concilium Toletanum II, I. "*De his quos parentes ab infantia clericatus officio manciparunt, si postea voluntatem habent nubendi.* De his quos voluntas parentum a primis infantiae annis clericatus officio mancipavit hoc statuimus observandum : ut mox detonsi vel ministerio electorum [In another manuscript: lectorum.] cum traditi fuerint in domo ecclesiae sub episcopali praesentia a praeposito sibi debeant erudiri; at ubi octavum decimum aetatis suae compleverint annum, coram totius cleri plebisque conspectu voluntas eorum de expetendo conjugio ab episcopo perscrutetur, quibus si gratia castitatis Deo inspirante placuerit et professionem castimoniae suae absque conjugali necessitate se sponderint servaturos, hi tanquam appetitores aretissime vitae lenissimo Domini jugo subdantur, ac primum subdiaconatus ministerium habita probatione professionis suae a vicesimo anno suscipiant ; quod si inculpabiliter ac inoffense vicesimum et quintum annum aetatis suae peregerint, ad diaconatus officium, si scienter implere posse ab episcopo comprobantur, promoveri. Cavendum tamen est his, ne quando suae sponsionis immemores ad terrenas nuptias aut ad furtivos concubitus ultra recurrant ; quod si forte fecerint, ut sacrilegii rei damnentur, et ab Ecclesia habeantur extranei : his autem quibus voluntas propria interrogationis tempore desiderium nubendi persuaserit, concessam ab apostolis sententiam auferre non possumus, ita ut cum propectae aetatis in conjugio positi renuntiuros se pari consensu operibus carnis sponderint, ad sacros gradus aspirent." PL LXXXIV, 335B-C. Here, we encounter the celibacy statute attributed to the Synod of Elvira ca. 306, concerning the clerics who serve at the altar: bishops, presbyters, and deacons. Subdeacons belonged to the same group because they were on their way to the diaconate. Elvira XXX and XXXIII, Hefele 1873, 167-169. ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 542.

expelled from the clergy.<sup>607</sup> Further, in the decree issued by the Second Council of Braga in 572, a reader who married a widow, or remarried, had no possibility of advancement in the hierarchy. He could be appointed a subdeacon, but only out of necessity.<sup>608</sup> Concerning the appointment of readers, the Council stated,

*A reader shall not mount the platform.*

It is not permissible to sing or to read on the platform except for those who are ordained readers by a presbyter.<sup>609</sup>

Apart from the apocryphal canon of Nicaea presented by Gelazius of Cyzicus above, this is the only instance where a reader is mentioned to have been appointed by anyone other than the bishop.

Readers seem to have tried to create an impression with their outward appearance. This is implied by several regulations specifying the kind of tonsure and clothing of the reader.<sup>610</sup> The First Council of Braga in 561 states that "the

---

607 Concilium Tarraconense, IX. "IX. *De clericis et ostiariis qui adulteris mulieribus admiscentur, ut a clero projiciantur.* Si quis lectorum adulteræ mulieri voluerit misceri vel adhærere consortio, aut relinquat adulteram, aut a clero habeatur extraneus : similis sententia ostiariorum manebit scholam." PL LXXXIV, 312C. The alternatives had already been set by the Synod of Neocaesarea ca. 319, which first refused clerical status to a layman living with an adulteress. If the adultery of the wife became evident after his appointment, he had to leave either her or the clergy. Neoc. VIII, Joannou 1962a, 78-79.

608 Concilium Bracarense II, XLIII. "*Si lector alterius viduam duxerit.* Lector si viduam alterius uxorem acceperit, in lectoratu permaneat, aut si forte necessitas sit, subdiaconus fiat, nihil autem supra : similiter et si bigamus fuerit." PL 84, 581B. Also in the imperial legislation of the East, a reader's second marriage, or marrying against decency – e.g. a widow or a divorced woman – barred his promotion to a higher order. If such a reader had already been promoted, he was reduced to his former rank. *Novella* CXXIII, 14, 2. The 8<sup>th</sup> canon of Epiphanius also treated the same matter, with the caution that a third marriage would cause separation from Communion. Riedel 1900, 290.

609 Concilium Bracarense II, XLV. XLV. "*Ut non ascendat in pulpitem lector.* Non liceat in pulpito psallere aut legere, nisi qui a presbytero [Some manuscripts read: *episcopo.*] lectores sunt ordinati." PL LXXXIV, 581B.

610 The dressing of the hair and shaving of the beard had been forbidden all clerics already in the SEA 25: "Clericus nec comam nutriat nec barbam radat." Munier 1960, 84; Conc. Carthag. IV, XLIV, PL CXXX, 346B.

readers in the church shall not sing adorned with mundane clothing, nor shall they let their hair hang free in the heathen manner."<sup>611</sup>

The heathen manner of the hair was to keep it long: this symbolized power and freedom.<sup>612</sup> Evidently, the order was not observed, as the Second Council of Braga in 572 defined it further, requiring a shaven head and bare ears.<sup>613</sup> Moreover, in 633, the Fourth Council of Toledo reproached readers with hair shorn like that of laymen and, even worse, of heretics.<sup>614</sup> From the Council onwards, there was to be one tonsure and one mode of attire for all; anyone differing from there would be considered a law-breaker.<sup>615</sup>

The Fourth Council of Toledo was presided over by Isidore of Seville, whose treatise on ecclesiastical offices includes an explanation of the origin and the model of the tonsure.<sup>616</sup> Isidore connects the provenance of the tonsure with the ancient Jewish Nazirites. These had dedicated themselves to God by voluntary vows, either for their lifetime or for a term. One example of the latter was to abstain from cutting the hair. After the term had expired, or if the purity of the

---

611 Concilium Bracarense I, XI. "*De lectoribus ecclesiae*. Item placuit, ut lectores in ecclesia habitu sæculari ornati non psallant, neque granos gentili ritu dimittant." PL LXXXIV, 566D.

612 Corbin 1960, 162.

613 Concilium Bracarense II, LXVI. "*De attendenda coma clericorum vel habitu ordinato*. Non oportet clericos comam nutrire et sic ministrare, sed attonso capite, patentibus auribus, et secundum Aaron talem vestem induere, ut sint in habitu ordinato." PL LXXXIV, 583C.

614 The term heretics probably refers to the Priscillianists. Orlandis/Ramos-Lisson 1981, 160. For the councils of Braga and Toledo, see also Page 2010, 266-267.

615 Concilium Toletanum IV, XLI. "*De qualitate tonsuræ a cunctis clericis vel lectoribus habenda*. Omnes clerici vel lectores sicut levitæ et sacerdotes, detonso superius toto capite, inferius solam circuli coronam relinquunt, non sicut hucusque in Gallæciæ partibus facere lectores videntur, qui prolixis ut laici comis in solo capitis apice modicum circum tondunt, ritus enim iste in Hispaniis hæreticorum fuit; unde oportet ut pro amputando Ecclesiæ scandalo hoc signum dedecoris auferatur, et una sit tonsura vel habitus sicut totius Hispaniæ est usus. Qui autem hoc non custodierit fidei catholici reus erit." PL LXXXIV, 377B. OKK 1980, 362, states that this would be the first western allusion to the clerical haircut.

616 Isidore of Seville (ca.560-636) is considered the last of the Latin Church Fathers. He is also the most important encyclopedist of the early Middle Ages with his *Etymologiae* (Origines), comprising twenty books. ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 851-852, 1122.

Nazirite had become defiled, the head was to be shaven and the hair burnt in the Temple, with specific offerings for purification.<sup>617</sup>

On the one hand, the shaven head indicated purity. On the other, Isidore explains the long hair of the Nazirites – as well as the trimmed hair of the Levitical priests – as symbolizing the veil which covered the hearts of the Israelites at the time of the Old Covenant. Now that the veil had been removed by the Gospel, the servants of the Christian Church were to wear a tonsure consisting of a shorn scalp with a lower crown, indicating the priesthood and the authority of the Church.<sup>618</sup>

---

617 The Nazirite law: Numeri 6. Cf. Ezekiel 44:20; Acts 21, 23-26. The tradition of the Nazirites in Judaism had disappeared by the Middle Ages. Milgrom and Rothkoff 1978, 907-910; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 1134.

618 Isidorus Hispalensis, *De ecclesiasticis officiis* II, III. "De tonsura. (1) Tonsurae ecclesiasticae usu a Nazareis, nisi fallor, exortus est qui, prius crine seruato, denuo post uitam magnae continentiae deuotione completa caput radebant et capillos in igne sacrificii ponere iubebantur, scilicet ut perfectionem deuotionis suae domino consecrarent. Horum ergo exemplis usus ab apostolis introductus est, ut hii qui in diuinis cultibus mancipati domino consecrantur quasi Nazarei, id est sancti dei, crine praeciso innouentur. [...] (4) Quod uero, detonso superius capite, inferius circuli corona relinquitur, sacerdotium regnumque ecclesiae in eis existimo figurari. Thiara enim apud ueteres constituebatur in capite sacerdotum (haec ex bysso confecta rotunda erat quasi sfera media), et hoc significatur in parte capitis tona ; corona autem latitudo aurea est circuli, quae regum capita cingit. Vtrumque itaque signum exprimitur in capite clericorum ut impleatur etiam corporali quadam similitudine quod scriptum est Petro apostolo perdocente: *Vos estis genus electum regale sacerdotium*. (5) Quaeritur autem: cur sicut apud antiquos Nazareos non ante coma nutritur et sic tonditur. Sed qui haec exquirunt aduertant quid sit inter illud propheticum uelamentum et hanc euangelii reuelationem de qua dicit apostolus: *Cum transieris ad Christum auferetur uelamen*. Quod autem significabat uelamen interpositum inter faciem Moysi et aspectum populi Israhel, hoc significabat illis temporibus etiam coma sanctorum. Nam et apostolus comam pro uelamento esse dicit. Proinde iam non oportet ut uelentur crinibus capita eorum qui domino consecrantur sed tantum ut reuelentur, quia quod erat occultum in sacramento prophetiae iam in euangelio declaratum est." CCSL CXIII, 55-56. Until the 9<sup>th</sup> century, there were three different types of tonsure, which were also named: the tonsure of St. Peter left a ring of hair to encircle the shaven head. The tonsure of St. Paul cut the hair "close", and the tonsure of St. John consisted of the shaven front of the head with long hair growing from the back of the head. Shaving a circle on the crown of the head eventually became the universal model. Riley 1967, 110.

The Hispanic councils also treated the principles of ecclesiastical singing. The First Council of Braga stated that a uniform psalmody was to be followed at matins and vespers everywhere in the diocese, not only in the churches but also privately. However, monastic practices were not to be mixed with ecclesiastical forms.<sup>619</sup>

At the monasteries, the celebration of the liturgical hours included an elaborated psalmody. The monastics read the Psalter constantly, eventually learning it by heart. They were also able to exercise other kinds of psalmody than the responsorial which was generally used in the parochial churches. Among the laity, the ability to read was still rare, and books were expensive. Thus, ordinary people could only participate in psalm responses which were easily learned by heart. Had the ecclesiastical service followed monastic forms, it would have left the lay congregation wholly outside.<sup>620</sup>

The Council also repeated the fourth-century restriction that in the church, only biblical psalms were allowed. The canon adds that "nothing composed in the poetic art shall be sung in the church, as the holy canons admonish."<sup>621</sup> The Fourth Council of Toledo took another view. On the regular use of several non-biblical hymns and the composition of liturgical elements, it saw no reason for

---

619 Concilium Bracarense I, I. "*De uno ordine psallendi*. Placuit omnibus communi consensu ut unus atque idem psallendi ordo in matutinis vel vespertinis officiis teneatur, et non diverse ac private, neque monasteriorum consuetudines cum ecclesiastica regula sint permixtæ." PL LXXXIV, 565D-566A. Cf. Page 2010, 238-239.

620 The antiphonal type of psalmody flourished in the monasteries, and direct psalmody caused no problems either. As to the question of how wide knowledge of the Psalms was among the ordinary people, Corbin 1960, 119 notes that Caesarius of Arles (ca. 470-542) ordered the laity to learn Psalms 50 and 90, and in exceptional cases Psalm 103. In the *Regula ad monachos* of Caesarius, the psalmody of the hours is rich both in the form and number of psalms sung. PL LXVII, 1097-1104.

621 Concilium Bracarense I, XII. "*De canonicis Scripturis*. Item placuit, ut extra psalmos vel canonicarum Scripturarum Novi et Veteris Testamenti nihil poetice compositum in ecclesia psallatur, sicut et sancti præcipiunt canones." PL LXXXIV, 566D-567A. Cf. Concilium Bracarense II, LXVII, PL LXXXIV, 583D.

prohibition. On the contrary, persons rejecting hymns were to be excommunicated.<sup>622</sup>

#### 4.3.2 Reader and singer in the works of Isidore of Seville

Above, a reference was made to the treatise on the ecclesiastical offices by Isidore of Seville, in connection with the tonsure. The main subject of the work

---

622 Concilium Toletanum IV, XIII. "*De hymnorum cantu non renuendo*. De hymnis etiam canendis et Salvatoris et apostolorum habemus exemplum, nam et ipse Dominus hymnum dixisse perhibetur, Matthæo evangelista testante : *Et, hymno dicto, exierunt in montem Oliveti* : et Paulus apostolus ad Ephesios scripsit dicens : *Implemini Spiritu loquentes vos in psalmis et hymnis et canticis spiritualibus*. Et quia nonnulli hymni humano studio in laudem Dei atque apostolorum et martyrum triumphos compositi esse noscuntur, sicut hi quod beatissimis doctores Hilarius atque Ambrosius ediderunt, quos tamen quidam specialiter reprobant pro eo quod de Scripturis sanctorum canonum vel apostolica traditione non existunt ; respuant ergo et illum hymnum ab hominibus compositum, quem quotidie publice privatoque officio in fine psalmodum dicimus : *Gloria et honor Patri et Filio et Spiritui sancto in sæcula sæculorum. Amen*. Nam et ille hymnus carmen nato in carne Christo angeli cecinerunt: *Gloria in excelsis Deo, et in terra pax bonæ voluntatis* : et reliqua quæ ibi sequuntur ecclesiastici doctores composuerunt. Ergo nec idem in ecclesiis canendus est quia in sanctarum Scripturarum libris non est? Componuntur ergo hymni, sicut componuntur missæ sive preces vel orationes sive commendationes seu manus impositiones, ex quibus si nulla dicantur in ecclesia, vacant officia omnia ecclesiastica. Admonet hæc fieri atque hortatur Timotheum Apostolus dicens: *Obsecro igitur primo omnium fieri obsecrationes, orationes, postulationes, gratiarum actiones pro omnibus hominibus, pro regibus et pro omnibus qui in sublimitate sunt*. Sicut igitur orationes ita et hymnos in laudem Dei compositos nullus nostrum ulterius improbet, sed pari modo Gallia Hispaniaque celebret: excommunicationi plectandi qui hymnos rejicere fuerint ausi." PL LXXXIV, 370D-371B. The Council ordered the regular singing of the Hymn of the Three Men in the Fire (Dan 3:52-90 in LXX and *Vulgata*; the hymn is missing from the Hebrew Bible). Concilium Toletanum IV, XIV. "*De hymno trium puerorum in cunctis missarum solemnibus decantando*. Hymnum quoque trium puerorum, in quo universa cæli terræque creatura Deum collaudat et quem Ecclesia catholica per totum orbem diffusa celebrat, quidam sacerdotes in missa dominicorum dierum et in solemnitatibus martyrum canere negligunt : proinde hoc sanctum concilium instituit, ut per omnes ecclesias Hispaniæ vel Galliæ in omnium missarum solemnitate idem hymnus in pulpito decantetur : communionem amissuri qui et antiquam hujus hymni consuetudinem nostramque definitionem excesserint." PL LXXXIV, 371C.

is the provenance and the content of the ecclesiastical orders, comprising bishops, rural bishops, presbyters, deacons, *custodii sacrarium*<sup>623</sup>, subdeacons, readers, singers (*psalmistae*), exorcists, and doorkeepers.<sup>624</sup> The general requirements for all clerics include that they shall constantly study the holy scriptures, including psalms, hymns, and canticles.<sup>625</sup> Thus, every ecclesiastic became familiar with them.

On the particulars concerning readers and singers, we encounter readers, who are first mentioned in connection with country bishops (*chorepiscopi*). The latter are now defined as locum tenentes of the bishops proper, with the right to appoint readers, subdeacons, and exorcists independently; for the ordination of presbyters and deacons they needed the consent of the bishop of the region.<sup>626</sup>

The readers are stated as succeeding to the prophets.<sup>627</sup> They must be trained to be able to distinguish and express the structure of sentences and the sentiment of

---

623 The guards of the sanctuary were deacons who were over fifty years old. Isidorus Hispalensis, *De eccl. off.* II, VIII.

624 Isidore's *De ecclesiasticis officiis* is divided into two books, of which the latter treats the origin of the ecclesiastical ministries. The text of Isidore partly follows the works of Pseudo-Jerome and Ambrose, and has the same title. It also includes features which have been considered in the preceding chapters, which are not repeated here unless they are of particular relevance. The treatise includes a chapter on each ecclesiastical rank, and on monks, penitents, virgins, widows, married people, catechumens and *competentes*, who formed the second rank after catechumens.

625 Isidorus Hispalensis, *De ecclesiasticis officiis* II, II. "*De regulis clericorum.* (3) [...] Postremo in doctrina, in lectionibus, psalmis, hymnis, canticis exercitio iugi incumbant. Tales enim esse debent quique diuinis cultibus sese mancipandos student, scilicet ut dum scientiae operam dant doctrinae gratiam populis administrent." CCSL CXIII, 54

626 Isidorus Hispalensis, *De eccl. off.* II, VI. "De corepiscopis. Corepiscopi, id est uicarii episcoporum, iuxta quod canones ipsi testantur, instituti sunt ad exemplum septuaginta seniorum tamquam consacerdotes propter sollicitudinem pauperum. Hii in uicis et uillis constituti gubernant sibi commissas ecclesias, habentes licentiam constituere lectores, subdiaconos, exorcistas. Presbiteros autem aut diaconos ordinare non audent praeter conscientiam episcopi in cuius regione praeesse noscuntur. Hii autem a solo episcopo ciuitatis cuius adiacent ordinantur." CCSL CXIII, 64. The text repeats the 10<sup>th</sup> canon of Antioch; see p. 94 above. In the edition of Migne, Isidore's list also has acolytes, who are not mentioned anywhere else in his text. PL LXXXIII, 786D-787A.

627 See pp. 120-121 above.

their contents, "now declaring, now lamenting, now rebuking, now exhorting". Furthermore, they shall master the proper prosody. Isidore warns about inexperienced readers who, not acknowledging their own failings, tend to criticize their betters. As to the qualities of the voice, Isidore repeats Ambrose.<sup>628</sup> He adds that readers have always taken special care of their voice to make it carry over noise: "Therefore, they were earlier called criers (*praecones*), or bawlers."<sup>629</sup>

The singers (*psalmistae*<sup>630</sup>) are stated to possess great progenitors in David and Asaph, whose sons succeeded him as Temple singers; singing was assumed by the Church to excite, in the minds of the listeners, affection towards God. Thus, the requirements for the singer presuppose excellence both vocally and in performance, both of which features Isidore quotes from Ambrose. The singing

---

628 See p. 151 above.

629 Isidorus Hispalensis, *De eccl. off.* II, XI, 1, 2, 4, 5. "De lectoribus. (1) Lectorum ordo formam et initium a prophetis accepit. Sunt igitur lectores qui uerbum dei praedicant, quibus dicitur: *Clama, ne cesses, quasi tuba exalta uocem tuam*. Isti quippe dum ordinantur, primum de eorum conuersatione episcopus uerbum facit ad populum, deinde coram plebe tradit ei codicem apicum diuinorum ad dei uerbum adnuntiandum. (2) Qui autem ad huiusmodi promouetur gradum, iste erit doctrina et libris inbutus, sensuumque ac uerborum scientia perornatus, ita ut in distinctionibus sententiarum intellegat ubi finiatur iunctura, ubi adhuc pendeat oratio, ubi sententia extrema claudatur. Sicque expeditus, uim pronuntiationis tenebit, ut ad intellectum mentes omnium sensusque permoueat, discernendo genera pronuntiationum atque exprimendo proprios sententiarum affectus, modo indicantis uoce, modo dolentis, modo increpantis, modo exortantis, siue his similia, secundum genera propriae pronuntiationis. (4) [...] Praeterea et accentuum uim oportet lectorem scire ut nouerit in qua sillaba uox protendatur pronuntiantis. Plerumque enim inperiti lectores in uerborum accentibus errant, et solent inuidere nos inperitiae hii qui uidentur habere notitiam, detrahentes et iurantes penitus nescire quod dicimus. (5) Porro uox lectoris simplex erit et clara et ad omne pronuntiationis genus accommodata, plena suco uirili, agrestem et subrusticum effugiens sonum, non humilis nec adeo sublimis, non fracta uel tenera nihilque femineum sonans, neque cum motu corporis sed tantum cum grauitatis specie. Auribus enim et cordi consulere debet lector, non oculis, ne potius ex se ipso spectatores magis quam auditores faciat. Vetus opinio est lectores pronuntiandi causa praecipuam curam uocis habuisse ut exaudiri in tumultum possent. Vnde et dudum lectores praecones vel proclamatores uocabantur." CCSL CXIII, 70-71.

630 Corbin 1960, 180, remarks that the title of psalmist follows the Gallican practice where the role of the singer was more significant than at Rome. Cf. fn. 563 above.

shall demonstrate "a Christian simplicity in its modulation" to increase the compunction of the listeners.<sup>631</sup>

Finally, Isidore mentions that for "this office are usually chosen such who are considered competent in the art of singing". The choice could be made without the bishop being aware of it, by the decision of a presbyter alone.<sup>632</sup> We recall that the country bishop was entitled to appoint subdeacons, readers, and exorcists. Singers, who in the treatise of Isidore were placed between the two latter, were absent from the list; the reason for this can be seen in this item where the position of the singer resembles that in the *Statuta Ecclesiae Antiqua*.<sup>633</sup>

During the act of appointment, clerics are given symbols of their duty: the reader receives a book from the bishop, the subdeacon a paten and a chalice from the bishop, and a goblet and a towel for hand washing from the archdeacon. Even the exorcist receives a book which includes the formulae for

---

631 Isidore also mentions the customs of the ancient singers; to abstain from eating before singing, except to consume "yellowish green vegetables", probably beans, the purpose of which was to dull the senses. Another practical aid to the singers was setting plates on their hearts, probably rather on the diaphragm, to support *fortissimo*. Sparksman 1980, 125, 156; Knoebel 2008, 83.

632 Isidorus Hispalensis, De eccl. off. II, XII. "De psalmistis. (1) Psalmistarum, id est, cantorum principes, uel auctores, Dauid siue Asaph extiterunt. Isti enim post Moysen psalmos primi conposuerunt et cantauerunt. Mortuo autem Asaph filii eius in hunc ordinem subrogati sunt a Dauid, erantque psalmistae per successionem generis sicut et ordo sacerdotalis, ipsique soli continuis diebus in templo canebant candidis induti stolis, ad uocem unius respondere choro. (2) Ex hoc ueteri more ecclesia sumpsit exemplum nutriendi psalmistas quorum cantibus ad affectum dei mentes audientium excitentur. Psalmistam autem et uoce et arte praeclarum inlustremque esse oportet, ita ut oblectamento dulcedinis animos incitet auditorum. Vox autem eius non aspera uel rauca uel dissona, sed canora erit, suavis, liquida atque acuta, habens sonum, et melodiam sanctae religionis congruentem, non quae tragicam exclamet arte sed quae Christianam simplicitatem in ipsa modulatione demonstret, neque quae musico gestu uel theatri arte redoleat sed quae compunctionem magis audientibus faciat. (3) Antiqui, pridie quam cantandum erat, cibis abstinebant. Pallentia tamen legumina causa uocis assidue utebantur ; unde et cantores apud gentiles fabarii dicti sunt. Veteres, lammina pectori inposita, sub ea cantica exclamantes alendis uocibus rationem demonstrauerunt. Solent autem ad hoc officium, etiam absque scientia episcopi, sola iussione presbyteri elegi, quique in cantandi arte probabiles esse constiterint." CCSL CXIII, 71-72.

633 Cf. pp. 161-162 above.

the various exorcisms.<sup>634</sup> The singer alone receives nothing. It has been assumed by way of explanation, that "the antiphony, the instrument of this office, had not yet come into use".<sup>635</sup> I do not agree with this interpretation. If the singer had been considered worthy of something symbolic, something to give would have been found, since as far back as over two centuries earlier, the Synod of Laodicea required canonical singers to be able to sing from a book.

Isidore treats the subject of singing further in his etymological encyclopedia. There, in the chapter on daily offices, he defines the different forms of singing: both the arrangements of performers from solo and duo to a double choir, and the practices of antiphonal and responsorial singing. The difference between lessons and songs is clear: in the former, only speech is required, while the performance of psalms and hymns includes melody. Singers fall into three grades: *succentor*, *incentor*, and *accentor*.<sup>636</sup>

Further, all the ecclesiastical grades are explained: doorkeeper, singer (*psalmista*), reader, exorcist, acolyte, subdeacon, deacon, presbyter, bishop.<sup>637</sup>

634 Isidorus Hispalensis, De eccl. off. II, X, 2. "De subdiaconibus. [...] Hii igitur cum ordinantur, sicut sacerdotes et leuitae, manus inpositionem non suscipiunt, sed patenam tantum et calicem de manu episcopi, et ab archidiacono scyphum aquae cum aquamanile et manitergium. [...] XIII, 4. De exorcistis. [...] Hii enim cum ordinatur, sicut ait canon, accipiunt de manu episcopi libellum in quo scripti sunt exorcismi, accipientes potestatem inponendi manus super inerguminos siue caticuminos." CCSL CXIII, 69, 73.

635 Sparksman 1980, 158.

636 Isidorus Hispalensis, Etymologiarum Liber VI, XIX. De officiis. "9. Lectio dicitur, quia non cantatur, ut psalmus, vel hymnus, sed legitur tantum. Illic enim modulatio, hic sola pronuntiatio quaeritur. 10. Canticum est vox cantantis in laetitia. [...] 13. Tres autem gradus sunt in cantando : primus succentoris, secundus incentoris, tertius accentoris." PL LXXXII, 252B-253A. Likewise in *De ecclesiasticis officiis*, Isidore in the *Etymologiae* borrows from the writings of earlier authors like Jerome and Augustine.

637 Isidorus Hispalensis, Etymologiarum Liber VII, XII. *De clericis*. " 1. Cleros et clericos hinc appellatos (credimus) quia Matthias sorte electus est, quem primum per apostolos legimus ordinatum, κληρως enim Graece, *sors*, vel *haereditas* dicitur. 2. Propterea ergo dicti *clerici*, quod de *sorte* sunt Domini, vel quia Dominum partem habent. Generaliter autem clerici nuncupantur omnes qui in Ecclesia Christi deserviunt, quorum gradus et nomina haec sunt : 3. *Ostiarius*, <sup>h</sup>*psalmista*, *lector*, *exorcista*, *acolythus*, *subdiaconus*, *diaconus*, *presbyter* et *episcopus*. [...]" Nota <sup>h</sup>. "Psalmist., lect. Psalmista, sive lector, Rab., lib. 1, cap. 4. Non est autem psalmista

In the detailed analysis, readers and psalmists are defined as follows<sup>638</sup>:

24. *Readers* are thus called because of *reading*, *psalmists* because of *singing the psalms*; the former proclaim to the people what is coming next; the latter sing to arouse remorse in the minds of the listeners, and some readers may proclaim so pathetically that they induce affliction and wailing in the listeners. 25. They [the readers] are also called *reciters* because they furthermore *announce*, and their voice shall be so loud and clear that they may be heard as far away as possible. 26. He who models his voice in *singing*, is called *cantor*. The two genres of such a one are called in the musical art, as people erudite in Latin say, *praecentor* and *succentor*. 27. The *praecentor* is thus called because he *sings first*, the *succentor* because he *answers in succession*. 28. The *concentor* is thus called because he *sounds in harmony with the others*: if his voice does not agree with the others and he does not sing together with them, he is not a choir-singer.<sup>639</sup>

Of the three grades of singers – *succentor*, *incentor*, and *accentor* given by Isidore in another paragraph – only the *succentor* appears here. The *incentor* corresponds to the *praecentor*; why Isidore has laid down the latter as the second of the grades, is not clear. The use of the word *accentor* is unique, and it seems to mean the same as *succentor*. Meticulous examination of the titles does not enlighten us in the actual position of the singers, although they imply an established arrangement of ecclesiastical singing.<sup>640</sup> However, as Isidore defines

ordinis aut gradus proprium nomen." PL LXXXII, 290C-D.

638 The italics follow the Latin text.

639 Isidorus Hispalensis, *Etymologiarum Liber VII, XII. De clericis*. "24. *Lectores a legendo* ; PSALMISTÆ, a *psalmis* canendis vocati ; illi enim prædicant populis quid sequantur ; isti canunt ut excitent ad compunctionem animos audientium, licet et quidam lectores ita miseranter pronuntient, ut quosdam ad luctum lamentationemque compellant. 25. Iidem etiam *pronuntiatores* vocantur, quod porro *annuntient* ; tanta enim, et tam clara erit eorum vox, ut quamvis longe positorum aures adimpleant. 26. *Cantor* autem vocatus, quia vocem modulatur in *cantu*. Hujus duo genera dicuntur in arte musica, sicut ea docti homines Latine dicere potuerunt, *praecentor*, et *succentor*. 27. *Praecentor*, qui vocem *præmittit in cantu*. *Succentor* autem, qui *subsequenter canendo respondet*. 28. *Concentor* autem dicitur, quia *consonat* ; qui autem non consonat, nec concinit, nec *concentor* erit." PL LXXXII, 292C-293A.

640 The title of the *praecentor* has also been connected with the head of the *schola cantorum*. The institution, attributed to Gregory I at Rome, is assumed to have been

psalmists as psalm singers, and then defines the different roles of the singers, it seems probable that, in his thinking, the psalmist was one of a kind, while other singers did not share his position in the clergy.

### 4.3.3 Reforms of Pope Gregory I

In the Church of Rome, according to the 4<sup>th</sup>-5<sup>th</sup> century inscriptions, Levites, i.e. deacons, were in charge of psalmody, and a reader could be admitted to Levitical rank if he possessed a beautiful voice.<sup>641</sup> The chronicle of the Popes, *Liber Pontificalis*, attributes the introduction of psalm singing to Damasus I, and sets the practice of antiphony in the time of Pope Celestine I (422-432), with the explanation that while earlier only the Epistles and the Gospel had been recited, now the psalms of David were to be sung "before the sacrifice".<sup>642</sup> The antiphonal singing would have required a competent choir, the existence of which at the time of Celestine I has been doubted.<sup>643</sup> The mentions of the *Liber*

---

familiar to Isidore through his brother Leander, who was a friend of Pope Gregory. Gurlitt 1950, 5; Sparksman 1980, 142-144, 167-168.

641 Cf. pp. 135-136 above.

642 Cœlestinus I Papa. (Notitia Libri Pontificalis) "[...] Hic multa constituta fecit, et constituit ut psalmi David CL ante sacrificium psallerentur, antiphonatim ex omnibus, quod antea non fiebat, sed tantum Epistolae beati Pauli recitabant [*Al. Epistola recitabatur*], et sanctum Evangelium. [...]" PL L, 407A. Cf. Page 2010, 120-121.

643 Corbin 1960, 160-161. In fact, both the archeological and written evidence – the latter indirectly – confirm that, as early as in the fifth century, an enclosed area, the schola, in front of the church had been allotted to singers. Thus, some of these had to exist. Cattin 1984, 51-52. Kelly 1986, 41-42, mentions nothing about Celestine's reform concerning singing. Corresponding doubts concerning the liturgical history of the Roman Church are common, and presuppose an extremely cautious approach to the topic. For instance, not all the liturgical books attributed to certain popes are genuine, although they may have a pontifical provenance: the Sacramentary bearing the name of Leo I (440-461) derives from the 6<sup>th</sup> or from the 7<sup>th</sup> century, though it also includes materials by Gelasius (492-496) and Vigilius (537-555). On the other hand, some Gelasian documents may derive from his predecessor Felix III (483-492). Kelly 1986, 43-44, 47-49, 60-62; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 658, 1697-1698.

*Pontificalis*, however, attempt to create a continuum in the history of the Roman ecclesiastical singing, in which the most prominent person is Gregory I (590-604). He never went on to become pope, but once inaugurated, he promoted the Roman Church in a manner which with reason earned him the epithet 'Great'.<sup>644</sup>

At the time, the practices of the Eastern and Western Churches not only differed from each other but it seems to have been essential that the West did not follow the East. In a letter to the bishop of Syracuse, Gregory addresses some of the practices which the Church of Rome had been accused of copying from the Eastern Church. The first of these was the singing of the Hallelujah, which traditionally was set for the fifty days between Easter and Pentecost. Gregory had ordered it also to be sung at other times. Attributing the tradition to the Church of Jerusalem – via Jerome – he states that the new practice was not adopted from the East, where the Hallelujah in fact was sung more often than at Rome.<sup>645</sup>

Further, the practice of the singing of the prayer *Kyrie eleison*, completed with *Christe eleison*, is treated. At Rome, it was sung in a responsorial manner between the clerics and the people. Among the Greeks, Gregory says, all sang it together. The same difference also concerned the Lord's Prayer, which was said by the whole congregation in the East, but in the Roman Church only by the priest. Gregory emphasizes that none of the Roman practices were imitations of the Greek consuetudes.<sup>646</sup>

---

644 Born into a senatorial family, Gregory received the best education available at the time, and he acted as the prefect of Rome for two years before devoting himself to monastic life in the monastery he had founded at his family home. He could not abide there for long because he was ordained deacon, and thereafter a papal delegate at Constantinople. There, he must have become acquainted with the eastern singing practices, although he is said not to have learned the Greek language. After returning to Rome, he resided in his monastery whenever possible. Cattin 1984, 48-49; Kelly 1986, 65-67; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 706-707. Cf. Brown 1996, 142.

645 The second item concerned the vestments of the subdeacons. One of Gregory's predecessors had allowed subdeacons to wear linen tunics during mass. This had now been prohibited; Gregory remarks that the eastern practice of the wearing of tunics by subdeacons would have been derived from the former usage of the Roman Church.

646 Sancti Gregorii Magni Epistolarum Lib. IX. Indict. II. Epistola XII. "[...] Nam ut

At the Synod of Rome in 595, Gregory reformed the arrangement of singing by putting an end to the psalm singing of the deacons. It had turned out that deacons who had been ordained on the grounds of their vocal ability tended to neglect their other duties, their aptitude for which had not been sufficiently evaluated before their ordination. Hence Gregory ordered that in the Roman see, "the servants of the altar shall not sing, except the chapter of the Gospel in the Mass: but the psalms before other lessons I propose to give to the subdeacons, or, when necessity demands it, to the members of the lower orders."<sup>647</sup>

---

alleluia hic diceretur, de Jerosolymorum Ecclesia ex beati Hieronymi traditione tempore beatæ memoriæ Damasi papæ traditur tractum, et ideo magis in hac re illam consuetudinem amputavimus quæ hic a Græcis fuerat tradita. [...] Kyrie eleison autem nos neque diximus, neque dicimus sicut a Græcis dicitur, quia in Græcis simul omnes dicunt, apud nos autem a clericis dicitur, et a populo respondetur, et totidem vicibus etiam Christe eleison dicimus, quod apud Græcos nullo modo dicitur. In quotidianis autem missis aliqua quæ dici solent tacemus, tantummodo Kyrie eleison et Christe eleison dicimus, ut in his deprecationis vocimus paulo diutius occupemur. Orationem vero Dominicam idcirco mox post precem dicimus, quia mos apostolorum fuit ut ad ipsam solummodo orationem oblationis hostiam consecrarent. [...] Sed et Dominica oratio apud Græcos ab omni populo dicitur, apud nos vero a solo sacerdote. In quo ergo Græcorum consuetudines secuti sumus, qui aut veteres nostras reparavimus, aut novas et utiles constituimus, in quibus tamen alios non probamur imitari ? [...]" PL LXXVII, 955C-957A.

647 Decreta sancti Gregorii papæ I. "1. [...] In sancta Romana Ecclesia (*Grat. dist. 92, c. 2*), cui divina dispensatio præesse me voluit, dudum consuetudo est valde reprehensibilis exorta, ut quidam ad sacri altaris ministerium cantores eligantur, et in diaconatus ordine constituti modulationi vocis inserviant, quos ad prædicationis officium eleemosynarumque studium vacare congruebat. Unde fit plerumque ut ad sacrum ministerium dum blanda vox quæritur, quæri congrua vita negligatur, et cantor minister Deum moribus stimulet, cum populum vocibus delectat. Qua in re præsentis decreto constituo ut in hac sede sacri altaris ministri cantare non debeant, solumque evangelicæ lectionis officium inter missarum solemnias exsolvant. Psalmos vero ac reliquas lectiones censeo per subdiaconos, vel si necessitas exigit, per minores ordines exhiberi. [...] 2. Verecundus mos tempore indiscretionis inolevit, ut hujus sedis pontificibus ad secreta cubiculi servitia laici pueri ac sæculares obsequantur ; et (*Grat. 2, q. 7, c. 58*) cum pastoris vita esse discipulis semper debeat in exemplo, plerumque clerici qualis in secreto sit vita sui pontificis nesciunt, quam tamen, ut dictum est, pueri sciunt sæculares. De qua re præsentis decreto constituo ut quidam ex clericis vel etiam ex monachis electi ministerio cubiculi pontificalis obsequantur, ut is qui in loco est regiminis habeat testes tales qui vitam ejus in secreta conversatione videant, et ex visione sedula exemplum profectus sumant." PL LXXVII, 1335A-B.

The lower orders below subdeacons were, naturally, readers.<sup>648</sup>

Further, the decretal includes an order concerning the chamber-servants of the pope (*cubicularii*). Hitherto, the office had also been available to the sons of laymen. Their discretion, however, could not be trusted, as they became aware of the most intimate details regarding the pope, who was to be their example in everything. Thenceforth only clerics or monks, with an inclination to diligence and progress, would be allowed to serve as *cubicularii* at the papal palace.<sup>649</sup>

The decree concerning the *cubicularii* has been connected with the foundation of the *schola cantorum*, attributed to Gregory.<sup>650</sup> However, the decretal reveals only that young clerics had been taken into the service at the papal palace, where they received a preparatory education for taking orders.<sup>651</sup> Further, neither Gregory's writings nor any other contemporary sources tell us anything about the foundation of an educational establishment, or about modifying an earlier one, the *schola lectorum*.<sup>652</sup> However, we shall here recall the testimony of Jerome whose reference to youths and appointed singers has been interpreted to indicate

---

648 Cf. Page 2010, 171.

649 Ibid. The *cubicularii* had been appointed by Leo I (440-461) to guard the graves of the apostles.

650 The foundation of the *schola cantorum* is attributed to Gregory in his biography, written by John the Deacon in 873. Sancti Gregorii Magni vita, auct. Joanne Diacono. Lib. II, 6. 6. "Deinde in domo Domini, more sapientissimi Salomonis, propter musicæ compunctionem dulcedinis, Antiphonarium centonem cantorum studiosissimus [The correct form of the words may be *cantum*, or *cententum studiosissimus*.] nimis utiliter compilavit ; scholam quoque cantorum, quæ hactenus eisdem institutionibus in sancta Romana Ecclesia modulatur, constituit ; eique cum nonnullis prædiis duo habitacula, scilicet alterum sub gradibus basilicæ beati Petri apostoli, alterum vero sub Lateranensis patriarchii domibus fabricavit, ubi usque hodie lectus ejus, in quo recubans modulabatur, et flagellum ipsius, quo pueris minabatur, veneratione congrua cum authentico Antiphonario reservatur, quæ videlicet loca per præcepti seriem sub interpositione anathematis ob ministerii quotidianam utrobique gratiam subdivisit." PL LXXV, 90C. Cf. Apel 1958, 47-50; Abraham 1979, 59-60; Cattin 1984, 51-52; Kelly 1986, 65-68; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 706-707; Page 2010, 256-259.

651 Andrieu 1925, 237-238; Corbin 1960, 158, 177.

652 If a *schola lectorum* at Rome had existed, it would have been between the 4<sup>th</sup> and 6<sup>th</sup> century. Leclercq 1950, 1012-1013. Cf. Corbin 1960, 166, 173; Huglo 1982, 68.

that both groups sang together; thus, some kind of education had to be given to the younger ones.<sup>653</sup>

#### 4.3.4 The question of the *schola*

The first appearance of the word *schola* in the present study was in connection with Roman professional and priest guilds, where it was used to refer to their meeting places.<sup>654</sup> Basically, the word has meanings like "leisure given to learning", "the disciples of a teacher", a corporation or a college (*collegium*) and, eventually, a place for instruction, i.e. a school.<sup>655</sup> Whether a mentioned *schola* was a corporation – a trade guild – or a school in the usual sense, is not always easy to determine.

Above, we considered a canon of the Council of Tarragona, concerning the punishment for readers and doorkeepers with adulterous wives. The text refers to the *schola* of the doorkeepers, evidently with the meaning of a trade guild: the question is of married men, not juveniles, and the office of doorkeeper would not have required an education comparable to that of a reader.<sup>656</sup> Further, a letter of Remigius of Reims, from the late fifth century, criticizes the bishop of Tongres for wrongful ordinations of all grades, including "the head (*primicerius*) of the honourable *schola* and profession of readers".<sup>657</sup> Here, *schola* might be understood as a 'group', or the expression could be interpreted to mean both the school of the readers and the group of those who already were appointed readers.

---

653 See pp. 138-139 above.

654 Cf. p. 22ff.

655 Du Cange VII, 349-350; Page 2010, 219-220. Cf. Jones 1964, 84. In the 6<sup>th</sup>-century History of the Franks, the word *schola* is used to denote all orders below archdeacon. Le Blant 1999, 143.

656 Concilium Tarraconense IX, see fn. 607 above.

657 "Primicerius scholæ clarissimæ militiæque lectorum." PL 65, 969A. For references to the *schola lectorum* in the medieval Latin literature, see Du Cange V, 53.

In the middle of the sixth century, the inscription for the Lyonnese Stephanus calls him "*primicierius scolae lectorum*".<sup>658</sup> The title of *primicierius* derives from the administrative vocabulary of the Empire, meaning the first or foremost of the rank in question.<sup>659</sup> In our examples, the ranks would have included those who were educated for the office.

The existence of the Roman *schola cantorum* as an educational institution is confirmed from the latter part of the seventh century, three popes of which are known to have studied there: Leo II (682-683), Benedict II (684-685), and Sergius I (687-701). Of them, Benedict is said to have joined the clergy at a very young age while Sergius arrived at the *schola* as an adult. About the latter, it is known that there he was appointed an acolyte.<sup>660</sup> There is information on both the children and adults who came to be educated in the *schola*, but the principle of selection of the pupils, indicated by a later Roman *Ordo*, emphasizes young boys:

As soon as there are found, in any school, boys who sing well, they shall be raised from there and be fostered in the school of the singers, and later on they shall become *cubicularii*. But if they are sons of the nobility, they shall immediately be brought up in the palace.<sup>661</sup>

Here, again, the office of the *cubicularii* appears in connection with singers, but the two duties are clearly separated. In the succeeding centuries the *schola*, in

---

658 Stephanus primicierius: "in hoc loco requiescit / famulus dī stefanus primicierius / scolae lectorum serviet in s ecl / lugduninsi vixit annos ΓXIV / obiit VIII kl decembris / duodecies P·C·Iustini / indictione XV". LeBlant I, 65, 142-144. In some sources, "primicierius scolae cantorum". The year of the inscription is 551 or 552 CE. Kaufmann 1917, 274.

659 Du Cange VI, 497-498. Cf. ILCV I, no. 484, 102. See also CIC II, 456; Leclercq 1950, 1008-1013. Galles 1981, 19, states that in the cities of Italy and Spain, any pupil of a cathedral school was titled *lector*.

660 Kelly 1986, 78-80, 82-83; Andrieu 1925, 236; Page 2010, 248.

661 Ordo IX Mabillon, n. 1. "Primum in qualicumque schola reperti fuerint pueri bene psallentes, tolluntur inde et nutriuntur in schola cantorum, et postea fiunt cubicularii. Si autem nobilium filii fuerint, statim in cubiculo nutriuntur." Andrieu 1925, 238. Jean Mabillon (1632-1707) published the collection of Roman Orders, which derive from the 8<sup>th</sup> to the 10<sup>th</sup> centuries. ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 1014, 1191.

the role of an orphan asylum (*orphanotrophium*), also fostered parentless children.<sup>662</sup>

The school of singers existed primarily to provide the papal liturgy with professional-level singers.<sup>663</sup> Its significance for recruitment to the ecclesiastical orders is complicated, but the singers themselves were, as Gregory I had ordered, primarily subdeacons.<sup>664</sup> The appointment of Sergius I to acolyte, mentioned above, testifies to the existence of the *cursum clericus* inside the *schola*, which was thus both an educational establishment and a professional corporation.

## 4.4 Singers in seventh-century eastern Christendom

### 4.4.1 Readers and singers in the Arabic Canons of Basil

The name of the fourth-century Church Father Basil of Caesarea is attributed to a considerably later collection of canons which treat disciplinary matters and the

---

662 Andrieu 1925, 235-236; Page 2010, 278. For the *orphanotrophium*, *ibid.* 254-255.

663 Pope Vitalian (657-672) is said to have "developed the song-school at the Lateran so as to train singers for the new, more elaborate and Byzantine-style papal rites; its chanters were called 'Vitaliani'." Cattin 1984, 27; Kelly 1986, 76.

664 The officials of the *schola* were titled with ordinal numbers: the head was *primus*, *primicerius*, or *prior*; and below him, there were three other subdeacons titled *secundus*, *tertius*, and *quartus*. The total number of the singers has been assumed to have been twenty or thirty. Emerson 1980, 811; Sparksman 1980, 111-112. Cf. Andrieu 1925, 233ff.; Leclercq 1929, 2254<sup>s</sup>; Page 2010, 245-246, 255, 288-289.

relationship between the ecclesiastical ranks.<sup>665</sup> The appointment of readers and singers is defined in the following canon:

Readers, psalm singers, and vergers shall be treated according to this order. The reader shall not receive the laying-on of hands but the bishop shall give him first the papyri. Likewise shall the psalmists be blessed on the orders of the bishop. They are not accounted among the rank of the leaders of the church but they are entrusted with their duties according to their dignity, regardless of their age. No one shall grumble over this even if he is already old or when he is far (?) because of the length of the time. If he does not deserve the order, he shall not receive it.<sup>666</sup>

The structure of the appointment of the reader has thus remained the same as it was in the Apostolic Tradition. He was to receive a symbol of his work, in this case, 'papyri'. That these were given 'first', may indicate that his career was intended to advance into ranks the ordination of which included the imposition of hands.<sup>667</sup> The blessing of the singer, on the orders of the bishop, leaves open the question whether the actual blessing was also given by the bishop, or whether the bishop ordered someone else to give the blessing. The sentence including the question mark might allude to some kind of principle, according to

---

665 The exact date of the collection is impossible to establish; it may derive from the former half of the seventh century. The one hundred and six canons, probably originally in Greek, have been preserved in Arabic; between the Greek and the Arabic version, there probably existed a Coptic translation. These canons shall not be confused with the genuine canons of Basil. Riedel 1900, 232-233; Μενεβίσογλου 1990, 557. This study utilizes a German translation which does not preface the name of the assumed author with the word 'pseudo-'; hence here the collection is simply called 'the Arabic Canons of Basil'.

666 Canon 48 des Basilius. "*Über die Anagnosten, Psalmisten und Küster*. Die Anagnosten, Psalmisten und Küster sollen nach diesem einen gesetzte behandelt werden. Einem Anagnosten soll keine Hand aufgelegt werden, sondern der Bischof gebe ihm zuerst τὰς χάρτας.\* Ebenso sollen die Psalmisten auf Befehl des Bischofs gesegnet werden. Sie werden nicht als im Range der Vorsteher der Kirche stehend betrachtet, sondern es werden ihnen die Werke anvertraut, mag der, welcher der Ordnung gewürdigt wird, nun jung oder alt sein. Keiner soll deswegen murren, wenn er auch schon alt geworden oder durch die Länge der Zeit fern ist (?). Es soll ihm keine Ordnung gegeben werden, wenn er dieselbe nicht verdient. [...]" Riedel 1900, 261-262. \* The leaves made of the separated layers of papyrus, i.e. paper.

667 In the German translation, the word is written in Greek.

which promotion to another grade was possible after a certain period. Evidently, the capability of the person in question was more important than the length of his service.

The canon continues, presenting a practical example of the effect of committing a crime:

If a reader steals, he shall be separated because of his sin. He shall remain standing and read on the קנדרה (?) . Also later on<sup>668</sup> when he reads, he shall not be situated in the second grade but he shall remain in his grade until the day of his death, because he who has been caught at a crime in the first grade shall not be worthy of the second.<sup>669</sup>

The Hebrew word, provided by Riedel with a question mark, is probably caused by a misspelling. With the change of the second letter, the word would be 'cathedra', meaning the platform on which the readers officiated.<sup>670</sup> We may understand here that a reader who was caught stealing was separated from the Eucharist for a period, but after serving his sentence he could continue in his office. The mention of the platform seems unnecessary because, according to all our sources, readers officiated on one. Naturally, it may be that the real meaning of the Hebrew word has been totally lost, and the place of reading, whatever it may have been called, also indicated that the reader in question was undergoing a punishment. In any event, he lost the possibility of promotion to the higher ranks.

An exceptional allusion to the use of instruments appears in the canon which states, "If a reader learns to pick a guitar, he must be taught to lecture(?) it. If he

---

668 I.e. after having fulfilled the period of penitence.

669 Canon 48 des Basilius. "[...] Wenn ein Anagnost stiehlt, soll er wegen der von ihm begangenen Sünde ausgeschlossen werden. Er soll stehn bleiben und auf der קנדרה (?) lesen. Auch später, wenn er liest, soll er nicht in die zweite Stufe versetzt werden, sondern bis zu seinem Todestage auf seiner Stufe verharren, weil wer auf der ersten Stufe bei einem Verbrechen betroffen ist, der zweiten nicht gewürdigt werden darf." Riedel 1900, 262.

670 The change would be from the letter *nun* (נ) to *tet* (ט); the word is not of Hebrew origin. Juusola, e-mail 16.4.2011.

does not return, his punishment shall last for seven weeks. If he continues, he shall be degraded and separated from the church."<sup>671</sup> The beginning of the canon has also been translated: "When a reader learns to play the cithara, he shall be taught to confess it." The translator James W. McKinnon states that the title of reader, instead of singer, reveals that the canon derives from the time when the order of the singer was not established in the church; calling the instrument a 'cithara' also better suits the era of Basil.<sup>672</sup> As we do not know the history of the collection in detail, the date of the preceding canons remains obscure. In any case, all use of instruments evidently was absolutely forbidden to clerics.

In several other canons, too, the only lower orders mentioned are readers and vergers. One such canon treats public winebibbing in the daytime; caught at it, a reader or a verger would be sentenced to three weeks separation and, by the order of the presbyter, "forty lashes less one", i.e. thirty-nine lashes.<sup>673</sup> The allusion to corporal punishment is unique.

Also, recalcitrance shown towards the higher orders led to punishments. If a reader did not obey a presbyter, the latter had the right to punish him without the interference of the bishop.<sup>674</sup>

The singer is mentioned in the canon regulating the punishments for visiting clairvoyants or astrologers, or exorcists of a superstitious bent. Whoever was

---

671 Canon 74 des Basilius. "*Über einen Anagnosten, welcher Guitarre spielt.* Wenn ein Anagnost die Guitarre schlagen lernt, soll er gelehrt werden, es zu beichten (?). Kehrt er dann nicht wieder dazu zurück, so soll seine Strafe 7 Wochen betragen. Will er dabei bleiben, soll er abgesetzt und aus der Kirche ausgeschlossen werden." Riedel 1900, 267.

672 McKinnon 1987a, 120.

673 Canon des Basilius 54. "*Daß die Diener des Altars sich hüten sollen, Wein zu trinken, bevor die Lampen angesteckt werden. Sie sollen am Tage, nachdem sie getrunken haben, ihre Häuser nicht verlassen.* [...] Ist es ein Anagnost oder Küster, soll er 3 Wochen ausgeschlossen werden und auf Befehl des Presbyters 40 Schläge weniger einen erhalten." Riedel 1900, 263. Cf. 2 Cor 11:24.

674 Canon des Basilius 90. "*Über Unbotmässigkeit des Diakonen gegen den Presbyter und ebenso des Anagnosten.* [...] Wenn ein Anagnost sich dem Presbyter widersetzt und dem Presbyter nicht gehorcht, so hat dieser die Berechtigung, ihn ohne den Bischof zu bestrafen." Riedel 1900, 271.

caught doing so, was separated for a period: a presbyter for ten years, and a deacon for three years. The members of the lower orders, a reader, a singer, or a verger, were separated for one or two years whereas a layman was separated for seven weeks.<sup>675</sup> On a more positive note, the singer is mentioned as among the clerics with the privilege to marry a second time in the event of widowhood.<sup>676</sup>

The canon regulating the divine service does not mention singers but orders:

If the deacons read well, *they* shall read out the Psalms, and if the presbyters read well, *they* shall read out the Gospel. If they do not read well, the oldest readers shall read out the Psalms, and the deacons shall read out the Gospel. Only a deacon or a presbyter shall read out the Gospel in the catholic Church; no one shall pass his dignity.<sup>677</sup>

---

675 Canon des Basilius 34. "*Daß es eine große Sünde ist, wenn jemand Sterndeuter wird oder zu einem Sterndeuter oder Zauberer oder Beschwörer oder Wahrsager geht. [...] Wenn ein Kleriker zu einem Sterndeuter oder Zauberer oder Beschwörer oder Wahrsager geht oder ein Blutbeschwörer ist oder... (?)*, soll er, wenn er Presbyter ist, 10 Jahre ausgeschlossen sein; ist er Diakon, 3 Jahre; ist er Anagnost oder Psalmist oder Küster, 2 Jahre oder ein Jahr. Ist er Laie, soll er 7 Wochen draußen stehn und gezüchtigt werden, damit er nicht zu einem Sterndeuter, Zauberer oder Wahrsager gehe. [...] Wenn ein Kleriker zu einem Wahrsager geht und sich in einer Lüge belehren läßt oder von ihm Derartiges lernt, soll er von der Ordnung des Klerus abgesetzt und von den Mysterien ausgeschlossen werden. Keiner von ihnen soll in die Kirche gelassen werden." Riedel 1900, 251, 253. The end of the canon orders that clerics who involve themselves with any kind of superstition shall be degraded from the clergy and separated from Communion, and that no one of them shall be allowed to come into the church.

676 Canon des Basilius 55. "*Wenn die Gattin eines Anagnosten, Psalmisten oder Küsters stirbt, darf er eine andere heiraten. Wenn die Gattin eines Anagnosten, Psalmisten oder Küsters stirbt, ist es ihnen erlaubt, sich wieder zu verheiraten. [...]*" Riedel 1900, 263. The canon continues on quite another topic.

677 Canon des Basilius 97. "*Über die heiligen Mysterien. Wenn sie die Mysterien zu veranstalten beginnen, sollen sie es nicht in Unruhe thun, sondern warten, bis die ganze Gemeinde versammelt ist: solange sie eintreten, sollen sie Psalmen verlesen. Dann, wenn die Gemeinde versammelt ist, soll aus den Aposteln verlesen werden, dann aus den προξείης und dem Evangelium. Wenn die Diakonen gut lesen, sollen sie die Psalmen verlesen, und wenn die Presbyter gut lesen, sollen sie das Evangelium verlesen. Wenn sie nicht gut lesen, sollen die ältesten Anagnosten die Psalmen und die Diakonen das Evangelium verlesen. Nur ein Diakon oder Presbyter soll in der katholischen Kirche das Evangelium verlesen; keiner soll seine Würde überschreiten. [...]*" Riedel 1900, 273.

From this we may conclude that if the deacons, in principal, read the Psalms and the Gospel, the lections of the readers were those of the Epistles and the Acts.<sup>678</sup>

Another section of the same canon treats psalm singing, ordering that

Those who sing Psalms at the altar shall not sing with pleasure but with understanding: they shall sing nothing else than Psalms. If someone says something which he has invented himself or heard from others, and which is not written by the Apostles, he shall be separated. A reader reading from foreign books pollutes the ears of the congregation and he shall be excluded. The congregation shall respond vigorously after each Psalm.<sup>679</sup>

These canons confirm that the duties of readers and singers were clearly separated; further, the singing of the Psalms is mentioned as being done by persons who are 'at the altar'. These would be presbyters and deacons, while the duty of the singers would have been to lead the responses of the congregation.

#### **4.4.2 Singers in the canons of the Synod of Trullo**

The Synod of Trullo convened in the last decade of the seventh century at Constantinople. Its aim was to supplement the canons of the fifth and sixth ecumenical councils.<sup>680</sup> The authority of the Trullan Council, convened by

---

678 The use of the verbs *lesen* and *verlesen* in the German translation indicates a difference between the ability to read and recite but, with no access to the original language, further conclusions remain impossible to make. The manuscript on which the German translation is based, was, at the time, situated in the Royal Library of Berlin. Riedel 1900, 129-131.

679 Canon des Basilius 97. "Die an dem Altare Psalmen singenden sollen nicht mit Lust, sondern mit Weisheit singen: sie sollen nichts als Psalmen singen. Wenn jemand etwas sagt, was sie allein gemacht oder von andern gehört haben, so steht das nicht bei den Aposteln geschrieben, und sie sollen ausgeschlossen werden. Wenn ein Anagnost aus fremden Büchern vorliest, so verunreinigen sie die Ohren der Gemeinde und sollen ausgeschlossen werden. Die Gemeinde soll nach allen Psalmen mit Kraft antworten. [...]" Riedel 1900, 274-275.

680 From this the title *Quinisext*; the Fifth and Sixth Councils had assembled at Constantinople in 553 and 680-681. ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 1175, 1644.

Emperor Justinian II, was to be universal. However, no official representatives arrived from the western parts of the Byzantine Empire, and when the canons of the council were eventually introduced to Pope Sergius I, he refused to sign them. The final result was that the Council is considered ecumenical only in the East.<sup>681</sup>

The Synod of Trullo issued one hundred and two canons, several of which illuminate our topic. First, all seven grades of the ecclesiastical hierarchy appear in the fourth canon: bishop, presbyter, deacon, subdeacon, reader, singer (*psaltēs*), and doorkeeper.<sup>682</sup> The canons also repeat that readers and singers could marry after their appointment while all the other clerics, likewise allowed to live in matrimony, had to be married before entering the subdiaconate.<sup>683</sup>

The matter of clerical cutting of the hair appears in the canon which criticizes customs observed in the Armenian Church. It seemed that, there, persons without the appropriate haircut could officiate as singers and readers. Clerical status was also considered hereditary, as in the Jewish priesthood. The Synod ordered that a person's dignity and not his descent would justify his appointment, a mark of which was the clerical mode of cutting the hair, and an episcopal

---

681 For the participants, see NPNF2-14, 357-358. For Sergius I, see Kelly 1986, 82-83, ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> edn.), 1486. We may notice that Sergius added the singing of the *Agnus Dei* to the Mass, probably as a remonstrance against the 82<sup>nd</sup> canon of the synod, which preferred depicting the Saviour in the form of a human being, 'instead of the ancient lamb'. NPNF 2-14, 399. Cf. Norwich 1990, 332. Disagreements about the synod also concern its date. According to the eastern calculation, the synod convened between 1.9. and 31.12.691, while the western dates it between 1.9.691 and 1.9.692; thus, they actually converge. For the eastern dating, see Μενεβισογλοῦ 1990, 279ff.; for the western, Hefele 1877, 328-329, and Joannou 1962b, 98.

682 The canon concerned the violation of women who had dedicated themselves to God. Trullo IV, NPNF 2-14, 364.

683 Trullo VI, NPNF 2-14, 364; cf. Trullo XIII.

blessing.<sup>684</sup> Here, singers are called 'sacred' (*hieropsaltai*), a rare title in Christian usage.<sup>685</sup>

On our topic, the most important canon of Trullo reads:

We want them who have become singers of the church not to use unruly shouting nor to force nature to scream or add anything to what is considered appropriate in the church, but with great care and piety to carry the hymns to God, the one who sees the secrets. For the holy Word has taught the children of Israel to be pious.<sup>686</sup>

For its conceptual advantages to be discussed below, here is used the English translation by Hilikka Seppälä. The translation as such is not word for word; for instance, the original canon does not use the noun 'singers' but speaks of 'those who have come to sing in the churches'. Further, the Greek word, translated here as 'hymns', is 'psalmodies', meaning ecclesiastical singing in general.<sup>687</sup>

684 Trullo XXXIII. "Ἐπειδήπερ ἔγνωμεν ἐν τῇ τῶν Ἀρμενίων χώρᾳ μόνους ἐν κλήρῳ τοὺς ἐκ γένους ἱερατικοῦ κατατάττεσθαι, Ἰουδαίκοις ἔθεσιν ἐπομένων τῶν τοῦτο πράττειν ἐπιχειρούντων, τινὰς δὲ αὐτῶν καὶ μὴ ἀποκειρομένους ἱεροψάλτας καὶ ἀναγνώστας θείου ναοῦ καθίστασθαι, συνείδομεν, ὥστε ἀπὸ τοῦ νῦν μὴ ἐξεῖναι τοῖς κλήρον βουλομένοις προάγειν τινὰς εἰς τὸ γένος ἀποβλέπειν τοῦ προχειριζομένου· ἀλλὰ δοκιμάζοντες, εἴ ἄξιοι εἶεν, κατὰ τοὺς τεθέντας ἐν τοῖς ἱεροῖς κανόσιν ὅρους ἐν κλήρῳ καταλεγεῖναι, τούτους ἐκκλησιαστικούς προχειρίζεσθαι, εἴτε καὶ ἐκ προγόνων γεγονάοι ἱερέων, εἴτε καὶ μὴ. Ἀλλὰ μηδὲ τινα τῶν ἀπάντων συγχωρεῖν ἐπ' ἄμβωνος, κατὰ τὴν τῶν ἐν κλήρῳ καταλεγόμενων τάξιν, τοὺς θείους τῶ λαῷ λόγους ἀποφωνεῖν, εἴ μὴ τι ἂν ἱερατικῇ κουρᾷ χρῆσοιτο ὁ τοιοῦτος καὶ τὴν εὐλογίαν ὑπὸ τοῦ οἰκείου ποιμένος κανονικῶς ὑποδέξοιτο. Εἰ δὲ τις φωραθεῖη παρὰ τὰ προγεγραμμένα ποιῶν, ἀφορίζεσθω." PG CXXXVII, 625B-C. See also Milasch 1905, 270-271; OKK 1980, 377-378, 455-456; Seppälä 2012, 73-74.

685 Apart from the present canon, the epithet is used in the Christian literature only in a homily of Basil of Caesarea. Sophocles 1914, 596; Lampe 1961, 672. *Hieropsaltēs* is also recorded in one Christian papyrus, see p. 206 below, while heathen *hieropsaltai* appear in three papyri, one of which is from the 1<sup>st</sup>, and two from the 3<sup>rd</sup> century CE. Wipszycka 1993, 205<sup>56</sup>; 208. In the first century CE, the historian Josephus applied the title to the Levite musicians of the Temple. Jos. Ant. 11.5.1; 12.3.3.

686 Trullo LXXV. "Τοὺς ἐπὶ τὸ ψάλλειν ἐν ταῖς ἐκκλησίαις παραγινόμενους βουλομεθα μῆτε βοαῖς ἀτάκτοις κεχρηῆσθαι καὶ τὴν φύσιν πρὸς κραυγὴν ἐκβιάζεσθαι, μῆτε τι ἐπιλέγειν τῶν μὴ τῇ ἐκκλησίᾳ ἀρμοδίων τε καὶ οἰκείων· ἀλλὰ μετὰ πολλῆς προσοχῆς τε καὶ κατανύξεως τὰς τοιαύτας ψαλμωδίας προσάγειν τῶ τῶν κρυπτῶν ἐφόρῳ Θεῷ· εὐλαβεῖς γὰρ ἔσεσθαι τοὺς υἱοὺς Ἰσραὴλ, τὸ ἱερὸν ἐδίδαξε λόγιον." PG CXXXVII, 769A-B, Seppälä 2005b, 16.

687 Cf. p. 112 above.

The condemnable practices mentioned in the canon are reminiscent of the homily of John Chrysostom, treated earlier.<sup>688</sup> Thus, it seems that singers still tended to use inappropriate vocal and theatrical effects. The prohibition on all additions continues the principle contained in the last canon of the Synod of Laodicea, which required the singer to sing from the biblical books only, and forbade the singing of private psalms.<sup>689</sup> At that time, the emphasis lay on the orthodoxy of the text. Here, the prohibition may rather be directed at melodic elements and voice control.<sup>690</sup>

One of the Trullan canons, however, concerns a text addition. The Thrice-holy hymn had in some regions been prolonged with 'Crucified for our sake, have mercy on us'. The Synod condemned the addition, and laid down punishments for those who used it.<sup>691</sup>

The references to singing in these canons lead us to a central tenet of Orthodox thinking. In the 75<sup>th</sup> canon, the singers are exhorted 'to carry the hymns to God'. This they perform for the members of the congregation, who remain silent. In like manner, the priest executing the liturgy carries the prayers of the congregation to God. Both officials represent the people assembled, thus continuing the principle of Judaism.<sup>692</sup> This may seem to leave the ordinary parishioner in the role of a bystander; however, in the Orthodox liturgy, there are no bystanders. The people who are present at the liturgy are comprehended as the original source of the hymns sung and the prayers recited. As to singing, they, indeed, sing 'in their hearts'.<sup>693</sup>

---

688 Cf. pp. 130-131 above and Balsamon on Canon LXXXV of Trullo, PG CXXXVII, 769B-772A. Seppälä 1999, 268.

689 See p. 111 above.

690 Seppälä 1999, 268, 271-275; 2005b, 17; 2012, 71-72, 79-80. Commenting on the canons of Trullo, the Byzantine canonists of the 12<sup>th</sup> century truly admonish singers for the use of unnecessary ornamentation. PG CXXXVII, 769ff.

691 Trullo LXXXI, NPNF 2-14, 399. The Thrice-holy hymn has been commonly used in the liturgy since the Council of Chalcedon, but it is probably of earlier origin. OKK 1980, 417; ODCC (3<sup>rd</sup> ed.), 1643.

692 See p. 41.

693 Seppälä 1996, 122-124; 2005b, 17.

Until now, none of our eastern sources has described the ordination of the singer. The particulars are given in the Great Euchologion, the contents of which are ancient. The same rite concerns both the reader and the singer, beginning with the clipping of the hair to reveal the shape of the cross – this, instead of the tonsure, is the clerical mode of cutting the hair. The bishop then reads the initial blessing, including the name of the aspirant. After he has been attired in the chasuble (*felon*), the ordination prayer is read by the bishop. He who is to become a reader, receives a book from which he reads, and a singer reads a verse from the Psalter. The rite ends with the episcopal blessing. The ordination may take place in connection with a liturgy or separate from it, and, if more than one reader or singer is ordained at a time the ordination prayer is read in the plural.<sup>694</sup>

With the canons of Trullo, we are left in the middle of the Byzantine era during which ecclesiastical singing prospered. Since the Church received imperial protection in the fourth century, singing had gained in importance in many ways, requiring the establishment of the rank of the singer.<sup>695</sup> As the final chapter of the study proper, we survey the character of singer-related inscriptions and papyri, some of them which extend until the end of the millennium.

694 *Τάξις γινομένη ἐπὶ χειροτονία ἀναγνώστου, καὶ ψάλτου.* "Προσαγόμενος τῷ Ἀρχιερεὶ ὁ τοιοῦτος, εἰ μὲν κοσμικὸς ἔστι, μετὰ ἱματίου, ἄσκεπής · εἰ δὲ Μοναχός, μετὰ μανδύου · καὶ σφραγίζεται τὴν κεφαλὴν παρὰ τοῦ Ἀρχιερέως, καὶ κείρεται παρ' αὐτοῦ σταυροειδῶς, λέγοντος· *Εἰς τὸ ὄνομα τοῦ Πατρὸς, καὶ τοῦ Υἱοῦ, καὶ τοῦ Ἁγίου Πνεύματος*· Ἐπιφωνούντων καθ' ἑκάστην ἐπίκλησιν τῶν συμπαρόντων τό, *Ἀμήν*. Εἶτα τέλος ὑπό τινος, εἰς Κληρικῷ κείρεται σχῆμα. Καὶ οὕτω πάλιν τῷ Ἀρχιερεὶ προσάγεται · καὶ αὐτὸς λαμβάνων Φελόνιον ἐνδυσθίσει. Καὶ τρίτον τὴν τουτοῦ κεφαλὴν σφραγίζων, ἐπιτίθησιν αὐτῷ τὴν χεῖρα τὴν δεξιάν, καὶ εὐχεται οὕτω· Κύριε, ὁ Θεὸς ὁ Παντοκράτωρ, ἔκλεξαι τὸν δούλον σου τούτον, καὶ ἁγιάσον αὐτόν · καὶ δὸς αὐτῷ, μετὰ πάσης σοφίας καὶ συνέσεως, τῶν θείων σου λογίων τὴν μελέτην καὶ ἀνάγνωσιν ποιῆσθαι, διαφυλάττων αὐτόν ἐν ἀμemptῶ πολιτείᾳ. Ἐλέει καὶ οἰκτιρμοῖς, καὶ φιλανθρωπία τοῦ μονογενοῦς σου Υἱοῦ, μεθ' οὗ εὐλογητὸς εἰ, σὺν τῷ παναγίῳ, καὶ ἀγαθῷ, καὶ ζωοποιῷ σου Πνεύματι, νῦν, καὶ αἰεὶ, καὶ εἰς τοὺς αἰῶνας τῶν αἰώνων. Καὶ μετὰ τὴν ἐκφώνησιν, δίδοται τῷ Ἀναγνώστῃ Βιβλίον Ἀποστολικόν καὶ ὀλίγον ἀναγινώσκων, λαμβάνει παρὰ τοῦ Ἀρχιερέως εἰρήνην. Εἰδὲ Ψάλτης ἔστι, λέγει ἀπὸ τοῦ Ψαλτηρίου Προκείμενον. Εἰδὲ εἰσι καὶ πλείονες οἱ χειροτονούμενοι Ἀναγνώσται, χειροτονοῦνται ὁμοῦ, καὶ λέγεται ἡ Εὐχὴ πληθυντικῶς. Ἰστέον δὲ ὅτι, ὅτε οὐκ ἔστι Λειτουργία, ποιεῖ ὁ Ἀρχιερεὺς Εὐλογητόν, καὶ ψάλλεται τό, *Βασιλεῦ οὐράνιε· Τρισάγιον· Παναγία Τριάς. Πάτερ ἡμῶν· Ὅτι σοῦ ἔστι*· καὶ τὸ Τροπάριον τῆς ἡμέρας, εἶτα γίνεται ἡ Ἀκολουθία, ὡς προεγράφη." *Εὐχολόγιον τὸ Μέγα* 1891, 186-187. Cf. Milasch 1905, 271.

695 Wellesz 1961, 165; Velimirović 1990, 30-31.

#### 4.4.3 Singers in inscriptions and papyri

The main body of inscriptions featuring singers derives from the eastern Mediterranean from the fifth century onwards. They are short, and the particulars they reveal are often limited to a name and title, while the dating tends to be difficult if not impossible. The language of the inscriptions is Greek, and the usual title used for a singer is *psaltēs*.<sup>696</sup>

Sometimes only a fragment has been preserved: for example, in Corinth, a fragment of an epitaph indicates only that the grave had belonged to a "most pious singer".<sup>697</sup> Further, only one singer inscription has been preserved on Crete, reading: "Here lies Theodoros, a chanter, awaiting the truthful promises of Christ; he went to rest in the month of December, on the twenty-third, on Sunday, in the tenth year of the indiction."<sup>698</sup> The contemporaries of Theodoros understood the date because they were aware of the number of the indiction they lived in. With the number lacking, the inscription can be dated only broadly, the estimations varying from the fifth to the seventh century.<sup>699</sup>

Some of the memorials are shared by several persons. At Edessa, Macedonia, a singer called Doulkitios was buried with an architect called Mauros, and his spouse Domnina.<sup>700</sup> The relationship between Doulkitios and the couple remains unknown, as does the relationship in the case of "the grave of Petros and of Menas the singer". Both names are given in the genitive form as well as the

---

696 Because of the cursory character of this chapter, the inscriptions and papyri mentioned here are not given in their original language.

697 SEG XXVI, no. 406 (1), 109-110. Cf. Sironen 1997, 403<sup>224</sup>. Page 2010, 96-98, surveys singer inscriptions on a general level.

698 Bandy 1970, no. 71, 98

699 Chronological calculation by indictions began during the reign of Diocletian in 287. The first three indictions were quinquennia; after these, one indiction covered fifteen years. AKK 2000, 231.

700 5<sup>th</sup>/6<sup>th</sup> cent. Feissel 1983, 43.

noun, which is in the singular: thus at least one of the men was a singer, probably Menas, after whose name the title is given.<sup>701</sup>

From Cilicia, Asia Minor, some short inscriptions have been found, such as "The grave of Heraklios, the singer".<sup>702</sup> Another, written with the title between two names leaves us in confusion: "The grave of Ioannes of the singer of Loukas" seems to indicate that Ioannes was the name of the singer. 'Of Loukas' may refer to his father but this is merely speculation.<sup>703</sup> An equally enigmatic case is the late Athenian graffiti mentioning "Ioannes the singer Kokkalas", with all the words in the accusative, including the definite article. "Kokkalas" is probably an eponym deriving from his native place.<sup>704</sup> From Apameia of Phrygia, a memorial of a trade guild of singer-readers (*psaltanagnōstai*) from ca. 600 has been preserved. The memorial was not just a gravestone but a shrine (*herōn*).<sup>705</sup>

Apart from plain singers, more specific titles also appear. The most common of them is *prōtopsaltēs*.<sup>706</sup> Meaning literally 'the first singer', it is sometimes written with the ordinal number.<sup>707</sup> The *prōtopsaltēs* was the head of the singers. At divine services, there were two choirs, one on the right side, one on the left. Although both choirs had their own conductors (*domestikoi*), the *prōtopsaltēs* answered for them, as well as for their instruction in singing.<sup>708</sup> Probably

---

701 MAMA III, no. 451B, 166. 5<sup>th</sup>/6<sup>th</sup> cent. Sironen, e-mail 17.11.2011.

702 MAMA III, no. 373, 155. 5<sup>th</sup>/6<sup>th</sup> cent. Sironen, *ibid*.

703 MAMA III, no. 472, 169. 5<sup>th</sup>/6<sup>th</sup> cent. Sironen, *ibid*.

704 Orlandos 1973, no. 31, 19-20. The graffiti possibly derives from the Middle Byzantine era. Sironen, *ibid*.

705 MAMA VI, no. 237, 87-88. Lampe 1961, 1540; Schmemmann 1975, 90. Cf. Schneider 1954, 130.

706 MAMA III, no. 649, 192. The grave of two brothers: Paulos the deacon and Georgios the *prōtopsaltēs*, undated, at Korykos, Cilicia.

707 CIG IV, no. 9383, 489; Orlandos 1973, no. 170, 137, deriving from 941 CE.

708 The title derives from the imperial court where body guards were called *domestikoi*. Sophocles 1914, 392. Πάλλη 1936, 66-67, mentions that the *prōtopsaltēs* was situated after two *primicerii* and before the *proximus*, both titles deriving from the imperial administration. For the titles of the Byzantine singers, see Seppälä 2005a, 25ff.; 2012, 63-65.

synonymous with *prōtopsaltēs* is the title "Father of the psalterion", mentioned in the inscription of the presbyter Anatolios.<sup>709</sup>

The same person could officiate both as *prōtopsaltēs* and storekeeper (*skeuofylax*).<sup>710</sup> Two Athenian inscriptions mention three offices: deacon, *prōtopsaltēs*, and *skeuofylax*.<sup>711</sup> The rank of deacon did not presuppose the rank of *prōtopsaltēs*; a deacon could also be a plain singer, and a storekeeper, which office was considered higher than that of *prōtopsaltēs*.<sup>712</sup>

All the inscriptions with the title *prōtopsaltēs* are considered to derive from the last centuries of the first millennium CE, or even later. Not all of them are datable. When the text includes the date, it is given according to the indictions. In cases where the number of the indiction is known, the year can be calculated in our chronology.<sup>713</sup>

The title of *tropologos* occurs in the sources once, and concerns the deacon Isidoros in Korykos, Asia Minor. The word *tropologos* is a combination of the words *tropos* and *logos*, together meaning someone who was skilled in verses or versicles. A lexical translation would read "reciter of select passages".<sup>714</sup>

Although monasticism has been left outside the present study, mention may be made here of three documents concerning monastic singers, all deriving from Egypt. The first of them is the epitaph of the singer Dorotheos, with the epithet

---

709 CIG IV, no. 8865, 382, including no further particulars.

710 Orlandos 1973, no. 192, 154; CIG IV, no. 9386, 489. The date of the inscription is between 892 and 991 CE.

711 Orlandos 1973, no. 45, 32-33; Theophanos, probably from the 5<sup>th</sup> cent.; *ibid.*, no. 64, 55; Thomas, from the Byzantine era proper. The latter appears also in CIG IV, no. 9406, 492. The estimated dates: Sironen, e-mail 17.12.2011.

712 CIG IV, no. 9396, 491; Orlandos 1973, no. 46, p. 33. The estimated date of the inscription lies between 904-979 CE.

713 E.g. Orlandos 1973, no. 120, p. 100.

714 MAMA III, no. 452, 166; Du Cange X, 194; Liddell and Scott 1940, 1827.

'Father' (*Abba*).<sup>715</sup> Two others are papyri, including receipts for the payment of the personal tax (*andrismos*).<sup>716</sup>

Preserved receipts mentioning parochial singers concern tenancy, in one case for a payment of part of the rent for premises belonging to the church, paid by a singer and received by a presbyter. On another papyrus, a singer had rented quarters which probably belonged to the church. Further, a singer occurs in a list of payments the character of which is not decipherable.<sup>717</sup>

The most detailed papyrus is a flour order to a baker, written by Theopemptos, a sacred singer (*hieropsaltēs*). He orders five *artabae* of the finest wheat flour, repeating the amount, "five only". The flour shall be given to the pastrycook – whose name has been preserved only partially – and his partners, and the amount of the flour shall suffice for one week.<sup>718</sup> We have no idea if the amount of the order was unusually small but evidently, the pastrycook would have preferred to be given more. Although Theopemptos has signed the order as a singer, he probably also answered for other duties in his church.

Further, singers appear on a list concerning wine distribution. The list includes a broad range of church personnel, respectively archpresbyter, archdeacon, second deacon, tax-gatherer, arbitrator, "the third" – probably a third deacon – and reader of hagiographical texts (*martyrologos*). These are mentioned in the singular, followed by the groups of stretcher-bearers, nurses, readers, singers,

---

715 The year of the inscription is 530 CE. Lefebvre 1907, 1; Kaufmann 1925, 273.

Except 'Father' as a title of respect, the word  $\acute{\alpha}\beta\beta\acute{\alpha}$  can also mean the superior of a monastery, abbot. Sophocles 1914, 58; Lampe 1961, 2.

716 On the receipts, name, title and monastic state are recorded. The receipt of the singer and monk Kyriakos derives from the 6<sup>th</sup> or the 7<sup>th</sup> century. Boswinkel & Pestman 1978, 24, 109-110. Cf. Jones 1964, 912. Another receipt, from the first half of the 7<sup>th</sup> century, is written for "Apollos the singer and his son David, monks". P. Lond. V 1748. Wipszycka 1993, 207.

717 P. Lond. IV 1430, 112. Wipszycka 1993, 207-208.

718 Sijpestein 1972, 2. The papyrus, written in Greek, derives from the 6<sup>th</sup> century, and the week which the order concerns is in the Egyptian month of Choiak situated between 27<sup>th</sup> November and 26<sup>th</sup> December. Zilliacus 1948, 48. The amount of five *artabae* – an Egyptian measure, approximately 3½ Roman *modii* – was roughly 153 litres. Lewis and Short 1993, 167; AKK 2000, 347.

and members of spiritual brethren. The list ends with the local presbyter and the local doorkeeper, a mule driver, and subdeacons.<sup>719</sup>

It has been assumed as a matter of course that all the appointed, or canonical, singers of the era studied here were men. That was evidently the case, as is implied by two inscriptions which have erroneously been thought to concern female Christian singers. The first of them is a Greek inscription pertaining to the virgin Ptolemais at Rome. The text includes abbreviations which have been interpreted to mean 'who sang to God'; in fact, they form the words 'to be always remembered'.<sup>720</sup> The other inscription refers to a female singer (*psaltria*) called Heraklea. It includes a cross, implying Christianity. In this case, however, it is very probable that the cross was added afterwards to the text, the wording of which does not match Christian inscriptions.<sup>721</sup>

The preserved small body of inscriptions and papyri confirm that singers were counted among the ecclesiastical personnel. Apart from officiating as singers, they could also answer for practical duties, and, within their rank, they possessed a hierarchy of their own.

## 4.5 Summary

Were the present study to be reproduced as a tree diagram, the phenomena of the three centuries from the fifth to the seventh would form its highest branches, but, the crown of the tree would not be visible: the apices of some branches would be apparent, but most would continue outside the frame of the diagram, as the history of the singer continues from the end-point presented here. One of the

---

719 P. Iand. VIII 154, ca. 600 CE. Wipszycka 1993, 205.

720 CIG IV, no. 9613, 534. For the erroneous assumption, see Leclercq 1913, 351.

721 IG XII:5, no. 592, 154. Sironen, e-mail 3.12.2005.

shorter branches would consist of the canons of the First Council of Toledo, in which confessors were mentioned in the connection with 'singing antiphons', thus leading to the assumption that 'confessor' would have been the title of the singer in the Hispanic Church. This, however, seems not to have been the case, and the canonical sources of the region do not refer to singers at all.

A branch with more than one limb, and continuing out of sight, is the earliest formula for the appointment of the 'psalmist' or 'cantor', which appears among the canons of the Fourth Council of Carthage and in the canonical collection called *Statuta Ecclesiae Antiqua*. The wording of the canon is bare, stating that the singer may simply 'undertake' his duty after the presbyter has exhorted him regarding the proper manner of showing his faith in his life. All the other ranks mentioned in the canons receive their appointment from the bishop, but the assignment of the singer is an action that the bishop need not be even aware of.

The appointment of the singer is not touched upon in any other documents except the Greek Great Euchologion, the character of which separates it from the other sources but which confirms the coexistence of the orders of reader and singer. In the fifth-century canons of the Council of Chalcedon, singers are referred to in connection with marriage; as before, readers and singers are allowed to marry after entering the clergy. Thus, the official standing of the singer is confirmed by an ecumenical council.

In the western canonical sources, only the rank of the reader appears. The education for reader also includes psalmody; otherwise the canons concerning the readers are mostly of a disciplinary character, treating their marital relations and outward appearance, especially their hair, which was to be appropriately tonsured.

The occasional mentions of the arrangement of ecclesiastical singing confirm the practice of responsorial psalmody, as well as the rejection of non-biblical hymns. On the latter, the Fourth Council of Toledo in 633 makes an important concession, stating that as several such songs were already in use, new ones

could also be composed. The president of the Council was Isidore of Seville, who defined the essence of the ecclesiastical orders in his treatise *De ecclesiasticis officiis*, drawing on the works of Ambrose and Pseudo-Jerome. Isidore analyses readers and singers separately, listing the requirements laid down for their voice and skills. His wording indicates that readers were ordained but singers chosen; concerning the latter, the bishop need not – again – be aware of the decision by the presbyter. In his encyclopaedia called *Etymologiae*, Isidore defines both the different manners of singing, and the roles of the singers.

Also to this era belongs the Roman school of singers, *schola cantorum*, the foundation, or reformation of which is attributed to Pope Gregory I. The matter is disputed because the activity of the school is confirmed primarily only from the seventh century onwards. For this study, the main impact of Gregory is his decree, issued at the Synod of Rome in 595, assigning psalm singing to subdeacons or readers instead of the deacons who had thitherto answered for it.

In the sixth-century East, singers are mentioned in the imperial legislation as a rank of their own, and in the following century, they appear in the Arabic Canons attributed to Basil of Caesarea. The canons define that the psalm reading belonged to the deacons, or, if these did not read well enough, to the oldest readers. The psalm singing is referred to as being performed at the altar, implying that the higher clerics answered for it. The psalmody included responses by the people, which were probably led by the singers. Hymns are not mentioned in these canons.

The early history of the order is complemented by the canons of the Synod of Trullo, at the end of the seventh century. The synod required that the appointment of singers was to include a clerical haircut and an episcopal blessing, and also emphasized the importance of proper conduct in performing the office. These particulars supplement the earlier canonical legislation of the Synod of Laodicea and the Council of Chalcedon, which thus form a coherent continuum regarding the order of the singer. The inscriptions and papyri,

introduced in the last chapter, show the variety of the character of the documents which have survived either complete or damaged. The inscriptions allude to combined offices where a member of a higher order is also mentioned to have been a singer, and also, to situations where a 'plain' singer is responsible for practical duties, such as that of a storekeeper. All the inscriptions are epitaphs, while the papyri were written when the singers were alive, and thus concern practical matters and everyday life.

## 5 Conclusions

### 5.1 Connections with other cults

The organization of the communities of believers seems not to have differed much from that of other associations of the time. With them, the Christian ecclesia shared its structural model and common nomenclature: the three-fold ministry of overseers, elders, and servants, turning with time into bishops, presbyters or priests, and deacons. The division of the ministry into three parallels with the ancient model of the Roman organization, the college (*collegium*). For instance, the organization of a priest college comprised of the overseer (*magister*), the priests (*flamines*), and servants, who, however, were slaves. Thus, only the structure is recognizable: we recall the election of the seven men in Acts 6, who were not described as deacons, and who were seemingly capable of much more than the simple tasks of servants. The high standing of the Christian deacons, as well as their traditional number, derives from Acts; their title owes to practical exigencies and tradition.

The essential difference between the officials of the Christian ecclesiae and the members of the Roman priest colleges appears in the requirements set for them: among the Christians, the origin of an individual had no significance, but how he lived his life did, while in the heathen priest colleges, only members of nobility were accepted. The hereditary priesthood in Judaism is a corresponding phenomenon. In the public synagogue, however, no such preference is evident; there, too, we encounter a three-fold organization. The ruler of the synagogue (*rosh ha-keneset*) was the leader of the whole community, and he was assisted by a council of elders (*zekenim*), and a servant (*hazzan*).

The order of the reader was established during the second century, probably because of the rarity of literacy. Although reading was mentioned as one of the

duties of an overseer in 1 Tim, the primary requirements laid down for him did not include book learning. In cases where the overseer was a Jew by birth, he would naturally have possessed the ability to read. But one of gentile or, later on, of Christian descent would not necessarily have received any education. However, from their rather highly esteemed standing in the early days, readers were soon included in the lower ranks of the clergy. In this, they resembled the poorly paid public criers (*praecones*), with whom they were compared as late as in the seventh century by Isidore of Seville.

During the third century, the ranks of acolyte, exorcist and doorkeeper emerged. Acolytes formed the second sub-category of the diaconate – the first being subdeacons, established in the late decades of the second century to lighten the workload of the deacons proper – with a title meaning an attendant, or a follower, drawn from the everyday vocabulary. The duties of the exorcist, which concerned the purification rites preceding baptism and the banishment of evil spirits from the distressed, consisted of anointing and the reading of exorcism formulae. On the possible model for the exorcist, the sources of this study offer no evidence, although we may see a connection with the rites of the mystery cults, which also aimed at purification. The doorkeepers – who had an evident counterpart in the Roman *aeditui* – are regularly mentioned in the lowest echelons of the hierarchy along with readers and singers.

Later on, the ecclesiastical nomenclature drew on the general administrative vocabulary: the Latin titles *princeps* and *primicerius* mean the first or foremost of the rank in question. Both are used in connection with a group, or a *schola* of readers and singers, indicating the existence of a trade guild. In most of the non-Christian cults, the role of musicians was important in their rites although musicians were not counted as among the protagonists of the cult, who performed the offerings and other acts. Likewise, in Christianity, the core of the cult – the sacrament of the Eucharist – was celebrated by the higher orders, who,

according to our sources, also sang. In this, they resemble the Temple priests, who could take on the duties of the Levite musicians.

The character of the profession of a musician presupposes a dedicated education. Those already in the trade instruct apprentices, and, within their group, persons with different levels of skill form a hierarchy. This occupational training is evident both in the trade guilds of antiquity and in the organization of the ecclesiastical singers, in both eastern and western Christendom.

From Judaism, the Christians probably adopted the principle of 'each', originally meaning that everyone was equally entitled to approach God. That the *sheli'ah zibbur* of the synagogue turned into the professional *hazzan* rather contemporaneously with the establishment of the canonical singer is a matter of interest. There is also the sixth-century coincidence in the introduction of new repertoire: in the synagogue, the song genre called *piyyutim*, and in the Church, the *kontakia* hymns. In the sources used for this study, there is, however, no positive evidence of cause and effect between the synagogue and the Church. On the contrary, the ecclesiastical authorities repeatedly admonished Christians to shun any relationships with the Jews – which, indirectly, confirms the existence of such relationships.

The chapter on the earlier research touched upon the theory according to which the *sheli'ah zibbur* was the prototype of the ecclesiastical singer. This view is strengthened by the Orthodox concept of the essence of the singing at the liturgy: the singers represent the people who attend the liturgy, and who actually are the source of the songs, as well as the source of the prayers said by the priest. The singers sing for the whole congregation.

The order of the singer in the Christian Church would thus have its roots in the messenger of the community of the synagogue, the *sheli'ah zibbur*. He was chosen from among the men present, evidently on the basis of his vocal skills and his ability to appear in public. Those who originally sang in the churches were probably 'voluntaries' of the same kind, either vocally skilled members of

some ecclesiastical grade or talented laymen, until it became necessary to incorporate singers in the clergy.

## **5.2 The origin of the order of the singer**

The official recording of the order of the singer indisputably happened at the Synod of Laodicea, the canons of which order that from then on, only canonical singers were permitted to sing in the church. The epithet 'canonical' implies subordination to the ecclesiastical law and regular appointment; the order also clarifies that the singers were to sing on the platform and from books. The singing was to alternate with readings, both from the canonical – i.e. biblical – books; the singing of private songs was separately forbidden. In the canons of Laodicea, singers are always mentioned in the plural.

Before the Synod of Laodicea, we encountered some individual singers: the youth Nikatorios, who in his lifetime had 'enchanted everybody with songs and holy lessons', and the notary Marcion, who had been both singer and reader. These both testify that singing and reading were considered to be closely allied. There was also the psalm singer (*psalmōdos*), whose part in the liturgy some people wished would end; had that not been the case, Basil of Caesarea would probably have not have said anything about him in the homily. And fourth, there was the presbyter Gaios, mentioned also as a hymnodist, in the epitaph of a deacon.

In the attempt to set the individual texts in chronological order, the apocryphal canon of Nicaea, published by Gelasius Cyzicus, was treated among the other 5<sup>th</sup>-century sources. Locating it in the time of the Council of Nicaea, we gain a

plausible picture of the singers – and also readers – who were not yet 'canonical' but who had, nevertheless, to be appointed to their offices by a presbyter.

But what did the singers sing? In the inscription mentioning presbyter Gaios to be 'far the best in hymns', the matter seems clear: as the text implies that Gaios also composed hymns himself, what was sung was something other than biblical psalms alone. These, however, seem to be in question regarding the psalm singer in the church of Basil: the persons who so keenly waited for the singing to end, were evidently not allowed to take part in the Eucharist. Thus, we may assume that the psalm singer officiated in the first part of the liturgy, where psalms – according to other 4<sup>th</sup>-century sources – were sung. However, in describing the first part of the liturgy, the *Apostolic Constitutions* does not allude to the singer: the reader is mentioned as being on his high place, i.e. the platform, and after every two lessons, someone other than the reader was to sing the psalms of David, and the people were to sing the refrains. It took me a long time to work out why the author had not used the noun 'singer' which, in fact, he had already used in an earlier segment of the text. With the aid of the details from other sources, I finally understood that it was because anyone of those in the higher orders – deacon, presbyter, even bishop – could officiate as a solo singer. The duty of the canonical singer was probably thus to lead the responses of the people.

The difficulty in answering the simple question I set myself over twenty years ago has appeared to be in the nature of the sources: very little can be stated directly from one or another text, but the answer can be deduced from circumstantial evidence. First, none of the primary sources states that the main duty of the singer was to lead common – or choral – responses or sing hymns. Second, and this is an intricate matter, the Orthodox concept of the word 'psalmody' covers the entirety of ecclesiastical singing: since when may we suppose this concept to have been introduced? The Byzantine canonists Theodore Balsamon and Johannes Zonaras wrote in the second Christian

millennium, utilizing, naturally, earlier scholarship, but could the tradition be said reliably to derive from the time when the psalmody, i.e. the ecclesiastical singing, was established, and was the time the moment of the Synod of Laodicea? I would be cautious on deciding these questions, but one is led to ponder at each appearance of the word 'psalmody' whether it is to be taken as 'psalm singing' in particular or as 'ecclesiastical singing' in general.

In the Greek texts, the singer is most often referred to by the title *psaltēs*, as used in the canons of Laodicea, Chalcedon and Trullo. The Apostolic Constitutions, in many ways the second important text in its chronological proximity to the Laodicean synod, also utilizes the titles *ōdos* and *psaltōdos*, which can be considered synonyms for *psaltēs*. As the rank of the singer is evident, I am inclined to conclude that in the cases when the sources of the time – the latter half of the fourth century and onwards – use periphrases instead of the noun 'singer', a member of another clerical order was entitled to do the singing.

The origin of the order of the singer is certainly to be dated in the latter half of the 4<sup>th</sup> century, but his precise tasks are revealed only indirectly: when the reading of the psalms in the first part of the liturgy remains among the lections given by the readers or is rendered by some higher ecclesiastic rank, conducting the common responses of the people is the task of the singer.

### **5.3 The relation between the orders of reader and singer**

To consider whether it was the office of the reader from which the office of the singer developed or was differentiated, we have at least two directions to go in. First, we may begin with the chronological situation: the reader appeared during the second century, and the singer in the latter half of the fourth. As the earlier

sources occasionally allude to singing – not primarily the same sources which refer to reading – somebody would have had to be responsible for leading it.

For the moment, we shall now return to the biblical basis of all ecclesiastical orders and ranks, 1 Cor 12. There, Paul emphasizes that every task and order is based on the spirit, who gives each person his specific ability to build the ecclesia; among them are the 'forms of assistance, forms of leadership'. From these, we easily deduce the orders of deacon and bishop. Reading and singing appear in 1 Cor 14, where singing is one of the spiritual gifts. Paul argues for singing with the mind instead of singing with the spirit, stating that when assembling together, "each one has a hymn, a lesson, a revelation, a tongue, or an interpretation." The character of the hymn (*psalmos*) was probably the same as that of the hymn (*carmen*) sung to Christ by the Bithynians who had confessed that much about their former divine service when interrogated by the Roman governor Pliny the Younger about half a century later.

Thus, singing could be solo or choral, and what was sung were probably not primarily biblical psalms but recent compositions; the books of both the canonical and the apocryphal New Testament include hymns and hymn-like verses, which reflect the spirit of creating new songs of worship. Of the composers of the first centuries mentioned here – Bardesanes and Harmonios, Paul of Samosata, and Arius – the information given is mostly negative but confirms that what was sung was considered something other than what was read.

Reading is not mentioned among the spiritual gifts in 1 Cor; only by stretching the concept can it be understood to mean 'lesson', as it is translated in the NRSV. Rather, in the original Greek it means 'teaching' (*didachē*), that is, a lection from the Scriptures, not only read but also explained. This accords with some early church orders requiring that the reader has the qualities of an evangelist, or those of the deacon.

According to some of our sources, singing and reading were assigned to the same person. When singers and readers are mentioned separately, they in general share the same position in the hierarchy.

However, there are some differences. First, on the matter of appointment, the reader is in general mentioned as receiving his office from the bishop in both eastern and western Christendom. The appointment of the singer is, in the East, included in the expression 'the other clerics', who are to be appointed by the bishop, in the eighth book of the Apostolic Constitutions (i.e. in the Apostolic Canons), and confirmed in the Great Euchologion. In the western provinces, the singer may be appointed without the knowledge of the bishop, and the wording of the formula – preserved among the Carthaginian canons and the *Statuta Ecclesiae Antiqua* – speaks of 'undertaking' the office, instead of being appointed to it. The reader, on the contrary, is even introduced to the congregation before his assignation by the bishop. The treatise of Isidore of Seville repeats the protocol.

A more crucial difference lies in the standing of the various orders in relation to advancement in the hierarchy. The order of the reader is, from the third century on, considered the first stage of the ecclesiastical career. The later canonical legislation limits his advancement in the case of an inappropriate wife, or a second marriage. From the order of the singer, there is no advancement except within his own rank, to the office of the *prōtopsaltēs* or *primicerius*. Naturally, a singer with no marital flaws had the alternative to aspire to the order of reader, and thence upwards.

In introducing the principles and structure of the ecclesiastical hierarchy, the present study has presented details which, at first sight, may not seem to be connected with the subject. Examples would be the metaphors used with respect to the other ecclesiastical orders: the modelling of bishops, presbyters, and deacons on the Trinity and similar sacred counterparts, and the allegorical language used to describe deaconesses, widows, and orphans that derives from

the Temple of Jerusalem. Readers, in turn, are thought to be provided with 'the prophetic spirit', while the possibility of advancing in the hierarchy is also mentioned on these occasions. Singers, on the contrary, are provided only with progenitors from the Old Testament era. The reason why the order of the singer remained unassociated with sacred allegories is found in the role of the Judaic *sheli'ah zibbur*, and the role of the singers in the Orthodox liturgy: both represent the assembled congregation, and thus they belong to the laity.

## 5.4 Regional lines

In the text proper, given above, the sources were arranged in chronological order, as far as this was possible. Below, they are compiled according both place and date, although in some cases, one or both of them can not be precisely stated. Although specifically defined, regional borders tend to be crossed both in regard to the subject matter, and in accordance with the division of the Roman Empire in 395, after which the eastern half of it became the Byzantine Empire.

### Syria

Grouping all the sources deriving from the same region together may provide, if not an accurate, at least a provisional sequence. For instance, in Syria, one might be tempted to assume that ecclesiastical singing began with the instruction in 'the rule of psalmody' – which I would interpret here as the singing of the biblical psalms – by Apostle Thaddaeus in the church of Edessa. Next, about a century later, this traditional psalmody seemed to need refreshing, as was done by

Bardesanes, who, with his son Harmonios, composed one hundred and fifty hymns to be used as interludes for the obligatory biblical psalms. That the latter were obligatory, is confirmed, first in the *Didascalia*, which instructs the believers to sing the psalms of David, and second, in the matter of the bishop of Antioch, Paul of Samosata, who gave offence when he introduced songs of his own composition. Although these incidents date from between the latter half of the second century and the latter half of the third, and the region is rather roughly delimited, the basic situation becomes discernible: the singing of the biblical psalms was practised in the liturgy, and it was considered to observe the tradition of representation.

Singing as such is referred to mostly in general expressions. It is not until almost a hundred years after Paul of Samosata that Antiochene ascetes Flavian and Diodore appear in the ecclesiastical history with the apparent innovation of dividing the choir into two parts to sing psalms in turns, alternately or, in the term that came to be used, antiphonally. Arranging singing in this way was not in itself a new idea; such singing had been practised earlier among both heathens and Jews, not to mention the heavenly vision received by Ignatius of Antioch around the beginning of the second century. However, in the fourth-century Church it is stated to have been considered a rather revolutionary step.

At this point, we digress from Syria to the south-eastern side of the Mediterranean to recall the wider circumstances surrounding the above-mentioned event. In Alexandria, the presbyter Arius had instituted a Christological heresy, which he also proclaimed with singing. He did this by utilizing popular melodies in which he set his theological ideas and which, again, became hugely popular not only in Alexandria but also elsewhere. Had the bishop of Antioch, Leontius, not been an Arian, we would not now possess the detail about this innovation which is also reported to have spread throughout the Christendom of the time.

The order of the singer is not present in the above account: the female choir of Paul of Samosata was directed by the bishop himself and, a century later, the choirmasters Flavian and Diodore did not possess an ecclesiastical rank, although the sources of the time reveal that ascetes were under canonical rule. The earlier church orders, the *Didascalia* and the Apostolic Church Order – providing that it derives from Syria – mention the ranks of bishop, presbyter and deacon, reader and widow. In the former, the reader is alluded in a manner that suggests such an official was not always available, and in the latter, he is presupposed to be able also to 'explain', i.e. to preach. It is not until the Apostolic Constitutions, compiled ca. 380 on the basis of three earlier church orders, that we encounter the singer, and this is also the end point of our Syrian sources.

### **Asia Minor**

By Asia Minor is understood the region approximately within the borders of the present-day Turkey. There, the earliest text testifying to singing at the assemblies of believers is 1 Cor, addressed to an audience across the Aegean Sea but written by Apostle Paul in Ephesus. In the letter, singing is referred to as a charisma, and preference is given to singing with the mind over the singing with the spirit. The important verses mentioning 'psalms, hymns, and spiritual songs' also derive from the Pauline corpus, but the expression remains on the level of a phrase of indefinite meaning, rather than alluding to separate song genres practised by the early Christians.

The first reference to actual singing appears in the report of Pliny the Younger to Emperor Trajan, concerning the Bithynian former Christians. When interrogated, these had confessed having sung hymns at their early Sunday assemblies. The singing of hymns is also mentioned in what is probably the earliest inscription touching upon the subject, which praises presbyter Gaios as

'far the best in hymns', probably composed by himself. These references combined lead us to conclude that, among the believers, it was customary to compose new songs of praise and sing them together.

Chronologically, the next to appear were the apocryphal canons of the Council of Nicaea, published by Gelasius of Cyzicus, according to which only such laymen 'who have been assigned to read or to sing from the books' were allowed mount the platform.

Singing and reading are connected in the inscription of Nikatorios, who 'enchanted everybody with sacred songs and lessons', and in the ecclesiastical historiography, where one of the Constantinopolitan notaries, Marcian, has the titles both of a singer and a reader. The latter piece of information would place the emergence of the singer as an ecclesiastical rank around the middle of the fourth century. Two decades later, Basil of Caesarea mentions a psalm singer in one of his homilies, although nothing is known about the ecclesiastical status of this person. Basil also argues for the spreading of the psalm singing in his letter to the Neocaesarean clergy, first describing the antiphonal and responsorial forms, and then listing a variety of nations who have adopted the custom, which thus belongs to all Christians. Considering that the churches of Asia Minor, as founded by Apostle Paul, consisted of Hellenistic Christians, the psalmody – meaning here the singing of the biblical psalms – was probably not adopted there as easily as in the churches with Judaeo-Christian background.

Among the Phrygian Christians, in order to keep the custom, the restoration of discipline was evidently needed, as the Synod of Laodicea, ca. 380, promulgated a decree permitting only canonical singers to sing in the church, officiate on the platform and sing from the books. The psalms were to alternate with lections, and the proximity of singers and readers appears both in the canons of the Synod of Laodicea and the Council of Chalcedon in 451. At the end of the 7<sup>th</sup> century, the canons of the Synod of Trullo confirm the existence of canonical singers and their established standing.

In the imperial legislation, only readers appear until the *Novellae* of Justinian, which gives the numbers of the different ecclesiastical ranks for the basilica of Sancta Sophia and its three annexed churches. There, the number of the readers is one hundred and ten, and that of the singers, twenty-five.

The major part of the preserved singer inscriptions, brief and difficult to date, derive from Asia Minor.

## **Egypt**

In the sources deriving from Egypt, the earliest writer was Clement of Alexandria who condemned the use of 'liquid harmonies' among Christians, requiring the responses and hymns to be sung in 'temperate harmonies'. In the fourth century, the same attitude was reflected in the writings of Athanasius of Alexandria, who preferred very moderate voice control, although understanding the singing of the psalms and odes as an order given by Christ himself. In the Athanasius' church, the deacon sang the psalm verses to which the people gave the response. However, some minor sources imply that singers were laymen, or even catechumens.

The Canons of Hippolytus mention those who are permitted to enter the altar – bishop, presbyters and deacons – to recite psalms after the distribution of the Eucharist, and refer to congregational singing in connection with daily services and agapes. Later on, the Pseudo-Canons of Athanasius required singers to sing nothing but the Psalter, and to teach others 'without grudging'. However, those explicitly mentioned as singing during the celebration of the Eucharist are readers.

The mention made in the Ecclesiastical History of Socrates that in the church of Alexandria even catechumens could officiate as readers and singers, remains a solitary statement.

Some papyri, from the sixth century and later, give us glimpses of the everyday life of a singer: the payment of personal tax by a monastic singer, some other receipts, a flour order given to a baker, signed by the sacred singer (*hieropsaltēs*) Theopemptos, who was probably also the storekeeper of his church. It is such sources as papyri and inscriptions which bind the study to past reality: although provided with church orders and councilary orders, which become supplemented with details from patristic writings, we are nevertheless left only with speculation. The names and occasional particulars of long-gone 'ordinary' individuals create a connection between their days and the present.

### **The Apennine peninsula**

The first Roman document derives from after the middle of the second century, and is the Apology to the Emperor by Justin Martyr. He gives a brief description of the Sunday morning divine service, which begins with reading. The rank of the reader appears in an inscription (*Favor lector*) already in the same century. The appointment of the reader is recorded in the Apostolic Tradition, while in the middle of the third century, on the evidence of the letter of Cornelius of Rome, the occupants of the rank seem to have been considered to form a lower class, along with exorcists and doorkeepers. During the fourth century, the ecclesiastical career path (*cursus clericus*) is documented, indicating that the lectorate was its initial rank. No rank of singer appears; instead, several epigrams praise the Levites – deacons, and in one case, a reader – for their vocal skills, and singing is mentioned as a merit for episcopacy.

Jerome refers to persons whose duty it was to sing in the church, mentioning youths in a manner which implies a system of education in singing. Such an arrangement would have been the *schola cantorum*, attributed about two centuries later to Gregory I, who forbade applicants for deaconship to be

ordained on the grounds of having a good voice, and reserved singing for subdeacons and the lower orders, i.e. readers. Solid information on the *schola* itself derives from the end of the seventh century on, which period remains outside the scope of this study.

The other centre of significance here is Milan, where, in 374, the consular governor Ambrose was elected bishop. He is recorded as having passed through the *cursus clericus* in an exceptionally short time, and also to have introduced 'the manner of the eastern Church' into western singing. This manner has been described as responsorial psalmody, a concept of which the first recorded use in Latin is by Ambrose. He refers to singers only a couple of times, stating that all ecclesiastical duties shall be divided according to personal aptitude, and emphasizing the proper use of the voice, which in psalmody and singing are the first steps to be learned.

More specifically, it is antiphonal psalmody which, because of the noun 'antiphons' used by his biographer Pauline, Ambrose is argued to have introduced. The noun appears in the travel account of Egeria in Jerusalem, where they were apparently independent compositions. The singers mentioned by Egeria are clerics and ascetes. The contemporaneous bishop of Jerusalem, Cyril, refers to psalm singers, although he also uses periphrase, exhorting the people to listen 'to him who is singing'. As far as Palestine is concerned, the sources of the present study have nothing more to offer.

### **North Africa and the Iberian peninsula**

Because of the brevity of the possible conclusions here, I present findings on these regions in the same section. The central North African locality is Carthage, where we first encounter Tertullian at the turn of the second and third centuries. Tertullian testifies to the rank of the reader, the singing of psalms and hymns,

without defining who conducted this, and congregational responses in the liturgy. In the middle of the third century, the letters of Cyprian indicate that the bishop decided on the appointment of readers, and reveal that those who were intended to become readers rehearsed this duty in the liturgy. From the time of the Great Persecution, a confiscation document informs us of the seven readers of the church of Cirta, apparently part-time ecclesiastics, as at least three of them carried on other trades. From the end of the fourth century, among the canons of the Third Council of Carthage, readers and singers – with doorkeepers – are emphasized as among the clerics, and the canons of the Fourth Council of Carthage include the appointment formulae for all ranks. The appointment of the singer (*cantor*) is the earliest mention of its kind, and also appears in the *Statuta Ecclesiae Antiqua*, the provenance of which, along with the particulars concerning the numbered Carthaginian councils, are not as clear as one would wish. Nevertheless, here might be considered whether the order of the singer would have entered the West via North Africa.

Another North African locality is Hippo, where the person of Augustine has been treated. In the church of Augustine, the reader answered for the psalmody. Concerning it, Augustine uses the words 'singing' and 'reading' rather interchangeably, but the actual singing – of hymns – shall be skilled and harmonious. However, the esthetic pleasure produced by melodies is viewed with caution. Augustine also refers to the roles of the singers with the terms *precentor* and *succentor*.

The above-mentioned *Statuta Ecclesiae Antiqua* were probably compiled in the latter half of the fifth century by Gennadius of Marseilles. Having now arrived in Gaul, we encounter, first, the Council of Vaison, which defined the education of the reader as including psalmody. Probably having begun with such an education, the Viennese presbyter Claudianus and the Lyonnesse bishop Nicetius are remembered as singers and choirmasters. The title *primicerius*, in connection with the school (*schola*) of readers or singers, also appears.

In the region of present-day Portugal, a unique inscription names the *princeps cantorum*, Andreas, while other Hispanic sources allude mostly to readers. The Second Council of Braga ordered that only those who were ordained readers were allowed to sing or read on the platform, thus confirming that readers also answered for singing. The canons of the ecclesiastical councils pay quite a lot of attention to the outward appearance of the reader; at the time, the provinces were governed by Gothic tribes whose looks seem to have tempted the lower orders, who were required to keep their heads tonsured and wear plain clothing.

The Fourth Council of Toledo sanctioned the composition of new hymns and liturgies, as such already were in use. The works of the president of the Council, Isidore of Seville, mention the psalm singer (*psalmista*) among the ecclesiastical grades. The different roles of singers are also introduced, but the connection between singers and the actual practice of singing remains to be investigated elsewhere, with the aid of further sources.



## Bibliography

### 1. Texts

#### *Augustine II*

Augustine in St. Augustine's Confessions Vol. II, transl. by William Watts. Loeb Classical Library 27. MCMLXI. (First published 1912.)

Bandy, Anastasius C.

1970 *The Greek Christian Inscriptions of Crete*. Vol. X. Part I: IV-IX A.D. Ἀθήναι.

#### *Basil III*

Saint Basil: The Letters III. The letters in four volumes with an English translation by Roy J. Deferrari, Ph. D. The Loeb Classical Library, William Heinemann Ltd. London 1957. (First published 1930.)

Beckmann, Joachim

1956 *Quellen zur Geschichte des christlichen Gottesdienstes*. Gütersloh.

Boswinkel et Pestman

1978 *Textes grecs, démotiques et bilingues (P. L. Bat. 19)*. Édités par divers auteurs et publiés par E. Boswinkel et P. W. Pestman. Lugdunum Batavorum.

#### *The Clementine Liturgical Text.*

2005 Translated and edited by V. Rev. Dr. Michel Elias Najim. Available at: <http://www.najim.net/liturgical.htm/>. [Accessed 04.10.2013.]

Connolly, R. Hugh

1929 *Didascalia Apostolorum*. Oxford: Clarendon Press. Available at: <http://www.bombaxo.com/didascalia.html>. [Accessed 24.09.2012.]

#### *Corpus Iuris Canonici I.*

Editio Lipsiensis secunda post Aemilii Ludouici Richteri instruxit Aemilius Friedberg. Pars prior decretum Magistri Gratiani. Lipsiae MDCCCLXXIX.

*Corpus Iuris Civilis II*

Editio duodecima lucis ope expressa. Volumen secundum. Codex Iustinianus. Recognovit et retractavit Paulus Krueger. Berolini MCMLIX apud Weidmannos.

*Corpus Iuris Civilis III*

Editio stereotypa. Volumen tertium. Novellae. Recognovit Rudolfus Schoell. Opus Schoellii morte interceptum absolvit Guilelmus Kroll. Berolini apud Weidmannos MDCCCXCV.

Danby, Herbert

1954 *The Mishnah* translated from the Hebrew with introduction and brief explanatory notes by Herbert Danby. London.

Epstein, I

1938 *The Babylonian Talmud*. Seder Mo'ed. Translated into English with notes, glossary and indices under the editorship Rabbi Dr I. Epstein B.A., Ph.D., D.Lit. London.

*Eusebius HE*

1989 *The History of the Church from Christ to Constantine*. Translated by G.A. Williamson. Revised and edited with a new introduction by Andrew Louth. London.

*Εὐχολόγιον τὸ Μέγα*

1891 Περιέχον τὰς ἑπτὰ μυστηρίων ἀκολουθίας. Βενετία.

*The Fathers of the Church I*

A New Translation. Volume 1. The Catholic University of America. Washington D.C. 1981.

Feissel, Denis

1983 *Recueil des inscriptions chrétiennes de Macédoine du IIIe au VIe siècle*. Bulletin de correspondance Hellénique. Supplément VIII. Paris.

Ferrua, A.

1942 *Epigrammata Damasiana*. In *Sussidi allo studio delle antichità cristiane* 2. Roma.

Goldschmidt, Lazarus

1933 *Der Babylonische Talmud* mit Einschluss der vollstaendigen Mišnah.

Dritter Band: Sukkah, Jom-Ṭob, Roš-Hašanah, Tânith, Megilla, Moêd-qatan, Ḥagiga, Šeqalim. Haag.

1980 *Der Babylonische Talmud* neu übertragen durch Lazarus Goldschmidt.

Joma/Sukka/Jom Tob/ Roš Hašana/Taánith. Dritte Auflage. Dritter Band.

1981a *Der Babylonische Talmud* neu übertragen durch Lazarus Goldschmidt.

Hulin /Bekhoroth / Árakhin. Dritte Auflage. Elfter Band. Jüdischer Verlag.

1981b *Der Babylonische Talmud* neu übertragen durch Lazarus Goldschmidt.

Temura/Kerethoth/ Meila/Tamid/Middoth/Quinnim/Nidda/Mišna/  
Taharuth. Dritte Auflage. Zwölfter Band. Jüdischer Verlag.

*Herodotus I*

Herodotus in Four Volumes I, Books I and II. Translated by A. D. Godley.  
London 1960.

Horsley, G. H. R.

1981 *New Documents Illustrating Early Christianity*. A Review of the Greek  
Inscriptions and Papyri published in 1976 by G. H. R. Horsley. The  
Ancient History Documentary Research Centre. Macquarie University.  
Australia.

Hüttenmeister, Frowald G.

1990 *Sheqalim – Scheqelsteuer* übersetzt von Frowald G. Hüttenmeister.

Übersetzung des Talmud Yerushalmi herausgegeben von Martin Hengel,  
Hans Peter Rieger, Peter Schäfer. Band II/5. Tübingen.

*Inscriptiones Latinae Christianae Veteres I*

Vol. I. edidit Ernestus Diehl. Berolini apud Weidmannos. MCMLXI.

Joannou, P. - P.

1962a *Les Canons des Synodes Particuliers*. t. I, 2. In *Fonti: Fascicolo IX*,  
Discipline générale antique. Roma.

1962b *Les Canons des Conciles Oecumeniques*. t. I, 1.

*John Chrysostom, St.*

Old Testament Homilies. Volume Two. Homilies on Isaiah and Jeremiah.  
Translated with an Introduction by Robert Charles Hill. Holy Cross  
Orthodox Press, Brookline, Massachusetts. 2003.

*Josephus IX*

1965 Josephus with an English translation by Louis H. Feldman in nine volumes. IX. Jewish Antiquities, Books XVIII-XX. London 1965.

Le Blant, Edmond

1999 *Inscriptions chrétiennes de la Gaule antérieures au VIII<sup>e</sup> siècle*, réunies et annotées par Edmond Le Blant. Tome I: Provinces Gallicanes. Tome II: Les Sept Provinces. Hildesheim.

Lefebvre, M. Gustave

1907 *Recueil des inscriptions Grecques-Chrétiennes d'Égypte*. Le Caire.

*Liber Pontificalis I*

Le Liber Pontificalis I. Texte, introduction et commentaire par l'abbé L. Duchesne. Bibliothèque des Écoles Françaises d'Athènes et de Rome. Paris 1981.

Lipsius, Ricardus Adelbertus

1990 *Acta Apostolorum Apocrypha*. Post Constantinum Tischendorf denuo ediderunt Ricardus Adelbertus Lipsius et Maximilianus Bonnet. Pars prior. Hildesheim.

*Livy I*

Books I and II with an English translation by B. O. Foster, Ph. D. London 1967.

Mansi, Joannes Dominicus

*Sacrorum Conciliorum nova, et amplissima collectio.*

I Tomus Primus. Ab initiis Ærae Christianae ad Annum CCCIV.

II Tomus Secundus. Ab anno CCCV. ad annum CCCXLVI.

III Tomus Tertius. Ab anno CCCXLVII. ad annum CCCCIX. Florentiae MDCCLIX.

Merkelbach, Reinhold und Stauber, Joseph

2001 *Steinpiogramme aus dem griechischen Osten*. Band 2. Die Nordküste Kleinasiens (Marmarameer und Pontos). München/Leipzig.

*Monumenta Asiae Minoris Antiqua*

- III Vol. III. Denkmäler aus dem rauhen Kilikien. Herausgegeben vom Josef Keil und Adolf Wilhelm. 1931.
- VI Vol. VI. Monuments and Documents from Phrygia and Caria. Edited by W. H. Buckler and W. M. Calder. 1939.

Neusner, Jacob

1988 *The Mishnah*. A New Translation. Yale.

*Novum Testamentum Graece*

28th revised edition, Edited by Barbara Aland and others, © 2012  
Deutsche Bibelgesellschaft, Stuttgart.

Noy, David

1995 *Jewish Inscriptions of Western Europe. Volume 2. The City of Rome*.  
Cambridge.

Orlandos, A. C.

1973 *Les Graffiti du Parthénon*. Inscriptions gravées sur les colonnes du Parthénon à l'époque paléochrétienne et Byzantine par A. C. Orlandos avec la collaboration de L. Vranoussis. Athènes.

*Ortodoksisen kirkon kanonit*

1980 Ortodoksisen kirkon kanonit selityksineen. Suomentanut Antti Inkinen. Ortodoksisen kirjallisuuden julkaisuneuvosto.

*The Oxyrhynchus Papyri Volume XXXIII.*

Greco-Roman Memoirs, No. 48. London, 1968.

*Paikallissynodiin kanonit.*

1983 Suomentanut Johannes Seppälä. Ortodoksisen kirjallisuuden julkaisuneuvosto.

Pharr, Clyde (transl.)

1952 *The Theodosian Code and Novels and the Sirmundian Constitutions*. A Translation with Commentary, Glossary, and Bibliography. Princeton.

*Philo IX*

Philo: in ten volumes (and two supplementary volumes). 9 / with an English translation by F. H. Colson. The Loeb Classical Library 363. Cambridge MA, Harvard University Press.

*Pliny II*

1963 *Letters*. With an English translation by William Melmoth. Revised by W. M. L. Hutchinson. In two volumes. II. The Loeb Classical Library 59, London: Heinemann.

## Rahmani, Ignatius Ephraem II

1899 *Testamentum Domini Nostri Jesu Christi* nunc primus edidit, latine reddidit et illustravit Ignatius Ephræm II Rahmani Patriarcha Antiochenus Syrorum. Moguntiaë, Sumptibus Francisci Kirchheim.

## Riedel, Wilhelm

- 1900 *Die Kirchenrechtsquellen des Patriarchats Alexandrien*. Zusammengestellt und zum Teil übersetzt von Lic. Theol. Wilhelm Riedel. Leipzig.
- 1904 *The Canons of Athanasius of Alexandria*. The Arabic and Coptic versions edited and translated with introductions, notes and appendices by Wilhelm Riedel, Professor in the University of Greifswald, and W. E. Crum, M.A. London/Oxford.

## Schneemelcher, Wilhelm

- 1964 *New Testament Apocrypha*. Edited by Wilhelm Schneemelcher. English translation edited by R. McL. Wilson. Volume Two. The Westminster Press. Philadelphia.
- 1989 *Neutestamentliche Apokryphen in deutscher Übersetzung* herausgegeben von Wilhelm Schneemelcher. 5. Auflage der von Edgar Hennecke begründeten Sammlung. II. Band. Apostolisches. Apokalypsen und Verwandtes. J.C.B. Mohr (Paul Siebeck), Tübingen.

*Scott XII*

1973 *The Civil Law* : including the Twelve Tables, the Institutes of Gaius, the Rules of Ulpian, the Opinions of Paulus, the Enactments of Justinian, and the Constitutions of Leo / translated from the original Latin, edited, and compared with all accessible systems of jurisprudence ancient and modern, by S. P. Scott. New York.

*Sidonius Apollinaris*

- 1915 Sidonius Apollinaris, Letters. Tr. O.M. Dalton. Vol. II, Book IV. Available at: [http://www.tertullian.org/fathers/sidonius\\_letters\\_04book4.htm](http://www.tertullian.org/fathers/sidonius_letters_04book4.htm). [Accessed 17.9.2008.]

## Sijpestein, P. J.

- 1972 Some Byzantine Papyri from the Amsterdam Papyrus Collection. In *Byzantina Neerlandica*, 3: *Studia Byzantina et Neohellenica Neerlandica* by W. J. Aerts, Willem Frederik Bakker and Arnold F. Von Gemert. Leiden, Brill 1972.

## Simon, M.

- 1932 *The Babylonian Talmud 24. Seder Mo'ed*. Translated into English with notes, glossary and indices by Maurice Simon, M.A., under the editorship of Rabbi I. Epstein B.A., Ph.D., D.Lit. London.

## Singer, Simeon

- 1915 *The Standard Prayer Book*, tr. by Simeon Singer. Complete English translation of a Jewish Prayer Book, or Siddur, including prayers, holidays, ceremonies, and important texts. Available at: <http://www.sacred-texts.com/jud/spb/spb07.htm>. [Accessed 06.01.2012.]

## Sperry-White, Grant

- 1991 *The Testamentum Domini: A Text for Students, with Introduction, Translation, and Notes*. Alcuin/GROW Liturgical Study 19 (Grove Liturgical Study 66) Nottingham.

## Stegmann, Anton

- 1925 Des heiligen Kirchenlehrers Basilius der Grossen, ausgewählte Homilien und Predigten, aus dem griechischen Urtext übersetzt und mit Anmerkungen versehen von Dr. Anton Stegmann, Stadtpfarrer in Heilbronn a/N. *Bibliothek der Kirchenväter. Des heiligen Kirchenlehrers Basilius der Grossen ausgewählte Schriften aus dem griechischen übersetzt II. Band*. Verlag Josef Kösel & Friedrich Pustet K.-G. München.

## Σύνταγμα II.

- 1852 Σύνταγμα τῶν θείων καὶ ἱερῶν κανόνων τῶν τε ἁγίων καὶ πανευφήμων ἀποστόλων, καὶ τῶν ἱερῶν οἰκουμενικῶν καὶ τοπικῶν συνόδων, καὶ τῶν κατὰ μέρος ἁγίων πατέρων, ἐκδοθὲν σὺν

πλείσταῖς ἄλλαις τὴν ἐκκλησιαστικὴν κατάστασιν διεπούσαις διατάξεσι, μετὰ τῶν ἀρχαίων ἐξηγητῶν, καὶ διαφόρων ἀναγνωσμάτων, ὑπὸ Γ.Α.Ράλλη καὶ Μ.Ποτλῆ. Τόμος δεύτερος, Ἀθήνησιν, ἐκ τῆς τυπογραφίας Γ.Χαρτοφύλακος.

*Supplementum Epigraphicum Graecum*

1979 Volume XXVI, 1976-1977. Netherlands – USA.

Tanner, Norman P. S.J.

1990 *Decrees of the Ecumenical Councils*. Volume One Nicaea I to Lateran V. Georgetown, Washington.

## 2. Lexica

Du Cange, Charles Du Fresne

1688 *Glossarium ad scriptores mediae et infirmae Graecitatis* duos in tomos digestum : accedit Appendix ad Glossarium mediae et infimae Latinitatis, Caetera subjectus Syllabus indicabit.

II *Glossarium mediae et infimae latinitatis*. Conditum a Carolo du Fresne domino du Cange; auctum a monachis ordinis Benedicti cum supplementis integris D. P. Carpenterii, Adelungi, aliorum, suisque digessit G. A. L. Henschel. Editio Nova aucta pluribus verbis aliorum scriptorum a Léopold Favre. Tomus secundus. Niort 1883.

III Tomus tertius. Nouveau tirage. Paris 1938.

V Tomus quintus. Niort 1885.

VI Tomus sextus. Nouveau tirage. Paris 1938.

Fürst, Julius

1889 *Hebräisches und Chaldäisches Schul-Wörterbuch über das Alte Testament*. Leipzig.

Lampe, G. W. H.

1961 *A Patristic Greek Lexicon*. Oxford.

Lewis and Short

1993 *A Latin Dictionary* founded on Andrews' edition of Freund's Latin Dictionary. Revised, enlarged, and in great part rewritten by Charlton T. Lewis. First edition 1879. Oxford.

Liddell and Scott

- 1940 *A Greek-English Lexicon* by Henry George Liddell and Robert Scott. Revised and augmented throughout by Sir Henry Stuart Jones with the assistance of Roderick McKenzie. Oxford.
- 1998 *Greek-English Lexicon*. A Lexicon Abridged from Liddell and Scott's Greek-English Lexicon. First edition 1891. Oxford.

Sophocles, Evangelinus Apostolides

- 1914 *Greek Lexicon of the Roman and Byzantine Periods: (From B.C. 146 to A.D. 1100)*. Cambridge.

### 3. General

Abraham, Gerald

- 1979 *The Concise Oxford History of Music*. Oxford University Press, London.

Achelis, Hans

- 1891 Die Canones Hippolyti. *Texte und Untersuchungen VI*. Leipzig.

Achelis, Hans - Flemming, Johs.

- 1904 Die ältesten Quellen des orientalischen Kirchenrechts. Zweites Buch. Die Syrische Didaskalia. *Texte und Untersuchungen*, Neue Folge X: 2. Leipzig.

Altaner, Berthold-Stuiber, Alfred

- 1993 *Patrologie*. Leben, Schriften und Lehre der Kirchenväter. Sonderausgabe 1978/1993. Freiburg.

Andrieu, Michel

- 1925 Les ordres mineurs dans l'ancien rit Romain. In *Revue des Sciences Religieuses*, Tome V, 232-274. Strasbourg.

*Antiikin käsikirja*

- 2000 Paavo Castrén - Leena Pietilä-Castrén. Keuruu.

Apel, Willi

- 1958 *Gregorian Chant*. USA.

Avenary, Hanoch

1978 Music. The Emergence of Synagogue Song. In *EJ 12*, 566-664.

Avi-Yonah, Michael

1978 Temple. From the Roman Conquest until the Destruction. In *EJ 15*, 959-960.

Bardy, G.

1927 Manichéisme. In *DTC IX:2*, 1841-1895.

1936 Priscillien. In *DTC XIII:1*, 391-400.

Bastiaensen, A. A. R.

1997 The Beginnings of Latin Liturgy. In *Studia Patristica Vol. XXX*, 273-290. Leuven.

Bayer, Bathja

1978 Music. Introduction and History to the Second Temple period. In *EJ 12*, 554-566.

2007 Hallelujah. In Music. In *EJ 8*, 2<sup>nd</sup> edn., 281.

Beccari, Camillus

1914 Confessor. *Original Catholic Encyclopedia*, 215. Available at: <http://oce.catholic.com/index.php?title=Confessor>. [Accessed 19.3.2013.]

Berger, Theresa

2011 *Gender Differences and the Making of Liturgical History: Lifting the Veil on Liturgy's Past* (Ebk). Ashgate Publishing Ltd. Available at: [http://books.google.fi/booksid=gGLctOhhssAC&printsec=frontcover&dq=gender+differences+and+the+making+of+liturgical+history&hl=fi&sa=X&ei=aZexU8a9KsHiywOxhoGACw&redir\\_esc=y#v=onepage&q&f=false](http://books.google.fi/booksid=gGLctOhhssAC&printsec=frontcover&dq=gender+differences+and+the+making+of+liturgical+history&hl=fi&sa=X&ei=aZexU8a9KsHiywOxhoGACw&redir_esc=y#v=onepage&q&f=false). [Accessed 23.2.2013].

Beyer, H. W.-Karpp, H.

1954 Bischof. In *RAC II*, 394-407.

Blidstein, Gerald J.

1978 Priests and Priesthood. In the Halakhah. In *EJ 13*, 1088-1089.

Botte, B.

1941 *Confessor*. Available at: <http://documents.irevues.inist.fr/handle/2042/2818>. [Accessed 24.03.2013.]

Bradshaw, Paul F.

1990 *Ordination Rites of the Ancient Churches of East and West*. New York.

1992 *The Search for the Origins of Christian Worship*. Sources and Methods for the Study of Early Liturgy. SPCK. London.

Braun, Joachim

2001 Jewish music. II. Ancient Israel/Palestine. In *NGD 13*, 29-37. Second edition.

Brown, Peter

1996 *The Rise of Western Christendom*. Triumph and Diversity AD 200-1000. First published in 1996. Reprinted in 1997. Padstow.

Brown, Raymond E.

1997 *An Introduction to the New Testament*. The Anchor Bible Reference Library, USA.

Burkert, Walter

1987 *Ancient Mystery Cults*. USA.

Burtchaell, James Tunstead

1992 *From Synagogue to Church*. Public Services and Offices in the Earliest Christian Communities. Cambridge.

Cabrol, F.

1907 Ariens. In *DACL I/2*, 2814-2819.

Calane, C.

2000 Orphik. Übersetzt von T. Heinze. In *DNP 9*, 58-69.

Cameron, Averil

1993 *The Later Roman Empire AD 284-430*. London.

Castrén, Paavo

2011 *Uusi antiikin historia*. Helsinki.

Cattin, Giulio

1984 *Music of the Middle Ages I*. Cambridge.

Clauss, Manfred

1993 *Einführung in die Alte Geschichte*. München.

1999 *Kaiser und Gott. Herrscherkult im römischen Reich*. Leipzig.

2000 *Roman Cult of Mithras*. Translated by Richard Gordon from *Mithras: Kult und Mysterien* (Munich 1990). Edinburgh.

Cobb, Peter G.

1992 The Liturgy of the Word in the Early Church. In *The Study of Liturgy*, 219-229.

Connolly, R. Hugh

1929 *Didascalia Apostolorum*. Oxford: Clarendon Press. Available at: <http://www.bombaxo.com/didascalia.html>. [Accessed 11.09.2012.]

Corbin, Solange

1960 *L'Église à la conquête de sa musique*. Paris.

1967 Cantor in Christian Liturgy. In *NCE 3*: 71-72.

Corbitt, Danny

2010 *Did Justin Martyr (150 AD) Condemn Instrumental Music in Worship?*

Available at: <http://missingmorethanmusic.com/research/Martyr.htm>.

[Accessed 27.08.2012.]

Crehan, Joseph

1958 The Seven Orders of Christ. In *Theological Studies 19*, 81-93.

Davies, J. G.

1963 Deacons, Deaconesses and the Minor Orders in the Patristic Period. In *The Journal of Ecclesiastical History, Volume Fourteen*, 1-15.

Dix, Gregory

1945 *The Shape of the Liturgy*. Reprinted 1986. London.

1992 *The Treatise on the Apostolic Tradition of St. Hippolytus of Rome*.  
(Reissued by Henry Chadwick.) Second revised edition 1968. Reissued  
with additional corrections 1992. London.

Dov Gilat, Yitzhah

1978 Soferim. In *EJ 15*, 79-81.

Dressler, H.

1967 Laodicea. In *NCE 8*: 379-380.

Ed.

1978 Bimah. In *EJ 4*, 1002-1006.

Emerson, John A.

1980 Western Plainchant. In *NGD 14*, 805-844.

Faivre, Alexandre

1977 *Naissance d'une hiérarchie*. Paris.

1990 *The Emergence of Laity in the Early Church*. Translated from *Les laïcs  
aux origines de l'Eglise* (Paris 1984) by David Smith. New York.

Farmer, Henry George

1957 The Music of Ancient Egypt. In *NOHM I*, 255-282.

Fischer, Balthasar

1970 Hat Ambrosius von Mailand in der Woche zwischen seiner Taufe und  
seiner Bischofs-konsekration andere Weihen empfangen? In *Kyriakon*.  
Festschrift Johannes Quasten in two volumes. Edited by Patrick Granfield  
and Josef A. Jungmann. *Volume II*, 527-531. Münster.

Fleischer, Ezra

1978 Piyyut. In *EJ 13*, 573-602.

Fleischhauer, Günter

1998 Rom (Reich). III. Musikleben. In *MGG 8*, 375-390.

2001 Rome. Ancient. In *NGD 12*, 606-614.

Foley, Edward

1982 The Cantor in Historical Perspective. In *Worship, Volume 56, Number 3*, 194-213. USA.

1996 *Foundations of Christian music*. The Music of Pre-Constantinian Christianity. American essays in liturgy. The Liturgical Press, Collegeville, Minnesota.

Freedman, Harry

1978 Soferim. In *EJ 15*, 81.

Funk, Franz Xaver

1891 *Die Apostolischen Konstitutionen*. Eine litterar-historische Untersuchung. Rottenburg. Unveränderter Nachdruck Frankfurt/Main 1970.

Galles, D.

1981 The Office of Cantor. In *Sacred Music, Vol. 108*, 17-20.

Gamble, Harry Y.

1995 *Books and Readers in the Early Church*. Yale.

Gaudemet, Jean

1958 *L'Église dans l'Empire Romain (IV<sup>e</sup>-V<sup>e</sup> siècles)*. Histoire du Droit et des Institutions d'Église en Occident. Tome III. Paris.

1985 *Les sources du droit de l'Église en Occident du II<sup>e</sup> a VII<sup>e</sup> siècle*. Initiations au christianisme ancien. Paris.

Geiger, W.

1920 Salii. In *P-W, Zweite Reihe I A: 2*, 1874-1894.

Gentz, G.

1950 Arianer. In *RAC I*, 647-652.

Godet, P.

1947 Gélase (de Cyzique). In *DTC VI/1*, 1182-1183.

Goldschmidt, Ernst Daniel

1978 Liturgy. In *EJ II*, 392-402.

Gordon, Richard L.

2001 Pontifex, Pontifices. In *DNP 10*, 135-138.

Grant, Robert M.

1970 *Augustus to Constantine. The Rise and Triumph of Christianity in the Roman World.* New York.

Graf, Fritz

1997 Carmen Arvale. In *DNP 2*, 987-988.

Gurlitt, Wilibald

1950 Zur Bedeutungsgeschichte von *musicus* und *cantor* bei Isidor von Sevilla. In *Abhandlungen der geistes- und sozialwissenschaftlichen Klasse. Jahrgang 1950. Heft 1-8*, 543-558. Wiesbaden.

Haas, Max

1982 Zur Psalmodie der christlichen Frühzeit. In *Schweizer Jahrbuch für Musikwissenschaft. Neue Folge 2 (1982)*. Herausgegeben von der Schweizerischen Musikforschenden Gesellschaft. Musik in lateinischer Ritus. Bern und Stuttgart.

Hahn, Ferdinand

1970 *Die urchristliche Gottesdienst.* Stuttgarter Bibelstudien 41. Stuttgart.

Hanna, Edward J.

1914 Penance. Original Catholic Encyclopedia, 618-635. Available at: <http://oce.catholic.com/indew.php?title=Penance>. [Accessed 19.03.2013.]

Haran, Menahem

1978a Priests and priesthood. Until the beginning of the Hellenistic Era. In *EJ 13*, 1069-1086.

1978b Priestly Vestments. In *EJ 13*, 1063-1069.

Harnack, Adolf von

1886a Die quellen der sog. apostolischen Kirchenordnung nebst einer Untersuchung über den Ursprung des Lectorats und der anderen niederen Weihen. In *Texte und Untersuchungen II*. Leipzig.

1886b Die Lehre der zwölf Apostel nebst Untersuchungen zu ältesten Geschichte der Kirchenverfassung und des Kirchenrechts. In *Texte und Untersuchungen II*. Leipzig.

Hawkins, Frank

1992 The Tradition of Ordination in the Second Century to the Time of Hippolytus. *The Study of Liturgy*, 347-355.

Hällström, Gunnar af

2004 From Chaos to Cosmos – Interpreting the Hierarchies of Pseudo-Dionysius. In *The Eastern Mediterranean in the Late Antique and Early Byzantine Periods*. Edited by Maria Gourdouba, Leena Pietilä-Castrén and Esko Tikkala. Papers and Monographs of the Finnish Institute at Athens Vol. IX, 33-39. Athens.

2006 Ett sjungande system? En aspekt på Dionysios Areopagitens helhets-åskådning. In *Ego sum qui sum. Festskrift till Jouko Martikainen. Jouko Martikainen juhla kirja. Festschrift für Jouko Martikainen*. Redigerad av – Toimittanut – Herausgegeben von Tuomas Martikainen. Studier i systematiska teologi vid Åbo Akademi Nr 29, 267-273. Åbo.

Hefele, Carl Joseph von

1873 *Conciliengeschichte*. Erster Band. Freiburg.

1875 *Conciliengeschichte*. Zweiter Band. Freiburg.

1877 *Conciliengeschichte*. Dritter Band. Zweite, vermehrte und verbesserte Auflage.

Herzog, Avigdor

1978a Masoretic accents. In *EJ II*, 1098-1111.

1978b Psalms, Book of. In *EJ I3*, 1303-1334.

Holleman, A. W. J.

1972 Early Christian Liturgical Music. *Studia Liturgica* 8. Holland.

Honigmann-Ruge

1924 Laodikeia. In *P-W XIII:1*, 712-724.

Huglo, Michel

2001 Antiphon. In *NGD I*, second edition.

Idelsohn, A. Z.

1948 *Jewish Music in its Historical Development*. New York.

Jacobson, Joshua R.

2005 *Chanting the Hebrew Bible*. Student Edition. Philadelphia, USA.

Available at: <http://books.google.fi/books?id=cAhkCXAEy6kC&pg=PA254&lpg=PA254&dq=joshua+r+jacobson+chanting+the+hebrew+bible&source=bl&ots=nMxTxpxJ7Q&sig=HsfmAczC8t9TpvKQerKBCjQ55uE&hl=fi&sa=X&ei=Dg6SUo3zHOeB4gSVj4Aw&ved=0CD4Q6AewAg#v=onepage&q=joshua%20r%20jacobso%20chanting%20the%20hebrew%20bible&f=false>. [Accessed 24.11.2013.]

Jones, A. H. M.

1964 *The Later Roman Empire 284-602*. A Social Economic and Administrative Survey. Oxford.

Kaser, Max

1968 *Roomalainen yksityisoikeus*. Saksankielinen alkuteos Römisches Privatrecht. Suomeksi toimittanut Hannu Tapani Klami. Porvoo.

Kaufmann, Carl Maria

1917 *Handbuch der altchristlichen Epigraphik*. Freiburg.

Kelly, J.N.D.

1986 *The Oxford Dictionary of Popes*. Oxford.

Kessler, Edward

2004 *Bound by the Bible: Jews, Christians and the Sacrifice of Isaac*.

Cambridge. Available at: <http://books.google.fi/booksid=FH8hgAJsWQoC&printsec=frontcover&dq=bound+by+the+bible&hl=fi&sa=X&ei=ch4DU5i6OM7S4QSS7oBY&ved=0CDgQ6AEwAA#v=onepage&q=bound%20by%20the%20bible&f=false>. [Accessed 03.04.2013.]

Klauck, Hans-Josef

2000 *The Religious Context of Early Christianity*. Translated by Brian McNeil from Die religiöse Umwelt des Urchristentums (Kohlhammer Studienbücher Theologie, Vols. 9,1 and 9,2, Stuttgart 1995 and 1996). Avon.

Klauser, Th.

1957 Diakon. In *RAC III*, 888-909.

Knoebel, Thomas Louis

2008 Isidore of Seville: *De ecclesiasticis officiis*. Paulist Press. Available at: <http://books.google.fi/booksid=YhkmfNeIIC&printsec=frontcover&dq=knoebel+isidore+of+seville&hl=fi&sa=X&ei=wx4DU8v6H6Sn4gTyuDwDA&ved=0CC8Q6AEwAA#v=onepage&q=knoebel%20isidore%20of%20seville&f=false>. [Accessed 4.12.2012.]

Kublin, Hyman/Ed.

1978 Hazzan. In *EJ 7*, 1542-1545.

Lauha, Risto

1991 Isien jumalista yhteen Jumalaan. In Sollamo Raija (toim.), *Paimentolais-ten uskonnosta kirkkolaitokseksi*, 3-16. Suomen Eksegeettisen Seuran julkaisuja 55. Helsinki.

Lawergren, Bo

1997 Mesopotamien. Musikinstrumente. Übs.: Guido Heldt. In *MGG 6*, 143-171.

Le Bachelet, X.

1937 Arianisme. In *DTC I/2*, 1779-1863.

Lebeau, P.

1967 Paul of Samosata. In *NCE II*, 26.

Leclerq, H.

1910 Bardesane. In *DACL 2:1*, 493-495.

1913 Chantres. In *DACL 3:1*, 344-365. Paris.

1921 Doxologies. In *DACL 4:2*, 1525-1536. Paris.

1929 Lacteur. In *DACL 8:2*, 2241-2269.

1950 Schola. In *DACL 15:1*, 1008-1013. Paris.

Leeb, Helmut

1967 *Die Psalmodie bei Ambrosius*. Wiener Beiträge zur Theologie, Band XVIII. Herausgegeben von der katholisch-theologischen Fakultät der Universität Wien.

Lendering, Jona

2002 *Cursus honorum*. Available at: [http://www.livius.org/ct-cz/cursus/cursus\\_honorum.html](http://www.livius.org/ct-cz/cursus/cursus_honorum.html). [Accessed 17.1.2012.]

Leppä, Outi

2003 *The Making of Colossians*. A Study on the Formation and Purpose of a Deutero-Pauline Letter. Publications of the Finnish Exegetical Society 86. Helsinki.

Levine, Baruch A.

1978 Gibeonites and Nethinim. In *EJ* 7, 552-554.

Levinson, Pnina Navè

1992 *Mitä on juutalainen usko?* Teoksesta Einführung in die rabbinische Theologie suomentanut Katri Lindroos. Helsinki.

Lindroos, Katri

1992 Juutalainen terminologia. In Levinson 1992, 145-162.

Linton, O.

1959 Ekklesia. In *RAC IV*, 905-921.

Litzen, Veikko

2009 *Tie Nikeaan*. Roomalaisten ja kristittyjen yhteinen matka ajanlaskumme alusta valtiokirkon syntyyn. k&h, kulttuurihistoria, Turun yliopisto. Kirja-Aurora, Turku.

Liver, Jacob and Sperber, Daniel

1978 Mishmarot and Ma'amadot, priestly and levitical divisions. In *EJ* 12, 89-92.

Luijendijk, Annemarie

2008 Papyri from the Great Persecution: Roman and Christian Perspectives. In *Journal of Early Christian Studies* 16:3, 341-369.

Mansoor, Menahem

1978 Essenes. In *EJ* 6, 899-902.

Mantel, Hugo

1978 Sanhedrin. In *EJ* 14, 836-839.

Martin, Ralph. P.

1966 The Bithynian Christians' *Carmen Christo*. In *Studia Patristica Vol. VIII*, 259-265. Texte und Untersuchungen zur Geschichte der altchristlichen Literatur. Band 93. Berlin.

1974 *Worship in the Early Church*. First printed 1964. This edition 1974. Reprinted 1983. USA.

Mathiesen, Thomas J.

2001 Greece. I. Ancient. In *NGD* 10, 327-348.

McCurdy, J. Frederic

1906 Prophets and prophecy. Biblical Data and Critical view. In *The Jewish Encyclopedia X*, 213-215. Available at: <http://www.jewishencyclopedia.com>. [Accessed 13.05.2011.]

McKinnon, James W.

1980 The Exclusion of Musical Instruments from the Ancient Synagogue. In *Proceedings of the Royal Musical Association Volume 106 (1979-1980)*, 77-87.

1986 On the Question of Psalmody in the Ancient Synagogue. In *Early Music History* 6, 159-191. Cambridge.

1987a (ed.) *Music in Early Christian Literature*. Cambridge.

1987b The fourth-century origin of the gradual. In *Early Music History* 7, 91-106.

McLynn, Neil

1997 Basil, Ambrose and Dionysius. In *Studia Patristica Vol. XXIX*, 75-84.

McVey, Kathleen E.

1989 *Ephrem the Syrian: Hymns*. Paulist Press, New York.

Meimaris, Yiannis E.

1986 *Sacred Names, Saints, Martyrs and Church Officials in the Greek Inscriptions and Papyri Pertaining to the Christian Church of Palestine*. Athens.

Μενεβισογλοῦ, Παύλου

1990 Ἱστορικὴ εἰσαγωγή εἰς τοὺς κανόνας τῆς Ὁρθοδόξου Ἐκκλησίας.  
Στοκχόλμη.

Metzmacher, Gerardus

1924 De sacris fratrum Arvalium cum ecclesiae christianae caerimoniis comparandis. In *Jahrbuch für Liturgiewissenschaft 4. Band*, 1-36. Münster.

Meyendorff, Paul

1999 Penance in the Orthodox Church. In *Liturgical Theology 331*, Spring 1999. Available at:<http://www.allsaints-stl.org/Penance%20in%20the%20Orthodox%20Church%20-%20We%20Version%202008.pdf>. [Accessed 12.10.2013.]

Meyer, Marvin W. (ed.)

1987 *A Sourcebook*. Sacred Texts of the Mystery Religions of the Ancient Mediterranean World. USA.

Milasch, Nikodemus

1905 *Das Kirchenrecht der morgenländischen Kirche*. Übersetzt von Dr. Alexander R. v. Pessić. Zweite verbesserte und vermehrte Auflage. Mostar.

Milgrom, Jacob-Rothkoff, Aaron

1978 Nazirite. In *EJ 12*, 907-910.

Millard A. R.

1970 "Scriptio continua" in early Hebrew: ancient practice or modern surmise? In *Journal of Semitic Studies*, 15 (1): 2-15.

Müller, Karl Ferdinand

1964 *Der Kantor*. Seine Amt und seine Dienste. Gütersloh.

Munier, Charles

1960 *Les Statuta Ecclesiae Antiqua*. Bibliothèque de l'Institut de droit canonique de l'Université de Strasbourg. 5. Strasbourg.

Najim, Michel

2005 *Liturgical Families of the East*. Available at: <http://www.najim.net/Antioch4.pdf>. [Accessed 04.10.2013].

Nau, F.

1923 Bardesanites. In *DTC II:1*, 398-401

1939 Ephrem (Saint). In *DTC V/I*, 188-193.

Nikolainen, Aimo T.

1985 *Apostolien teot*. Avaa Uusi testamenttisi 5. Helsinki.

1986 *Paavalin korinttilaiskirjeet*. Avaa Uusi testamenttisi 7. Helsinki.

1987a *Paavalin kirkolliset kirjeet*. Varhaiskristillisen kirkon järjestäytyminen. Avaa Uusi testamenttisi 9. Helsinki.

1987b *Katoliset kirjeet*. Apostolinen kirkko esittäytyy. Avaa Uusi testamenttisi 11. Helsinki.

Norwich, John Julius

1990 *Byzantium*. The Early Centuries. First published 1988. London.

Nowacki, Edward

1994 Antiphon. In *MGG I* Sachteil, 636-660. Germany.

Ohme, Heinz

2004 Kanon I. In *RAC XX*, 1-28.

Orlandis, José / Ramos-Lisson, Domingo

1981 Die Synoden auf der Iberischen Halbinsel bis zum Einbruch des Islam (711). *Konziliengeschichte*. Herausgegeben von Walter Brandmüller. Reihe A: Darstellungen. Paderborn.

*The Oxford Dictionary of the Christian Church*.

1997 Edited by F.L.Cross and E. A. Livingstone. Third edition. Oxford.

Page, Christopher

2010 *The Christian West and its Singers*. The First Thousand Years. Yale University Press.

Pakkanen, Petra

1996 *Interpreting Early Hellenistic Religion. A Study Based on the Mystery Cult of Demeter and the Cult of Isis. Papers and monographs of the Finnish Institute at Athens Vol. III.* Helsinki.

Paul, Shalom M./Sperling, S. David

2007 Prophets and Prophecy. In *EJ 16* (2<sup>nd</sup> edn.), 566-580.

Pétridès, Sophrone

1910 Laodicea. *Catholic Encyclopedia*. The article is transcribed for New Advent by Joseph E. O'Connor. Available at: <http://www.newadvent.org/cathen/08794a.htm>. [Accessed 9.1.2005.]

Prescendi, Francesca

1998 Flamines. In *DNP 4*, 537-539.

Price, Simon

1999 *Religions of the Ancient Greeks*. Cambridge.

Quasten, Johannes

1941 The Liturgical Singing of Women in Christian Antiquity. In *The Catholic Historical Review, Volume XXVII, July 1941*, 149-165.

1954 Carmen. In *RAC II*, 901-910.

1973 *Musik und Gesang in den Kulturen der heidnischen Antike und christlichen Frühzeit*. 2., erweiterte Auflage. Liturgiewissenschaftliche Quellen und Forschungen, Heft 25. Münster.

Rabinowitz, Louis Isaac

1978 Synagogue. Origins and History. (Until the Middle Ages.) In *EJ 15*, 579-584.

Ῥάλλη, Κ. Μ.

1936 Ἐκκλησιαστικὸν δίκαιον. Περὶ τοῦ ἀξιώματος τοῦ πρωτοψάλτου. *Πρακτικὰ τῆς Ἀκαδημίας Ἀθηνῶν. Ἔτος 1936*, 66-69.

Ramsay, W. M.

1893 *The Church in the Roman Empire before 170 A.D.* London.

Riley, T.J./editors

1967 Tonsure. In *NCE 14*, 110.

Runesson, Anders

2003 *The Origins of the Synagogue. A Socio-Historical Study. Coniectania Biblica. New Testament Series 37.* Stockholm.

Safrai, Shmuel (partly with Michael Avi-Yonah)

1978 Temple. In *EJ 15*, 960-984.

Salzmann, Jorg Christian

1989 Pliny (*ep.* 10,96) and Christian Liturgy. A Reconsideration. *Studia Patristica Vol. XX*, 389-395. Leuven.

Scheid, John

1997 Arvales fratres. In *DNP 2*, 67-69. Stuttgart.

Schiffman, Lawrence H

1998 Texts and Traditions: A Source Reader for the Study of Second Temple and Rabbinic Judaism. KTAV Publishing House. Available at:  
[http://books.google.fi/booksid=VFhwknlb\\_FAC&printsec=frontcover&dq=schiffmann+texts+and+traditions&hl=fi&sa=X&ei=cCEDU6bYBqXK4ASAnICABg&ved=0CDgQ6AEwAA#v=onepage&q=schiffmann%20texts%20and%20traditions&f=false](http://books.google.fi/booksid=VFhwknlb_FAC&printsec=frontcover&dq=schiffmann+texts+and+traditions&hl=fi&sa=X&ei=cCEDU6bYBqXK4ASAnICABg&ved=0CDgQ6AEwAA#v=onepage&q=schiffmann%20texts%20and%20traditions&f=false). [Accessed 24.9.2012.]

Schmemmann, Alexander

1975 *Introduction to Liturgical Theology*. First published in English in 1966. Translated from Russian by Asheleigh E. Moorhouse. Second edition. New York.

Schneider, A. M.

1950 Ambon. In *RAC 1*, 363-365.

1954 Bema. In *RAC 2*, 129-130.

Scott, J. E.

1957 Roman Music. In *NOHM I*, 404-420.

Sendrey, Alfred

1974 *Music in the Social and Religious Life of Antiquity*. USA.

Seppälä, Hilkka

- 1996 *Sanasta säveleen*. Ortodoksisen kirkkolaulun kysymyksiä. Ortodoksisen teologian laitoksen julkaisuja. Publications of The Department of Orthodox Theology of the University of Joensuu N:o 18. Joensuun yliopisto.
- 1999 Kirkkolaulun uustestamentillisistä lähtökohdista perinteen ja suomennosten valossa. In *Erga 1997-1998*, 85-93. Joensuun yliopiston ortodoksisen teologian laitoksen vuosikirja. Orthodox Theology Year Book in the University of Joensuu. Ortodoksisen teologian laitoksen julkaisuja. Publications of Orthodox Theology in the University of Joensuu N:o 26.
- 2005a *Bysantin kirkkolaulusta ja sen taitajista*. In Ortodoksisen teologian laitoksen julkaisuja N:o 34, 9-44. Publications of Orthodox Theology in the University of Joensuu
- 2005b *The song of fire and clay* : perspectives of understanding Orthodox church singing. Translation from Finnish to English: Maria Takala-Roczzenko. Publications of Continuing Education Centre/University of Joensuu. Series B, Teaching material; n:o 21. Joensuun yliopiston täydennyskoulutuksen julkaisuja. Sarja B, Oppimateriaalia, 0788-1770: n:o 21.
- 2012 *Idän kirkon pyhä laulu*. Laulajien perinne ortodoksisessa kirkossa. Aducate Reports And Books 1/2012. Koulutus- ja kehittämisspalvelu Aducate. Itä-Suomen yliopisto. Joensuu 2012.

Seroussi, Edwin

- 2001 Jewish music. Ancient Israel/Palestine. In *NGD 13*, 29-39.

Shepherd, Massey H.

- 1970 The Liturgical Reform of Damasus I. In *Kyriakon*. Festschrift Johannes Quasten in two volumes. Edited by Patrick Granfield and Josef A. Jungmann. *Volume II*, 847-863. Münster.

Sironen, Erkki

- 1997 *The Late Roman and Early Byzantine Inscriptions of Athens and Attica*. Helsinki.

Smith, J. A.

- 1984 The Ancient Synagogue, the Early Church and Singing. In *Music and Letters*, Volume 65, No. 1, 1-16. Oxford.

Smith, W. S.

- 1962 *Musical Aspects of the New Testament*. Amsterdam.

Sparksman, Brian Joseph

1980 *The Minister of Music in the Western Church: a Canonical-Historical Study*. The Catholic University of America, Canon Law Studies No. 502. Washington.

Stern, Menahem

1978a Priests and Priesthood. From the Beginning of the Hellenistic Era. Until the Destruction of the Temple. In *EJ 13*, 1086-1088.

1978b Diaspora. In *EJ 6*, 8-19.

*The Study of Liturgy*

1992 Edited by Cheslyn Jones, Geoffrey Wainwright, Edward Yarnold SJ, Paul Bradshaw. Revised edition. London.

Stuiber, A.

1959 Doxologie. In *RAC IV*, 210-226.

Syme, Julian

1980 *Some Arval Brethren*. Oxford.

Szemler G.J.

1978 Pontifex. In *P-W Supplementband XV*, 331-396. München.

Söhngen, Oskar

1954 Theologische Grundlagen der Kirchenmusik. In dem Handbuch des evangelischen Gottesdienstes von Karl Ferdinand Müller und Walter Blankenburg: *Leiturgia I*, 2-15. Kassel.

Taitto, Ilkka

1989 Antifonian käsitteistä ja antifonien musiikillisista ominaisuuksista. In *Musiikki 3-4/1988*, 73-99. Helsinki.

Thraede, Klaus

1994 Hymnus I. In *RAC XVI*, 915-946.

Τρεμπέλα, Παναγιώτου Ν.

1993 Λειτουργικοί τύποι Αιγύπτου καὶ Ἀνατολῆς. Τόμος Β΄. Ἐκδοσις δευτέρα. Ἀθῆναι.

Tripp, D. H.

- 1984 Pliny and the Liturgy - yet again. In *Studia Patristica Vol. XV*, 581-585. Texte und Untersuchungen zur Geschichte der altchristlichen Literatur. Band 128. Berlin.

Velimirović, Miloš

- 1990 Christian Chant of the Eastern Churches. In *NOHM II: The Early Middle Ages to 1300*, 3-25. Oxford.  
Byzantine Chant. In *ibid.*, 26-68.

Wagner, Peter

- 1911 Einführung in die gregorianischen Melodien. *Ein Handbuch der Choralwissenschaft. Erster Teil*. Dritter Auflage. Leipzig.

Watson, Alan

- 1992 *The State, Law and Religion*. Pagan Rome. The University of Georgia Press. Athens and London.

Weinfeld, Moshe, and Rabinowitz, Louis Isaac

- 1978 Elder. In *EJ* 6, 578-580.

Wellesz, Egon

- 1955 Early Christian Music. In *NOHM II*, 1-10. Oxford.  
1961 *A History of Byzantine Music and Hymnography*. Second edition. Oxford.

Werner, Eric

- 1959 *The Sacred Bridge*. The Interdependence of Liturgy and Music in Synagogue and Church during the First Millennium. USA.  
1980 Jewish Music, Liturgical. In *NGD* 9, 614-634.

Wetzel, Christoph

- 1961 Die Träger des liturgischen Amtes im evangelischen Gottesdienst bei dem Apostel Paulus und bei Martin Luther. In dem Handbuch des evangelischen Gottesdienstes von Karl Ferdinand Müller und Walter Blankenburg: *Leitourgia IV*, 270-286. Kassel.

Wijngaards, John

- 2002 *No Women in Holy Orders?* The Women Deacons of the Early Church. Norwich.

Wille, Günther

1967 *Musica Romana*. Die Bedeutung der Musik im Leben der Römer.  
Amsterdam.

Wipszycka, Ewa

1993 Les ordres mineurs dans l'église d'Égypte du IV<sup>e</sup> au VIII<sup>e</sup> siècle. In *The Journal of Juristic Papyrology*, Vol. XXIII, 181-215.

Wissowa, Georg

1896 Arvales fratres. In *P-W II:2*, 1463-1486.

Wüst, E.

1932 Mithras. In *P-W XV*, 2131-2155.

Zilliacus, Henrik

1948 *Nya vägar till antiken*. Papyrusfynd och papyrusforskning. Helsingfors.

Zmorzanka, Anna Z.

2000 Bardesanes. Internet Version of the *Universal Encyclopedia of Philosophy*.  
Available at:<http://peenef2.republika.pl/angielski/hasla/b/bardesanes.html>.  
[Accessed 14.01.2013.]

#### 4. Correspondence

Juusola, Hannu

e-mail 16.4.2011.

Sironen, Erkki

e-mail 3.12.2005.

e-mail 17.11.2011.

## Appendix A. Table of inscriptions and papyri

Date      Name      Age      Title      Other details      Place      References

### Jewish singer inscriptions

3 <sup>rd</sup> cent.	Benjamin		"psalm-singer[?]"	on a list of donators	Aphrodisias	Schiffman 1998, 197-198; Page 2010, 42, 84-85.
3 <sup>rd</sup> /4 <sup>th</sup> cent.	Gaianos		scribe, psalm-singer	"lover of the law"	Rome	Horsley 1981, 115-117; Noy 1995, 399.

### Christian singer inscriptions

3 <sup>rd</sup> /4 <sup>th</sup> cent.	Gaios		presbyter	"far the best in hymns"		Page 2010, 87.
4 <sup>th</sup> /5 <sup>th</sup> cent.	Nikatorios	not decipherable		"enchanting all with sacred song and lessons"	Orhaneli (Hadrianoi pros Olympon), Bithynia, Asia Minor	Leclercq 1913, 344-345; Kaufmann 1917, 201; Merkelbach und Stauber 2001, 125.
	Redemptus		deacon	"celebrated the ancient prophet with gentle melodies"	Rome	Kaufmann 1917, 272; Ferrua 1942, 31-32, 234
384 or later	Florentius		reader	"served as a Levite"	Rome	Ferrua 1942, 243.
	Leo		bishop	"I wanted to sing the songs of the prophet"	Rome	Ferrua 1942, 240.
	Sabinus		archdeacon	"the singer of psalms with skill"	Rome	Kaufmann 1917, 264; ILCV I, 1194, 231-232.

probably after 410	Deusdedit		archdeacon	"a singer of Davidic songs"	Rome	Kaufmann 1917, 273; ILCV I, 1195, 232.
551/552	Stephanus		primicirius scolae lectorum /cantorum		Lyon, Gaul	Kaufmann 1925, 274; Le Blant I 1999, 65, 142-144
525	Andreas	36	princeps cantorum		Mertilla (modern Portugal)	Kaufmann 1917, 273; ILCV I, 1300, 250.
573	Nicetius		bishop	teacher of the psalmody	Lyon, Gaul	Kaufmann 1917, 274; Le Blant I 1999, 25, 57-60.
			singer	"most pious"	Corinth	SEG XXVI, no. 406 (1), 109 -110.
5 <sup>th</sup> /6 <sup>th</sup> cent.	Doulkitios		singer	buried with architect Mauros and his spouse	Edessa, Macedonia	Feissel 1983, 43.
5 <sup>th</sup> /6 <sup>th</sup> cent.*	Heraklios		singer		Korykos, Cilicia	MAMA III, no. 373, 155.
5 <sup>th</sup> /6 <sup>th</sup> cent.*	Menas		singer	buried with Petros	Korykos, Cilicia	MAMA III, no. 451b, 166.
5 <sup>th</sup> /6 <sup>th</sup> cent.*	Ioannes Loukas		singer		Korykos, Cilicia	MAMA III, no. 472, 169.
prob. the Middle Byzantine era*	Ioannes Kokkalas		singer		Parthenon, Athens	Orlandos 1973, no. 31, 19-20.
ca. 600			psalm readers	a <i>herōn</i> of a trade guild	Apameia, Phrygia	MAMA VI, no. 237,87-88.

5 <sup>th</sup> /7 <sup>th</sup> cent.	Theodoros		singer		Crete	Bandy 1970, no. 71, 98.
5 <sup>th</sup> /6 <sup>th</sup> cent.*	Georgios		<i>prōtopsaltēs</i>	buried with Paulos the deacon	Korykos, Cilicia	MAMA III, no.649, 192.
941	Filippos		<i>prōtopsaltēs</i>		Parthenon, Athens	CIG IV, no. 9383, 489; Orlandos 1973, no. 170, 137.
	Anatolios		presbyter	"Father of the psaltery"	Greece	CIG IV, no. 8865, 382.
between 893-991	Michael		<i>prōtopsaltēs skeuofylax</i>		Parthenon, Athens	Orlandos 1973, no. 192, 154; CIG IV, no. 9386, 489.
probably 6 <sup>th</sup> cent.*	Theofanos		deacon, <i>prōtopsaltēs skeuofylax</i>		Parthenon, Athens	Orlandos 1973, no.45, 32-33.
the Byzantine era proper*	Thomas		deacon, <i>prōtopsaltēs skeuofylax</i>		Parthenon, Athens	Orlandos 1973, no.64, 55; CIG IV, no. 9406, 492.
between 904-979	Theodoros		deacon, singer, <i>skeuofylax</i>		Parthenon, Athens	CIG IV, no. 9396, 491; Orlandos 1973, no.46, 33-34.
863	Konstantinos		singer		Parthenon, Athens	Orlandos 1973, no. 120, 100.
6 <sup>th</sup> cent.*	Isidoros		deacon, <i>tropologos</i>			MAMA III, no.452, 166.
530	Dorotheos		singer	<i>Abba</i> , monastic	El Doukheileh, Egypt	Lefevbre 1907, 1; Kaufmann 1917, 273.

\* Date estimations: Sironen, e-mail 17.11.2011.

## Singer papyri

Arabic period or 6 <sup>th</sup> /7 <sup>th</sup> cent.	Kyriakos		singer	monastic, a tax receipt	Egypt, exact provenance unknown	Boswinkel et Pestman 1978, 109-110
642-?	Apollos		singer	with his son David, both monks, a tax receipt	Bawit, Hermopolites	P. Lond. V 1748.** Available at: <a href="http://papyri.info/ddbdp/p.lond;5;1748/**">http://papyri.info/ddbdp/p.lond;5;1748/**</a> . [Seen 6.1. 2012.]
6 <sup>th</sup> cent.	Theopemptos		<i>hieropsaltēs</i>	a flour order to a baker	provenance unknown	Sijpestein 1972, 2.
7 <sup>th</sup> cent.			singer	a receipt for a rent payment	Arsinoe	PKF 801**
7 <sup>th</sup> cent.			singer	a hire contract	prob. Hermopolis	PKF 411**
ca. 600			singers	a wine distribution list		P. Iand. VIII 154. Available at: <a href="http://papyri.info/ddbdp/p.iand;8;154">http://papyri.info/ddbdp/p.iand;8;154</a> . [Seen 6.1. 2012.]
7 <sup>th</sup> /8 <sup>th</sup> cent.	Ioannes Athanasios		singer	a payment list	Aphrodito	P. Lond. IV 1430,112**. Available at: <a href="http://papyri.info/ddbdp/p.Lond;4;1430">http://papyri.info/ddbdp/p.Lond;4;1430</a> . [Seen 6.1.2012.]

\*\* Wipszycka 1993, 207-208.

**Heathen inscriptions of female singers**

	Ptolemais		virgin		Rome	CIG IV, no. 9613, 534; Leclerq 1913, 351.
	Heraklea		<i>psaltria</i>		Greece	IG XII:5, no. 592, 154.

## Appendix B. Table of chronology

An allusive summary of items and persons mentioned in the text

Mithraism into the Roman Empire the 1 <sup>st</sup> cent. CE	Pliny the Elder (23-79)	Josephus (37-ca.100)	Philo of Alexandria (ca. 20 BCE-50 CE)
		Christians persecuted by Jews ca. 50	
Agrippa II, King of Judea (reign 53-100)		1 Cor ca. 56	
Destruction of the Temple of Jerusalem 70		Col and Eph ca. 60-90	
	Clement of Rome ca. 95	Pastoral Epistles, end of the 1 <sup>st</sup> cent.	
Persecution of Trajan (reign 98-117)	Letter of Pliny the Younger ca. 112		Letters of Ignatius of Antioch ca. 110
Emperor Antoninus Pius (reign 138-161)	Apology of Justin Martyr ca. 155		
Completion of the Mishnah the end of the 2 <sup>nd</sup> cent.		Apocryphal Acts of Paul ca. 185-195	Bardesanes and Harmonios, Syria
Emperor Septimius Severus (reign 193-211)	Tertullian (ca. 160-ca.225)	Clement of Alexandria beginning of the 3 <sup>rd</sup> cent.	Apocryphal Acts of John 2 <sup>nd</sup> /3 <sup>rd</sup> cent.
		Apostolic Tradition ca. 215	Apocryphal Acts of Thomas beginning of the 3 <sup>rd</sup> cent.
		<i>Didascalia Apostolorum</i> ca. 230	Apocryphal Acts of Thaddeus 3 <sup>rd</sup> cent. (possibly 6 <sup>th</sup> )
Persecution of Decius (reign 249-251)	Letters of Cyprian of Carthage middle of the 3 <sup>rd</sup> cent.	The Letter of Cornelius of Rome 251 to Antioch	
		The Apostolic Church Order, end of the 3 <sup>rd</sup> century	Paul of Samosata (bishop of Antioch 260-268)

Persecution of Diocletian (reign 284-305)	The confiscation at Cirta, North Africa 303		The confiscation at Chysis, Egypt 304
Last mention of the Arval Brethren 304			
Emperor Constantine (reign 306-337)		The Edict of Milan 313	Arianism ca. 310, from Alexandria
	Pope Sylvester I (reign 314-335)	Synod of Ancyra 314	
	Athanasius of Alexandria (ca.296-373)	Council of Nicaea 325	Eusebius of Caesarea, HE ca. 325
		Synod of Sardica 343	Canons of Hippolytus ca. 336-340
	Hilary of Poitiers (ca. 315-ca.367)		Flavian and Diodore at Antioch ca. 350
Jerome (ca. 345-420)	Pope Damasus I (reign 366-384)	Ephraem Syrus (306-373)	Basil of Cappadocia (ca. 330-379)
Augustine of Hippo (354-430)	Ambrose of Milan (ca. 339-397)	John Chrysostom (ca. 345-407)	Cyril of Jerusalem (reign 348-386)
	Priscillianist heresy from Hispania 370	Apollinarius of Laodicea, Syria (ca. 310-ca. 390)	
Emperor Theodosius I (reign 379-395)		Synod of Laodicea, Phrygia ca. 380	Apostolic Constitutions ca. 380
Prohibition of heathen cults 391-392	Pope Siricius (reign 384-399)		Canons of Athanasius end of the 4 <sup>th</sup> cent.
The final division of the Roman Empire 395	Fourth Council of Carthage 398		<i>Testamentum Domini</i> prob. 4 <sup>th</sup> /5 <sup>th</sup> cent.
	First Council of Toledo 400		Pilgrimage of Egeria ca. 400
Completion of the Talmud of Jerusalem, first half of the 5 <sup>th</sup> cent.			Sozomen, HE beginning of the 5 <sup>th</sup> cent.

<i>Codex Theodosianus</i> publ. 438		Socrates Scholasticus, HE before 450
	Council of Chalcedon 451	Theodoret of Cyrillus, HE before 460
Completion of the Babylonian Talmud ca. 500	<i>Statuta Ecclesiae Antiqua</i> prob. the latter part of the 5 <sup>th</sup> cent.	Gelasius of Cyzicus (fl. 475)
	Second Council of Toledo 527 or 531	<i>Codex Justinianus</i> publ. between 529-534
	Council of Vaison 529	
	First Council of Braga 561	<i>Novellae Justiniani</i> latter half of the 6 <sup>th</sup> cent.
	Second Council of Braga 572	
Pope Gregory I (reign 590-604)	Synod of Rome 595	
Isidore of Seville (d. 636)	Fourth Council of Toledo 633	Arabic Canons of Basil former half of the 7 <sup>th</sup> cent.
Pope Sergius I (reign 687-701)		Synod of Trullo 691

## Index of fundamental issues

Ambrose of Milan.....	145-152, 157-8, 182, 209, 225
Apostolic Canons.....	113, 122-124, 173, 218
Apostolic Church Order.....	76, 88, 121, 221
Apostolic Constitutions.....	112-125, 157, 166, 215ff., 221
Apostolic Tradition.....	70-4, 80, 88, 96, 113, 120-1, 126-7, 157, 168, 194, 224
Arianism.....	102-3, 131, 147, 156, 217, 220
Athanasius of Alexandria.....	99ff., 125, 156-7, 171, 223
Augustine of Hippo.....	99, 147-8, 152-5, 158, 226
Bardesanes.....	84-5, 89, 132, 217, 220
Basil of Caesarea.....	104-5, 147, 156, 193ff., 200, 209, 215, 222
Carthage, Councils of.....	161, 164, 208, 218, 226
Chalcedon, Council of.....	142, 166-8, 201, 208-210, 216, 222
Clement of Alexandria.....	31, 99, 223
Clement of Rome.....	94, 113, 115, 124
Clementine Liturgy.....	115ff.
Cornelius of Rome.....	78, 88, 139, 224
Council of Tarragona.....	176, 191
<i>cursus clericus</i> .....	141, 143, 146
Cyprian of Carthage.....	77-8, 88, 121, 226
Cyril of Jerusalem.....	128, 225
Damasus I, Pope.....	133-4, 143, 187
<i>Didascalia Apostolorum</i> .....	74-6, 83, 88-9, 113, 115, 220-1
Dionysius (the Pseudo-)Areopagite.....	169-171
Egeria.....	129, 148, 157, 225
Ephraem Syrus.....	132
Euchologion , the Great.....	202, 208, 218
Flavian and Diodore.....	103, 111, 220-1
Gregory I, Pope.....	187ff., 193, 209, 224
Harmonios.....	84, 132, 217, 220
<i>hazzan</i> .....	41, 45, 48ff., 63, 110, 211, 213
Hippolytus, Canons of.....	95-8, 156, 223
Ignatius of Antioch.....	62, 124, 220

Isidore of Seville.....	178ff., 209, 212, 218, 227
Jerome.....	133ff., 143, 157, 182, 190, 209, 224
Jesus of Nazareth.....	41-2, 59, 84, 87, 89, 143-4
John, Apocryphal Acts of .....	84, 89, 145
John Chrysostom.....	130-1, 157, 201
Justin Martyr.....	64ff., 87-8, 97, 224
Laodicea, Synod of.....	11, 94, 107-112, 120, 124, 144, 156-7, 164, 166, 173, 185, 201, 209, 214, 216, 222
Levites, in Judaism and Christianity.....	34ff., 75, 135-6, 157, 179, 187, 200, 213, 224
<i>Liber Pontificalis</i> .....	18, 78, 133-4, 139, 187
Nicaea, Council of.....	19, 91ff., 122, 155, 168-9, 177, 214, 222
Paul, Apostle.....	53ff., 59-60, 63, 68, 217, 221-2
Paul of Samosata.....	85-6, 89, 132, 217, 220-1
Pliny the Younger.....	57-9, 65, 87, 217, 221
<i>schola</i> .....	22-3, 191, 212
<i>schola cantorum</i> .....	190, 192-3, 209
<i>sheli'ah zibbur</i> .....	12, 41, 49, 213, 219
<i>Statuta Ecclesiae Antiqua</i> .....	161ff., 184, 208, 218, 226
Tertullian.....	66ff., 70, 72, 87ff., 225
<i>Testamentum Domini</i> .....	96, 121, 126, 157
Thaddaeus, Apocryphal Acts of.....	85, 219
Trullo, Synod of.....	107, 122, 198ff., 209, 216, 222