Mapping the cultural elements that support and inhibit music teachers' sociomusical identities in Chile

Rolando Angel-Alvarado[a]*, rolando.angel.alvarado@gmail.com

Guadalupe López-Íñiguez[b], guadalupe.lopez.iniguez@uniarts.fi

Isabel Quiroga-Fuentes[a], isabel.quiroga.fuentes@gmail.com

Bayron Gárate-González[a], b.garate.g@gmail.com

[a]*Instituto de Música, Universidad Alberto Hurtado, Santiago, Chile.*

[b]*Sibelius Academy, University of the Arts Helsinki, Finland.*

*Corresponding author: 31 Almirante Barroso Street, 303 office, ZIP 8340540 Santiago, Chile. Email addresses: rolando.angel.alvarado@gmail.com & rangel@uahurtado.cl

Abstract

Sociomusical identities determine social positions of individuals based on traditions and historical backgrounds, taking as a departure point the reciprocal interchange of cultural elements within a social group. This study aims to identify mechanisms of support/inhibition of sociomusical identities of school music teachers from Chile. The country's exceptionally long and narrow characteristics makes it feasible to disclose distinctive features of sociomusical identities of teachers active in various geographical zones. Thirty school music teachers shared their professional stories in terms of social positions and transcultural processes through semi-structured interviews. A multiple-case study was employed to analyse their stories from a humanistic standpoint based on boundaries of time, space, and place. Findings reveal that sociomusical identities are supported/inhibited by elements within the national education system. Furthermore, the sociomusical identities of music teachers depend on personal interests, which are aroused through pedagogical knowledge, teaching experience, and the environmental conditions of the *milieu*. Implications suggest generalisations about music pedagogy should be avoided within a country, as each context deals with particular issues.

Sociomusical capital is understood as a sociocultural capital subtype (e.g. Bernal, 2017; Bourdieu, 1986), such that it is distributed within an immanent social structure, supporting or inhibiting a sociomusical mobilisation (Fuhrmann, 2011; Hennion, 2016). Within that understanding, social life is determinant in the strengthening or slackening of an individual's sociomusical identity (Angel-Alvarado, 2020), negotiating it permanently in a never-ending cycle across life (Ozer et al., 2017; Van Klyton, 2014). Sociomusical identities determine the social positions of individuals based on behaviours displayed publicly (Kippen, 2002; Skinner, 2015), delving even into "things people know but never need to explain" (Weidman 2012, p. 230). Thus, it is reinforced through traditions, social classes, upbringing styles, and historical backgrounds (Casas-Mas et al., 2014) because individuals can be classified by patterns linked to cultural goods and membership in a group or groups (Bourdieu, 1986).

Sociomusical identities should be seen as transcultural processes of "preservation, adaptation and innovation" (Harnish, 2005, p. 265) due to local and foreign communities exchanging cultural elements reciprocally within a social group (Hao et al., 2016; Rojas, 2021), emerging a new kind of identity based on syncretism and interculturality (Casas-Mas, 2018; Längler et al., 2020; Moore, 2016; Steingress 2004). Such social practices can be observed, for instance, in the Aymara youth from Chile who recreated the cumbia using digital and electronic instrumentation (Guerrero, 2007). It may also be seen in the mixing of Andean sounds with contemporary musical elements in Chile since the 1960s, highlighting renowned artists linked mainly to protest song movement, such as, for example, Quilapayún, Inti Illimani, Illapu, Los Jaivas, or Congreso (i.e., González, 2012; García, 2013). Furthermore, such social positions and transcultural processes can be also

observed not only in performing musicians, but also in the practices of in-service music schoolteachers. In fact, music schoolteachers represent a particular group of study in connection to sociomusical identities because—as Chile is the longest and narrowest country in the world—the existence of a large diversity of school realities can be recognised *a priori*.

In this study, we aim to identify mechanisms which support and inhibit the sociomusical identities of music schoolteachers who work in the compulsory education system in Chile. Different zones of the country are represented herein with the purpose of mapping distinctive features of each zone, taking into consideration *a priori* that music education is seen as a compulsory subject in the curriculum for primary education and an elective subject in secondary education levels. The instructional time is not above 90 minutes per week, having lost temporal resources in the last decade because the national education policy prioritises knowledge areas assessed in standardised tests (Valdivia & Angel-Alvarado, 2021). Hence, music education is understood by students as a mere chance for increasing the grade point average (Angel-Alvarado et al., 2019; Magnitzky & Sepúlveda, 2017), and by school administrations as an opportunity for financial savings, allocating limited resources for improving work conditions (Angel-Alvarado et al., 2021).

Historical background of Chilean compulsory (music) education

Sociomusical identities are inextricably related to historical background; in Chile, music education has been part of the country's compulsory education system since 1847 (Sepúlveda, 2017); that is, it was included in the national curriculum before the War of the Pacific (1879–1883), which was determinant for configuring the current map of

Chile. According to Pino (2015), the national history of music education may be divided into four periods:

1. First period: Schools understood music as an adornment in the 19th century because there was no teaching identity.

2. Second period: Music was used in schools to internalise moral values and the sense of belonging to the country. This period ended in 1945 with the graduation of the first generation of specialist school music teachers.

3. Third period: Music education was centred on disciplinary content knowledge, with the emergence of the first Latin American children's orchestra thanks to Jorge Peña Hen (Carlson, 2014). In this period, the Association of Music Teachers was founded through the influence of Domingo Santa Cruz, who was elected subsequently as a Vice-president of the Board of Directors at the first general assembly of the International Society for Music Education (McCarthy, 2004).

4. Fourth and current period: This period pursues developing competencies linked to the music industry (Valdivia & Angel-Alvarado, 2021), such that Competency-Based Learning (CBL) is promoted in music education. In this regard, the national curriculum for music education establishes that students should acquire and develop the capacity for assessing themselves in terms of musical skills (Mineduc, 2013; 2016).

This means that there is a national curriculum for music education in Chile, which must be implemented in the four geographical zones. According to the national curriculum (Mineduc, 2013; 2016), the content-knowledge pedagogy should be centred on three pillars iteratively. First (1), music listening pursues the generation of audiences and

cultural consumers. Second (2), music performing is oriented towards expression, encompassing both musical interpretation and creation. Finally (3), the third pillar is reflexivity, which serves to value the diversity of musical practices. Thus, the national curriculum establishes the development areas in music learning, giving each music schoolteacher the autonomy to make decisions regarding activities, repertoires, and particular contents (Angel-Alvarado, 2018).

Four geographical zones in Chile

Chile is the longest country in the world. In figurative terms, the septentrional point of the country may be envisioned at the Norwegian North Cape, while the opposite end could be imagined at the Lebanese Mediterranean border. Such a geographical condition gives rise to a centralised political and economic model because the head of each governmental institution performs the functions in the Central Zone (OECD, 2017), which comprises the Valparaiso Region and Metropolitan Region. Both regions depict a demographical barrier that serves to differentiate between the septentrional and meridional areas, spanning from the Pacific Ocean until the Andes Mountain. The centralised model is replicated in music education because, according to Angel-Alvarado et al. (2022), music schoolteachers who work in remote areas away from the Central Zone express a deep disconformity regarding the budget for music education and the stereotyped incorporation of local traditions in the national curriculum. Furthermore, nine out of fifteen music teacher education programmes are implemented in the Central Zone (cf. Poblete, 2021), which reinforces the centralised model.

The Northern Zone has the aridest desert in the world, where mining extraction is the main job market. There is a cosmopolitan population because different communities have settled down for reasons relating to business and asylum. In this zone, traditional music prevails in popular feasts and celebrations, highlighting that native Northern sounds are intertwined with elements of different foreign cultures reflecting religion and globalisation (i.e. Gavilán & Vigueras, 2020; Guerrero, 2007). In contrast, the Southern Zone is well-known as woodland because forestry and agricultural companies dominate the job market. This is also a cosmopolitan society, but the Spanish elements have been recreated musically in lyrics and sounds. That is, the sound heritage of native and ancestral communities have been preserved practically in a pure state. Furthermore, there are cases where ancestral tongues, such as *Mapudungun*, are used in popular music (Rekedal, 2019).

In addition to those areas, there is also an Insular Zone that is linked administratively to the Valparaiso Region, where there exist clear cultural differences. For instance, two insular territories can be highlighted in terms of the urban population. On the one hand, the Juan Fernandez Islands are inhabited mainly by descendants of European immigrants, where local waltzes influenced by rhythms from the Southern zone prevail. On the other hand, the Easter Island is populated by native people primarily, who have internalised aboriginal and Polynesian music thoroughly. Only five schools offer compulsory education in the Insular Zone.

In addition, a sole Northern university offers a bachelor's degree in music teacher education, five Southern universities issue the bachelor's degree in music pedagogy, and no university exists in the Insular Zone. Furthermore, postgraduate programmes oriented

towards music education do not exist in Chile. Regarding the enrolment in music teacher education programmes, there is a standard selection process that does not consider previous musical knowledge and skills. Then, student teachers could have no disciplinary knowledge in music reading, pre-professional training in a specific musical instrument, or verifiable experience in performative activities. This means that higher education programmes cannot anticipate whether candidates possess or not the sociomusical capital required for starting a degree in music pedagogy.

Method

Multiple-case study research is employed to analyse music schoolteachers' individual stories from a humanistic standpoint (Stake, 2006), carrying out private interviews because they enable revealing information within "a bounded system with boundaries such as time, space, or place" (Strike et al., 2019, p.152). First (1), the time inquires in retrospective and prospective visions. Second (2), the space delves into existential matters within a community, encompassing feelings, expectations, or moral attitudes. Finally (3), the place demarcates the workplace's borders where the pedagogy is done. These boundaries allow disclosing unintentional agreements and discrepancies among music schoolteachers, which have served to identify and map mechanisms of support/inhibition of sociomusical identities.

Participants

The nonprobability sample was chosen to allow for maximum variation sampling to have a good representation of music schoolteachers from different geographical zones who

work either in primary or secondary schools (i.e., Shaheen et al., 2019). The number of

participants per zone is irrelevant in terms of proportionality within that zone (Sim et al.,

2018), as there are no official statistics about the total number of music educators in the

school system. 30 music schoolteachers participated (Table 1); 23 work in socially

vulnerable schools, fluctuating the percentage of vulnerability between 70% and 96%

according to the School Vulnerability Index applied by the National System for

Allowance with Equality and the Ministry of Education. Participants are qualified as

music specialists, with the exception of two Northern educators who have governmental

authorisation due to the lack of schoolteachers in the most septentrional area. Names of

participants were substituted, using the geographical zone, the first letter of the 'teacher'

word, and a nominal number (e.g., Northern T1, Central T1, and Southern T1).

Table 1. Characteristics of the sampling unit according to geographical zones.

	n	Age		EXP 1		EXP 2		Master's degree	Doctoral researcher
		Mean	SD	Mean	SD	Mean	SD		
Northern Zone	7	32	5.9	6	3.5	3	2.8	3	0
Central Zone	15	36	10.2	11	10.6	5	3.5	7	1
Southern Zone	7	34	7.6	8	6.4	2	1.5	0	0
Insular Zone	1	41	-	12	-	2	-	0	0

EXP 1 = Total years of teaching experience.
EXP 2 = Years of teaching experience at the current school.
SD = Standard Deviation.

Materials

Semi-structured interview based on commonplaces. Four questions were presented in the

Spanish language, and structured according to three criteria. First (1), the time delves into

ongoing stories on music education valuing (two questions: how do you think music

education is valued in Chile? Do you have a mentor or idol in music education?). Second

(2), the space focuses the conversation on an existential mindset regarding pedagogy (one

question: Could you please describe your teaching practices?). Lastly (3), the place is centred on the cultural heritage of the context (one question: How do your teaching practices consider cultural elements of the context?).

Photos and videos. Music schoolteachers voluntarily provided visual evidence of educational milestones discussed during the interview. For instance, photos of facilities and resources, as well as videos of school rituals, teaching tasks or school bands. Those materials were used during data analysis to contextualise their narratives; however, they are not revealed due to confidentiality agreements.

Procedures

Data collection and ethical aspects. A personal email apprised the study purpose, the participation protocol for the interview, and the informed consent. According to Chilean law (Ministry of Health, 2006), consents must ensure voluntary participation, data confidentiality, and the right to leave the interview in any moment. Almost all interviews were conducted using Zoom, obtaining the authorisation of each participant by means of a voice recording. The exception was the conversation with the Insular T1, as the Internet connection is rather weak on the island, forcing the first author and participant to talk and record the conversation via phone. MP3 files of the recordings were used to transcribe the conversations. The average time of the interviews was 52 minutes. Photos and videos relating to the discussion were requested at the end of the interview, assuming the commitment of data confidentiality. Participants shared the digital evidence voluntarily through Google Drive.

Data analysis. Three conceptual categories are established to organise information. The *time* is centred on the music education valuing, the *space* is focused on the existential mindset concerning music teaching, and the *place* delves into the contextualisation of the teaching. These conceptual categories are analysed through open, axial, and selective coding procedures (Appendix 1). Such a research design serves to map the sociomusical identities of school music teachers in Chile. Hence, our position as researchers is to disclose that the music pedagogy in Chile cannot be generalised. However, our findings may also make generalisations according to geographical zones, such that the article should be understood within an ongoing research plan and not as a conclusive research project.

Results

Time: Music education valuing

There is an unintentional agreement across the country that music education is undervalued in the school system, although arguments are different in each geographical zone. Northern music schoolteachers stated that "the music is understood as an adornment" (Northern T2), such that "music educators are socially evaluated in school ceremonies" (Northern T3). In this scenario, "students prefer ensuring better qualifications in other subjects rather than music" (Northern T1), "overlooking an education based on spirituality and humanism" (Northern T6). Certainly, "the national policy understands the music learning as a right" (Northern T6), but "the instructional time and the budget are reduced" (Northern T7) to the point that "the governmental office delay more than one year in delivering musical instruments at schools" (Northern T4).

Central music schoolteachers expressed that "the education system prioritises knowledge assessed through standardised tests" (Central T2), which is accepted by school communities because "parents complain to music educators about low grades, but they accept silently low marks in maths" (Central T12). This is primarily because "music education is seen by parents as a subject to increase the grade point average" (Central T14), which is determinant in the standard university selection process. So, "the subject becomes relevant only in school ceremonies and celebration" (Central T7). In this panorama, "principals allocate very limited resources to music education" (Central T8), forcing schoolteachers to implement handcrafting tasks where "bottles are filled with rice" (Central T10); however, "a bottle filled with rice, or a broomstick cut in two parts do not generate real music…. Equal opportunities for learning to play real instruments in all schools do not exist" (Central T4). The Insular music schoolteacher agrees, adding that "some schools have no music room, and principals are disinterested in installing facilities."

In the Southern Zone, music schoolteachers emphasised that "students conceive music as a superfluous activity within schools" (Southern T2), to the extent that "they put under scrutiny the relevance of music education in the grade book" (Southern T3). The school management devalues the music curriculum because "headteachers used to apply tests of other subjects in the instructional time for music education, provoking tensions among music teachers, principals, and teaching staff" (Southern T5). Certainly, "schoolteachers of other subjects conceive musical practice as a noisy activity often, but they reconsider the value of music education when a band or choir is required for ceremonies or other school rituals" (Southern T4). Hence, music education is "seen as an

adornment" (Southern T3), placing music schoolteachers with "the responsibility for organisation, amplification, conducting school bands, and so forth" (Southern T2).

Regarding mentors or idols in music education, Northern music schoolteachers recognised an admiration for their teachers from conservatoires and universities (Northern T1; T4; T5; T6). Nonetheless, it is noteworthy that three participants paraphrased the legacy of Paulo Freire explicitly, understanding "music as the practice of freedom" (Northern T3), recognising that "students also teach the educator in dialogical terms" (Northern T1), and expressing the value of "generative words" (Northern T6). Central participants also admired professionals linked to their instrumental and initial teacher training (Central T1; T7; T8; T9; T10; T12; T13). However, Central T7 highlighted spiritual inspiration depicted by icons of Chilean music, such as Margot Loyola, Violeta Parra, and Lucy Briceño; whereas Central T8 and Central T9 turn to Humberto Maturana as a model, given that "emotions serve for developing the fine motor skill of fingers" (Central T9).

Southern music schoolteachers expressed an admiration for educators who trained them both in instrumental and pedagogical terms (Southern T3; T5; T6; T7). However, they stated that their music schoolteachers were not good guides, sharing their negative experiences. For instance, Southern T7 revealed that his music teacher hit him "really hard with a recorder", and Southern T5 described how his music teacher encouraged him "to play the flute in each school ceremony, disregarding the rest of the students. That is, the collective lesson became a one-to-one instruction because she was not capable of managing misbehaviours of my classmates." Consequently, some current Southern music schoolteachers have a negative opinion about the pedagogy applied by their predecessors.

Space: Existential mindset concerning music teaching

Participants apply similar teaching practices and contents unintentionally, focusing activities on music theory, instrumental playing, music technology, songwriting, and cover making. Only Southern T2 placed emphasis on his specialisation as a music conductor and his critical attitude for assessing academic achievement. The rest of the participants provided specific information about their teaching practice, revealing differences between geographical zones.

Northern music schoolteachers referred to "emotional learning and value-based education" (Northern T2) because "courtesy and respect are important" (Northern T1) for "students [to] learn in happy, empathic, and solidary environments" (Northern T6). In this regard, Northern T3 described how a learner "used to unleash his rage by pummelling a wall with a punch. He vents currently his frustration writing lyrics, which are transformed in songs subsequently." Another story is provided by Northern T7, revealing that a "student sang *El cielito de mi pieza* [Congreso Band] to give emotional support to a classmate when his mother passed away. It is fascinating that a little girl expresses her feelings of empathy musically." Concerning repertoires, all participants prioritise traditional music, naming Violeta Parra with "*Gracias a la vida*" (Northern T2), Victor Jara with "*El derecho de vivir en paz*" (Northern T6), and rhythms from Altiplano, such as *takirari*, *huayno*, *tinku*, *morenada* (Northern T2; T4) and "the *Caporales*" (Northern T3). Popular music was also discussed, in particular, the Chilean rock/pop band called Los Prisioneros (Northern T1; T2; T6). However, Northern T6 was accused of

"ideologising to students in political terms with the song *El derecho de vivir en paz* during national uprising in 2019."

Central participants also expressed the relevance of courtesy, empathy, and values (Central T5; Central T13), highlighting that "the teacher must give emotional support and affection to learners" (Central T6). Thus, Central T9 admitted a "training in neuro-linguistic programming to display a good mood through jokes and satire." These music schoolteachers also referred to learner autonomy, as "it is important that each student can make decisions about their own education process" (Central T14) because, in addition to "developing the capacity of self-assessing" (Central T15), "sooner or later, they will be alone in the world" (Central T12). Regarding repertoires, Central T7 considers that "Violeta Parra' songs are indispensable in the curriculum", which is ratified by other participants, who also included traditional songs from Victor Jara (e.g., Central T6; T12; T14). Despite this, popular music prevails in classroom settings because each participant alluded to rock, pop, rap, jazz, or trap. The list of Chilean bands is headed by "Los Prisioneros, Congreso, Los Jaivas, and Tiro de Gracia" (Central T10). However, English-speaking music also is taught at schools, as demonstrated by 12 teachers who discussed or shared videos using repertoire from The Beatles, Queen, Louis Armstrong, Jeanette, Gotye, Toto, or Michael Jackson.

The teaching practice of Southern music schoolteachers takes as a cornerstone the contextualisation of the repertoire to "establish sociocultural bonds within the national territory" (Southern T6) and "fostering the socialisation between classmates" (Southern T4). Therefore, music education is based on "democratisation because each student participates actively in music lessons" (Southern T5). Artists such as Violeta Parra and

Victor Jara play a determinant role again because all teachers named them. However, five participants also discussed the relevance of love songs in the Spanish language, highlighting Chilean singers as "Mon Laferte or Camila Gallardo" (Southern T3), Mexican artists as "Marco Antonio Solís and Jesse & Joy" (Southern T1), as well as Latin rock, such as Los Enanitos Verdes, Los Tres, La Ley, and Los Prisioneros (Southern T2, Southern T7). In this part of the conversation, Southern T4 reported teaching censorship: "the principal prohibited me from teaching the Anita Tijoux' song called 'Cacerolazo,' even when Chile's Constitution guarantees teaching freedom. Obviously, I will be fired, but I am not scared because my dignity as a teacher is paramount."

Finally, the Insular music schoolteacher expressed that his teaching practice is centred on live music; that is, "students play music on public stages often." The repertoire is mainly "popular music, although it is appropriate to say that we recreate traditional music toward a modern perspective, including electric instruments, passages for improvisation, and tailoring typical songs to urban rhythms, such as reggaeton, trap, or hip hop." The Insular participant concluded: "Here, the students enjoy their kinds of music, and they do not accept that the teacher imposes a task. They do not do it; it's that simple."

Place: The contextualisation of the teaching

The Insular music schoolteacher understands teaching contextualisation from a sociomusical approach because traditional repertoires are mixed with popular music by introducing foreign and modern instruments and rhythms. However, the contextualisation

of the teaching is understood differently in the other geographical zones because each one has a particular culture.

In the Northern Zone, teachers incorporate Altiplano's rhythms and other elements linked to these expressions, such as "musical instruments" (Northern T4) or "masks of devotional dances" (Northern T3). Ancestral legends are also used as a learning resource to internalise repertoires, highlighting stories where a "princess falls in love with a mountain or an armadillo, as well as the aboriginal attachment between the human being and vicuna" (Northern T1). Moreover, teachers are conscious that students from other nationalities have settled down in the zone, such that popular music plays a determinant social role in establishing bridges in relational terms. In this way, cumbia is often used in classroom settings because "students enjoy making arrangements in cumbia style" (Northern T5), considering "sound elements from Argentina with the *villera*, Peru with the *chicha*, and Chile with the *pachanga*" (Northern T1), in addition to "repertoires and lyrics from Colombia" (Northern T3).

In the Southern Zone, participants teach traditional music from different parts of the country "to foster the internalisation of the whole of Chile's musical panorama" (Southern T1). However, Southern T5 expressed disagreement over this stance because, according to his vision, "rhythms as reggaeton, rap or cumbia should prevail in lessons because the use of traditional music reveals an old-fashioned approach to teaching, causing tensions between schoolteachers and students." Such a vision is coherent with the teaching practice of the sample because most of the schoolteachers use cumbia and rap primarily, including love songs, reggaeton, and trap. Nonetheless, "lyrics are evaluated thoroughly before the lesson because those songs are composed to an adult's audience"

(Southern T3). The exception is the Southern T7, who states: "We cannot reinforce the influence of home that is depicted by reggaeton and cumbia. To broaden musical taste is our responsibility, listening to artists of different genres, such as Mercedes Sosa, Deep Purple or Paco de Lucía."

Southern music schoolteachers recognise that a variety of Latin American communities have settled down in the zone, but those families live in neighbouring cities (Southern T2; T6). Therefore, few learners "have enrolled in music courses at school" (Southern T5). At this point, Southern T1 has only two students, "using a specialised language for explaining musical contents, avoiding Chilean slangs." In contrast, Southern T3 does not tailor his oral expression because he thinks that "music education is naturally centred on soft skills." Southern T7, however, provides information about students from Haiti who do not speak the Spanish language, highlighting that "they are brilliant in music activities because they have rhythmic abilities for dancing and percussion playing. Nonetheless, the singing is hard for them for idiomatic reasons, although they will get it on." Such a difficulty with the Spanish language is observed in other realms, as "they have difficulties following instructions and writing." At this point, Southern T7 is convinced that "schools are implementing wrong plans because no member of teaching staff understands Haitian Creole, and, even so, administrations refuse to hire a professional who supports in translation matters."

Finally, music schoolteachers from the Central Zone recognise that the context is influenced by Information and Communication Technology (ICT) because "this generation was born with the smartphone in hands. They use it for everything" (Central T2). Thus, Central T4 authorises the use of mobile phones to "seek lyrics and chords on

the internet." Likewise, Central T2 delivers sheet music and instructional guides in digital format, recognising the importance of "establishing clear rules because some students suffer smartphone addiction." Moreover, some students "learn to utilise production and post-production audio platforms, when schools have a specific and equipped room for those activities" (Central T5).

Central music schoolteachers also refer to the school project to contextualise music lessons. Central T4 highlights that "all musical activities are centred on a big band ensemble because the school has invested a lot of funding in it", Central T2 organises "a Festival of English Song every year as the school promotes British values", and the Central T1 coordinates "activities based on traditional music because the school has financed the configuration of a Latin American orchestra and the city celebrates annually an important festival of troubadours." Another example was provided by Central T10, who works in an Adventist school, as her "students are systematically rehearsing and playing live music at the church, which is beneficial for music lessons." Likewise, Central T2 works in a school linked administratively to the Chilean Navy, such that "the disciplinary structure is essential in all activities, serving to internalise the habit of practising the instrument daily."

All Central music schoolteachers agree that many students from other nationalities have enrolled at school, and participate in music lessons. However, most of them do not provide information about the teaching practice. One exception is Central T7, who describes how "each community of foreign learners organises their own show for the cultural fair of the school, where they can dance and sing their traditional music, as well as selling their traditional food." Another exception is Central T2, who prioritises

"repertoires in the English language to challenge each student in regard to singing." The last example was provided by Central T14, who "prefers to teach songs in other languages to internalise the vocal technique, having used the Portuguese and some ancestral languages from Chile," such as the *Mapudungun* that is the native language of the *Mapuches*, and the Rapa Nui that is the spoken tongue by the people from Easter Island. According to the Central T14, "typical Chilean students have heard those languages, but they do not speak Portuguese, *Mapudungun*, or Rapa Nui."

A general view of boundaries

Music education is undervalued by national society, and music schoolteachers from different zones are dissatisfied with those perceptions. Participants stated that music is understood as an adornment because it is relevant in school rituals, but it is undervalued as a subject by principals, teaching staff, students, and parents. Some repertoires have been excluded due to ideological conflicts. Furthermore, music schoolteachers from all zones do not recognise educators who taught them during primary or secondary education as mentors. Concurrently, three discrepancies between geographical zones have identified (Table 2): 1) the purpose of music education; 2) repertoires applied in classroom settings; and 3) contextualisation of music teaching.

Table 2. Understanding music education in different geographical zones.

	Purpose of music education	Repertoires applied in classroom settings	Contextualisation of music teaching
Northern Zone	Emotional learning and socialisation	V. Parra, V. Jara, Andean sounds, and popular music	Local culture, cumbias, and modern instruments
Central Zone	Learner autonomy and CBL	V. Jara and V. Parra, and popular music	ICT, singing in different languages
Southern Zone	Socialisation between classmates	V. Parra, V. Jara, and popular music, mainly love songs	Avoidance of old-fashioned rhythms
Insular Zone	Socialisation through live music	Local songs and urban rhythms	Local songs are mixed with popular music

Discussion and conclusions

According to participants, music education is undervalued by Chilean society across the country because the point of interest is centred on obtaining good academic outcomes in subjects assessed through standardised tests (OECD, 2005). Thus, students tend to procrastinate in musical tasks (Angel-Alvarado et al., 2019; Magnitzky & Sepúlveda, 2017), school administrations allocate few resources for music education (Angel-Alvarado et al., 2021), and school communities reduce the value of the music because it is merely understood as an ornamental element in ceremonies and celebrations, reminiscent of the first period of the Chilean history of music education (Pino, 2015). Furthermore, some repertoires are censored at schools, as lyrics are perceived to be problematic. The school censorship frame represents an opportunity for questioning ethical implications, as it serves as a barrier for the encouragement of sociomusical identities, controlling or limiting the ideologies (Kallio, 2015). These systemic characteristics play a determinant role in music schoolteacher beliefs concerning the value of music education in Chile; however, it is particularly notorious that participants also have negative memories regarding music educators who taught them at school.

Some music schoolteachers emphasised that they did not learn music at primary nor secondary education levels (cf. Poblete et al., 2019), telling stories of violence in some cases. Thus, the current generation of educators scrutinises the reputation of now-retired music schoolteachers, revealing that music education professionals have been historically discredited because the profession is unappreciated intergenerationally in all zones. The professional discredit gives an account of a vulnerable social position within the society (Kippen, 2002), making it feasible that parents and guardians also have a

negative vision of music schoolteachers, establishing no difference between former and current educators.

In matters of teaching practice, all participants seek to foster the acquisition and development of musical competencies linked to instrumental playing and cover making, using a wide variety of repertoires (i.e. Poblete, 2021). Nonetheless, it is noteworthy that almost all interviewees implement songs composed by Violeta Parra, Victor Jara, and Los Prisioneros at any educational level. Beyond these unintentional agreements, at least two differences are apparent within participants' teaching practices, making it feasible to map in depth the sociomusical identities of music schoolteachers according to their geographical zone (Figure 1).

First, school music teachers from the Central Zone advocate for music education based on individualism, while educators from other zones encourage teaching models oriented towards active participation, socialisation, and interculturality (Angel-Alvarado, 2020; Moore, 2016; Rojas, 2021). More precisely, participative musical behaviours and social life are encouraged by schoolteachers from the Northern, Insular, and Southern zones because students with different backgrounds can interchange cultural elements within the classroom setting through popular music (Bernal, 2017; Casas-Mas et al., 2014; Hao et al., 2016). For instance, the use of the cumbia and its subgenres in the Northern Zone (Guerrero, 2007), the interpretation of love songs in the Southern Zone (i.e. Montoya & Solís, 2020), and the recreation of traditional music from the Insular Zone using modern sounds. In contrast, schoolteachers from the Central Zone think about music education from an individualistic viewpoint (Angel-Alvarado et al., 2021) because, in addition to promoting the use of smartphones and laptops during music lessons, the

focal point is centred on CBL, attempting to achieve the desired effect according to the national curriculum. That is, students should be capable of assessing their own musical skills (Mineduc, 2013; 2016).

Figure 1.

Second, schoolteachers from the Northern and Insular zones encourage sociomusical identities in classroom settings because the traditional music is mixed with elements of the modern life. In contrast, educators from other zones use mainly repertoires linked to popular music, making distinctions between genres to the point that traditional music is unmixed with popular music. According to Harnish (2005) and Skinner (2015), the sociomusical identities are seen when the traditional music is preserved, adapted, and renewed using contemporary elements. In other words, sociomusical identities involve a syncretism based on post-ethnicity because local traditions and foreign cultural elements are intertwined reciprocally (Casas-Mas, 2018; Moore, 2016; Van Klyton, 2014), giving rise to new types of transcultural identities (Steingress, 2004). In this regard, the Altiplano rhythms and Insular music have mixed respectively with electric and digital sounds within local communities, emerging new cultural movements. The role of the school is then primarily to foster the internalisation of sociomusical identities promoted by the community, using a wide variety of local elements, such as traditional tales, clothing, verses, or games (Fuhrmann, 2011; Hennion, 2016; Weidman, 2012).

In conclusion, the sociomusical identities of music schoolteachers are supported when social life through music is encouraged in classroom settings (Angel-Alvarado,

2020) and when traditional repertoires are mixed with modern elements in learning tasks (Harnish, 2005; Skinner, 2015). Nonetheless, such pedagogical actions rise from the personal interest of schoolteachers, making it imperative to focus the research sight on the seed or primary source of inspiration of the sociomusical identities. In this study, Northern teachers admit putting into practice the legacy of Paulo Freire, while the Insular teacher refers to the educational contract that students are willing to subscribe to. Therefore, the support or inhibition of music teachers' sociomusical identities depends on mechanisms oriented towards the professional background (Bourdieu, 1986; Casas-Mas et al., 2014; Ozer et al., 2017), encouraging it through pedagogical knowledge, teaching experience, or environmental conditions of the *milieu*.

In contrast, the sociomusical identities of music schoolteachers could be inhibited by mechanisms linked to professional discredit because, according to Angel-Alvarado et al. (2021), schools tend to hire one music teacher as the Chilean education system prioritises knowledge areas that are assessed through standardised tests, overlooking music education and its potential benefits. The professional disrepute may be seen intergenerationally, as even our participants call the performance of their own music schoolteachers into question; in fact, many interviewees recognised that they did not learn music at school during childhood and youth. The rest of society might also question the role of music education, frustrating further any endeavours to legitimise the profession. In addition to the undervaluation of music education and music teaching at school, the sociomusical identities of music educators are inhibited by ICT tools because some students suffer smartphone addiction, which hinders active and collaborative participation in learning tasks (Mascia et al., 2020). Findings represent a prior reality to the COVID-19

pandemic, making it plausible that the sociomusical identities of music teachers have further declined in these latter years.

Last but not least, our findings are not conclusive because more evidence is required from the perspectives of decentralisation and mixed research methods. Nonetheless, the current study serves as a departure point for distinguishing the sociomusical identities of music schoolteachers that work in the sunny desert and rainy forest geographical zones because the research purpose is to recognise the existence of a variety of music education realities in the Chilean school system, revealing its characteristics and challenges. Such a purpose should be replicated in other countries for two main reasons. On the one hand, to avoid generalisations where a nation is described in a centralised way with data collected in big cities and, on the other hand, to identify the sociomusical identities internalised by schoolteachers from different regions in order to elaborate and implement improvement plans both in the school system and programs of continuing education. In this regard, we inform that findings reported in this study will be shared with the Ministry of Education, policy-makers, and members of Chile's constitutional convention because the country is immersed in a democratic process of writing a new constitution, making it plausible that the position and conditions of music education can be enhanced within the school system.

Declaration of interest statement

Authors report no potential conflict of interest.

References

Angel-Alvarado, R. (2018). Controversies between curriculum theory and educational practice in music education. *Revista Electrónica Complutense de Investigación en Educación Musical, 15*, 83-95. https://doi.org/10.5209/RECIEM.58530

Angel-Alvarado, R. (2020). The crisis in music education resulting from the demise of educational institutions. *Revista Educación, 44*(1), 1-14. https://doi.org/10.15517/revedu.v44i1.39188

Angel-Alvarado, R., Belletich, O., & Wilhelmi, M. R. (2019). Motivation of Secondary Education Students in Soundscape Activities: A Quasi-Experimental Study in a Context of Social Vulnerability. *Revista Electrónica Educare*, *23*(2), 1-17. https://doi.org/10.15359/ree.23-2.18

Angel-Alvarado, R., Gárate-González, B., & Quiroga-Fuentes, I. (2021). Insurrection in Chile: The Effects of Neoliberalism from a Music Education Perspective. *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education, 20*(3), 107-131. https://doi.org/10.22176/act20.3.107

Angel-Alvarado, R., Quiroga-Fuentes, I., & Gárate-González, B. (2022). Working on the dark side of the moon: overcoming music education inequities in the Chilean school system. *Arts Education Policy Review*. https://doi.org/10.1080/10632913.2022.2043970

Bernal, M. J., Castro-Tejerina, J., & Blanco, F. (2017). Hooked on the Blues: Technical and expressive continuities between life and music. *Culture & Psychology, 24*(1), 80-95. https://doi.org/10.1177/1354067X17729625

Bourdieu, P. (1986). The Forms of Capital. In J. G. Richardson (ed.), *Handbook of Theory and Research for the Sociology of Education* (pp. 241-258). Greenwood Press.

Carlson, A. (2014). Inundating the Country with Music: Jorge Peña, Democracy, and Music Education in Chile. *Journal of Historical Research in Music Education, XXXVI*(1), 65-78. https://doi.org/10.1177/153660061403600105

Casas-Mas, A., Pozo, J. I., & Montero, I. (2014). The influence of music learning cultures on the construction of teaching-learning conceptions. *British Journal of Music Education, 31*(3), 319-342. http://dx.doi.org/10.1017/S0265051714000096

Casas-Mas, A. (2018). Developing an approach to the Flamenco learning-teaching culture: An innovate (traditional) learning. In B-W. Leung (Ed.), *Traditional musics in the modern world: Transmission, evolution, and challenges* (pp. 25-40). Springer.

Fuhrmann, W. (2011). Toward a Theory of Socio-Musical Systems: Reflections on Niklas Luhmann's Challenge to Music Sociology. *Acta Musicologica, 83*(1), 135-159.

García, M. (2013). *Canción valiente: 1969-1989 Tres décadas de canto social y político en Chile*. Ediciones B.

Gavilán, V., & Vigueras, P. (2020). Embodied temporalities and memories in aymara rituals in northern Chile. *Cultura y Religión, 14*(2), 100-127. http://dx.doi.org/10.4067/S0718-47272020000200107

González, J. P. (2012). Música chilena andina 1970-1975: Construcción de una identidad doblemente desplazada. *Cuadernos de Música Iberoamericana, 24*, 175-186. https://core.ac.uk/download/pdf/153338169.pdf

Guerrero, B. (2007). Sociomusical identity of Aymaran youth: the music sound. *Última Década, 15*(27), 11-25. https://doi.org/10.4067/S0718-22362007000200002

Hao, J., Li, D., Peng, L., Peng, S., & Torelli, C. J. (2016). Advancing Our Understanding of Culture Mixing. *Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology, 47*(10), 1257-1267. https://doi.org/10.1177/0022022116670514

Harnish, D. (2005). Defining ethnicity, (re)constructing culture: Processes of musical adaptation and innovation among the Balinese of Lombok. *Journal of Musicological Research, 24*(3-4), 265-286. https://doi.org/10.1080/01411890500234013

Hennion, A. (2016). *The passion for music: A sociology of mediation*. Routledge.

Kallio, A. (2015). *Navigating (un)popular music in the classroom: censure and censorship in an inclusive, democratic music education.* Sibelius Academy of the University of the Arts Helsinki. Studia Musica 65.

Kippen, J. (2002). Wajid Revisited: A Reassessment of Robert Gottlieb's "Tabla" Study, and a New Transcription of the Solo of Wajid Hussain Khan of Lucknow. *Asian Music, 33*(2), 111-166.

Längler, M., Nivala, M., Brouwer, J., & Gruber, H. (2020). Quality of network support for the deliberate practice of popular musicians. *Musicae Scientiae*. https://doi.org/10.1177/1029864920938451

Magnitzky, D., & Sepúlveda, A. (2017). Evaluación en educación musical en la educación básica: Una reflexión desde la percepción del profesorado. *Revista Electrónica Complutense en Investigación en Educación Musical, 14*, 239-265. https://doi.org/10.5209/RECIEM.54849

Mascia, M. L., Agus, M., & Penna, M. P. (2020). Emotional Intelligence, Self-Regulation, Smartphone Addiction: Which Relationship with Student Well-Being and Quality of Life? *Frontiers in Psychology, 11*, 1-7. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2020.00375

McCarthy, M. (2004). *Toward a global community: The International Society for Music Education 1953-2003*. ISME.

Ministry of Education (2013). *Bases curriculares: Educación básica.* Unidad de Currículum y Evaluación. https://www.curriculumenlineamineduc.cl/605/articles-30013_recurso_15.pdf

Ministry of Education (2016). *Bases curriculares 7° básico a 2° medio*. Unidad de Currículum y Evaluación. https://www.curriculumenlineamineduc.cl/605/articles-36153_recurso_1.pdf

Ministry of Health (2006). *Ley 20120, sobre la investigación científica en el ser humano, su genoma, y prohíbe la clonación humana*. Subsecretaría de Salud Pública. https://www.bcn.cl/leychile/navegar?idNorma=253478

Montoya, L., & Solís, K. (2020). La influencia cultural a través de la música mexicana: rancheras en Chile. *Revista Digital Universitaria, 21*(3), 1-10. http://doi.org/10.22201/codeic.16076079e.2020.v21n3.a1

Moore, T. (2016). Interculturality, postethnicity and the aboriginal Australian policy future. *Ethnicities, 16*(5), 712-732.

OECD. (2005). *The definition and selection of key competencies: Executive summary*. OECD Publishing. https://www.oecd.org/pisa/35070367.pdf

OECD. (2017). *Making Decentralisation Work in Chile: Towards Stronger Municipalities*. OECD Multi-level Governance Studies. https://doi.org/10.1787/9789264279049-en

Ozer, S., Bertelsen, P., Singla, R., & Schwartz, S. J. (2017). "Grab Your Culture and Walk with the Global": Ladakhi Students' Negotiation of Cultural Identity in the Context of Globalization-Based Acculturation. *Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology, 48*(3), 294-318. https://doi.org/10.1177/0022022116687394

Pino, O. (2015). *El concepto de música en el currículo escolar chileno 1810 – 2010* (Tesis de Magíster), Universidad de Chile, Santiago, Chile.

Poblete, C. (2021). Socio-cultural background and teacher education in Chile: Understanding the musical repertoires of music teachers of Chile. In R. Wright, G. Johansen, P. A. Kanellopoulos, & P. Schmidt (Eds.), *The Routledge Handbook to Sociology of Music Education* (pp. 136-152). Routledge.

Poblete, C., Leguina, A., Masquiarán, N., & Carreño, B. (2019). Informal and non formal music experience: power, knowledge and learning in music teacher education in Chile. *International Journal of Music Education, 37*(2), 272-285. https://doi.org/10.1177/0255761419836015

Rekedal, J. (2019). Martyrdom and Mapuche Metal: Defying Cultural and Territorial Reductions in Twenty-First-Century Wallmapu. *Ethnomusicology, 63*(1), 78-104. https://doi.org/10.5406/ethnomusicology.63.1.0078

Rojas, J. S. (2021). Afro-Colombian internal migration and participatory music: Ethnically and politically charged religious festivals in Bogota. *Musicae Scientiae*. https://doi.org/10.1177/10298649211017602

Sepúlveda, A. T. (2017). Chile. En R. Torres-Santos (Ed.), *Music Education in the Caribbean and Latin America: A comprehensive guide* (pp. 185-202). Rowman & Littlefield.

Shaheen, M., Pradhan, S., & Ranajee. (2019). Sampling in qualitative research. In M. Gupta, M. Shaheen, & K. Prathap (Eds.), *Qualitative techniques for workplace data analysis* (pp. 25-52). IGI Global.

Sim, J., Saunders, B., Waterfield, J., & Kingstone, J. (2018). Can sample size in qualitative research be determined a priori? *International Journal of Social Research Methodology, 21*(5), 619-634. https://doi.org/10.1080/13645579.2018.1454643

Skinner, R. T. (2015). *Bamako sounds: The afropolitan ethics of Malian music*. University of Minnesota Press.

Stake, R. E. (2006). *Multiple Case Study Analysis.* The Guilford Press.

Steingress, G. (2004a). El flamenco como arte popular y popularizado. In M. López (Ed.), *Introducción al flamenco en el currículum escolar* (pp. 181-199). Akal.

Strike, K. T., Fitzsimmons, J. C., & Meyer, D. K. (2019). *The impact of teacher leaders: Case studies from the field.* Rowman & Littlefield.

Valdivia, C. V., & Angel-Alvarado, R. (2021). Representations and activism in music education: The case of an emblematic secondary school. *Revista Chilena de Pedagogía, 2*(2), 105-134.

Van Klyton, A. (2014). All the way from … authenticity and distance in world music production. *Cultural Studies, 30*(1), 106-128. https://doi.org/10.1080/09502386.2014.974642

Weidman, A. (2012). The Ethnographer as Apprentice: Embodying Sociomusical Knowledge in South India. *Anthropology and Humanism, 37*(2), 214-235. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1548-1409.2012.01131.x

Appendix 1.

Emerging codes in data analysis, some examples.

	Open Coding	Axial Coding	Selective Coding
Time	**Music Education Undervaluing**: "the instructional time and the budget are reduced" (Northern T7); "the education system prioritises knowledge assessed through standardised tests" (Central T2); "headteachers used to apply tests of other subjects in the instructional time for music education" (Southern T5).	**Intergenerational Discredit of the Music Teaching**: "my music teacher hit me really hard with a recorder" (Southern T7).	**Participative Musical Behaviour**s: "We play popular music, although it is appropriate to say that we recreate traditional music toward a modern perspective, including electric instruments, passages for improvisation, and tailoring typical songs to urban rhythms, such as reggaeton, trap, or hip hop…. It is important to say that, here, the students enjoy their kinds of music, and they do not accept that the teacher imposes a task. They do not do it; it's that simple" (Insular T1).
Space	**Emotional Learning**: "he used to unleash his rage by pummelling a wall with a punch. He vents currently his frustration writing lyrics, which are transformed in songs subsequently" (Northern T3); "the teacher must give emotional support and affection to learners" (Central T6); "fostering the socialisation between classmates in music lessons" (Southern T4).		
Place	**Contextualisation of Music Teaching**: "there are learners from different Latin American countries at the school, and those students enjoy making arrangement in cumbia style" (Northern T5); "this generation was born with the smartphone in hands. They use it for everything" (Central T2); "rhythms as reggaeton, rap or cumbia should prevail in lessons because the use of traditional music reveals an old-fashioned teaching" (Southern T5)	**Intercultural Classroom Settings**: "at the classroom, there are sound elements from Argentina with the villera, Peru with the chicha, and Chile with the pachanga" (Northern T1),	